The opinions and statements expressed by contributors to *Brigham Young University Studies* are their own and do not necessarily reflect the views of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Brigham Young University, the editor or editorial board.

Editor
Book Review Editor
University Editor

Charles D. Tate, Jr.
Richard L. Anderson
Ernest L. Olson

Volume VIII  AUTUMN 1967  Number 1

CONTENTS

Brigham Young University Studies: Its Purpose, Its Freedom, Its Scope, An Editorial  Charles D. Tate, Jr.  1
An Interview, A Poem  G. E. Robertson  5
Astronomy, A Poem  Marden J. Clark  6
The Origin, Structure, and Evolution of the Stars  D. H. McNamara  7
Innocence, A Poem  Naomi-Ruth  22
The New Morality: Research Bases for Decision in Today's World  Harold T. Christensen  23
Fisherman, A Poem  Harrison Davis  36
Eternal Progression and the Foreknowledge of God  James R. Harris  37
Sawing Wood, An Etching  Mabonri Young
A Note on "Sawing Wood"
Sonnet: To Peace, A Poem  Marden J. Clark  60
Freedom and the American Cowboy  Neal E. Lambert  61
Camp Floyd Centennial, A Poem  Clinton F. Larson  72
Mormonism and the Germans: An Annotated Bibliography, 1848-1966  D. L. Ashliman  73
Book Reviews  95
Brigham Young University Studies is published quarterly by Brigham Young University. Send manuscripts to Editor, Brigham Young University Studies, A-283 JKB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah 84601. Enclose self-addressed, stamped envelope.

Subscription is $5.00 for four numbers; $9.00 for eight numbers; and $12.00 for twelve numbers. Single copies are $2.00 each. The rate to bona fide students is $4.00 for four issues. Please send subscriptions to Publication Sales Department, 132 HRCB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah 84601.
Editorial

Brigham Young University Studies: Its Purpose, Its Freedom, Its Scope

CHARLES D. TATE, JR.*
Editor

In this our initial editorial it is our desire to present the motivation behind the publication of BYU Studies and to set before our readers the policies under which our editorship will be carried out.

The Purpose of BYU Studies

The purpose of BYU Studies is to be a voice for the community of LDS scholars, as has been its purpose since its inception back in 1959. Those who look closely will see that this issue is the first number for the eighth volume; thus BYU Studies is not a new journal. But we hope it is a reactivated, a revitalized journal that will provoke intellectual and spiritual growth in its readers and contributors.

When BYU Studies first began publication in 1959, the motivating thought was that it should not be a general, not even a Mormon-studies journal in the usual sense of those terms, but that it should really be a voice for the Latter-day Saint scholar writing articles about how he correlated his scientific, literary, sociological, or psychological research and his religious convictions. Such articles could find little if any opportunity for publication in any of the then existing journals. In the early issues of BYU Studies, we can read several such articles; but for numerous reasons, partly editorial and partly administrational, the journal failed to grow to meet its challenge, to fulfill the need of the LDS scholarly community to give them a voice wherein they might express their thinking and findings. With the coming issues of BYU Studies, we again dedicate its pages to the pursuit of truth, no matter where

*Dr. Tate is assistant professor of English at Brigham Young University.
it may be found, and to the rooting out of error, no matter what its source. This specific charge was given to the Brigham Young University faculty in particular and to the whole community of LDS scholars in general by President Hugh B. Brown at the Preschool Faculty Conference in Provo in 1961.¹

Let's talk more specifically of this challenge. The intellectuals in the Church have long been critical of those members who seem to embrace the gospel on a purely emotional level, who feel with the heart but do little with the head. On their part, the heart feelers have long felt out of sorts with and suspicious of the intellectuals who can't let anything lie, who are forever bringing up new ideas to challenge them to think, to understand, but who often close their own hearts and emotions to the gospel because they cannot explain or do not trust them intellectually. Too often it has been easy for each group to write off the other and each go its own way. BUT NEITHER GROUP BRINGS A FULNESS OF TRUTH TO ITS MEMBERS! The full quest for truth, as President Brown said in 1947 in the introduction to a series of radio addresses on building a rational faith, must "involve the heart as well as the head, something which can be felt as well as thought. Emotion is not enough, cold intellect will not suffice, but rational faith fired by spiritual insight ..."² (Italics added) will lead us to truth. How much or how little each man is able to find in his search will remain his individual challenge. The purpose of BYU Studies is to give a voice to those who are striving in find truth, who are endeavoring to synthesize the spiritual and intellectual in their search, who are seeking "learning by study and also by faith." (D&C 88:118)

