

BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

Brigham  
Young  
University

# STUDIES

SPRING-SUMMER 1965

The Newly Established Asian Research  
Institute

Uses of the Five Elements in East Asia

*Spencer J. Palmer*

The Pair of Japanese Bronze Lanterns  
at Brigham Young University

*Schuyler Cammann*

China and Japan: An Analysis of Con-  
flict

*Lee W. Farnsworth*

The Postwar Appeal of Communism in  
Malaya, Vietnam and the Philip-  
pines

*Ray Cole Hillam*

Politics and Religion on China's Mon-  
golian Frontier

*Paul V. Hyer*

Mormon Bibliography 1964

Late on Father's Day, *A Poem*

*Marden J. Clark*

Book Reviews

Book Notes

Asian Research Institute Personnel

Index, Volume VI



---

Brigham  
Young  
University

# STUDIES

Volume VI

Numbers 3 and 4

---

## CONTENTS

The Newly Established Asian Research Institute	121
Uses of the Five Elements in East Asia	<i>Spencer J. Palmer</i> 123
The Pair of Japanese Bronze Lanterns at Brigham Young University	<i>Schuyler Cammann</i> 135
China and Japan: An Analysis of Conflict	<i>Lee W. Farnsworth</i> 139
The Postwar Appeal of Communism in Malaya, Vietnam and the Philippines	<i>Ray Cole Hillam</i> 153
Politics and Religion on China's Mongolian Frontier	<i>Paul V. Hyer</i> 163
Mormon Bibliography 1964	171
Late on Father's Day, <i>A Poem</i>	<i>Marden J. Clark</i> 176
Book Reviews	178
Book Notes	190
Asian Research Institute Personnel	192
Index, Volume VI	198

---

University Editor  
Managing Editor

Ernest L. Olson  
Dean B. Farnsworth

*Editorial Board for 1964-65: J. Roman Andrus, Harold T. Christensen, Dean B. Farnsworth, Crawford Gates, Bertrand F. Harrison, Charles J. Hart, Clinton F. Larson, Melvin B. Mabey, Keith R. Oakes, Ernest L. Olson, Blaine R. Porter, Robert K. Thomas, Arthur Wallace, Dale H. West.*

The purpose of *Brigham Young University Studies* is to be a voice for the community of L.D.S. scholars.

*Brigham Young University Studies* is published by Brigham Young University. Send manuscripts to Editor, *Brigham Young University Studies*, Box 1, McKay Building, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah. Enclose self-addressed, stamped envelope. Subscriptions, \$2.00 for four numbers; single copies, \$.50 each. Please send subscriptions to Office of University Publications, C-341 ASB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.

Printed by Brigham Young University Press



## *The Newly Established Asian Research Institute*

From increased interest in Asia and its problems has come a newly organized Asian Research Institute at Brigham Young University. The Institute recognizes the imperative need for countries of the West to gain a more realistic understanding of Asia and its cultures. Recommended by the University Administration, the Institute was approved recently by the Board of Trustees and will begin its activities at once under the direction of Dr. Lee W. Farnsworth, specialist in Asian studies. Members of the Executive Committee of the Institute are: Lee W. Farnsworth, Ray C. Hillam, Russell N. Horiuchi, Wesley P. Lloyd, Paul V. Hyer and Spencer J. Palmer—all with academic training and practical experience relating to Asia.\*

"The establishment of the Institute at Brigham Young University is a formal recognition on the part of the University of the need for relations between occidental and oriental countries to be developed on the basis of reliable information," said President Ernest L. Wilkinson. "This institution, with historic concern for cultures of the world, will establish through research procedure a body of significant information about the Orient and its people that will supplement the findings of other educational institutions."

In addition to its major research activities, the Institute is, according to Director Farnsworth, authorized to develop a library of research materials, establish financial aids for students working in Asian studies, set up panels on which faculty members, students and visitors may present significant issues relating to Asia, and encourage and sponsor publications on Asian subjects.

Asia, as the largest, least known, and possibly the most critical area in the world today, presents both danger and opportunity. It is to the credit of the University that a systematic research approach will now be given to problems of Asian cultures. It is expected that through the Institute

---

\*For vitae of ARI personnel see p. 192.

further steps will be taken toward a type of original thinking and investigation that can become a hallmark at B.Y.U. The research approach can enrich and make more reliable the basis of teaching for which Brigham Young University has been traditionally known. To be disseminators alone without giving appropriate emphasis to research as a companion discipline to teaching is to fall short of the purpose for which universities exist. The Institute is established separate from but complementary to the Asian Studies teaching program.

The Asian Studies Program established in 1961 has a faculty of five and draws on a considerably larger number of people in supporting areas. The present curriculum includes about forty-five courses in eight disciplines. The number of majors studying in the field is increasing rapidly. Majors are required to fill requirements concurrently in a regular discipline. The number receiving assistantships, scholarships and other grants to continue work at major institutions is most encouraging. Paul Hyer is Chairman of the Committee on Asian Studies, which includes all the Asian Studies faculty listed below. The necessity of research facilities for advanced work and graduate study is keenly felt and the new Asian Research Institute is planned with this in mind.

The trend toward increased interest in Asia at B.Y.U. is shown partly by the academic work and research presently in process by members of the faculty. There is a major gain also in the number of Asian students and professors of the University. There is a substantial gain in enrollment in the area of Asian studies.

With increased emphasis on graduate work on the campus it is imperative that more attention be given to research, and in this area activity will be coordinated for the best use of time, talent and finances. This research organization can serve faculty and mature students toward the encouragement of and genuine interest in the cultures of the Orient.

Not the least justification for emphasizing research in Asia is that of the national interest. American interchange has been more successful in European countries than in Asia, partly because Americans are better informed about Europe than about the Orient.



# *Uses of the Five Elements in East Asia*

SPENCER J. PALMER\*

Certain themes have great staying power, known for their endurance in time as well as their transmission in space. Thus, with varying degrees of intensity, it has been possible for the ancient world to influence and guide ways of thinking and events down to the present.

In the Western world, it may be said that Greece and Rome have exerted a continuous influence upon art, literature, religion, politics, and education. As an example, there has been a persistence of the idea of imperial power. From Charlemagne to Mussolini (some would bring this up to de Gaulle), despots have sought to engage the impelling image of Rome's ancient glory. Thus Charlemagne and Frederick II Hohenstaufen, with startling deviation from contemporary artistic norms, deliberately portrayed themselves on their coinage as ancient Caesars and Augustuses—which they were not. The works of Frederick, the thirteenth century emperor, German but ruling from Sicily, showed a self-conscious ambition to restore the power of Rome; and Napoleon, who on the coinage of his time was dressed in incongruous toga and wreath, was inspired by the same vision. During the Renaissance, emulation was at times even more slavish—as illustrated by the coins of Galba (A.D. 68) and Francesco I da Carrara, a petty ruler of Padua. Later, when Charles II of England wanted a symbol for "Britannia" he commissioned a design from a coin of Antoninus Pius (A.D. 138-161).

The eagle as a symbol of national pride derives from the Roman standard. It appears on a coin of Trajan, on the seal of the United States of America, and as the emblem of the German Federated Republic. In architecture, there is a witness of ancient themes in such well-known American buildings as Jefferson's Monticello in Virginia and in the Capitol building in Washington.<sup>1</sup> The classical influence upon West-

\*On leave from Brigham Young University, Dr. Palmer is president of the L.D.S. Mission in Korea. He had been selected as first director of the Asian Research Institute prior to his mission call.

<sup>1</sup>These motifs are all beautifully illustrated in photographs and paintings in *The Birth of Western Civilization*, ed. Michael Grant (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1964), pp. 9-25.

ern political doctrines and institutions is generally recognized but the classical contribution in the realm of myth and literature, although lesser known today, has been continuous and widespread. It ranges from the idea of the bull as a symbol of fertility (what Jack Conrad in *The Horn and the Sword* says is the background of the modern Spanish bull-fight) to sophisticated psychological theories such as Narcissism and Oedipus Complex.

In the cultural history of East Asia, where precedent has been the leitmotif, the influence of classical thought has been profound and extensive indeed. I think it is safe to say that its impact upon the traditions of China, Korea, and Japan has even exceeded in comprehensiveness the Greco-Roman impact upon the West, although such an assertion is not really verifiable.

This article will suggest (not circumscribe) the social, religious, political, and historical implications of one classical Chinese theory known as *Wu-hsing*, usually translated as The Five Elements. Upon this theory, in close association with the so-called Yin-Yang theory, the whole scheme of Chinese philosophy is based.

The earliest mention of the Wu-hsing theory, which involves the elements of fire, earth, metal, water and wood as dynamic and interacting agents or powers, is an inscription on a jade sword-handle which may be dated not long after 400 B.C.<sup>2</sup> The primary locus classicus for this ancient theory, however, is the "Great Plan" section of the *Shu Ching* or the Book of History, a book which later became one of the five Confucian classics. This text contains the record of a speech delivered to King Wu of the Chou dynasty (1122-255 B.C.) by the Viscount of Ch'i, a prince of the Shang dynasty (1766-1154 B.C.) which King Wu conquered at the end of the twelfth century B.C. The viscount had said that when ruin overtook the house of Shang, he would not be the servant of another dynasty. Accordingly he refused to acknowledge the sovereignty of Wu, who had nevertheless made it possible for the learned Ch'i to be delivered from prison and be invested with territory now connected with north Korea, where he reputedly established a dynasty, between the years 1122 B.C. and

---

<sup>2</sup>See Joseph Needham, *Science and Civilization in China: History of Scientific Thought* (Cambridge: University Press, 1956), II, 242.



194 B.C.,<sup>3</sup> surrounding the site of present-day P'yongyang. The viscount apparently felt constrained out of courtesy to appear at the court of Chou, when the king took the opportunity to consult with him on the great principles of government. The result was that he communicated the "Great Plan," with its nine divisions.<sup>4</sup> The first of these was called Wu-hsing, explained as follows:

The five elements: the first is called water, the second fire, the third wood, the fourth metal, the fifth earth. Water is said to soak and descend; fire is said to blaze and ascend; wood is said to curve or be straight; metal is said to obey and change; earth is said to take seeds and give crops. That which soaks and descends produces saltiness; that which blazes and ascends produces bitterness; that which curves or is straight produces sourness; that which obeys and changes produces acidity; that which takes seeds and gives crops produces sweetness.<sup>5</sup>

In this quotation the idea of Wu-hsing is still crude. In speaking of them, its author is obviously still thinking in terms of actual substances instead of abstract forces bearing these names, as they came to be regarded later on.

From this very inconspicuous beginning, the five-elements theory gradually came to be associated with every conceivable category of things in the universe (the tables at the end of this article set these forth). As Joseph Needham has suggested, many of these ramifications were a natural outcome of the basic hypothesis itself. The association of the elements with the seasons was obvious enough. What could have been more unavoidable than to link fire and summer and the south? The colors invited much speculation. Since the cradle of Chinese civilization was the land of yellow loess soil in the upper Yellow River basin (modern Shansi and Shensi), it is quite plausible to suppose that for the center that color imposed itself. Then white in the west would stand for the perpetual snows of the Tibetan massif, with green (or blue) in the east for the fertile plains or the seemingly infinite ocean. Finally, red in the south may have taken its origin from the red soil of Szechuan, the region which lies just south of Shensi and

<sup>3</sup>In Korean history Ch'i-tzü is known as Kija.

<sup>4</sup>James Legge, *The Chinese Classics: The Shoo King or the Book of Historical Documents* (London: Oxford University Press, 1865), III, 320.

<sup>5</sup>Bernard Karlgren, *The Book of Documents* (Stockholm: The Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities, 1950), p. 30.

Shansi; there are, moreover, large areas of red soil in Yunnan. But several schools of scholars in China have contributed to the vast schema of correspondences between the Five Powers and the phenomena of society, thought, politics, and morality. These have included the so-called astronomical groups, the naturalists, the Yin-Yangists, and the agriculturalists, so that Wu-hsing has become a significant force in the development of astronomy, astrology, the calendar, the key social relationships, geomancy, alchemy, and the Taoist search for the elixir of life.<sup>6</sup>

The wide-ranging ramifications of the five-elements theory are apparent throughout East Asia even today. On the most superficial level, there is a contemporary children's game called "stone" (earth), "scissors" (metal), and "cloth" (wood), by which easy decisions can be reached. Stone wins over scissors, scissors wins over cloth, and cloth wins over stone. This game reputedly started with the Japanese, but the theory behind it is no doubt an adaptation of the five-elements, which were thought of as being mutually friendly or antagonistic to each other as follows:

Water produces Wood but destroys Fire;  
Fire produces Earth but destroys Metal;  
Metal produces Water but destroys Wood;  
Wood produces Fire but destroys Earth;  
Earth produces Metal but destroys Water.

Another indication of the pervasive impact of Wu-hsing in China, Korea, and Japan is found in concepts of time. In these three countries the names for the days of the week are a perpetual reminder of this fact. The word "Sunday" means literally Sun-source-day and Monday means Moon-source-day, representative of the Yin-Yang theory of correlative opposition between light, buoyance, and generation (Yang), and receptiveness and calmness (Yin). The other five days of the week are associated with the theory of Wu-hsing: Tuesday is Fire-source-day; Wednesday is Water-source-day; Thursday is Wood-source-day; Friday is Metal-source-day; and Saturday is Earth-source-day. Not only days of the week, but hours of the

---

<sup>6</sup>Wu-hsing and Taoist ideas of alchemy, geomancy, and medicine are elaborated in Homes Welch, *The Parting of the Way* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1957), pp. 96-97, 133f.



day, and the years in the cycle of sixty, have been influenced by the five-elements theory.<sup>7</sup>

In Korea, the construction of names for the newly-born is a fascinating art traditionally much influenced by Wu-hsing. In most Korean families all the children of one generation share the same middle character-name, called *sor'im*. Thus of the three characters which usually comprise a person's name (the first being the surname) only one is strictly peculiar to the individual.

The harmony of characters in the names of a well-educated family has a certain beauty of its own. But superstition may enter in. The practice of counting the number of strokes used in writing a name and ensuring that the total is an auspicious number is not often admitted to, even if it is still practiced, but the dreams of the mother or father while the child is still in the womb may be taken into account. Generation or middle names can be chosen on the basis of several theories. Some families base them on the old Chinese Thousand Character Classic or the set of astronomical characters called the Ten Heavenly Stems. By far the most common basis for the selection of generation names is the cycle of the Five Elements. In one contemporary Korean family the generation character is connected with the element of earth, all the boys' personal characters are connected with daylight, and their order reflects the state of the sunlight at different times of the day.<sup>8</sup> As a further practical illustration of how the theory may be applied, we will use the example of an unmarried Korean student presently enrolled at Brigham Young University whose name is Kim Ho-min. This young man's great-grandfather's name is Kim Yong-bong. His middle name contains a symbol meaning *wood*. The grandfather's name is Kim Chae-uk (containing *earth*), the father's name is Kim Ch'ol-jin (*metal*), the student's name is Kim Ho-min (*water*), and his infant

<sup>7</sup>The Chinese sexagenary cycle can be thought of in the image of two enmeshed cogwheels, one having twelve and the other ten teeth so that not until sixty combinations have been made will the cycle repeat. The usual view of the so-called ten celestial stems is that they have been developed by combining the Five Elements with Yin-Yang dualism. Tables giving the names and affinities of the ten celestial stems and the twelve branches or horary characters, along with other relevant data for showing the Chinese cyclical character system in terms of the western calendar, are found in *Mathews' Chinese-English Dictionary* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1956), p. 1176ff.

<sup>8</sup>Richard Rutt, *Korean Works and Days: Notes from the Diary of a Country Priest* (Rutland, Vt.: Charles E. Tuttle Company, 1964), pp. 162-163.



nephew's name is Kim Song-*ch'an* (*fire*). In these five generations we have cognizance of the cycle of the Five Elements: wood, earth, metal, water, and fire in that order.

The theory of the Five Elements entered into social matters fully as much as personal ones. Throughout East Asia, in case of prospective marriage, the Five Elements were called in, shuffled, and consulted, in order to determine whether two young people could expect a compatible life together. Since the time of each person's birth is ruled by a given element, it was a matter of matching these elements so as to provide an auspicious situation. If a young man whose element was wood was mated to a metal girl, he would suffer as wood does from ax and saw and chisel. If he were married to a fire girl, nothing but total destruction would await him. Earth and water were the only safe elements with which wood could mate. Domestic happiness was often explained in terms of the theory of the Five Elements.

#### *Politics and the Cyclical Theory of History*

Perhaps the most substantive contribution of Wu-hsing in East Asian tradition has been in the area of practical politics and the philosophy of history. This development starts with Tsou Yen, the father of the five-elements school, who lived in the fourth century B.C. Tsou Yen followed events in the rise and fall of ages, recorded their omens and institutions, and extended his survey backward in time when heaven and earth had not yet been born, to what was profound and abstruse and not to be examined. By making citations of the revolutions and transformations of the Five Powers, he was influential in the development of a new philosophy of politics and history: changes must be interpreted in accordance with transformations of the Five Elements.

The details of this theory are treated in one section of a text called *Lü-shih ch'un chi'iu*.<sup>9</sup> This work states (XIII, 2):

Whenever an Emperor or King is about to arise, Heaven must first manifest some favorable omen to the common

---

<sup>9</sup>A congerie of ritual tracts prescribing seasonal activities, of legalist and Taoist theorizing, and containing a number of legends and anecdotes inserted to illustrate points of doctrine. Traditionally this work was compiled under the patronage of Lu Pu-wei (d. B.C. 235), a rich merchant who had befriended the Ch'in prince whose son became ruler of all China as Ch'in Shih-huang-ti. See James Robert Hightower, *Topics in Chinese Literature* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1962), p. 9.

people. In the time of the Yellow Emperor, Heaven first made huge earthworms and mole crickets appear. The Yellow Emperor said: "The force of soil is in ascendance." Therefore he assumed yellow as his color, and took Soil as the pattern for his affairs.

In the time of Yu [founder of the Hsia dynasty, legendary dates 2205 B.C. to 1818 B.C.] Heaven first made grass and trees appear which did not die in the autumn and winter. Yu said: "The force of Wood is in ascendancy." Therefore he assumed green as his color and took Wood as the pattern for his affairs.

In the time of T'ang [founder of the Shang dynasty, traditional dates 1766 B.C. to 1154 B.C.] Heaven made some knife blades appear in the water. T'ang said: "The force of Metal is in ascendancy." He therefore assumed white as his color and took Metal as the pattern for his affairs.

In the time of King Wen [founder of the Chou dynasty, traditional dates of 1122 B.C. to 255 B.C.] Heaven made a flame appear, while a red bird, holding a red book in its mouth, alighted on the altar of soil of the House of Chou. King Wen said: "The force of Fire is in ascendancy." Therefore he assumed red as his color, and took Fire as the pattern of his affairs.

Whatever will inevitably be the next force that will succeed Fire. Heaven will first make the ascendancy of Water manifest. The force of Water being in ascendancy, black will be assumed as its color, and Water will be taken as the pattern for affairs. . . . When the cycle is complete, the operation will revert once more to Soil.

The Yin-Yang school maintained that the Five Elements produce one another and also overcome one another in a fixed sequence. It also maintained that the sequence of the four seasons accords with this process of the mutual production of the Elements. Thus Wood, which dominates spring, produces Fire, which dominates summer. Fire in its turn produces Soil, which dominates the "center"; Soil again produces Metal, which dominates autumn; Metal produces Water, which dominates winter; and Water again produces Wood, which dominates spring.

According to the above quotations from the *Lü-shih ch'un ch'iu*, the succession of dynasties likewise accords with the natural succession of the Elements. Thus Earth, under whose Power the Yellow Emperor ruled, was overcome by the Wood



of the Hsia dynasty. The Wood of this dynasty was overcome by the Metal of the Shang dynasty, Metal was overcome by the Fire of the Chou dynasty, and Fire would in its turn be overcome by the Water of whatever dynasty was to follow the Chou. The Water of this dynasty would then again be overcome by the Soil of the dynasty following, thus completing the cycle. Although Wu-hsing was but a theory, it soon afterwards had its effect in practical politics, and eventually in the pattern of Chinese history.

China's earliest general history, the *Shih-chi*, or Records of the Historian, written around 100 B.C. by Ssu-ma Ch'ien (145 B.C. to ca. 90 B.C.)<sup>10</sup> inaugurated the series of twenty-four Chinese dynastic histories and has served as the model for subsequent official histories written in Korea and Japan. Chapter 28 of this history is of great importance for the religious history of ancient China. It also contains vital information on the political ramifications of the Five Elements theory as anciently understood.

At an indeterminate time in Chinese history there was a series of Five Emperors (traditional dates 2852 B.C. to 2255 B.C.) who succeeded Three August Personages. From the *Shih-chi* we learn that by 771 B.C. the people associated with the small state of Ch'in (which became the foundation for the first Chinese empire) were already acquainted with the theory of the legendary Five Emperors and the Five Elements. According to this theory, the Four Directions and the Center are bound by a sort of magic participation in the Five Elements and Five Colors, and they are ruled by five emperors and five colors. The Five Elements were bound to directions and colors as follows: Green Emperor, wood, east; Red Emperor, fire, south; Yellow Emperor, earth, center; White Emperor, metal, west; Black Emperor, water, north.<sup>11</sup>

In the year 221 B.C., the First Emperor of the Ch'in dynasty, known as Ch'in Shih-Huang-Ti (246-210 B.C.), conquered all the rival feudal states and thus created a unified

<sup>10</sup>Cf. Edouard Chavannes, *Les Mémoires historiques de Sseu-ma Ts'ien*, 5 vols., Paris, 1895-1905. The best monographic treatment of Ssu-ma Ch'ien available in English, describing the form and content of his work, and indicating something of its importance in Chinese history is Burton Watson, *Ssu-ma Ch'ien Grand Historian of China* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1958).

<sup>11</sup>Max Kaltenmark, "Religion and Politics in the China of the Ts'in and Han," *Diogenes*, No. 34 (Summer 1961), 20-21.

Chinese empire under the Ch'in. As the successor to the Chou dynasty, he actually believed that "the force of Water is in ascendancy," and so, according to Ssu-ma Ch'ien "assumed black as his color" and "took Water as the pattern for affairs." "The name of the Yellow River," says the Historical Records," was changed to that of Power Water, because it was supposed to mark the beginning of the Power of Water. With harshness and violence, and an extreme severity, everything was decided by law, for by punishing and oppressing, by having neither human-heartedness nor kindness, but only by conforming to strict justice, there would come an accord with the Five Powers."<sup>12</sup>

In part because of its legalistic severity, the Ch'in dynasty did not last long, and was soon succeeded by the Han (206 B.C. - A.D. 220). The Han Emperors also believed that they had become Emperors "by virtue of" one of the Five Powers, but there was considerable dispute as to which of the powers it was. At the time of the founding of the Han, when Kao-tzu the first emperor was still a commoner, he once killed a great snake, whereupon a spirit appeared and announced, "This snake was the son of the White Emperor and he who killed him is the Son of the Red Emperor!" When Kao-tzu first began his uprising, he offered prayers at an altar of soil in the city of Feng, and after he had won control of the district of P'ei and become its governor he sacrificed to the warrior god Ch'ih Yu<sup>13</sup> and anointed his drums and flags with the blood of the sacrifice. During the second year of his reign (205 B.C.) Kao-tzu inquired what deities the Ch'in rulers had worshipped in their sacrifices to the Lords on High and was told that there had been sacrifices to four deities, the White, the Green, the Yellow, and the Red Emperors.

"But I have heard that there are Five Emperors in Heaven," said Kao-tzu. "Why is it that the Ch'in rulers worshipped only four?"

When no one was able to offer an explanation, Kao-tzu replied, "I know the reason. They were waiting for me to come and complete the five!" He accordingly set up a place

<sup>12</sup>Quoted in Fung Yu-lan, *A Short History of Chinese Philosophy* (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1960), pp. 130-138.

<sup>13</sup>For an engrossing discussion of artistic representations of this long-lasting deity of Han times see: Chêng Tê-k'un, "Ch'ih Yü: The God of War in Han Art," *Oriental Art*, IV, No. 2 (Summer, 1958), 45-54.



of worship for the Black Emperor, called the Altar of the North, with officials appointed to carry out its sacrifices.<sup>14</sup>

Also in the Treatise on the Calendar of the same work occurs the following entry.<sup>15</sup>

"The Han came to power. Kao-tzu said: The holy place of the north waited for me to give it honor. He thought that he too had obtained the favorable presage of the virtue of water. . . ." Thus it can be assumed that Kao-tzu considered himself as the Black Emperor and that, consequently, the Han dynasty in its beginnings reigned by virtue of water.

Following the Han dynasty, there was a lapse of interest in the Five Elements as a political theory. Yet as late as 1911, when the last dynasty was brought to an end by the Chinese Republic under Sun Yat-sen, the official title of the Emperor was still "Emperor through the Mandate of Heaven and in accordance with the Movement of the Five Powers."

---

<sup>14</sup>This information occurs in the discussion of the Feng and Shan sacrifices, in Burton Watson, *Records of the Grand Historian of China* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1961), II, 30-31.

<sup>15</sup>Chavannes, *Mémoires historiques*, III, 328.

THE SYMBOLIC CORRELATIONS

ELEMENTS	SEASONS	CARDINAL POINTS	TASTES	SMELLS	STEMS (denary cyclical signs)	BRANCHES (duodenary cyclical signs) and the animals pertaining to them	NUMBERS
hsing (行)	shih (時)	fang (方)	wei (味)	ch'ou (臭)	kan (干)	chih (支)	shu (數)
Wood	spring	east	sour	goatish	chia i ( )	yin ( ) (tiger) & mao ( ) hare	8
Fire	summer	south	bitter	burning	ping ting ( )	wu ( ) horse & ssu ( ) serpent	7
Earth	—	center	sweet	fragrant	wu chi ( )	hsu ( ) dog, ch'ou ( ) ox, wei ( ) sheep & ch'ou ( ) dragon	5
Metal	autumn	west	acid	rank	keng hsin ( )	yu ( ) cock & shen ( ) monkey	9
Water	winter	north	salt	rotten	jen kwei ( )	hai ( ) boar & tzu ( ) rat	6

ELEMENTS	MUSICAL NOTES	HSIU	STAR-PALACES	HEAVENLY BODIES	PLANETS	WEATHER	STATES
hsing (行)	yin (音)	hsiu (宿)	kung (宮)	ch'en (辰)	hsing (星)	ch'i (氣)	kuo (國)
Wood	choi ( )	1-7	Azure Dragon	stars	Jupiter	wind	Ch'i
Fire	chih ( )	22-28	Vermillion Bird	sun	Mars	heat	Ch'u
Earth	kung ( )	—	Yellow Dragon	earth	Saturn	thunder	Chou
Metal	shang ( )	15-21	White Tiger	hsiu constellations	Venus	co'd	Ch'in
Water	yu ( )	8-14	Sombre Warrior	moon	Mercury	rain	Yen

ELEMENTS hsing (行)	RULERS ti (帝)	YIN-YANG (陰陽)	HUMAN PSYCHO- PHYSICAL FUNCTIONS shih (事)	STYLES OF GOVERNMENT cheng (政)	MINISTRIES pu (部)	COLORS ssu (色)	INSTRUMENTS ch'i (器)
Wood	Yu the Great/Hsia/	Yin in Yang or Lesser Yang	demeanour	relaxed	Agriculture	green	compasses
Fire	Wen Wang/Chou/	Yang or greater Yang	vision	enlightened	War	red	weights & measures
Earth	Huang Ti/pre-dyn/	Equal Balance	thought	careful	the Capital	yellow	plumbines
Metal	T'ang the Victori- ous/Shang/	Yang in Yin or lesser Yin	speech	energetic	Justice	white	T-squares
Water	Ch'in Shih Huang Ti/Ch'in/	Yin or greater Yin	hearing	quiet	Works	black	balances

ELEMENTS hsing (行)	CLASSES OF LIVING ANIMALS ch'ung (蟲)	DOMESTIC ANIMALS sheng (牲)	'GRAINS' ku (穀)	SACRIFICES ssu (祀)	VISCERA tsang (臟)	PARTS OF THE BODY r'i (體)	SENSE- ORGANS kuan (官)	AFFECTIVE STATES chih (志)
Wood	scaly (fishes)	sheep	wheat	inner door	spleen	muscles	eye	anger
Fire	feathered (birds)	fowl	beans	hearth	lungs	pulse (blood)	tongue	joy
Earth	naked (man)	ox	panicked millet	inner court	heart	flesh	mouth	desire
Metal	hairy (mammals)	dog	hemp	outer court	kidney	skin & hair	nose	sorrow
Water	shell-covered (invertebrates)	pig	millet	well	liver	bones (marrow)	ear	fear



# *The Pair of Japanese Bronze Lanterns at Brigham Young University*

SCHUYLER CAMMANN\*

Brigham Young University has recently acquired a pair of handsome Japanese temple lanterns, made of bronze.<sup>1</sup> Metal lanterns of this type were called *kane doro*, and they were used almost entirely as temple lanterns. They were either placed around the outside of the temple building itself, or were placed in rows in the outer gardens, often lining the avenue of approach. Generally they were pious gifts from individuals who offered them in memory of some deceased friend or relative.

These are no exception, because the inscription says that these were respectfully offered, on June 19, 1716, by a high official of the Tokugawa Family, which then ruled Japan, to be placed in the courtyard before the mausoleum of Lord Yusho (the Seventh Tokugawa Shogun, who died in 1716), in memory of him.<sup>2</sup> These were two out of a set of twelve which he presented at that time.

The two lanterns are practically the same in construction; so a precise description of one should serve to explain both. The basic idea of the whole structure is to represent the Universe in symbolic form, with all its component parts.

Beginning at the bottom, we find a six-sided base rising above a set of conventionalized flower petals, which represent the cosmic lotus that was thought to provide the foundation of

---

\*Dr. Cammann is a distinguished orientalist at the University of Pennsylvania.

<sup>1</sup>In addition to these two lanterns donated by Lorraine Allen of Los Angeles, Brigham Young University has also recently acquired forty-five pieces of eighteenth and nineteenth century oriental ivory carving in honor of Mrs. Pearl Jones Pharis.

<sup>2</sup>The actual inscription on the two lanterns reads:  
"Tokugawa Tsuna-eda, Junior Third Rank, Acting Middle Counsellor, respectfully offers, on the last day of the fourth month of the Shōtoku reign-period (June 19, 1716), twelve copper lanterns (to be placed) in the courtyard before the mausoleum of Lord Yushō (i.e. Tokugawa Testsugu)."

(Translated with the help of Professor E. Dale Saunders)







the earth. The base itself, which signifies Earth, or "land," has three panels picturing a mythical animal called a *kirin*, and three that were left plain for the inscription. Atop this, is a three-dimensional representation of waves and spray, to symbolize the seas and Water. From the center of the base, springs a circular, tapering shaft that supports the lamp proper, and around this coils a Japanese three-clawed dragon, with supernatural flames issuing from its shoulders and flanks. This middle section represents the Air or atmosphere.

Above this, resting on three-dimensional clouds, is the lantern proper, representing the Sky. Around its base is a railing, with floral panels depicting celestial flowers. Then comes the actual lamp, with a lattice panel covering each of its six sides, having enough openwork to allow the light to shine through. Three of the panels have at their centers the *mon* or crest of the Tokugawa Family, formed by three mallow leaves touching at their tips, inside a narrow circular frame.

The lantern is topped by an elaborate roof, representing the canopy of Heaven, resting on an intricate supporting structure simulating wood bracketing. The main beams supporting the brackets proper have embossed panels showing a tiger on the ground and a dragon among clouds above it. These opposing animals symbolize the *Yin* and the *Yang*, which in Old Chinese philosophy—passed on to Japan—were the two main forces in Nature, expressed in Darkness and Light, Passive and Active, Negative and Positive, Female and Male. (In China, these were more usually represented with a circle bisected by an S-curve, one side of the wavy line being black, the other side red—or white; but the Chinese also used the tiger and the dragon to illustrate this concept.)

Over the main aperture of the lamp is a figure in high relief representing a sacred mythical bird (*ho-o*), often described as the phoenix, and considered as a creature of especially good omen.

The ends of projecting rafters, under the roof, terminate in the heads of elephants—by an artist who had doubtless never seen the real animal. Elephant heads were particularly popular in the architecture of this period, and were also used on some of the gates of the first Tokugawa Mausoleum in Nikko, north of Tokyo.

The six-sided roof itself has on it six dragons, whose bodies curl down the ridges between the roof sections, and out of their mouths jut curling tongues from which hang wind bells. (These bells differ slightly on the two lanterns, probably because one complete set of them was lost and had to be replaced.)

One of the lanterns has, on the front panel of its roof, an open circle resting upon clouds. When the lamp was lit the light shining out through this would represent the Sun. The second lamp has, in the same place, a crescent riding on clouds, to represent the moon. This was the only real difference between the two lanterns when they were originally made. Three other roof panels display the Tokugawa crest in open-work, so that they would be quite conspicuous when light shone out through them.

Atop the roof, as a finial, is a flaming pearl to symbolize Divine Truth, which is above all things and yet pervades all. The three tongues of flame climbing its sides divide it into three portions to represent the *Triratna* or triple jewel, symbolic of the Buddhist Trinity.<sup>3</sup>

Such lanterns are rather common in Japan, but it is unusual to find outside that country such large ones, so rich in sculptured detail. The University is indeed fortunate to have them.

---

<sup>3</sup>Editor's note: Masaki Shibata of Hokkaido, Japan, has also done considerable study of the symbolism of the lantern and of the Tokugawa family. Only a fraction of his elaborate notes has been translated into English.



# *China and Japan: An Analysis of Conflict*

LEE W. FARNSWORTH\*

## I

Since the end of World War II there has been a constant series of conflicts involving both large and small nations. I propose here to analyze a conflict which occurred prior to this, hoping that it lies far enough in the past to allow perspective and objectivity, but not so far back that it becomes irrelevant to an understanding of current conflict. Obviously we need to know more about causes of conflict if we are ever to reduce it effectively, much as a scientist must discover the various microscopic viruses in order to successfully combat disease. Therefore, the basic purpose here is to bring to light certain political hypotheses of the causes of conflict in the search for principles or concepts that will at least indicate under what conditions international conflict will likely occur.

The analysis will be made on the basis of certain established principles of international politics: the sovereignty of nation-states; the problem of overlapping national interests, particularly as differentiated between vital and secondary interests; the manifestation of power as the major factor in international conflict; and the necessity to understand the law of change.

I have tried to show in this paper that conflict is more than the result of a specific incident which "insulted" a nation's honor: it includes a series of "causes." Unfortunately, there is also a series of "results." It is not exaggeration to say that the War in the Pacific, the Chinese Civil War, the Korean War, and the current crisis in Southeast Asia are only some of the results of the conflict under study. As Secretary of Defense Robert McNamara has so aptly said, wars only give us time to determine how to avoid future wars.