The Freedom of BYU Studies

Whatever the blend of the heart and the head, the synthesis of the spiritual and the intellectual in each man's search, he must be free to search and to express his thoughts and findings, being completely honest with himself and his Creator. Such was the heart of President Brown's challenge to the

¹Hugh B. Brown, Address to BYU Faculty, September 11, 1961, published in "Preschool Conference Addresses" (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Bulletin, LVIII, No. 38).

faculty in that 1961 address. We were so impressed with what he said that we quote a paragraph:

We [the members of the Board of Education of the Church] would like you to know we are interested in academic research. You must go out on the research front and continue to explore the vast unknown. You should be in the forefront of learning in all fields, for revelation does not come only through the prophet of God nor only directly from heaven in visions or dreams. Revelation may come in the laboratory, out of the test tube, out of the thinking mind and the inquiring soul, out of search and research and prayer and inspiration. You must be unafraid to contend for what you are thinking, unafraid to dissent if you are informed and honest. We must combat error with truth in this divided and imperiled world and do it with the unaltering faith that God is still in His heaven even though all is not well with the world.  

We say let this charge from one of the great leaders of the Church be our creed, to search with all our hearts and minds in the faith that the source of all knowledge might reveal truths to us in our laboratories, our studies, or our secret places of prayer. Then let us write up our thoughts, our findings, our inspirations, and share them with our fellow searchers within the community of LDS scholars through the pages of BYU Studies. Each author must remember that in what he has to say he speaks for himself and not for the Church, not for Brigham Young University, nor even for the Editorial Board of BYU Studies. We lay no claim to being official spokesmen for the Church, and readers who refuse to accept this fact will misread our purpose and our desires. This disclaimer of speaking for the Church will be printed on the inside of the front cover of each issue of our journal, for we do not purport to be an official organ through which Church policy is set and made known. Any opinions expressed in any articles published in BYU Studies will necessarily be those of their authors.

In light of President Brown's admonition to study, to think, to dissent in honesty, we feel that we must challenge the often-voiced claim that there is no real academic freedom or freedom from censorship within the Church and that to get at the real truth we must go outside the control of the Church where we

--- Address to BYU Faculty, p. 4.
may "freely" say what we think and believe. This basic assumption says that in its estimation the Church as a whole and its leadership in general are either so immature or so weak in their positions that they cannot or will not tolerate freedom of inquiry and expression which will look at all things with the critical eye of scholarship. There is also an interesting assumption that to be valuable, scholarship must be critical, analytical. This is not the whole fact. We challenge the claim that any group or any journal however honest and pure its motives can better serve the Church outside its support and control than can BYU Studies which is supported by the Church and freely places itself under its control. We challenge the assumption that scholarship must always be analytical and critical to be valid. As scholarly effort, critical synthesis is just as valid as critical analysis, but it is much more difficult to achieve. This, then, is the real challenge that BYU Studies wholeheartedly accepts. We hope in our coming issues to prove to the world that we do have academic freedom and freedom of expression within the Church, that the place to help build the kingdom is from within not from without, and that the Church can give voice to constructive criticism without the threat of dire consequences for such expression.

The Scope of BYU Studies

Though our primary interest in the pages of BYU Studies is toward articles dealing with Latter-day Saint thought, history, theology, and related subjects, we have been commanded and admonished to search out the truth in all things, to learn

of things both in heaven and in the earth, and under the earth; things which have been, things which are, things which must shortly come to pass; things which are at home, things which are abroad; the wars and the perplexities of the nations, and the judgments which are on the land; and a knowledge also of countries and kingdoms—That ye may be prepared in all things when I shall send you again to magnify the calling whereunto I have called you, and the mission with which I have commissioned you. (D&C 88:79-80. See also 93:53)

The scope of BYU Studies is this fuller search for truth, for knowledge in all fields of learning. It is this concept of its scope that will place articles like "The Origin, Structure, and
EDITORIAL


Such is the challenge of BYU Studies to its editor, its Editorial Board, and its contributors and readers. Remembering Jacob’s observations in 2 Nephi 9:28 that when worldly wisdom sets aside the counsel of God such wisdom becomes profitless foolishness, we wish you challenging reading and spiritual and intellectual growth, for “to be learned is good if they hearken unto the counsels of God.” (verse 29)

* * *

An Interview

GLEN E. ROBERTSON*

Like a Mormon Buddha
Behind a broad expanse of desk
Eyes narrowed, reflective,
Fingertips meeting exactly,
Taking your measure slowly,
So very slowly, minutes ticking,
Swinging metro-gnome-like
In swivel chair from side to side;
Ponderous body in ponderous chair,
Verifying your mind,
Calculating your soul.

*Mr. Robertson is instructor of English at College of the Sequoias in California.
Astronomy

MARDEN J. CLARK*

He told us of the thousand million stars
In each of a hundred million galaxies,
Of hydrogen exploding, and light-measured years.
Ten to the twentieth power may only tease
The mind, but stops the soul with zeroes piled up—
A hundred thousand million million suns!
How else make man alive to what it means to sup
From earth’s four billion years of growing pains?
Ten million years, four gases free, and energy:
Amino acids, replicating, come alive!
The What? the How? he tried to tell; the Why?
He left to us. My daughter, still not five,
Restive in her hour of time and foot of space,
Stretched up and planted kisses on my face.

*Dr. Clark is professor of English at Brigham Young University.
The Origin, Structure, and Evolution of the Stars*

D. H. McNamara**

A glance at the stars on a dark, moonless night away from the lights and other distractions of the city is one of nature’s most rewarding scenes. Although the number of stars in the dark vault of the heavens appears to the eye to be incredibly large, only three thousand are visible at any one time. But with the aid of even small telescopes it is possible to observe a million stars, and we are able to photograph well over a hundred million stars with a 200-inch telescope at Mount Palomar. All these stars belong to a unit in space that we commonly call the galaxy, although our galaxy is only one among millions of other galaxies that are found in the universe.

Even to the eye the stars are not uniformly distributed over the sky. They appear to be strongly concentrated to a faint diffuse band of light that we call the Milky Way. The stars tend to concentrate to the Milky Way because the galaxy is a flattened disk, as illustrated in Figure 1. As we look along the plane of the disk, we observe the largest number of stars (corresponding to the Milky Way). At right angles to this plane, the stars thin out rapidly and we see only the stars that might happen to be relatively close to us. As illustrated in Figure 1, the sun lies near the central plane of our galaxy about 27,000 light-years (one light-year equals 6 trillion miles) from the galactic center. The sun is one of approximately 200 billion stars found in our galaxy and revolves in an orbit around the galactic center in a period of approximately 200 million years. Although the total number of stars in the galaxy is very large, the average distance between them (4 light-years) is very great. Let us assume for a moment that we can

---

*Given as the Fourth Annual Faculty Lecture at Brigham Young University, March 29, 1967.

**Dr. McNamara has been on the Brigham Young University faculty since 1955 and is presently professor of physics and astronomy; he was responsible for the inauguration of the graduate program in astrophysics at BYU.
shrink the stars down to the size of marbles. On this scale the average distance between the stars would be about fifty miles.