---

\*Dr. Farnsworth is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Brigham Young University and Director of the new Asian Research Institute.

## II

A survey of the traditional relations of East Asia will show that China has long been on the defensive, with demands always directed inward. Now, paradoxically, that great nation is reversing history.

*China and the Powers*

Beginning with Russia in the mid-Seventeenth Century, demands for treaties and trade were made upon China. Her response was haughty and weak. Great Britain led off the ensuing assaults in the Opium War, which resulted in the series of unequal treaties which the Celestial Kingdom was forced to accept. These treaties were to seriously infringe upon Chinese sovereignty by forcing the opening of ports, ceding territory (Hong Kong), charging indemnities, controlling tariffs, establishing extraterritoriality, and yielding special Western enclaves and spheres of interest. The more rights and privileges given, the more need of Western power to protect those rights.

By 1900, the Germans had mining and railway concessions in Shantung; the Russians were building railways from Siberia to Manchuria; the French were working mines in Kwangtung, Kwangsi, and Yunnan, and were building a railroad towards these provinces through China's former vassal-state of Indo-China; the British had leased Weihaiwei and Kowloon and had issued a warning that the Yangtze valley was her special area of interest; and the Americans were preparing the first note on the Open Door policy.

*Japan and the Powers*

Like China's, Japan's first modern contact with the West resulted in a forced acceptance of an unequal treaty. After more than two centuries of isolation, Commodore Perry's Black Ships in 1854 convinced Japan of the efficacy of opening up limited trade and coaling stations.

Whereas China had rejected Western technological advances, Japan adopted them in conformity with the Charter Oath of 1868 proclaimed by the young Emperor Meiji that "knowledge and learning shall be sought for throughout the world in order to establish the foundation of the Empire." Japanese missions soon began to spread throughout the world in search of new ways and techniques to strengthen the polity of Japan.



Japan was soon dissatisfied with being the unequal partner and sought revision of the treaties. Although the United States was sympathetic, it was only the British who could lead the way, which they did only in 1894 after being satisfied that Japan had modernized her legal codes and courts.

These events were humiliating and degrading to Japan. She had been bombarded by punitive squadrons, missionaries had been forced on her, and her own concessions won from China had been wrested from her, only to fall into the hands of Russia a few years later. These conditions in Japan (and eventually in China) were bound to bring forth a national reaction among a people who had so recently seen themselves as a nation for the first time. As Japan's relations with China are surveyed, it will become obvious where these anxieties thus produced were to be directed.

### *China and Japan*

In 1871 Japan became the first Asian power to enter into a treaty with China. The treaty of peace and amity gave Japan commercial rights in part similar to those enjoyed by Westerners. Japan was not only no longer a vassal to the Middle Kingdom; she even obtained a greatly modified form of extraterritoriality, although she failed to obtain the usual, for Western nations, most-favored nation clause. Japan was on her way to demonstrating her equality, albeit at the expense of China.

In the next three decades Japan intensified this drive for equality. In 1874 a punitive mission was sent to Formosa because of the murder of several Okinawan sailors by aborigines. This mission not only challenged China's sovereign claim on Formosa, but also asserted Japan's protective sovereignty over Okinawa and the Ryukyus, previously considered as under the suzerainty of China. In 1876 Japan recognized another Chinese vassal-state, Korea, as an independent state with the "same sovereign rights" as those of Japan.

In the 1880's Japan imposed Western-style indemnities on Korea for Japanese deaths in that country. In 1894, one week after the signing of the equality treaty with Great Britain, Japanese seized the royal palace in Seoul and overthrew the government of the king. The result was war with China.

The Treaty of Shimonoseki was signed April 17, 1895, and included indemnities and land concessions. Although a tri-



partite intervention of Russia, Germany, and France forced Japan to return the Liaotung peninsula to China (only to be taken by Russia in 1898), Japan had manifest her equality with the West by humiliating the giant of Asia.

*China in the Early Twentieth Century*

The patterns established in the Nineteenth Century continued into the Twentieth. The treaty powers, having carved China into their respective spheres of interest, now sought to stabilize the status quo by proclaiming through the United States that China's territorial and administrative integrity must be protected, and declared the Open Door to be the guiding principle for "equal and impartial trade with all parts of the Chinese Empire."

The Japanese were not satisfied with the status quo, however, and after joining in a treaty of alliance with the mighty Great Britain in 1902, proceeded to attack and defeat Russia in 1904, obtaining her spheres of interest in North China, Manchuria, and North Korea. Furthermore, Japan having annexed Korea in 1910 now saw herself not only as equal with the West in China, but as having a pre-eminent interest. The Japanese political scientist Masamichi Royama wrote that although Japan cooperated generally with the Western powers, "it was nevertheless tacitly understood by the majority of the Japanese people that she had special relations with the Asiatic continent, upon which she depended for her economic security and future prosperity, no matter what policies the Western powers might pursue."<sup>1</sup>

Japan's vital interests on the mainland—for relief of population pressures, obtaining raw materials, and satisfying a growing power drive—reached its first peak in the Twenty-One Demands of January 18, 1915. Had China accepted these demands *in toto*, it would have meant the yielding of sovereignty to Japan. As it was, China agreed wholly to nine of the demands, partially to five, and rejected seven. This particularly strengthened Japan's influence and control of Northeast China and Manchuria.

A contemporary Japanese apologist pointed out that Japan's sphere of interest was minute compared to others. He argued that the lessons of imperialism were learned from the West:

---

<sup>1</sup>Masamichi Royama, *Foreign Policy of Japan: 1914-1939* (Tokyo: Japanese Council, Institute of Pacific Affairs, 1941), p. 6.

Remember that it was not Japan that originated the idea of sphere of interest. It was because European powers were bent upon dividing China into so many spheres of influence that Japan was obliged to step in and take such measures as might be necessary to safeguard her position in the Far East that might arise from the unhappy condition of China.<sup>2</sup>

Kawakami was especially biting towards the protests from the United States and the American people:

The trouble with the average American is that he permits the non-essential details of Japan's recent diplomatic negotiations with China to obscure the main point upon which Japan's policy hinges. That point is her desire to become the dominant factor in the molding of China's destiny. Call it an Asiatic super-Monroe Doctrine if you will. The name is immaterial. The important thing is that Japan, the only Asiatic nation efficient enough to escape the yoke of European domination, is aspiring to the leadership of other Asiatic nations. To me this is a laudable ambition, with which America, whose traditional policy has been to keep Europe at arm's length, must sympathize. Once this point is frankly conceded, even the apparently obnoxious Group V of the Japanese Demands is easily understood.<sup>3</sup>

Though there were protests from the West in response to cries for relief from the Chinese government, none were more than moralistic utterances. America's Open Door policy apparently was the same because Acting Secretary of State Lansing informed the American legation in Peking in 1914 that "it would be quixotic in the extreme to allow the question of China's territorial integrity to entangle the United States in international difficulties."<sup>4</sup>

In the 1920's the Japanese yielded most of the privileges thus won back to China in return for international recognition as a world power. Included in the various treaties signed by Japan and the West were guarantees of China's sovereignty similar to those of the earlier Open Door Notes. Japan also joined in signing the ill-fated Pact of Paris which renounced war as an instrument of policy. In this case, however, Japan

---

<sup>2</sup>K. K. Kawakami, "Japan and the Open Door," *Century*, XCIII (December 1916), p. 284.

<sup>3</sup>*Ibid.*, p. 287.

<sup>4</sup>*Foreign Relations of the United States*, 1914 (Supplement), (Washington, D.C.: United States Government Printing Office, 1928), p. 190.



took special note that Manchuria was within its sphere of defense and was still a vital interest.<sup>5</sup>

*Asia and the West in the Twentieth Century*

Although the early Twentieth Century seemed to be moving from a state of tension to a period of calm, there were unseen but dangerous currents which more than offset the possibility that the utopian hopes of the "decade of treaties" would reach fruition. Chief among these was the reaction of the Western nations, notably that of the land of freedom and equality, the United States, to the immigration of Orientals.

Beginning with the Chinese Exclusion Acts, continuing through the head tax on Chinese in California (declared unconstitutional) and the sharp limitations of Japanese by Washington and California legislatures, and culminating in the 1924 Exclusion Acts, the policies were ill-designed to promote international conciliation. A Japanese scholar later noted that Japan had accepted its responsibilities in the Washington treaties while the United States responded with the Exclusion Acts. "No act on the part of a foreign Power could have given a stronger argument to Japanese conservatives for continental expansion."<sup>6</sup> These same treaties were used later by the militarists as proof of the inability of civilian government to exercise sound judgment in protecting Japan's vital interests.

As if a portent of the future, despite the fact Japan was now showing greater respect for the growing independence of China, the failure of the Japanese government to send troops to defend her citizens at Nanking during an uprising there in 1927 led to the collapse of the General Baron Tanaka cabinet, even though no foreigners, including Japanese, were injured at that time. The successor government did not fare much better, although it did carry out a more "positive" policy towards China. In 1928, the Manchurian warlord, Chang Tso-lin, who was considered to be a puppet for Japanese ambitions, bolted to the Nationalist Chinese when he failed to receive Japanese aid in expeditions against the Nationalists. Whereupon, the Japanese "young officers" in Manchuria plotted Chang Tso-lin's death, hoping his son, Chang Hsueh-liang would be more amenable to control; he was not. A crisis re-

---

<sup>5</sup>Royama, p. 55.

<sup>6</sup>Tatsuji Takeuchi, "The Background of the Sino-Japanese Crisis," *Amerasia*, June 1938, p. 186.

sulted in Tsinan in North China and on April 19, 1928, Japanese troops landed there to protect Japanese property and residents, and to keep Chiang Kai-shek from the void of power which would be "detrimental to Japan's interests there."<sup>7</sup> The liberals in Japan were incensed that the Japanese were risking a fight against the Chinese Nationalist army "for the sake of some remote apprehension about her future position in Manchuria."<sup>8</sup> With the withdrawal of the troops on May 2, 1929, it was only a short time before the government fell again under conservative pressure.

The new Chinese government further alienated the Japanese with a new tariff schedule which imposed heavy duties on Japanese goods. "Under these circumstances," reported Takeuchi, "liberal elements found it extremely difficult to convince the people whose lot was becoming progressively worse, that continuation of a liberal policy would be beneficial to the country."<sup>9</sup> The world depression made Japan's Chinese investments even more vital to her economic survival. By 1931 her investments in China were second only to those of Great Britain, but by percentage there was no comparison: as a percentage of total overseas investments British investments in China were 5.9 percent, whereas those of Japan represented 81.9 percent.<sup>10</sup>

### III

#### *Japan as a Participant in Conflict*

The strict Japanese hierarchical relationships were such that they could cause the nation to succumb to conflict caused by a few well-placed leaders. There is a proper station for each person in the society and respecting that condition is what brings social tranquility. This requires a high degree of discipline and loyalty, particularly in relation to the Emperor who had become the focal point of all loyalty. Ruth Benedict, in her classical study of Japanese culture, pointed out how the hierarchical system was transferred to international relations by the Japanese government's practice of introducing international notes with the idea that the basic aim of her policy was

---

<sup>7</sup>Royama, p. 43.

<sup>8</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>9</sup>Takeuchi, p. 188.

<sup>10</sup>*Ibid.*



to enable "each nation to find its proper place in the world."<sup>11</sup> In the hierarchy, China had strangely enough become the backward young brother who needed assistance in finding his proper station.

We have already seen that economically Japan's need for sources of raw materials for industry and markets for finished goods made the loss of these sources dangerous for her economic survival. Takeuchi says that the high tariffs of the West (33.3% in "free trade" Great Britain and 41.5% in the United States) gave rise "to a new feeling of desperation among Japanese in their struggle for civilized existence. Herein lies the basic cause for Japan's expansionist tendency."<sup>12</sup>

Within Japan a number of patriotic societies, such as the *Amur River Society* (erroneously called the *Black Dragon Society*), whose name indicates the demand to extend Japanese influence into North China, came into being. The fanaticism of these societies increased to such an extent that it led in November 1930 to the shooting of a Prime Minister (he died eight months later). On May 15, 1932, another Prime Minister was assassinated, bringing to an end the few and futile years of party government. In 1936 more assassinations were carried out, and the criminals became national heroes because their acts were intended solely to protest the place of Japan and its Emperor.

A final factor in Japan's warmaking potential was her *image* of China. The official image of China, as depicted by the Chief Delegate to the League of Nations, was that although Japan had in 1922 envisioned a peaceful and unified China, the China of 1932 was one of "disunion" and "anarchy" with the militarist struggles threatening the core of China itself. "Communism," he declared, "has deeply entrenched itself in the heart of the country," and, "the habit of civil strife has become engrained and endemic." As for the people, they "are misled, much terrorized and much misrepresented," and "their main desire is to enjoy in peace and quiet the results of their industry."<sup>13</sup> The conclusion reached by the

---

<sup>11</sup>Ruth Benedict, *The Chrysanthemum and the Sword* (New York: Houghton-Mifflin Co., 1946), p. 44. This is an excerpt from the note to the United States of December 7, 1941.

<sup>12</sup>Takeuchi, pp. 184-85.

<sup>13</sup>Japan, Delegation to the League of Nations, *The Manchurian Question* (Geneva, 1933), pp. 12-13.

Japanese was that China was badly in need of an elder brother to help straighten out her internal confusion.

*China as a Participant in Conflict*

The conditions in China, though more unsettled, were not quite as complex as those in Japan. It is certain, however, that levels of tension capable of producing external conflict were present, albeit in a rather negative sense.

After centuries of a stereotyped form of Confucianism, with its ancient and rigid patterns of social relationships, China was in a woeful condition of upheaval following the coming of the West. The adjustments from archaic ideas to a modern view of the world and practical education was slow and painful. With the fall of the last dynasty in 1911, control of the country degenerated into two rival governments and numerous areas controlled by warlords. The people were not sure of any authority except that of the family, and the various movements toward national unity received little grassroots support.

In spite of the efforts of Sun Yat-sen, Yuan Shih-k'ai, and Chiang Kai-shek, "the plight of the peasantry in the decade after 1915 became so wretched that a truly revolutionary atmosphere was developing in the countryside."<sup>14</sup> The Nationalist triumph eventually brought a modicum of control and a few reforms, but it could not gain full control, especially through democratic means, and was forced to establish a tutelary government. The Nationalist Party, established on communist party lines, thanks to the Soviet advisers to Sun Yat-sen, became the basic decision-making organ. Still the internal political structure remained so corrupt and weak as to almost invite interference.

Militarily, the prime aim of Chiang was to suppress the communist soviet areas of China while dealing diplomatically with Japan over North China and Manchuria. Perhaps this was all he could do. The Lytton Commission, which investigated Japan's attack on Manchuria, reported that the local army in Manchuria was generally independent of Nanking and its officers controlled all public offices. "Nepotism, corruption, and maladministration continued to be the unavoidable consequences of the state of affairs . . . . This state of affairs, however, was not peculiar to Manchuria, as similar or even

---

<sup>14</sup>Fred Greene, *The Far East* (New York: Rinehart, 1957), p. 112.



worse conditions existed in other parts of China."<sup>15</sup> Even Chiang, undoubtedly in an effort to arouse his people, noted in 1934 that from the standpoint of military preparedness "we are not fit to be called a modern state."<sup>16</sup> Furthermore, he cited Mencius' wisdom that "a kingdom must first smite itself, and then others will smite it," in warning that further weakening of China would invite further external encroachment.<sup>17</sup>

As for the image of the opponent, it was ambivalent. On the one hand, China saw Japan as a barbaric and uncivilized upstart challenging a superior in the hierarchy of nations. On the other hand, the Chinese also viewed Japan as a progressive Oriental nation successfully countering the Western imperialists. As one Chinese writer noted, Japan is like "a man who has made a lot of money in a short time, but does not know how to spend it." Yes, Japan has built up vast organizations, he asserts, and because of this she "claims the right to be considered among the first rank of civilized nations." But, he concludes, "Japan today is not civilized—she is merely 'mechanized' . . . ."<sup>18</sup>

#### IV

##### *The Beginning of Conflict*

In the spring of 1931 a Captain Nakamura of the Japanese Army wandered into Inner Mongolia from Manchuria. He was dressed as a civilian and apparently carried documents variously identifying himself as a doctor, a commercial trader and a soldier. Nakamura managed to get himself killed in a small village, apparently over a gambling debt. Japan immediately demanded both justice and honor. The Chinese were slow and evasive, but finally met the demands of the Japanese on September 17, 1931.<sup>19</sup>

The following night, despite these actions of the Chinese, the Japanese military machine went into action, and with a minimum of resistance occupied the city of Mukden and half a dozen other strategic points in south Manchuria—a move

<sup>15</sup>Japan, Delegation to the League of Nations, pp. 28-29.

<sup>16</sup>David N. Rowe, *China Among the Powers* (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1945), p. 13.

<sup>17</sup>Chiang Kai-shek, *China's Foreign Relations* (Nanking: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 1935), pp. 4-5.

<sup>18</sup>Bruno Lasker and Agnes Roman, *Propaganda from China and Japan* (New York: American Council, Institute of Pacific Relations, 1938), p. 93.