**THE STRUCTURE OF STARS**

Stars, like people, show a great diversity in their physical characteristics. We find, for example, considerable differences in size, temperature, color, mass, luminosity, and other properties. One of the most fruitful ways of investigating the physical properties of the stars is to plot their colors against their luminosities. This type of plot is known as a color-magnitude or Hertzsprung-Russell diagram (H-R diagram for short). This diagram is based on brightness measurements of stars corrected for distance and accurate measurements of colors or surface temperatures. The vertical scale is the intrinsic brightness (luminosity) expressed in terms of the sun's brightness. This is identical to the ratio of the energy radiated by the star to the energy radiated by the sun. The color or temperature is plotted along the horizontal scale with the blue or high temperature stars on the left and the red or low temperature stars on the right. Figure 2 illustrates the positions occupied in the H-R diagram by the stars found in the neighborhood of the sun. The shaded areas indicate a strong concentration of stars;
few stars are found outside these areas. Most of the stars in the solar neighborhood fall on a diagonal line called the main-sequence. The sun itself is a yellow main-sequence star with a surface temperature of 10,000° F. The blue-white stars at the upper end of the main-sequence with surface temperatures of about 50,000° F radiate ten thousand times as much energy as the sun, while the red main-sequence stars with surface temperatures of 5,000° F radiate only one ten-thousandth as much energy as the sun. In a sample volume of space, the lower main-sequence stars far outnumber the upper main-sequence stars.
Although the majority of stars lie on the main-sequence, we do find stars that populate other well-defined regions of the diagram—for instance, the yellow, orange, and red giants that are about 100 times brighter than the sun lying above and to the right of the main-sequence. A few stars are found in the supergiant region at the upper edge of the diagram; and another group of white and yellow stars, hundreds of times less luminous than the sun, called white dwarfs, is found in the lower left region of this diagram. Since a yellow supergiant star at the same temperature as the sun radiates the same amount of energy per square inch of the surface, it must have a surface area 10,000 times greater than the sun or a radius 100 times greater (since surface area is proportional to the square of the radius) to radiate 10,000 times as much energy per second. By a similar argument we can show that a typical white dwarf star must have a radius about 1/100th that of the sun or about the size of the earth itself. By studying the positions of stars in the H-R diagram, we have discovered that stars differ enormously in their sizes and also in the amount of energy they radiate.

A significant question of physical makeup of stars arises: What is the most fundamental physical difference between the low-luminosity red stars of the main-sequence and the high-luminosity blue stars of the upper main-sequence? The answer to this question can fortunately be given because many main-sequence stars are double stars. As a matter of fact, as many as one-half of the stars that appear single to the eye are actually binary systems. These stars move in orbits around their common center of gravity, indicating they attract each other. Since the force of attraction between them depends on their masses, the measurement of this force allows us to "weigh" them—that is, to find their masses. The data available from double stars indicate that the low-luminosity red stars have masses about one-fifth the solar mass. The yellow stars that lie near the sun in the H-R diagram have just one solar mass, and the upper blue-white main-sequence stars are as much as twenty times as massive as the sun. These results lead us to an important discovery: the mass-luminosity relation, which indicates that the more massive stars are the more luminous and thus expend their fuel at a much faster rate than low mass stars. The luminosity depends very critically upon the
mass. If the mass is doubled, the luminosity is increased by twelve. Evidently the most fundamental physical characteristic of a main-sequence star is its mass. The mass determines the luminosities and surface temperatures.

THE ORIGIN OF STARS

Now that we have considered some of the basic physical properties of the stars, I want to raise some issues that perhaps you have never thought about before: How and when were the stars born? Are stars being formed at the present time? What is their ultimate fate?

To make a beginning with the first question, we must realize that the space between the stars (interstellar space) is not entirely empty. Scattered throughout the galaxy is a diffuse gas, consisting primarily of hydrogen atoms, that is concentrated frequently in clouds. The interstellar gas is so rarefied that a volume element of one cubic inch in interstellar space would contain only one or two atoms. Some of the cloud complexes, however, would contain a thousand times as many atoms. In addition to the gas, we find tiny dust particles about the size of the wavelength of visible light (0.00001 inches) that are very effective in scattering the light of distant stars—acting like a smog to hinder our view.

Although the interstellar gas and dust are a very low density medium, the galaxy is so huge that the total mass of this material accounts for about one-tenth the mass of the galaxy—quite enough to provide material for the formation of new stars. Astronomers believe that initially the galaxy was an ellipsoid of gas that tended to flatten to its present form because of its rotation. The physical processes by which the first stars were formed are not well understood, but local condensations of gas may have cooled and the hotter surrounding gas caused the cooler gas to begin to contract under compression. We have already pointed out that at the present time the interstellar medium is tied up primarily in cloud complexes. A typical cloud may be thirty light-years in diameter and contain enough material to produce a hundred stars. Figure 3 is a photograph of such a cloud or nebula in the constellation of Monoceros. The cloud shines by virtue of the high-luminosity stars embedded in the nebula, and some dark foreground
clouds are seen projected on the nebula. Once the clouds begin to condense, they continue to contract under their gravitation. Many astronomers believe that some of the small dark globules found throughout the bright nebulous regions (as can be seen in Figure 3) are the initial phases of star formation. As the protostar continues to contract, one-half of the potential energy stored up in the gravitational field is converted to heat and

Figure 3. Nebula in the constellation of Monoceros photographed in red light with the 48-inch Schmidt telescope. This nebula is particularly rich in dark globules (dark clouds seen projected on the bright nebula).
increases the central temperature and the other half is simply radiated away.

Why does the protostar stop contracting? Precisely, as pointed out above, because the internal temperature rises, and when the temperature reaches a certain critical value, energy begins to be generated in the interior. Eventually the energy generated in the interior compensates for the energy radiated away on the surface. Contraction ceases and we end up with an enormous sphere of hot gas, with a central temperature of the order of fifteen million degrees. The star is now in a state of delicate balance—the gas and radiation pressure that tend to force the star to expand are just balanced by the gravitational force that tends to make the star collapse. Sophisticated mathematical calculations on large computers indicate that when the energy produced in the interior compensates for the energy losses at the surface, the star is a typical main-sequence star. If the protostar starts initially with twenty solar masses, it reaches the main-sequence at the upper left of the H-R diagram along the evolutionary track (dashed lines) shown in Figure 4. A protostar with one solar mass will reach the same position in the H-R diagram occupied by the sun; if it has twice the mass of the sun, it will reach the main-sequence with twelve times the sun’s luminosity, and so on. Note that the gravitational contraction stage is much shorter for the more massive stars than the less massive stars. For example, the sun requires about fifty million years to pass through the contraction stage, whereas a star with twenty solar masses requires only 300,000 years, as indicated in Figure 4.

Having reached a stage of equilibrium, how long do the stars remain on the main-sequence and what type of stars do they become after leaving the main-sequence? To answer this question we must first identify the source of the star’s energy. We have already pointed out that the internal temperatures of main-sequence stars are very high—on the order of 15,000,000° F to 30,000,000° F. Indeed, if we could peel off the outermost layers of the sun and expose the earth directly to the intense radiation of the inner part, the earth would be vaporized within a few minutes. At such high temperatures the electrons are stripped from the nuclei of the atoms, and the nuclei move about at very high velocities. Collisions between the particles are very frequent—most of the time they merely bounce off
Figure 4. Evolutionary tracks on to (dashed line) and off (solid lines) the main-sequence. The times given are the intervals of time required for a protostar to contract to the main-sequence and the time intervals a star remains on the main-sequence.

each other, but occasionally they will interact in a nuclear reaction to form a heavier nucleus and release energy according to the Einstein equation, \( E = mc^2 \), where \( E \) is the energy released when a mass, \( m \), is transformed into energy. The symbol \( c \) is the velocity of light.

There must be an enormous amount of nuclear fuel to have kept the sun shining at about its present rate for the last five billion years (the estimated age of the earth). A study of the possible nuclear processes shows that nuclear reactions involving the most abundant element hydrogen can successfully
account for the energy radiated by the sun and stars. There are two series of reactions, which we shall not describe in detail here, that provide the energy at the central temperatures calculated for main-sequence stars. Both of these reactions have the same final result—the conversion of four hydrogen nuclei into one helium nucleus. About seven-tenths of one percent of the mass is converted to energy. Utilizing Einstein’s equation it is easy to show that the sun must convert four and a half million tons of matter into energy every second to maintain its present brightness. In the deep interior of the sun this would require more than 500 million tons of hydrogen converted to helium each second.

**THE EVOLUTION OF STARS**

How long can the sun shine, expending energy at its present rate? The sun has only so much hydrogen; and, when it is used up, the sun must change its structure. Starting with the "cosmic abundance" of hydrogen, it is easy to show that the sun will exhaust twelve percent of its hydrogen supply in about ten billion years. The twelve-percent value has been chosen because calculations with large computers show that a star begins to evolve up and to the right of the main-sequence when about twelve percent of its mass of hydrogen is converted to helium. Ten billion years is the time interval that the sun will remain a main-sequence star. Since the sun is probably about five billion years old at the present time, it is a middle-aged star.