<sup>19</sup>American Council, Institute of Pacific Relations, *Conflict in the Far East* (New York: 1932), pp. 11ff.



which even surprised the Tokyo government, which had been pursuing a policy of conciliatory diplomacy. Faced with a *fait accompli*, however, the government could do nothing except publicly support the move, "while privately struggling to regain control of the destiny of Japan."<sup>20</sup>

The spark that ignited the conflagration was an explosion which cracked the fishplate at the junction of two rails on the South Manchurian Railway—damage so slight as not to even slow down a train passing the spot shortly afterward.<sup>21</sup>

By January of 1932, Japan had advanced to the Great Wall and controlled more than half of Manchuria and had attacked Shanghai as a result of anti-Japanese riots and boycotts there, killing thousands of Chinese. Manchoukuo, under the ex-Emperor Henry Pu Yi, had been proclaimed in Manchuria.<sup>22</sup>

This pattern of an attack following almost impossible demands continued through the entire period of 1931-37, finally escalating from the level of "incidents" to all out war.

#### *Claims and Demands*

Japan claimed at the League of Nations that chaos in China was "endangering international relations." Japan's actions were to "prevent the development of war," and were "therefore in conformity with the League of Nations."<sup>23</sup> Furthermore, Japan had "a special position" in China as a result of "exceptional treaty rights" *plus* "the natural consequences which flow from her close neighborhood and geographical situation and from her historical associations." Although Japan still did not have "a general and vexatious right of intervention" it did have a position "in which she must defend herself with uncommon energy against military attack."<sup>24</sup> The Japanese delegation pointed out how even the Lytton Commission had admitted Japan's vital interests in Manchuria when it reported:

There is probably nowhere in the world an exact parallel to this situation, no example of a country enjoying in the

---

<sup>20</sup>*Ibid.*, p. 13.

<sup>21</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>22</sup>Interestingly enough, Japan waited nearly a year before recognizing the new puppet regime, probably in anticipation of another nation leading the way.

<sup>23</sup>Japan, Delegation to the League of Nations, p. 7.

<sup>24</sup>*Ibid.*, p. 30.

territory of a neighbouring State such extensive economic and administrative privileges.<sup>25</sup>

When someone suggested that there be a measure of international control over Manchuria, the Japanese made it clear that this was contrary to their vital interest.

In this connection, let me state clearly once and for all, that the Japanese people will, for reasons too patent for me to feel necessary to explain, oppose any such attempt in Manchuria. You can be sure of that. We do not mean to defy the world at all; it is only our right.<sup>26</sup>

Japan claimed, even after occupying Canton, that her desire to establish a "New Order in Asia" was based on the firm conviction that it, and it alone, "will offer the real solution for the age-long problem: independent, strong and prosperous China."<sup>27</sup>

China, for her part, merely demanded that there be no violation of her sovereignty, with economic cooperation "based upon the principles of equality and reciprocity," according to Chiang, who was willing to acknowledge Japan's natural interest in Manchuria. "What we have been striving for incessantly is nothing more than our existence as a nation and co-existence with other countries in the family of nations."<sup>28</sup>

The growing attacks of Japan led to a brief unification of China to "Resist Japan and Save the Country." Japan countered by sending more troops into North China, resulting in the Chinese announcement to the world that its vital interests were still being violated and further appeasement was at an end. Chiang is quoted as follows:

The safety of Lukouchiao is a problem involving the existence of the nation as a whole, whether the incident can be amicably settled comes within the comprehension of the term "limit of endurance. . . ." If we abandon as much as an inch of our territory to the invaders without attempting to defend it, then we shall be guilty of an unpardonable sin against our race.<sup>29</sup>

## V

It is recognized that part of the failure to deter conflict was the failure of the available international machinery to

<sup>25</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>26</sup>*Ibid.*, p. 13.

<sup>27</sup>Royama, p. xi.

<sup>28</sup>Chiang, pp. 6-8.

<sup>29</sup>Royama, p. 117.



uphold its covenant to protect nations from unprovoked attack, and Japan warned that she would violently oppose any attempt to do so. The roots of the conflict, however, are found elsewhere.

National pride of Japan had much to do with Japan's attacks. Exclusion acts in both the United States and Australia led Professor Takeuchi to remark:

You have closed all doors to our men and goods elsewhere and yet insist on the Open Door only in China. We have a population that is increasing at the rate of nearly one million a year, and they must be fed. . . . Rightly or wrongly the Japanese people are not convinced that the world has been fair with them.<sup>30</sup>

Japan as a sovereign nation was unwilling to allow international interference in her desire to protect what she viewed as her vital interests. She exerted her power to do so and, not meeting resistance, continued on the road to conquest.

China also sensed that her vital interests were in jeopardy from Japan, but lacking sufficient power had to appease Japan's demands, who in turn exerted more power to make the position even more secure.

Just as Japan had announced her intent to fight for her vital interests, so China also had to fight eventually or lose her sovereignty and nationhood. Clearly, the vital interests of China and Japan had come into conflict and war was the inevitable result. Japan knew the consequences, because each time she made a demand which violated China's vital interests reinforcements were usually on the way. All of the sugar-coated moral underpinnings of saving China and arranging the hierarchy of nations in true perspective, could not hide the fact that Japan was committing aggression.

Finally, there was widespread neglect of the law of change. The West failed to recognize until too late how powerful Japan had become and how interdependent economically the world had become, despite depression. It further failed to realize the dangers of racial discrimination in international relations.

Both Japan and the West failed to recognize the changes that were going on within China. The new noises of nation-

---

<sup>30</sup>Takeuchi, pp. 190-91.

alism and desire for international recognition, so recently heard in Japan itself, were ignored as if they were mere impolite stomach rumblings. Japan was thirty years too late as far as accomplishing her ends in China were concerned.

The contest was inevitable, as was the eventual outcome. The conflict was a real education to the world, but as is so often the case, the lessons have not been remembered. International organization is still only a facade behind which the sovereign states vie for position with their power. The law of change is consistently ignored and challenges of overlapping vital interests are everywhere upon us. We wonder if another broken rail can be the "cause" of another conflict in a day when the arsenals of nations contain nuclear weapons—weapons which the awakened giant, so recently abused, now possesses.



# *The Postwar Appeal of Communism in Malaya, Vietnam and the Philippines*

RAY COLE HILLAM\*

From 1948 to the mid-fifties Malaya, Vietnam and the Philippine Islands were seriously threatened by Communist-led insurrections. The constituted authorities in Malaya and the Philippines were able eventually to suppress the insurgents, but in Vietnam, the French were less successful. The challenge of these insurgents was partly the result of the dynamic appeal of Communism in these three varied but similar revolutionary situations.

## *What Did Communism Seem to Offer?*

Frustration was the raw material of the post-war insurrections in the Philippines, Malaya and Vietnam. It mattered little whether those who revolted were Filipino peasants, Vietnamese intellectuals or Chinese plantation workers in Malaya. Frustration tied them all into a brotherhood of revolt. For a variety of reasons many turned to Communism.

For some Communism provided a simple and often acceptable explanation for their deplorable environment and lack of opportunity. According to Communist pronouncements, was it not the Western imperialists who seized their countries, transforming them into colonies for purposes of economic exploitation? Was it not the West which was responsible for the growth of famines and epidemics, for the mass expropriation of the land of the native population and for the inhumane conditions of labor?<sup>1</sup> In Vietnam, was it not the French who deceitfully raised their standards of "Liberty, Equality and

---

\*Dr. Hillam is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Brigham Young University.

<sup>1</sup> Jane Degras (ed.), *The Communist International, 1919-1943: Documents* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1960), II, 535.

Fraternity" while violating the independence and equality of the Vietnamese?<sup>2</sup>

In addition, Western imperialism became a convenient scapegoat. Since self-judgment is difficult and sometimes painful, it was easy to transfer the responsibility for political and economic underdevelopment to factors difficult to control, such as colonialism. Whether justified or not, many assumed that their miserable conditions and their inability to do much about them were a result of Western imperialism.

Many were receptive to Communism because it portrayed itself as a decisive enemy of Western imperialism and the champion of national independence. This portrayal enabled the Communists to pose as genuine nationalists. For instance, Ho Chi-minh of the Communist Vietminh repeatedly made conciliatory statements to collaborate tactically with non-Communists in order to win popular support. His militant opposition of French imperialism and close identification with the movement for Vietnamese independence enabled him to emerge as the most decisive and active champion of Vietnamese nationalism. In Malaya and the Philippines the Communist insurgents made every effort to champion the cause of anti-imperialism and to identify themselves with the cause of nationalism.<sup>3</sup>

Many also felt Communism provided an effective strategy for seizing power. The strategy, as it developed in China under the leadership of Mao Tse-tung, caught the imagination of the Vo Nguyen Giaps of Vietnam, the Chen Pengs of Malaya and the Luis Tarucs of the Philippines. This attraction was not only stimulated by the success of Mao's strategy in China but also by the prospects of achieving personal power.

Finally, Communism also seemed to offer a dynamic program for rapid self-directed industrialization and modernization. Many reacted to the material achievements of Russia much as the Chinese reacted. Long before the Communists seized power in China, Mao said:

---

<sup>2</sup>Quoted in the Communist Declaration of Independence for Vietnam, September 2, 1945. See Allan B. Cole (ed.), *Conflict in Indochina and International Repercussions: A Documentary History 1945-1955* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1956), pp. 19-21.

<sup>3</sup>The failure of the movements in Malaya and Vietnam were partly a result of the inability of the Communist to exploit the anti-colonial and national attitudes of the people.



There is much in common or similar between the situation in China and pre-revolutionary Russia. Feudal opposition was the same. Economic and cultural backwardness was common to both countries. . . . The October Revolution (in Russia) helped the progressive elements of the world, and of China as well . . . in determining the fate of the country. . . . The conclusion was reached that we must advance along the path taken by the Russians.<sup>4</sup>

The "progressive" approach of the Russians, when adopted and "perfected" by the Chinese, was particularly attractive to the frustrated intellectuals of Vietnam, Malaya and the Philippines.

*Who Found Communism Appealing?*

Many in the West assumed that the appeal of Communism in Asia was greatest among the peasant class. The appeal of Communism was greater among the intellectuals, who in turn, usually identified peasant demands with their own political objectives. They acted as the intermediary between the Communist movement and the manifestations of peasant unrest. The Communist appeal usually filtered through to the peasants by first becoming the political outlook of the intellectuals. It was the intellectuals who provided the ideas, leadership and organization to give peasant unrest its direction.

The students were also receptive to Communism. Highly impressionable and closely associated with the intellectuals, many were enthusiastic followers of the new "wave of the future." They became the transmission belt of revolutionary ideas from the intellectuals to the urban and peasant classes. In Communist-controlled areas they were often assigned as cadre to supervise reconstruction and reform projects.

The broad base for the Communist movements was usually provided by the peasants. Lenin, in speaking to a group of Asian Communists, said it was imperative to apply Communist theory and practice under conditions where the peasant is the primary class of the masses.<sup>5</sup> Since China had few proletariat, Mao Tse-tung had to rely on the peasant. Winning the peasant support proved crucial to the Communist victory in China. In the Philippines, the Communist leaders received their principal

<sup>4</sup>Mao Tse-tung, *On People's Democratic Rule* (New York: New Century Publishers, 1950), pp. 2-4.

<sup>5</sup>V. I. Lenin, "Report Before the Second All-Russian Representatives Congress of the Communist Organizations of the Eastern Peoples," *Works* (Moscow, 1932) XXIV, 542-51.

support from the peasants. While less important in Vietnam, the peasants were a significant factor in the success of the Communist Vietminh.

The urban population, which formed a broad base of Communist support in Malaya and Vietnam, was also receptive to Communism. In Vietnam, almost half of the Vietminh guerrillas were recruited from the urban population.<sup>6</sup> In Malaya, most of the Communist guerrillas were urban Chinese. Their movement, in turn, was largely supported by the *Min Yuen*, a secret organization receiving much of its support from the urban population.

Since Communism is so closely allied with nationalism, some members of the business and landlord classes were deceived into accepting the revolutionary objectives of Communism. Indeed some of the Communist elite came from the well-to-do or aristocratic classes. As a rule, few were receptive, but some yielded to the pressure of a "new democracy." With mere passive support from some members of the business and landlord classes, the Communists came close to achieving their ideal, a "United Front" of all classes.

*Why Was the Intellectual Attracted to Communism?*

A Western education made the intellectual particularly vulnerable to Communism because it condemned him to a form of separate existence. He became accustomed to Western ways and had little interest in returning to the kind of life unbefitting his new status. Many acquired a split personality. One concluded that:

We are habitual schizophrenes, divided within ourselves and resentful of this division. This resentment may flare up into hostility, and may turn us in hatred against what we have loved (the West), as it had made us unwhole for life.<sup>7</sup>

The inability to find their proper place in society produced a reservoir of frustrated intellectuals who in a state of restlessness were searching for an answer to their dilemma. Since many were sensitive to the need for national independence and the achievement of an economic and social revolution, and since many had developed an anti-capitalistic bias and a convic-

---

<sup>6</sup>George K. Tanham, *Communist Revolutionary Warfare: The Vietminh in Indochina* (New York: Frederick A. Praeger, 1961), p. 58.

<sup>7</sup>Han Su-yin, *A Many Splendored Thing* (Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1952), pp. 298-299.



tion that state-sponsored programs were the only answer to the enormous problems of underdevelopment, they saw in Communism a solution to the future and, perhaps more important, a means of personally directing the future.

Many intellectuals, on the other hand, had mixed feelings about Communism, but they were willing to tolerate its undesirable aspects with the hope of rapid industrialization and eventual democratization. In order to meet the challenges of underdevelopment and to "catch up," they were convinced that they must telescope centuries into decades. While some preferred methods of consent, the urgency of the matter tempted them to accept the more rapid route of coercion. They justified the latter on the basis that the future justified the present. In the words of one intellectual:

. . . Many of the best, the more honest among the intellectuals . . . chose. They forsook individual, personal freedom for a larger self than their own, although it meant a control, and a discipline stern and repugnant to a part of them. They chose what might overwhelm them, not through cowardice, nor through opportunism, but because they had a social conscience, they loved their people, and they had a deep need to be whole again, unfrustrated in service to a land so much in need of them. They chose against themselves, renouncing the small liberty of one, so insignificant-seeming when faced with the spiritual challenge of communism in lands where freedom from hunger has never been known. They relinquished a difference which had made them alien among their own people for a shared oppression which would free their energies for the good of mankind.<sup>8</sup>

#### *Why Was Communism Appealing to the Student?*

Students were among the first to join any new movement for change. Since they were young, ambitious, adventurous, outspoken and forward-looking, they found it easy to cultivate high political, economic and social ideals. Unlike their elders, they could afford all these privileges because they had relatively little to lose.

They had acquired a deep sense of ambivalence toward all things western and a criticism of things indigenous. They reacted against traditional parental control, arguing that their elders were too old-fashioned to understand the world of modern politics. In Malaya, one student had the following to say:

---

<sup>8</sup>*Ibid.*

My father was a very old person and naturally had no political ideas. . . . When I was a young child, I used to obey my parents, but as I got older, I realized they knew very little about affairs and that only young people understood politics.<sup>9</sup>

Since they had been raised in a political atmosphere of violence, many were convinced that hostility and aggressiveness were characteristic of political activities and that physical violence was likely to be the final arbiter. One ex-Communist youth said: "My father was a quiet man. . . . I used to like to argue a lot and fight with people. That is why I was interested in politics." Another said:

My father knew nothing about politics. If he ever heard any fights or quarrels, he would get afraid. I never heard him discuss political questions or argue with people. He never swore at people and therefore I know he never belonged to any party or association. He was a person who was afraid of affairs.<sup>10</sup>

This attitude toward politics made it easy for the young to accept the violent expressions of Marxism-Leninism. When the Communist Party assumed the most active and dynamic force in the community, the students were impressed. Because of their unrest they were inclined to hitch their ambitions to any dynamic, forward-looking political movements which posed as the symbol of resistance to things both Western and indigenous.

Many were swept up by the "patriotic" enthusiasm of the "new order." The passionate idealism of the "new order" expressed "with heart-stirring words, with love of country and giving purpose to living, making death negligible, dazzling today with songs of glorious tomorrows" genuinely inspired the hearts and minds of the young.

In some cases where emotionalism for the "new order" did not win their support, the Communist concept of leadership by an educated elite would do the trick. The prospects of achieving positions of leadership and responsibility in the "new order" were attractive to those students who were restless and anxious about their future.

---

<sup>9</sup>Incian Pye, *Guerrilla Communism in Malaya: Its Social and Political Meaning* (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1956), p. 167.

<sup>10</sup>*Ibid.*, p. 168.



*Why Did the Peasant Go Along with the Communists?*

The vast majority of the peasants were landless and alienated by landlordism. This alienation was a result of abusive treatment and resentment. Also many peasants learned to resent the negative and indifferent attitude of their government. The Communists, exploiting this situation, agitated and politically organized them with promises of land and an improved status once the new "peasant" government took over.

The peasants, however, were rarely moved by ideological arguments. In the Philippines, only a minority of those who joined the Communist movement were influenced by Communist ideology.<sup>11</sup> Many were moved by such simple slogans as "land for the landless." In Vietnam, some simply waited to see who was to win before they made any commitment. They cared little about the ideological question nor did they understand it. They wanted to belong to the future and would support the faction which seemed to be winning.

Some peasants, however, had no choice. They were either tricked or forced to join the movement. One peasant youth told how he was "invited" by the guerrillas to assist them in carrying their supplies into the jungle. By the time they arrived at their destination, he had become "convinced" to remain with them. Another was invited to "volunteer" in exchange for the release of his kidnapped sister. It was hoped that these irregular means of recruiting would soon be forgotten and through proper indoctrination the victims would become effective Communist guerrillas.