Now the mass-luminosity relation that we have alluded to previously indicates that the more massive a star is, the brighter it is, which implies that it expends its fuel at a greater rate. As we have pointed out previously, if the mass is doubled, the luminosity is not just doubled but increased by a factor of about twelve. The more massive stars are spendthrifts, expending their energy at prodigious rates—so rapidly they cannot last very long. We may calculate the time a star spends on the main-sequence with the aid of the equation

\[ \text{lifetime (years)} = 10^{10} \left( \frac{\text{Mass}^*}{\text{Mass}_\odot} \right) \left( \frac{\text{Lum}_\odot}{\text{Lum}^*} \right), \]

where Lum_\odot is the luminosity of the sun and Lum^* is the luminosity of the star. For example, a star of ten solar masses radiating 10,000 times as much energy as the sun would remain
a main-sequence star for only ten million years (10^7 yrs.)—a brief moment compared with the sun's age. On the other hand, a main-sequence red star, with a mass of one-half that of the sun, radiating energy at the rate of one one-hundredth that of the sun could remain on the main-sequence for more than a trillion years (10^{12} yrs.); practically indefinitely. The solid curve in Figure 4 illustrates the evolutionary tracks of stars off the main-sequence and also gives the time spent as main-sequence stars for stars in different regions of the H-R diagram. Our calculations indicate that the more massive stars "burn" their fuel so rapidly they cannot last very long. Some of these bright stars must have been formed more recently than the earth, perhaps some even as recently as the appearance of early man. By the same arguments, there must have been stars that were in the sky a billion years ago that exhausted their energy supplies and simply faded away.

It may appear surprising at first that when a star begins to evolve away from the main-sequence it moves to the right in the H-R diagram. When about twelve percent of the hydrogen fuel has been burned, the helium content is built up in the interior—the core consequently contracts, releasing energy that forces the outer layers to swell and become cooler. The energy source is now shifted to an envelope around the core, as illustrated in Figure 5. The increase in the luminosity of the star resulting from increased size more than compensates for the decrease in luminosity caused by the drop in temperature, so the star moves up to the right in the H-R diagram. This continues until the star becomes a red giant. At this stage the central temperatures may be high enough (200,000,000° F) to ignite helium as a new nuclear fuel. In this new reaction helium nuclei are converted to the nuclei of carbon and other heavier elements. The length of time that a star remains a red giant is not well known, but the observational evidence indicates that it is short compared to the main-sequence phase.

What chance does the astronomer on the earth have of catching a star going through some of the antics that we have described? It is practically impossible because star aging is slow on the timescale of human life. On a relative scale the "lifetime" of a star like the sun is about 10^9 greater than the lifetime of a man.
Changes of Internal Structure of Star With Time

Figure 5. A star’s expansion as the energy-producing region is shifted from the core to an envelope around the core.

To illustrate our problem let us imagine that a visitor from another planet has arrived here in Provo to observe the birth, growth, and death of human life. To make his observing time commensurate with the astronomer’s, we can allow him only five seconds. Humans do not change in this time interval—and neither do the stars in the lifetime of an astronomer. Consequently, indirect methods are required to verify our theories, but we do not have to wait for the changes to occur if we can identify, by observations, which are young stars, which are old stars, and what the course of evolution may be in between.

Fortunately, many stars are frequently found in large groupings called clusters, as illustrated in Figure 6. These stars must have all been formed at approximately the same time in a space roughly the size occupied by the group at the present time. One of the important advantages in studying these clusters is that all the stars are at the same distance so that differences in apparent brightness correspond to differences in their true luminosity. Now even a cursory examination of a cluster such as that shown in Figure 6 indicates that stars differ considerably in brightness and consequently must differ in their masses—because of the mass-luminosity relation. A specific cluster, therefore, affords us an opportunity to study the effects evolutionary changes have on individual stars; and moreover, by
comparing one cluster with another, we can anticipate finding differences between them that may reveal the stellar aging process.