When support could not be won through subtle techniques of persuasion and deception, the Communists often resorted to more drastic means of striking fear into the peasant masses. The assassination of government officials and village leaders became a common objective, and citizens who collaborated with the government were marked for torture and assassination. The Communists, however, made a genuine effort to gain popular support through persuasion. Often they backed up their promises by initiating reform, restraining the abusive conduct of the landlords and in some cases turning the land directly over to the peasants.

---

<sup>11</sup>In interviews conducted among 95 ex-Communist Huks, Alvin H. Scaff concluded that well over half became members without being moved by ideas. Alvin H. Scaff, *The Philippine Answer to Communism* (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1955), p. 116.

Conscious of the importance of popular support, the Communist guerrillas were directed to do everything within their power to befriend and assist the peasants. Even during the most hostile periods of the campaign, they sought their friendship and support. In the Philippines, they were instructed to:

Clean the houses provided by the people. . . . Speak in a friendly tone. . . . Buy and sell things fairly. . . . Return the things we borrow. . . . Pay for the things we destroy. . . . Do not do, and even refuse to do, things which may harm the people. . . . All actions that may encroach upon or harm the people are forbidden. Any offender of this rule will be severely punished. Forcing the people to work for the army is forbidden. Coercion, beating or insulting the people are forbidden. . . . Help the people in plowing, transplanting, harvesting or in cutting wood whenever it does not hinder the actions of the army.<sup>12</sup>

This kind of behavior was often contrasted by the abusive treatment of the peasants by the Philippine constabulary forces or the traditional conduct of Asian military forces.

*Why Was the Urban Class Receptive to Communism?*

The newly urbanized, which included the uprooted people who had not found social and economic security, were often attracted to Communism. They were either lured to the city or driven to it, and in the process they saw the possibilities for a much better life. The obstacles to the achievement of their aspirations, however, led to a high degree of restlessness.

The problem of rapid population growth without industry to absorb the growth was a pressing problem. Since the need for labor did not expand much, the result was low wages and unemployment. It was largely these newly or misplaced urbanized elements, who, dissatisfied with their lot, found their way into front organizations and eventually into the Communist Party.

Many were attracted to Communism because they saw it as a means of gaining security, status, and a formal recognition of their capabilities. Some saw it as the most effective means of "career advancement." One ex-Communist in Malaya said he never thought he could be anything except a worker, but the Party made him dream that he could become an official.<sup>13</sup> In

<sup>12</sup>Luis Taruc, *Born of the People* (New York: International Publishers, 1953), p. 69.

<sup>13</sup>Pye, p. 317.



spite of the difficulties in becoming a member of the Communist Party, the standards were not too high provided a person had some leadership ability as well as dedication. Achievement as a Communist did not require the ability or recognition that is often required in fields of Western knowledge. Since revolutionary zeal became the prime criterion, Communism gave the less educated an attractive opportunity.

*Did Communism Appeal to the Business and Landlord Classes?*

The Communist approach in Asia was adjusted to appeal to the business and landlord classes as well. Theoretically, they were supposed to be the final link in what is commonly referred to as the "United Front." In reality, few were deceived into thinking that they had a future with Communism. The most that was achieved was the softening of their resistance.

Some indication of how their role was visualized was revealed in the following remarks:

As Communists we consider that you are exploiting your workers; but we realize that, at the present stage of China's economic development, such exploitation is unavoidable and even socially useful. What we want is for you to go ahead and develop production as fast as possible and we will do what we can to help you. You may be afraid of what will happen to you and your family when we develop from New Democracy to Socialism. But you need not really be afraid. If you do a really good job in developing your business, and train your children to be first-class technical experts, you will be the obvious people to put in charge of the nationalized enterprises and you may find that you earn more as managers of a socialized enterprise than as owners.<sup>14</sup>

In the early phases of the movement, even the landlord class was given reason to think its members might have a future with Communism. The pacification of both the business and landlord classes was aided by the fact that it was futile for them to resist.

*Summary*

Communism seemed to offer the frustrated Filipino, Vietnamese and Malayan a simple explanation for their conditions and a convenient scapegoat for their dilemma. It posed as genuine nationalism while portraying itself as the most decisive

---

<sup>14</sup>Quoted by Michael Lindsay in O. van der Sprinkel (ed.), *New China* (London, 1950), p. 139.

enemy of Western imperialism and its imposed institutions. Also it provided an effective strategy for seizing power, and finally, it offered a dynamic program for rapid self-directed industrialization.

What Communism seemed to offer was not uniformly appealing to all sectors of the people. The appeal varied according to cultural differences, conditions of development, and even differences within a given class. Generally the appeal was greatest among the most significant element of Asia, the intellectuals. Somewhere down the line, depending on the situation, the students, peasant and urban classes fell into place.

The nature of Communism's appeal was also varied because of the broad scope of the appeal. The intellectuals and students were attracted for related yet quite different reasons. This was likewise true of the peasants and urbanized. Where the intellectuals were impressed with the logic of their position as leaders, the students were impressed with the idealism and emotion of the movement. The peasants and working class were attracted by the simple slogans of "land for the landless" and "jobs for the jobless."

Of course, the attraction to Communism was largely the result of a high level of individual and collective frustration resulting from the aspiration to overcome poverty, ignorance, disease, unemployment, and a measure of other problems associated with underdevelopment and a long experience with colonialism and war. This condition produced a vulnerability to the efforts of the highly motivated Communist revolutionary who seemed to provide the people an escape from their problems.



# *Politics and Religion on China's Mongolian Frontier*

PAUL V. HYER\*

There are many factors involved in the shaping of modern Mongolian history and one of the more significant aspects is that of Japanese influence, which must be considered in the discussion of virtually every field whether political, social, economic, or some other. From the turn of the century, Japanese activity in Mongolia rapidly increased, culminating in Japan's occupation of a large part of Inner Mongolia for a decade and a half from 1931 to 1945.

One thesis proposed here is that a basic tenet of Japanese expansion was the belief that Asian peoples could be influenced or controlled through their traditional religious institutions. A case in point is Japanese policy towards Lamaist Buddhism which had long dominated Mongolian society. The following treatment of Japanese handling of a particular religious institution for the purposes of expansion and control offers insight into the objectives and methods of a significant group of Japanese officials and also offers insight into the ecclesiastical politics of Lamaist Buddhism. This account of a Japanese plan for restoring a new incarnation of the Grand Lama of Urga (now Ulan Bator) or Mongolia is based largely on interviews with individuals concerned and the absence of documentation makes it difficult to check particular details.<sup>1</sup> The events summarized here may be the last, but not the least intriguing chapter in the four-hundred year history of the Jebtsundamba Khutukhtu, most famous and powerful of Mongolian Living Buddhas.

---

\*Dr. Hyer is Coordinator of Asian Studies and Associate Professor of History at Brigham Young University.

<sup>1</sup>In pursuing research on the Chinese frontier areas the writer personally interviewed the Dilowa "Living Buddha" in July 1957 and in April 1960. Later, during a stay in Japan and Taiwan, 1963-1964, many more interviews were made with Mongol refugees and with key Japanese persons who have lived in Mongolia for many years. The Dilowa, a central figure in this report, is a rare person who made the transition from the feudalistic Mongolia of pre-revolution days to America in the Atomic Age.

Escaping from Communist arrest in Outer Mongolia in the early 1930's he fled to Inner Mongolia which came under Japanese occupation at the

### *Background of the Jebtsundamba*

Understanding the importance of the role of religion in Mongolian politics, particularly the institution of the Jebtsundamba, and hence the desire of certain Japanese to make use of it for their own purposes, requires some background of the Jebtsundamba's whose role in Mongolian history is analogous to that of the more famous Dalai Lama in Tibetan history. Just as the Dalai Lamas have been both temporally and religiously supreme among Tibetans, so also were the Jebtsundamba Khutukhtus supreme among the Mongols for several centuries. Historically, the Jebtsundamba is revered by Mongols as an incarnation of the Indian saint Taranatha, who first appeared in Tibet in 1537 as a *hubilgan* or incarnation. He became famous through various cultural accomplishments in Tibet, went to Mongolia in the early 1600's as a part of the process of assimilating Lamaist Buddhism to Mongolia and was there reborn as a Mongolian incarnation. Later this first Mongolian Jebtsundamba went to Peking, gained the favor and friendship of the Kang Hsi emperor and was recognized as the religious leader of all Mongolia; indeed as the pre-eminent figure in Mongolia during the entire period of the Manchu dynasty (1644-1911) and the early republic.

The Chinese showed great deference to the Jebtsundamba in following generations, but at the same time imposed controls, fearing the possible resurgence of a strong Mongol nation. One stipulation was that subsequent incarnations must be found in Tibet, and thus it was. Six Jebtsundambas were Tibetans, only two were Mongols. Such manipulations prompted Lattimore's comment that the "reincarnation" doctrine is more political than divine and "invented as a justification for the fact that those who controlled the political power found it convenient to select the incumbents of church office."

The Jebtsundamba, as a symbol of religious power or unity in Mongolia, weathered the storm of China's 1911 Revolution, and Russia's 1917 Revolution with their "liberations" and "counter-liberations." At the time of the Siberian Expedition of the United States and Japan (1918-21), the Jebtsundamba made an official appeal to the Japanese Government for aid

---

time. Later he was captured by the Chinese and held during World War II, finally making his way to Tibet and thence to the U.S., where he died at over eighty years of age in April of this year. I am greatly indebted to most of the individuals mentioned in the text for valuable information.



against Mongolia's two over-bearing neighbors. During the early period of the Communist Revolution in Mongolia (1921), because the Jebtsundamba wielded enormous influence as head of the Lamaist Church, he was retained as a clever device of the Soviets to cloak the revolution in Outer Mongolia. However, when the last Jebtsundamba died in 1924, the Soviets forbade any search for a new incarnation and those suspected of plotting such a thing were purged.

*Origin and Purpose of Japan's Plan  
for a Puppet Jebtsundamba*

The issue of searching out a new *hubilgan* was not raised again for more than a decade—until Mongolia came under Japanese influence in the 1930's. The Japanese usually gave attention to the unique historical background of regions they occupied and studiously adapted policy to traditional culture and local customs. Accordingly, several groups of Japanese attempted to reinstitute a new incarnation of the Jebtsundamba in Inner Mongolia. They were obviously seeking control within Mongol society, as well as power which would be effective against external enemies—the Chinese and Russians. This could be facilitated by gaining sanction for their policies through a new incarnation of the Jebtsundamba instituted under Japanese auspices. Those in the role of authority in a society usually attempt to justify their rule by linking it with religious symbols, sacred emblems, or legal formulae which are widely believed in and deeply engrained. Through a Jebtsundamba, the Japanese hoped to invest themselves with moral or legal justification for their actions.

Soon after the Manchurian incident, in formulating policy for Outer Mongolia, a Japanese Colonel, Mitsuji Yano, proposed the restoration of a Jebtsundamba incarnation, but it remained a paper proposal only. The real attempt to carry out a restoration plan came in the western area of Mongolia, in the autonomous state which was set up by Prince Teh after breaking away from China with Japanese assistance.

There were probably restoration discussions and plans current among traditionally oriented Mongols, unrecorded and unknown in detail, but concrete measures to set up a new Jebtsundamba came from the Japanese in two or three separate attempts. One originated in the Cultural Affairs Section of the Hsingan Bureau or Mongolian administrative office of Man-

chukuo, directed at the time by Shinjiro Takatsuna. The plan seems to have originated with and been carried out by Tokushiro Goshima of this office with Colonel Yano of the General Staff as an advisor. Goshima contacted the An-ch'in Living Buddha of Tibet who had been the chief intermediary between the Dalai Lama and the exiled Panchen Lama and who had come to Peking in 1938, apparently to establish relations with the Japanese. Because Lhasa, Tibet, is the fountain-head of Lamaist Buddhism, such a Tibetan connection was necessary in gaining backing or sanction for a new Jebtsundamba.

The cooperation of this Tibetan was obtained in carrying out a plan for setting up a Japanese base in Lhasa by smuggling Japanese into the country disguised as members of the An-ch'in's party. The Military Intelligence Organization of Japan's Kwantung Army sponsored the Tibetan expedition which was financed by the South Manchurian Railway Company. Though the party was successful in reaching Tibet, the An-ch'in Khutukhtu was unable to obtain approval for the proposed reinstitution of a Jebtsundamba. This may be due to the fact that the An-ch'in became involved in a coup d'état against the ruling regency in Tibet. The Japanese agent taken into the country by the An-ch'in had to leave the country because of suspicion regarding his identity; another had been dropped from the party just before it entered Tibet due to illness. Had this preliminary operation been successful, the engineering of a Jebtsundamba restoration would next have been attempted.

Another plan for a restoration which seems to be quite distinct and unrelated to the above operation was developed by a group centered around Colonel Kanagawa Kosaku, one of the most famous of Japan's old "Mongol hands" and military intelligence men in Mongolia. It was Kanagawa who was particularly active in promoting the cult of Genghis Khan later in the 1940's at Wang-yeh-miao. The Japanese faced two major problems in attempting this ambitious scheme to restore the Jebtsundamba.

First was the matter of obtaining the support of Prince Teh, head of the Mongolian Government. Next was the old problem of gaining the sanction of Tibet. For assistance in negotiations for carrying out the plan Kanagawa called in Inokuchi Sanzo from the Holonbier region of Eastern Mongolia, a man of long experience who spoke Mongolian fluently.



At this point another Tibetan, Lang Tsang, was brought into the picture. He had close contact with the Japanese army in the Holonbier region and had probably been recruited by Inokuchi, since both came to Kalgan from North Eastern Mongolia. Lang Tsang is described as an opportunist, an ambitious young Lama originally from the Labrang Monastery in Chinghai.

Lang Tsang approached Prince Teh on the proposition of a new Jebtsundamba. Prince Teh approved the idea but not without some misgivings. He said that a new incarnation would be allowed and even welcomed—as long as it was under the proper circumstances. The Dilowa Khutukhtu, a principal figure in the plan, claims that there was no significant opposition among the Mongols. Younger men with positions of responsibility in Teh Wang's government have expressed the view that the majority of Mongols would not have responded favorably to such a scheme. They feel that only the older more conservative generations would have supported the plan. This is a moot question.

Prince Teh instructed Lang Tsang that in order to be acceptable, a new *hubilgan* or incarnation of the Jebtsundamba must be approved by the Tibetan authorities. The Japanese could not avoid gaining sanction from Tibet for the installation of a new incarnation. Because both the Dalai Lama and the Panchen Lama had died and because their incarnations had not yet been found, only the Sa-kyā Grand Lama remained from whom sanction could be obtained. Lang Tsang boasted that he could accomplish this task and received a letter from Teh Wang requesting an oracle of the Sa-kyā Lama. The ranking patriarch of the Sa-kyā line, now a refugee from Tibet, affirms in an interview that representatives came to Tibet and discussed the problem of the Jebtsundamba Khutukhtu but he was young at the time and recalls nothing of the details.

The Dilowa informs us that Lang Tsang was able to obtain an oracle from the Sa-kyā for direction in finding the incarnation. He reportedly enlisted the aid of Ja-mu-yan (Chin. Chia-mu-yang), the famous Living Buddha of the Labrang Monastery in Kansu Province. The Sa-kyā's pronouncement was given in very vague terms. The Dilowa quotes him as saying: "The sign shows a new incarnation will be found in the Chinese direction, but it will be difficult to find him." When Lang Tsang returned to Mongolia in the summer of 1939, he brought

with him, besides the Sa-kya's oracle, a letter from the Labrang Living Buddha stating: "There is a boy of dragon age in Amdo and the calendar indicates the boy must be eleven years of age."

The implication of the Labrang Khutukhtu's action in interjecting himself into the affair was obvious. He hoped to be able to select and install an incarnation which would extend his influence and open new sources of wealth. Lang Tsang also seemed to be promoting the scheme in order to associate himself with the power and wealth which inevitably flowed to the court of a high Khutukhtu. Teh Wang was displeased with this new turn of events and disapproved the opportunistic arrangements made by Lang Tsang. Thus, this attempt to install a new Jebtsundamba was also unsuccessful.

It is at this stage that the Dilowa Khutukhtu from Outer Mongolia became involved in the plan. When he escaped from Outer Mongolia in 1931, he had hoped that the Japanese would serve the needs of the Mongol nation. However, he was disillusioned by the actions of some of the Japanese officers and advisers and, although he preferred Japanese rule to Chinese or Russian, he had a long-cherished desire to make a pilgrimage to Tibet. However, leaving the Japanese area was not an easy matter. Though he had been successful in secretly negotiating with the British in Peking for a visa to Tibet, an opportunity to leave had not yet arisen. The Dilowa mentioned to Sain Bayar, a trusted lieutenant of Prince Teh, his desire to go to Tibet. Sain Bayar knew of the Jebtsundamba plan and conceived the notion of helping the Dilowa by means of this plan to get to Tibet.

Lang Tsang, the Tibetan, had failed in his attempt; moreover, the Dilowa Khutukhtu was the most logical choice to implement a restoration. He was from Outer Mongolia and had been very close to the Jebtsundamba in the past. Prince Teh approved this new proposal partly for his own reasons. Sain Bayar convinced the Japanese of the advantages of working through the Dilowa. As an important Outer Mongolian Living Buddha he would have the approval and cooperation of most Mongols who were united religiously through Lamaism, though divided politically under China, Russia, and Japan.

This points up one of the main reasons for Japanese interest in the plan, namely, Pan-Mongolism. Both Japanese and Mongol sources agree that this was a factor involved in the proposed reinstitution. One Russian remarked, "The Chinese



emperors disappeared from the stage of political events but the Living Buddha continues to be a center for the Pan-Asiatic idea."