We have already pointed out that when a star depletes its hydrogen supply by about twelve percent, it moves to the right in the H-R diagram. According to the equation on page 15, the more massive stars will evolve first because they consume their hydrogen supply faster. Figure 7 shows how we would anticipate individual stars to move away from the main-
sequence. The brightest and more massive stars have evolved considerably, while the less massive stars on the main-sequence have not yet moved significantly from their positions on the initial main-sequence. This "turn-off" from the main-sequence is actually verified by studies of star clusters. Figure 8 shows the H-R diagrams of several clusters. It is evident that the h and x Persei cluster has upper main-sequence stars well represented as well as a number of supergiant red stars. The Pleiades cluster, on the other hand, shows a "turn-off" from the main-sequence and has no stars brighter than 1,000 times the bright-
ness of the sun; while the Hyades cluster has no members brighter than 100 times the brightness of the sun. The M 67 cluster has the lowest "turn-off" point lying just above the sun. Note how the brighter stars of M 67 are red giants lying just below the Hyades red giants.

It is clear that the h and x Persei cluster is the youngest and M 67 must be the oldest. The two youngest clusters, h and x Persei and the Pleiades, are still associated with bright and dark interstellar clouds. In an older cluster like the Hyades or NGC 752, the more massive and luminous stars have depleted their hydrogen fuel and have evolved off the main-sequence through the red giant stage and faded out, possibly passing through the white-dwarf stage (the celestial graveyard). The only stars now left are the less massive ones, which
expend their fuel less rapidly and consequently have longer lives.

It is of interest that the ages of the clusters can be determined from the "turn-off" points in the H-R diagram. For example, the ages of stars in the h and x Persei cluster are between 5 and 10 million years; in the Pleiades cluster, 100 million years; in the Hyades cluster, 1 billion years; and in the M 67 cluster, about 10 billion years.

It is not entirely clear just what happens to the stars immediately after the red-giant stage, but the observational evidence indicates that they probably move from the right to the left on a roughly horizontal track. After all energy sources have been exhausted, the star must collapse and become a white dwarf. Before a massive star can become a white dwarf—the kind all good stars become when they die—it must eject vast quantities of gas back into the interstellar medium, because white dwarfs cannot have masses exceeding one and two-tenths the solar mass.

**SUMMARY**

In summary, stars form from contracting gas and dust clouds composed chiefly of hydrogen. They contract in relatively short astronomical time intervals. The contraction is arrested when they begin to convert hydrogen into helium as main-sequence stars. The time spent as a main-sequence star depends upon the mass—the more massive stars departing first from the main-sequence. Stars evolve to the right in the H-R diagram and become giant stars expanding and probably ejecting matter back into space, and then pass rapidly through a number of other stages until they collapse and become white dwarfs when all energy sources have been depleted. The white dwarfs gradually cool and probably end up as cold clinkers in the heavens.

The theory of stellar evolution indicates that the lifetime of a star like the sun is almost staggering, but we are at the same time inescapably faced with the fact that such a star is not a timeless structure. All the available evidence we can muster indicates that some time in the future (perhaps five billion years from now) the sun will evolve rapidly to the red-giant stage. The energy output will increase by 100 times its present value. The surface temperature of the earth will
increase to such a high value that life on the earth will be impossible. After all its nuclear fuel has been used up, the sun will begin to collapse to become a white dwarf, no larger than the earth in size. With further passage of aeons of time, the sun will cool from a white dwarf to a dull red one and finally will fade completely away.

The theory of stellar evolution outlined above meets all the tests of a great scientific theory: relative simplicity, fruitful in its predictions and explanations, and intellectually satisfying. It gives the astronomers a broad framework to view the way we have come during the last fifty years of stellar research and points the direction we must go in the future. Like many scientific theories, part will prove to be wrong, but an appreciable part is almost certainly correct. Only a future generation of astronomers will be able to sift out the errors that are now undetected.

* * *

_Innocence_

NAOMI-RUTH*

The faint flutter of heart
Believes the soul is,
And would I inform the mystery
    Of its own understanding—
    Or be the partaker.
If only the pastime were sure
And replenished in marvel,
For secrets are but the known
Enrobed in innocence.