Unensechin (Pao Kuo-Yi), son of Sain Bayar, informs the writer that "the Japanese plot was to set up the new incarnation of the Jebtsundamba as a strong appeal to the Mongols as a whole, especially to the Mongols in Outer Mongolia. . . . Under the flag of the Jebtsundamba, Mongols were to be persuaded to fight for a Pan-Mongolia." In Mongolian government circles Prince Teh deferred to the Dilowa declaring that he was neither opposed to the plan nor enthusiastic about it, but that without fail the Sa-kyā Lama must be contacted if the plan were pursued. The Dilowa Khutukhtu was "authorized to persuade [the] Dalai Lama to announce the new incarnation of the Jebtsundamba in Inner Mongolia," and one of the children of the ruling princes was to be the choice, possibly one of the children of Teh Wang. According to Japanese intelligence sources the youngest son of Prince Teh was to be the new Jebtsundamba.

Regarding his departure for Tibet in the fall of 1939, the Dilowa remarks, "The Japanese evidently thought they could use me as an agent." As it turned out his expedition was short-lived. When he arrived in Hong Kong he was arrested and flown to Chungking. A high lama companion (Da Lama) was allowed to continue his journey to Lhasa. The Dilowa was unsuccessful in persuading the Nationalist Government to allow him to complete his pilgrimage to Tibet. Instead, he was placed under detention and remained the better part of World War II at Omei-shan, a temple center in Ssuchuan. Apparently, there were no further attempts on the part of the Japanese to restore the Grand Lama of Mongolia after the failure of the plan noted here.

In conclusion it may be noted that though we are unable to observe what might have happened had the Japanese been successful in setting up a new Jebtsundamba, we can see in this case an example of an age-old problem—the role of religion in the struggle for power. Religion, in this case Lamaism, by the use of powerful emotional sanctions, can strongly inhibit necessary changes. Ultra-conservative Mongols with vested interests maintained that because Lamaism had traditionally acted as a conserver of attested social values, it should not be changed, that instead the status quo should be maintained. Con-

versely a new Jebtsundamba and a Lamaism controlled by the Japanese could so prepare public opinion that it would be easier to break down traditional barriers and give the new order an ethical justification.

Just as Japan modernized the most rapidly of all Asian countries, while at the same time clinging tenaciously to such traditional institutions as the emperor system, so also in the Lamaist World of Mongolia the Japanese pushed rapid reform while at the same time trying to preserve, reinstitute, or develop such traditionally oriented institutions as the Jebtsundamba Living Buddha of Urga, the Emperor Pu-Yi (P'u-i) of the Ch'ing Dynasty, or a nationalistic state cult of Genghis Khan at Wang-yeh-miao. These institutions, of course, would no longer be the same. They would be traditional forms given new meaning in Japan's Greater East Asia.



# Mormon Bibliography

## 1964

The 1964 Mormon bibliography follows the pattern adopted in the previous issues of the *Brigham Young University Studies*. It consists of items noted in the 1964 (v.5) *Mormon Americana*, a cooperative listing of books dealing with Utah and the Mormons. In the following, only items concerning the church have been considered.

A librarian and bibliographer, on first receiving a new book on Mormonism examines it bibliographically; that is, finds out when it was published and by whom; if it has been enlarged from a previous edition; what material has been used to create this work; and if it is adequately indexed. It is unfortunate that many of the regional publishers are very careless in these areas.

The problem of edition rather than printing is one of the most confusing for persons trying to collect all editions of a given work. The 1961 edition of *The Naked Communist* by W. Cleon Skousen is listed as the tenth edition, yet has been copyrighted only three times. The 1963 printing of *Essentials in Church History* by Joseph Fielding Smith is listed as the eighteenth edition, and though it has been revised many times, no difference is apparent between the eighteenth and the seventeenth editions. On the other hand *A Marvelous Work and a Wonder*, 1961 edition, places 1950 on the title page, but on the verso reads "Revised Printing, 1961." The differences between edition and printing are very important to the scholar who needs to know whether the material has been revised. These two terms have definite accepted usage. For instance, the 1957 printing of *No Man Knows My History* by Fawn Brodie, published by Alfred Knopf, has that date on the title page, but on the verso states "Published November 22, 1945; second printing, January, 1946; third printing, June, 1946; fourth printing, March, 1954; fifth printing, May, 1957." The scholar has thus been told that the work has not been revised.

Although Webster's dictionary does not make a clear distinction between these two terms, scholars and publishers are well aware of it. The definition of an edition as given in Geof-

frey Ashall Glaister's *An Encyclopedia of the Book* (London: George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., c1960) is "The whole number of copies of a work printed from the *same set of type* and issued at *any* time. An edition may consist of a number of impressions *if the matter is not altered to any appreciable extent.*" (italics ours). An impression (or printing) is defined as "all copies of a book printed at *one* time from the same type or plate."

A more serious problem is that of bibliography or bibliographic citations. This is particularly critical in a subject as controversial as the Mormon church. For years many important sections from Whitney's *History of Utah* have been ignored by the careful scholar due to the fact that this great work lacks bibliography or citations, and material should not be used which cannot be verified. On the other hand *De-Profeet der Mormonen Joseph Smith* by M. H. A. Van der Valk, has such a long and complex bibliography (1395 bibliographical entries and 601 citations) that one must conclude that Mr. Van der Valk had no scholarly ability to eliminate those materials that would not contribute to his thesis. A long bibliography and a multitude of citations will never take the place of critical evaluation.

An example of modern lack of bibliographic care is *He Walked the Americas* by L. Taylor Hansen; an attempt to show that in the legends and ceremonies of the Indians, there is proof of Christ's visit to the western hemisphere. Unfortunately, not a legend has a bibliographic citation, with the result that the scholar is not able to examine the original to see if the material is out of context, translated incorrectly, or even exists. There is a bibliography in the work, but it is almost impossible to use. It is unfortunate that an otherwise provocative book should be rendered relatively useless by the lack of scholastic apparatus.

## HISTORICAL

Allen, James B. *Mormonism in the Twentieth Century* by James B. Allen and Richard O. Cowan. Provo, Utah: Extension Publications, BYU, 1964.

Andrus, Hyrum. *The Glory of God and Man's Relation to Deity*. Provo, Utah: Extension Publications, BYU, 1964.

Deweyville Centennial Committee. *Deweyville Centennial, 1864-1964*. Deweyville, Utah: Deweyville Centennial Committee, 1964.



- Freedgood, Seymour. "Mormonism, Rich, Vital, and Unique," *Fortune*, LXIX (April, 1964), 136-139, 168, 171-173.
- Jacobson, Pearl F. *Golden Sheaves From a Rich Field: A Centennial History of Richfield, Utah*. Richfield: Richfield Reaper, 1964.
- Kimball, Stanley B. (Compiler) *Sources of Mormon History in Illinois, 1839-48: An Annotated Catalog of the Microfilm Collection at Southern Illinois University*. Carbondale, Illinois: The Library, Southern Illinois University, 1964. Bibliographic contributions No. 1.
- Klassen, Joe. "Co-Hab Hunts in the Mormon Territory," *The Trail Guide* (published quarterly by the Kansas City Posse, the Westerners), VIII (September, 1963), 1-14.
- Knecht, William L. *History of Brigham Young* by William L. Knecht and Peter L. Crawley. Berkeley, California: MassCall Associates, 1964. MassCall Associates, 2855 Telegraph Avenue. A copy of three manuscripts: "Early Records of Utah," "Incidents in Utah History," and "Utah Historical Incidents." Manuscripts in Bancroft Library.
- Proper, David R. "Joseph Smith and Salem." in *Salem Institute Historical Collections*, C (April, 1964), 88-97. Joseph Smith's trip to Salem, 1836.
- Skousen, W. Cleon. *The Third Thousand Years*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.
- Stegner, Wallace. *The Gathering of Zion: The Story of the Mormon Trail*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1964. American trails series.
- Ricks, Joel E. *Forms and Methods of Early Mormon Settlement in Utah and Surrounding Region, 1847-1877*. Logan, Utah: Utah State University Press, 1964. Monograph Series. Vol. XI, No. 2.
- Tagg, Melvin Salway. *A History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in Canada, 1830-1963*. Ann Arbor: University Microfilms, 1963. Ph.D. Brigham Young University.
- Woolsey, Nethella Griffin. *The Escalante Story*. Springville, Utah: Art City Publishing Co., 1964. Escalante and Garfield County, Utah.

## DOCTRINAL

- Allred, Gordon T. *If a Man Die*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.
- Bradford, Reed. *And They Shall Teach Their Children*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1964.
- Cheville, Roy A. *Scriptures from Ancient America: A Study of the Book of Mormon*. Independence, Mo.: Herald House, 1964.
- Doxey, Roy W. *The Latter-day Prophets and the Doctrine and Covenants*, Vols. I-IV. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1963-4.
- Dyer, Alvin R. *The Fallacy*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1964.
- The Elders Journal*. Edited by Joseph Smith. Salt Lake City: Modern Microfilm Company, 1964. Reprint.
- Newquist, Jerreld L. *Prophets' Principles and National Survival*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.

- Pratt, Orson. *The Seer*. Salt Lake City: Eugene Wagner, 1963. Reprint of original edition.
- Smith, Joseph Fielding. *Answers to Gospel Questions*, Vol. IV. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1963.
- Sperry, Sidney. *The Problems of the Book of Mormon*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.
- Taylor, John. *The Gospel Kingdom*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964. Reprint.
- . *Mediation and Atonement*. Salt Lake City, 1964. Lithographic reprint.

### INSPIRATIONAL

- Burton, Alma P. and Clea M. *For They Shall be Comforted*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1964.
- Curtis, Lindsay R. *2 1/2 Minute Talk Treasury*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.
- Dyer, Alvin R. *The Lord Speaketh*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1964.
- Lund, Jane. *Stories of Jesus for L.D.S. Children*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.
- Petersen, Mark E. *Guide to a Happy Marriage*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, c1964.
- Sill, Sterling W. *The Way of Success*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.

### LITERATURE AND MUSIC

- Bailey, Paul. *For Time and All Eternity*. Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1964.
- Clark, Bruce B. *Out of the Best Books: An Anthology of Literature* by Bruce B. Clark and Robert K. Thomas. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1964. An anthology for Relief Society lessons.
- Song of the Mormon Pioneers: Historical Annotations* by Austin E. and Alta S. Fife. Salt Lake City: Columbia Research Group, 1964. Sung by Rosalie Sorrels. Phone-record with pamphlet on text and music.
- Stewart, Ora Pate. *Buttermilk and Bran*. San Antonio, Texas: Naylor, 1964.
- Utah Sings*, Vol. IV. Edited by Ann W. Hafen, Provo, Utah: State Poetry Society, Inc., 1964. Anthology of Utah Poets.

### BIOGRAPHY AND FAMILY HISTORY

- Beldon, L. Burr. *Amasa Lyman, San Bernardino's First Mayor*. San Bernardino, California: San Bernardino County Museum, 1964. Included in Annual Report of the Museum.
- Bullock, Kenneth C. *A Genealogy of James Bullock and Mary Hill, Latter-day Saint Pioneers*. Provo, Utah: The Author, 1964.



- Coleman, Arthur D. *The John and Nannie O'Neil Family*. Provo, Utah: The Author, 1964.
- Cowley, Matthias F. *Wilford Woodruff, History of His Life and Labors*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964. Reprint of 1909 edition.
- Dransfield, Jennive Clark. *Anders Peterson Families, 1862-1962*. Provo, Utah: Peterson Family Organization, 1964.
- Gregerson, Edna J. *The Mellors Through the Years*. Orem, Utah: Art City Publishing Co., 1964.
- Hatch, Nelle Spilsbury. *Mother Jane's Story*. Wasco, California: Shafer Publishing Co., 1964. Jane Redd Spilsbury, Early Colonizer of the Mexican Mormon Colony.
- Hilton, Eugene. *Hugh, the First Mormon Hilton, his Progenitors and Descendants*. Oakland, California: Hugh Hilton Genealogical Society, 1964.
- Larn, Hubert. "Fantastic Hilda: Pioneer History Personified," *Swedish Pioneer*, XV (April, 1964), 63-76. Interview with Hilda Erickson of Grantsville on her 104th Birthday. She crossed the plains in 1866.
- Perry, Hannah Laurie Hair. *The Hair Family History*. Provo, Utah: The Author, 1964.
- Thomas MacKay Family Organization. *Descendants of Thomas MacKay, Utah Pioneer*, Vol. I. Los Angeles, California, 1964.
- Smith, Albert E. *Thales Hastings Haskell, Pioneer, Scout, Explorer, Indian Missionary, 1847-1909*. Salt Lake City: The Author, 1964.
- Spencer, Seymour H. *Life Summary of Orson Spencer*. Salt Lake City: Mercury Publishing Co., 1964.
- Stout, Hosea. *On the Mormon Frontier: The Diary of Hosea Stout, 1844-1861*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, August, 1964. With Prepublication offer.
- Wait, Mary Van Sickle. *Brigham Young in Cayuga County, 1813-1829*. Ithaca, New York: DeWitt Historical Society of Tompkins County, 1964.
- Young, S. Dilworth. *Here is Brigham . . . Brigham Young the Years to 1844*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964.

## *Late on Father's Day*

I always try to take him apples, red delicious if I can.  
Or, if it's winter, d'Anjou pears, just losing  
Their autumn hardness and gaining a hint of gold.  
He still loves fruit.  
Just so he always brought home fruit,  
Watermelons long and green that cracked  
Before the knife to draw it through. Or cantaloupe  
Webbed with gray, so unpromising until the knife  
Revealed the salmon meat within. Peaches, "cots," cherries,  
Pears—wonderful return, we thought,  
For the lustreless potatoes, onions, cabbages he took away.  
Often a box of bananas, too ripe sometimes, but still  
A treat for us. And in depression days a whole  
Gunnysack of day-old doughnuts—took some picking  
To get all the hairs of burlap off, but "warm 'em up  
And they're as good as new."

The bringer of all things good!  
We nine, we ate a lot.

But I remember too with what enforced reluctance came  
Those dimes and quarters and nickels from pocket  
To impatient hands, even when we'd earned them  
Hoeing endless weeds in endless heat down endless rows.  
And I remember worse the pain and hurt  
In eyes that should have danced; we'd waited long,  
And fussed too much, in front of banks.

Too early up, he roused the house with shaking grate  
And sound of knife through kindling wood, started breakfast  
cooking  
On burning fire, and left for warehouse or for farm  
To "get things going," forgot about the meal  
Or any routine of wife and home. He ate, if he ate,  
When nothing else was pressing. Played with us,  
If he played, in snatches. But always went with us to church.



Those days are gone—and so is she.  
Like the d'Anjou pears I take to him, he's mellowed much:  
Long years, hard work, we nine, his debts, her pain.  
We watched him watch, we watched him help,  
We watched him hurt, we watched him pray.  
We watched her pay the price of pain and pay the price  
Of growth—both ours and his—but price they shared.  
No mellowing from banker's pain; depression's pain  
Hardened. But her pain mellowed.

Without her now, we're all he has.  
And so I try to bring him fruit—

He brought us fruit  
And still he brings us fruit.

—Marden J. Clark

## Book Reviews

JAMES R. CLARK, ed. *Messages of the First Presidency, I*, Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, Inc., 1965. Pp. xxv-415. \$4.50.

In compiling the *Messages of the First Presidency*, Professor Clark is seeking to perform a vital and helpful work. To Latter-day Saints, the official pronouncements of the First Presidency are of utmost importance particularly those from the formative period of the Church. Professor Clark commences this volume with a Preface and an Introduction, after which he compiles in chronological order those available statements, letters, discourses, etc. which he considers as official pronouncements. The first 231 pages concern the administration of Joseph Smith, while the remaining 132 pages contain the administration of Brigham Young between July, 1844 and October, 1849. Until December, 1847, Brigham was acting in the capacity of President of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles. While the Index is fairly adequate, it omits some items. (For example, the editorial on "The Gift of the Holy Ghost," pages 143-149, is not listed under Holy Ghost.) There is no Table of Contents. Evidently Professor Clark feels that the chronological listing of documents, with the Index he personally prepared, is sufficient to give the reader the necessary assistance in finding specific items within the volume.

As an aid to the reader, Professor Clark has also written introductions to some of the items included in his compilation. In his introduction to "The Proclamation of the Twelve Apostles of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints," etc., he assigns the authorships to Wilford Woodruff, citing an article by William H. Reeder, Jr. as his authority. But while Dr. Reeder commences his article with the statement that Wilford Woodruff was instructed to write this Proclamation, he gives no proof whatever to support his assertion. B.H. Roberts assigns the authorship of this Proclamation to Parley P. Pratt, indicating that it was published by Wilford Woodruff. (See *History of the Church*, VII, 558.) A study of the literary style of the document in question, with other facts that have a bearing on the subject, supports the statement by Roberts. Obviously, Dr. Reeder mistook the publisher for the author.



While Professor Clark's own efforts in making this compilation commenced at an earlier time, he and sixteen LDS educators worked together on the project as part of a course assignment at Brigham Young University during the summer of 1960. Later, he obtained a research grant to continue his efforts; and with the cooperation of the Church Historian's Office, he indicates that the collection of Messages was expanded until it is believed that "the collection is substantially complete for the period from the establishment of the First Presidency in 1833 A.D. to date." Nevertheless, he states that "final completeness is not claimed because of human limitations." The materials in volume one, however, with the exception of three items are taken exclusively from the *History of the Church*; and in the opinion of this writer, two of these items cannot appropriately be classified as Messages. One is a personal letter by the Prophet to his wife Emma; and the other is a poem in which Joseph Smith placed section 76 of the *Doctrine and Covenants* in verse. Neither of these items was considered by Joseph Smith as an official declaration.

The work of gathering the official pronouncements of the First Presidency during the administration of Joseph Smith apparently has been approached by Professor Clark with a view, first, to compile all known statements that bear the signatures of all members of the First Presidency. Here his work conforms to his stated intent. (There are some statements that bear the signatures of Joseph Smith and one other member of the Presidency that are not included.) In addition, he has selected at his own discretion other representative statements, letters, discourses, etc. of Joseph Smith which he considers to be authoritative, in an effort to reflect the role of the Prophet as the presiding officer in the Church during this early period. This means that his compilation is not a complete collection of all authoritative statements of Joseph Smith, as President and Prophet of the Church. For example, Professor Clark states that this compilation began some years ago with his own file which he labeled "Revelations Not in the Standard Works of the L.D.S. Church." Yet there are several revelations to Joseph Smith that are not in the Standard Works which he does not include in his compilation. To illustrate, there are revelations to the Prophet concerning certain individuals within the Church, including Reynolds Cahoon, Frederick G. Williams, Isaac Morley, Edward Partridge, Warren Parrish, Harvey Whit-

lock and Brigham Young. (See *ibid.*, II, 299, 300, 302-303, 311, 315-316; III, 23.) Of a different nature, there is also a revelation concerning the Twelve and another on the status of those who die in ignorance of the Gospel, but who would have received it had they heard it in mortality. (See *ibid.*, II, 300-301, 380.)

In other ways, Professor Clark has been selective. The First Presidency was not officially organized until March, 1833; and prior to that time, Joseph Smith made certain official pronouncements. But while Professor Clark includes the Prophet's letter to N.E. Seaton, an editor at Rochester, New York, he omits such declarations as Joseph Smith made in the Conference held October 25, 1831, and the official statement he published in *The Evening and The Morning Star*, I (August, 1832), 22, entitled "The Honorable Men of the World."

Again, some letters written by the Prophet are considered by Professor Clark to be official declarations and are therefore included in his compilation. These include certain letters written to individuals. But other letters by the Prophet which this writer feels are equally important in the development of the Church are not included. Among the latter is a letter written by Joseph Smith to William W. Phelps, November 27, 1832, and a letter by Joseph Smith and Elias Higbee to Hyrum Smith and the High Council of the Church at Nauvoo, written from Washington, D.C., December 5, 1839. Part of the letter to Phelps has been excerpted and placed in the *Doctrine and Covenants*. However, the remaining portion fits logically into the category of material compiled in this volume; and it would not have been inappropriate to have reproduced the full letter. The Prophet's letter from Washington is of vital importance and was directed to an official body within the Church, instructing them on pertinent issues that then faced the Church. Other letters by Joseph Smith that are not included in this compilation are some of a political nature, written to John C. Calhoun and Henry Clay. The Prophet never considered his mission as being limited to the religious sphere of life. He also spoke officially on current political issues; and George Q. Cannon, for one, looked upon these declarations as official statements to men who were leading the political destiny of the country. Joseph Smith's letter to Calhoun, in particular, is a classic document in American political thought and is of the



utmost importance in seeing the relationship the Saints then had with the nation and its leading figures.

In the area of political affairs, Professor Clark is also selective in that he includes Joseph Smith's "Views of the Powers and Policy of the Government of the United States," as the Prophet's declaration to the nation on political economy, written for use in his campaign for the Presidency of the United States in 1844. But he does not include President Smith's "Appeal to his Native State—Vermont," which is also an important statement in the area of pronouncements to the citizens of the country.

Finally, Professor Clark includes in his compilation certain discourses, declarations, etc. made by the Prophet on a variety of subjects. Here again he is selective in that which he includes in his compilation. For example, he reproduces an editorial written by the Prophet on "The Gift of the Holy Ghost," but omits another editorial of equal importance on a similar subject area, entitled "Try the Spirits." (See *ibid.*, IV, 571-581.) The later editorial is of particular importance in light of some problems the Church had had with spurious revelations from unauthorized individuals. Again, on April 8, 1844, Joseph Smith declared in an official statement to the Church that he had "received instructions from the Lord" that the whole of America is Zion, and that the Saints could thus build up Stakes of Zion in all areas of the land. This meant that they did not have to remain in the area of Missouri and Illinois to build up Zion, but could go elsewhere and find a haven from the oppression that was being heaped upon them. Upon the basis of this declaration, the Saints made their great exodus to the West. But while Brigham Young termed the Prophet's declaration "a perfect sweepstakes" and "a perfect knock-down to the devil's kingdom," Professor Clark does not include it in his compilation.

Professor Clark has been faced with a problem of what to include in his compilation. In this volume of his work, he has chosen to include all known statements bearing the signatures of the First Presidency, and in addition to supplement these statements with miscellaneous materials of a representative nature, to illustrate the role Joseph Smith played in developing the Church and its doctrines. While this approach will not be necessary in the future volumes of his work, some will agree that under the circumstances it is appropriate in this in-

itial publication. Others, however, will argue that this formative period is of such importance that a compilation of this kind should include all authoritative statements by the Prophet. Whichever view one takes, Professor Clark is to be commended for the contribution he has made in initiating a work of this kind. If, after he has published the remaining volumes, he sees the need for a different approach to be taken on this early formative period, a future edition could be more inclusive in its scope.

Hyrum L. Andrus



G. A. WILLIAMSON. *The World of Josephus*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1964. Pp. 313. \$6.00.

The historical writings of the Jewish historian, Josephus (37-100 A.D.) are our best source for knowledge of conditions in Palestine during the first century A.D. The English classicist G. A. Williamson has tried a new approach to the study of this controversial figure by relating him more completely to his Palestinian and Roman background. About four fifths of the book is devoted to a description of the life of Josephus and the political cross-currents in Palestine, their relation to the Roman Empire, and the final explosive Jewish revolt against Rome 66-70 A.D. The career of Josephus is intimately associated with these events in his role as a Jewish aristocrat, diplomat, and commanding general against the Romans in Galilee. He was defeated and captured early in the war. Then he became a Roman partisan and negotiator who tried to persuade the Jews to submit to Rome. The leading personalities and events of the immediate pre-war period and the war are set forth with sharp descriptive and narrative skill by the author. To a large degree Williamson presents his account from the exciting and dramatic eye-witness perspective of Josephus' *Jewish War* supplemented with his own scholarly commentary.

The last thirty years of the historian's life were spent in Rome as a highly favored protégé of the Flavian emperors Vespasian and Titus, who commanded the Roman forces in the Jewish War. He received wealth, Roman citizenship, and imperial protection from the slander and conspiratorial prosecution of bitter Jewish enemies. This hostility is understandable because of his changing sides during the war and the pro-Roman bias of his *Jewish War*. He devoted this time to literary activity. He learned Greek and was aided in his writing by learned Greek assistants and a wealthy patron, Epaphroditus.

He wrote the *Jewish War* about 75 A.D. to correct the inaccuracies of Greek writers of that episode and to honor the achievements in it of his imperial patrons. Towards the end of his life he wrote *Jewish Antiquities* to present the great historical and religious heritage of his people to a hostile Gentile public. About the same time he wrote his *Life*, which is almost entirely devoted to a violent defense of his conduct in the early months of the war because of the charge in a recently pub-

lished book by a Jew, Justus of Tiberias, that he had agitated the war. He also launches a vitriolic attack on the activities of Justus himself as an agitator for revolt. There are many flat contradictions between his account in the *Life* of his role in the war and the account in his *Jewish War*. His last preserved work is *Against Apion*, a learned and literary refutation of the many false criticisms leveled against the Jews and their religion by sophisticated Greek intellectuals led by Apion of Alexandria. Josephus manifests here a genuine and deep devotion to the faith of his people.

Williamson shows clearly why Josephus has been the subject of extended and bitter scholarly controversy for many years. In his evaluation of Josephus as a historian, he avoids the extremes of unduly harsh criticism and high praise. The faults of the *Jewish War* are very real with its harsh judgments and biting attack upon his personal enemies, the many long speeches of Jewish and Roman leaders, the boasting and self vindication of the author's own conduct, the highly dramatic exaggeration in the tales of stupendous heroics, horror, violence, suffering, and the enormous battle statistics. Furthermore, there is constant adulation of the brilliant strategy, resourcefulness, courage, and virtue of Vespasian and Titus. However, this display of rhetorical distortion and bias must be viewed in the light of contemporary Greek and Roman historiography. Viewed in this context Josephus was merely following the conventions of the historical guild. On the other hand his collection of numerous sources including the memoirs of Vespasian and Titus, his basic accuracy in the account of the war, except wherein he was personally involved, his description of Palestinian geography, battle topography, the city of Jerusalem, Roman military engines, weapons, legionary formations and discipline, and tactics are essentially accurate and valuable history. The *Antiquities* is far inferior in historical quality to the *Jewish War*. It is history from Adam to 66 A.D. Most of it is based on the Old Testament supplemented by legends and the author's imagination. Its literary style is dry and involved except the description of the reign of Herod the Great whose vivid and full account is based on the Greek historian Nicolaus of Damascus.

A work of such extensive description and analysis as Williamson's is bound to raise some questions of emphasis, omission and interpretation. The long historical survey is largely



confined to the outstanding leaders and political events. One could wish for a more penetrating analysis of basic political issues and causes. Likewise there is little attention to fundamental social and intellectual trends that are pertinent to the background of Josephus. There is a superficial treatment of contemporary Jewish religion and hardly anything about the role and significance of the Law of Moses. The Pharisees are given an extremely negative image not in keeping with recent scholarly studies. Nevertheless, it is a most interesting, well written, and informative analysis of Josephus, his life, character, and significance as a writer and historian in his relationship to the vital and complex events of his time.

Russel B. Swensen

JOHN B. COBB, JR. *A Christian Natural Theology*. Westminster Press, Philadelphia, 1965. Pp. 288. \$6.50.

Can the existence and, if so, the nature of God be known independent of specific religious experiences? The answer "yes" and attempts to vindicate it are known traditionally as "natural theology." They are extremely rare on the contemporary scene. For the Barthians the project is a futile withdrawal from the faith-state, for the humanists a throwback to defunct scholastic assumptions or fraudulent Protestant value-theory. For the fundamentalists it is dangerous intellectualizing; for the existentialists it is the idolatric identification of religion with finitude. Typically, the informed layman finds it suspect either because it seems loosely unscientific or because it does not touch on "matters of the heart."

Alfred North Whitehead, partly because he pre-dated most of these outlooks, was not fettered by them. Seeking models by which to account for reality in all its fulness and variety he was perhaps the last of the "grand style" metaphysicians, more fascinating because he was an acknowledged master mathematician, formal logician, and philosopher of science. Whitehead is the starting point for the natural theology of the book under review—but the result is a composite of Whitehead and the author. John B. Cobb, Jr. offers a summary-supplement to Whitehead as an alternative to contemporary trends. It amounts to a religious redefinition of secular experience.

Mormons may be startled to find views they have espoused on grounds of reason and revelation defended on grounds of reason alone. Once one ceases to be awed at Whitehead's terminology he may still be mystified at the method. By whatever procedure Whitehead bridges three chasms as if they didn't exist. First, the language gap. Both the relations and attributes of God can be stated in literal language. Second, the dualism of being and becoming. Whitehead (as well as his disciple, Hartshorne) balances traditional static with dynamic terms, holding, if anything, that the static terms (absolute, unchanging, infinite, etc.) are in need of denial or qualification. The conclusion of his book *Process and Reality* is that even in and for God, Process *is* reality. Third, the God-man cleavage—God is not "utterly other" and man is not utterly corrupt. Whitehead is unafraid of praising man as "co-creator" whose "grandeur and dignity" are a reflection of God. In other words, for



Whitehead, the "infinite qualitative distinction" between the Divine and the human is not infinite, not qualitative, and not a distinction. (Neither, by the way, are the usual distinctions between men and animals.)

Beginning with pure possibilities (eternal objects) the cosmos as a society of occasions (substantial activity) and a telos or thrust (creativity) Whitehead is constrained to introduce an envisaging "principle of limitation." This can only account for the ordering rule if it is an "actual entity." It becomes in Whitehead's later thought (or, at least in Cobb's) a living being. Further, on Whitehead's principles, God, to be susceptible to the "occasions of experience," which open to Him a rich synthesis of this and all other worlds, must have "physical feelings." It is therefore Whiteheadian to speak of God as having an aim (primordial in Him as in man) toward intensity of feeling, whose ultimate appetition is toward "the strength of beauty." Hence God is described as having consciousness, purpose, vision, knowledge, wisdom, love. Thus God, for whom man is not an inappropriate model, is personal, "the mirror who discloses to every creature its own greatness" (*Religion in the Making*, pp. 154-55).

Whitehead goes further. God, being involved in the actual processes of the universe, is a "lure" to man. There is temporal successiveness in the divine nature. Unlike man, God knows no "perishing" of experience. There is living immediacy in God of all His and all our experiences. Unlike man he preserves in memory all values in complete conscious form. There is spatiality in God at least in the sense that He "has a standpoint" and thus, contra orthodoxy, may be somewhere. Unlike man his touch with everywhere is direct and non-inferential. He is numerically one, hence "union" with Him is literally impossible. His freedom is not unlimited (whatever that concept might mean), and His will is often thwarted by other "occasions." In sum "God is the great companion—the fellow-sufferer who understands." All this is the more interesting because Whitehead sternly rejects the view that religious experience provides a basis for affirming that God is personal (*Religion in the Making*, pp. 62-66).

Cobb argues in favor of this di-polar approach to God that "an abstraction can't *do* anything." He means, of course, that a mere abstraction cannot account for the harmony of actual entities. But Cobb clearly sees the religious point too. *Belief* that

God is an abstraction *does* do much. It stifles and suffocates the religious life. In witness whereof we need only observe that dominant writers today who defend the ultimacy of God while denying personal attributes portray religion as a matter of alienation, monotony, meaninglessness, loneliness, and "fear and trembling." Whitehead, in exact contrast, affirming the personal intimacy of God portrays religion as worship, adventure, meaning, companionship and peace (which is not, by the way, mere cessation of activity, but "the harmony of harmonies which calms destructive turbulence and completes civilization." Apparently *constructive* turbulence is everlasting).

What may prove stimulating to Mormons are ideas enmeshed or implied in these: Emphasis on beauty, not just truth, as the religious quest; each occasion is novel and the universe is everlastingly unfolding in infinite variety, even the inanimate. Whitehead's view of process is a matrix for resolving such theological anxieties as how there can be development and response in a perfected entity, how freedom and novelty may emerge in a universe of interrelated causation, how there may be worth in the midst of anguish. It also gives a remarkable rationale, which Whitehead avoids, for continual revelation. In fact, since Cobb's Whiteheadian theology turns out to have a distinctive Mormon flavor, Mormons may conclude that Whitehead is more Christian than Christendom and that Mormonism is more Christian than both.

Whitehead is one of the least-read and rarely-cited philosophers in the American climate and maybe has the fewest serious followers. For Mormons it is at least interesting that such views commended themselves to one of the most religious of thoughtful men in the Twentieth Century.

Truman G. Madsen



W. CLEON SKOUSEN. *The Third Thousand Years*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft Publishers, 1964. Pp. xvii-704. \$5.95.

This volume is a continuation of Cleon Skousen's earlier book, *The First 2000 Years*, and is meant to cover "those ten thundering centuries between 2000 and 1000 B.C." The book contains an appendix containing a description of the Egyptian embalming process, the history and significance of the Urim and Thummim, and a digest of the Law of Moses. Mr. Skousen uses his legal training to advantage in discussing the Law of Moses. Unfortunately, he does not include a digest of the Law of Carnal Commandments which would have also helped students of the *Doctrine and Covenants*. (See D&C 84: 27.) He gives his reasons for not including it, feeling that his book was already large. Bookmaking these days is expensive.

That Mr. Skousen was not writing for the benefit of the Bible scholar is quite apparent from a cursory examination of the book. His chronology is the high, traditional one, with the period of the Judges lasting over four hundred years. Moses comes on the scene about 1597 B.C. instead of 1300 B.C. as Albright and other scholars might suggest. Nor are there discussions of the technical problems inherent in the Exodus and the Conquest. As he says in the Preface, his purpose is "to capture the exciting historical reality of the life and times of those remarkable people. This is not a children's story of the Bible but a synthesis of the vast historical fabric of that entire period as seen through the eyes of the men and women who lived it and the prophets of God who wrote about it."

Mr. Skousen writes his book in the light of the modern revelations given to the Church. He draws freely on the information afforded us by the Book of Mormon, Doctrine and Covenants and The Pearl of Great Price. Nor does he miss Joseph Smith's Revision of the Bible, the works of Josephus, or the *Documentary History of the Church*. Using these and other aids, he weaves the Bible accounts of the period treated into a fascinating, yes, entertaining, volume. For those who cannot find the Bible interesting reading firsthand, we recommend Mr. Skousen's book. He tries hard to make the Bible understandable and meaningful to the Latter-day Saint.

Mr. Skousen's book shows that a tremendous amount of labor has gone into its production and he is to be congratulated on having helped to supply a real need in popular Biblical literature.

S. B. Sperry

## BOOK NOTES

DAVID H. YARN, JR. *The Gospel: God, Man, and Truth*. Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1965. Pp. 211. \$3.25.

This theological and philosophical treatment of the subjects named in the title is a fine piece of craftsmanship. Characterized by methodological comprehensiveness, it carries a balanced critique of both the position that reason supersedes revelation and the position that revelation supersedes reason. Certain themes in the book refreshingly state basic Latter-day Saint tenets, such as the fundamental position of Jesus Christ in all scripture and the liberating force of revealed truth, when accepted. Since many essays were originally presented in an academic situation, other issues should have especial appeal to the Mormon intellectual community, such as Professor Yarn's rather comprehensive discussion of the Latter-day Saint view of man as only environmentally sinful and the definition of intelligence in modern scripture as equated with character. Because of the author's evident care in the use of terminology, it should be pointed out that use of "Holy Spirit" as different from "Holy Ghost" (p. 52, p. 142) can only breed confusion. "Ghost" is merely archaic English for "spirit"; consequently most modern translations of the New Testament render this Greek phrase literally as "Holy Spirit."



JAMES M. MCPHERSON. *The Negro's Civil War*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1965. Pp. 358. \$6.95.

Joseph Smith's prophecy on war in 1832 contained the prediction of the rebellion of slaves, "who shall be marshaled and disciplined for war." In past decades a number of studies have explored the Negro contribution to the Civil War, including that of some half-million slaves who deserted to Union lines. Professor McPherson adds a smoothly annotated set of source readings that has the cohesiveness of a novel. A substantial number of chapters report on-the-scenes information from and about the approximately 200,000 Negroes in the Union forces (about 10% of Northern manpower), including, by the end of the war, 140 Negro regiments. Other chapters put this war effort in its context of initial official resistance against using colored troops at all to Lincoln's ultimately vigorous promotion of their recruitment. (Imitation on the part of the Confederacy was adopted late as a "dying gesture" in the Negro Soldier Law.) Climaxing chapters chronicle the developing Negro status that came from participation in the burdens of war. This result was clearly seen by many Negroes, of whom one saw in the enlistment invitations "slight atonement for the past and cheerful promise for the future" (p. 176). In an official report to the Secretary of War, General David Hunter paid tribute to the abilities of "the colored regiments" and observed: "They are imbued with a burning faith that now is the time appointed by God, in His All-wise Providence, for the deliverance of their race . . . ." (p. 168)

## *Asian Research Institute Personnel*

*Lee W. Farnsworth*

*Present Position:* Director, Asian Research Institute, Brigham Young University.

Assistant Professor of Political Science.

*Academic Degrees:*

A.B., University of California - Regional Group Major on Japan.

M.A., University of California - Political Science.

Ph.D., Claremont Graduate School - Government.

*Other Graduate Work:*

Stanford University - Chinese and Japanese.

*Theses Subjects:*

M.A., Decision-Making in Burma and Japan.

Ph.D., Factionalism in Recent Japanese Politics.

*Professional Experience:*

Assistant Professor, Florida State University.

*Awards: (Partial)*

NDEA Language Fellowship - two and one-half years.

B.Y.U. Faculty Research Fellowship - Spring 1966.

*Research and Publications:*

1. Articles Published:

"East and Far from What?" (Analysis of Asian Studies in Public Schools) *Journal of Florida Education Association*, February 1964.

2. Articles in Process:

"Analysis of Japan's Foreign Policy toward China" (Beginning project for faculty fellowship).

*Ray C. Hillam*

*Present Position:* Assistant Professor of Political Science and Coordinator of International Relations Program.

*Academic Degrees:*

B.A., University of Utah - Political Science.

M.A., George Washington University - Political Science.

Ph.D., American University - International Relations and Organization.



*Professional Background:*

Research Assistant - Psychological Warfare Group in the Far East.

Intelligence Analyst - Central Intelligence Agency.

Consultant for U.S. Navy in Unconventional Warfare.

*Research and Publications:*

1. Articles Published: (Two studies for limited circulation with Department of Navy.)

"Insurgent Communism in Southeast Asia."

"Counterinsurgency in Malaya, Vietnam, and the Philippines: The Resistance Capabilities and Essentials of Effective Counterinsurgency."

2. Article in Process:

"Emergence of the Functional Theory in a Counterinsurgency Situation: Categories for Analysis."

*Russell Nozomi Horiuchi*

*Present Position:* Assistant Professor of Geography.

*Academic Degrees:*

B.A., Brigham Young University, 1953.

M.A., University of California at Berkeley, 1958.

Present doctoral candidate, University of Washington (Danforth Fellow).

*Professional Experiences:*

After graduating from B.Y.U. with a brilliant record and as valedictorian, Russell Horiuchi received a John Hay Whitney scholarship to the University of California, Berkeley.

Teaching Assistant - Research Assistant - University of California, 1955-58.

Instructor - College of San Mateo - San Mateo, California.

Instructor - Brigham Young University.

Is a regional specialist on the Far East and is presently engaged in a systematic study of political geography.

*Paul V. Hyer*

*Present Position:* Associate Professor of History.

Coordinator, Asian Studies Program, Brigham Young University.

*Academic Degrees:*

B.A., Brigham Young University - History and Sociology, 1951.

M.A., University of California, Berkeley, 1953.

Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley, - Far Eastern History and Asian Social Institutions, 1960.

*Theses Subjects:*

M.A., Lamaist, Buddhism and Japanese Policy Mongolia, 1953.

Ph.D., Japan and the Lamaist World: Part I, Japanese Relations with Tibet, 1960.

*Professional Background:*

Director, B.Y.U. South Pacific-Orient Travel Study Program, June-September, 1961.

Assistant Director and faculty "Big Eleven" Far Eastern Language Institute, University of Michigan, Summer 1963.

Member Board of Directors, Mongolia Society, 1963-1965.

Social Science Analyst, Guerrilla-warfare research team for Vietnam (Department of the Navy), September 1962-June 1963.

Researcher, Chinese Border Regions - Twentieth century Mongolia and Tibet, Sponsor - Toyo Bunko (National Research Center for East Asian Cultural Studies) Resident, Tokyo, Japan, October 1963 to September 1964.

National Screening Committee, Institute of International Education, San Francisco. Selection of Fulbright candidates for Asia 1965-66, 1966-67.

*Travel and Study Abroad:*

Southeast Asia, Taiwan, Japan - 1961.

Residence and research in Japan and Taiwan - 1963-64.

*Honors and Fellowships:*

Grants-in-Aid, from Institute of Asiatic Studies, University of California, 1956, 1957.

Member, Association of Asian Studies.

Member, Phi Alpha Theta - History Fraternity.

Member, Phi Kappa Phi - National Honorary Scholastic Fraternity.

Fellow, Royal Central Asian Society (London).

*Research and Publications:*

1. Articles Published:

"Japaner und Lama Priester," *Zeitschrift für Geopolitik*, Vol. XXV, No. 8 (August, 1954), 474-478.

Review Article of Louis M. J. Schram, *The Monguors of the Kansu-Tibetan Frontier*: Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, New Series, Vol. XLIV, Part I. Published in *Oriens* VIII (1957).

Contributed research to *Outer Mongolia* (psychological warfare handbook) done by Inner Asia Project University of Washington for Human Relations Area Files, Inc., 1956. Pp. 1045.



Review Article, John A. White, *The Diplomacy of the Russo-Japanese War* (Princeton, 1964) in *The Historian*, Spring 1965.

*Papers of the C.I.C. Far Eastern Language Institute: 1963* (Ann Arbor, 1964), Associate editor with Joseph Yamagiwa. "The Development of a Model for the Society and Culture of Vietnam" with John Sorenson (limited circulation, Department of the Navy) 1963. Pp. 150.

English translation editor, Tung Tso-ping, *Fifty Years of Studies in Oracle Inscriptions*. Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies (UNESCO, major project on Mutual appreciation of Eastern and Western Cultural Values), Tokyo, 1964.

2. Article in Process:

"Zen Buddhism and the Puritan Tradition in America" for *Bussei* (annual publication of the Berkeley Branch of the Buddhist Churches of America).

*Wesley P. Lloyd*

*Present Position:* Professor of Education and Dean of the Graduate School.

*Academic Degrees:*

B.S., Brigham Young University - Education.

M.S., Brigham Young University - Sociology.

Ph.D., University of Chicago - Religion.

*Professional Experience:*

Chairman, Committee on International Relations, American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1956-58.

Member, Standing Committee on International Education, American College Personnel Association.

Dean of Students and Professor of Education, Brigham Young University, 1937-60.

Dean of the Graduate School, Brigham Young University, 1960—

*Books:*

*Student Counseling in Japan*, University of Minnesota Press, 1953.

*Student Personnel Services in Universities of the World*, American Personnel and Guidance Association, Washington, D. C., 1956.

*Student Personnel Services in Japan*, American Council on Education, Washington, D.C., 1957.

*The University in the Changing Community*, American Red Cross, Washington, D.C., 1961.

*International Appointments:*

- 1951-52, Director of a team of American specialists to universities in Japan.
- 1955, Team Director - University of Tokyo.
- 1955, Consultant to universities in 23 countries in Europe, Asia and Africa representing American Personnel and Guidance Association.
- 1958, Adviser for Higher Education in Burma. The Asian Foundation.
- 1962, U.S. Department of State, Visiting Specialist for seminars in universities in Colombia.
- 1963, U.S. Department of State, Visiting Specialist in Japan.

*Honors and Fellowships:*

- Scholarships - University of Chicago - 1934-36.
- Fellow - University of Chicago, 1936-37.
- Brigham Young University Alumni Distinguished Service Award, 1964.

*Spencer John Palmer*

*Present Position:* President L.D.S. Korean Mission June 1965 - Associate Professor of History and Religion.

*Academic Degrees:*

- B.A., Brigham Young University, 1952, in Fine Arts.
- M.A., University of California (Berkeley), 1959, East Asiatic Studies.
- Ph.D., University of California (Berkeley), 1964, Asian history with a minor in Buddhism.

*Theses Subjects:*

- M.A., Korean-Japanese Relations, 1945-57.
- Ph.D., Protestant Christianity in China and Korea: The Problem of Identification with Tradition.

*Professional Background:*

- Teaching Assistant, Department of History, University of California 1959-60.
- Graduate Research Historian, Institute of International Studies, University of California, 1960-61.
- Assistant Professor, Brigham Young University, 1962-64.
- Associate Professor, Brigham Young University, 1964.

*Travel and Study Abroad:*

- Korea and Japan in the Army Chaplain Corps, 1954-56.
- Travel through southern and southwest Asia, 1956.



*Honors and Fellowships:*

Phi Theta, Oriental Languages Honor Society, University of California.

Grants-in-Aid, from Institute of Asiatic Studies, University of California, Fall and Spring, 1959-60.

Member of Membership Committee, Association for Asian Studies.

Member of Royal Asiatic Society, Korea Branch.

*International Assignment:*

International Committee on Korean Studies of the Association for Asian Studies.

*Research and Publications:*

## 1. Articles Published:

"American Gold Mining in Korea's Unsan District," *Pacific Historical Review*, XXXI, No. 4 (1962), 379-391.

"View of the Hebrews: Substitute for Inspiration?" *Brigham Young University Studies*, V (Winter 1964), 105-113, with William L. Knecht, Jr.

"Truth and Metaphor in Akutagawa's *Rashomon*," *Brigham Young University Fine Arts Festival*, 1963.

## 2. Books Published:

*Erastus and Frances Hancock: An Informal Family History* (Berkeley: Wuertz Letter Shop, 1958), Illus. Pp. 72.

*Korean-American Relations: The Period of Growing Influence, 1887-1895* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1963), Documents Pertaining to the Far Eastern Diplomacy of the United States, Appendixes. Pp. 389.

## 3. Articles in Process:

Buddhist Charges of Plagiarism Against Jesus.  
Jews and Judaism in Asia.

## 4. Books in Process:

*Korean-American Relations: The period of Retreat, 1896-1905* Volume III (Berkeley: University of California Press), Documents Pertaining to the Far Eastern Diplomacy of the United States.

*Korea and Christianity*, the problem of identification with tradition (to be published by the University of California Press).

# Brigham Young University Studies

## Index

Volume VI

Autumn 1964 and  
Winter, Spring-Summer 1965

### AUTHORS

- Anderson, Richard L., "Book Notes," 190, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Anderson, Richard L., review: Martin, *The Maze of Mormonism*, 57, Autumn 1964.
- Andrus, Hyrum L., review: Clark, *Messages of the First Presidency*, 178, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Cammann, Schuyler, "The Pair of Japanese Bronze Lanterns at Brigham Young University," 135, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Christmas, R. A., "To Joseph Smith," a poem, 24, Autumn 1964.
- Clark, Bruce B., "The Challenge and Responsibility of the L.D.S. Teacher," 25, Autumn 1964.
- Clark, Marden J., "Late on Father's Day," a poem, 176, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Farnsworth, Lee W., "China and Japan: An Analysis of Conflict," 139, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Felt, Paul E. and S. Lyman Tyler, "The Institute of American Indian Studies at Brigham Young University," 52, Autumn 1964.
- Gassman, Byron, "Religious Attitudes in the World of Humphry Clinker," 65, Winter 1965.
- Green, John A., "Marcel Schwob and 'The Talking Machine': a Tale à la Poe—via Thomas A. Edison," 41, Autumn 1964.
- Grow, Stewart L., "The Institute of Government Service," 55, Autumn 1964.
- Harris, John S., "Tag, I. D.," a poem, 100, Winter 1965.
- Hill, Douglas, "The Other Presences in Irish Life and Literature," 35, Autumn 1964.
- Hillam, Ray Cole, "The Postwar Appeal of Communism in Malaya, Vietnam and the Philippines," 153, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Hyer, Paul V., "Politics and Religion on China's Mongolian Frontier," 163, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Jensen, DeLamar, "The 'Renaissance' in Recent Thought: Fifteen Years of Interpretation," 3, Autumn 1964.



- Larson, Clinton F., "An English Graveyard," a poem, 40, Autumn 1964.
- Madsen, Truman G., review: Cobb, *A Christian Natural Theology*, 186, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Palmer, Spencer J., "Uses of the Five Elements in East Asia," 123, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Sperry, S. B., review: Skousen, *The Third Thousand Years*, 189, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Swensen, Russel B., review: Williamson, *The World of Josephus*, 183, Spring-Summer 1965.
- Thayer, Douglas H., "His Wonders to Perform," 101, Winter 1965.
- Tyler, S. Lyman, "The Library and the Availability of Knowledge," 48, Autumn 1964.
- Tyler, S. Lyman and Paul E. Felt, "The Institute of American Indian Studies at Brigham Young University," 52, Autumn 1964.
- Wirthlin, Richard B., "The Impact of Inflation on the Developing Economy: The Brazilian Case," 73, Winter 1965.
- Young, Karl, "Winter Feast at San Ildefonso," 93, Winter 1965.

## ARTICLES, FICTION, AND BOOK REVIEWS

- "Asian Research Institute Personnel," 192, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Book Notes," by Richard L. Anderson, 190, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "The Challenge and Responsibility of the L.D.S. Teacher," by Bruce B. Clark, 25, Autumn 1964.
- "China and Japan: An Analysis of Conflict," by Lee W. Farnsworth, 139, Spring-Summer 1965.
- A Christian Natural Theology*, by John B. Cobb, Jr., review by Truman G. Madsen, 186, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "His Wonders to Perform," by Douglas H. Thayer, 101, Winter 1965.
- "The Impact of Inflation on the Developing Economy: The Brazilian Case," by Richard B. Wirthlin, 73, Winter 1965.
- "The Institute of American Indian Studies at Brigham Young University," by Paul E. Felt and S. Lyman Tyler, 52, Autumn 1964.
- "The Institute of Government Service," by Stewart L. Grow, 55, Autumn 1964.
- "The Library and the Availability of Knowledge," by S. Lyman Tyler, 48, Autumn 1964.
- "Marcel Schwob and 'The Talking Machine': a Tale à la Poe—via Thomas A. Edison," by John A. Green, 41, Autumn 1964.
- The Maze of Mormonism*, by Walter R. Martin, review by Richard L. Anderson, 57, Autumn 1964.
- Messages of the First Presidency*, edited by James R. Clark, review by Hyrum L. Andrus, 178, Spring-Summer 1965.

- "Mormon Bibliography 1964," 171, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "The Newly Established Asian Research Institute," 122, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "The Other Presences in Irish Life and Literature," by Douglas Hill, 35, Autumn 1964.
- "The Pair of Japaneze Bronze Lanterns at Brigham Young University," by Schuyler Cammann, 135, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Politics and Religion on China's Mongolian Frontier," by Paul V. Hyer, 163, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "The Postwar Appeal of Communism in Malaya, Vietnam and the Philippines," by Ray Cole Hillam, 153, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Religious Attitudes in the World of Humphry Clinker," by Byron Gassman, 65, Winter 1965.
- "The 'Renaissance' in Recent Thought: Fifteen Years of Interpretation," by DeLamar Jensen, 3, Autumn 1964.
- The Third Thousand Years*, by W. Cleon Skousen, review by S. B. Sperry, 189, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Uses of the Five Elements in East Asia," by Spencer J. Palmer, 123, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Winter Feast at San Ildefonso," by Karl Young, 93, Winter 1965.
- The World of Josephus*, by G. A. Williamson, review by Russel B. Swensen, 183, Spring-Summer 1965.

## POETRY

- "An English Graveyard," by Clinton F. Larson, 40, Autumn 1964.
- "Late on Father's Day," by Marden J. Clark, 176, Spring-Summer 1965.
- "Tag, I. D.," by John S. Harris, 100, Winter 1965.
- "To Joseph Smith," by R. A. Christmas, 24, Autumn 1964.