*Naomi Ruth Peterson, a former student at Brigham Young University, now lives in Provo.
The New Morality: Research Bases for Decision in Today’s World*

HAROLD T. CHRISTENSEN**

I was once asked the somewhat startling question: "Harold, are you a Mormon or a sociologist?" My answer was a quick and brief "yes," for, though the sociologist, as scientist, looks for answers to his questions through empirical observations and objective analysis, while the Latter-day Saint leans heavily upon faith and obedience to authority, I do not believe these two approaches to truth are mutually exclusive. I am both a Mormon and a sociologist and I seek to harmonize these two positions—seeing them, not as contradictions, but as being complementary and mutually reinforcing. Truth is truth, whether discovered by the scientist or revealed to the religionist; and total truth by whatever route it is understood cannot be in conflict with itself. In my humble opinion, the unique mission of Brigham Young University is to combine fact with faith, to team the intellectual with the spiritual without the weakening of either—indeed to the strengthening of both.

But I have been invited to this platform to treat a specific topic from the standpoint of analysis and research. The topic is a highly important though sensitive one: sexual morality. Since most of what I shall have to say will be objective and analytical, my own value position may not always be apparent. Let me therefore make two things very clear in the beginning: (1) I personally believe in the principle of chastity; this has been my upbringing and it is my present value position. (2) If I say, as I shall, that science can provide a basis for moral decision, I will only mean that it can help—not that science alone is sufficient.

THE NEW MORALITY

The term morality is used commonly to designate conduct that is considered "good" or "right," frequently conceived in

*Brigham Young University Forum Address, June 29, 1967.
**Dr. Christensen is professor of sociology at Purdue University.
terms of absolutes. But questions of ultimates and absolutes lie outside the reach of science, and the best the scientist can do with them, in fact, all he can do as scientist—is to maintain suspended judgment and apply objective analysis. Assertion without evidence is the essence of dogmatism and the scientist as well as the religionist can be dogmatic though to do so puts him beyond his data. Dogmatism in either camp is an unfortunate occurrence.

There probably is less consensus over sex values today than at any other time in history. The simple folk cultures of the past, with their clear and homogeneous norms, have given ground to complex civilizations such as our own, where change and heterogeneity are the order of the day. Old norms are being challenged and weakened without any real agreement as to what the replacements shall be.

Opinions range all the way from regarding sex as basically evil and at best tolerated for purposes of reproduction, to looking at it as essentially good and demanding of maximum expression both in and out of marriage. There are, of course, more moderate positions in between these two extremes.

The Judeo-Christian tradition. American sex norms have been rooted in the Christian movement, which in turn had its beginnings among the ancient Hebrews. The Hebrews regarded woman's sex functions as impure and coitus outside of marriage as a grievous sin—especially for the woman, who, when she offended, was sometimes even stoned to death. With Christianity came a slight softening of the code but also the addition of new elements. It was Saint Paul who promulgated the notion that celibacy is preferable to marriage, though conceding that if one cannot contain himself "it is better to marry than to burn (1 Corinthians 7:79). The notion that sex is sinful became particularly strong during the Middle Ages and it was then that celibate religious orders had their greatest development. With the Reformation, these interpretations became less harsh. Nevertheless, the code that was transplanted to America carried with it many restrictions: sex was regarded suspiciously as a prime source of evil, at best to be tolerated and only then within marriage and chiefly for purposes of reproduction.
Within the Judeo-Christian tradition, it has been enough to say that ”God has spoken.” The source and the rationale for the chastity norm it has promoted have been concepts of divine will. Followers of this tradition have not felt compelled to ”prove” their position, only to believe and obey.

The so-called ”new morality.” But the Industrial Revolution has ushered in an ”Age of Science” and, in the spirit of the day, people are questioning and looking for proofs—even in the area of sexual behavior. Furthermore, since science sets the tone or style for this modern era, many people now do not want to appear godly or to be labeled a moralist; they prefer to ”play it cool” and to be thought of as being rational, objective, and progressive. For many, it almost appears as if the ”suspended judgment” value of science is resulting in a noninvolvement stance in regard to community affairs.

There is, of course, a large number of factors which explain the shift over the last half century or so toward more liberal sex codes: the demoralizing effects of modern war, the newer freedoms given to women and youth, the invention of the automobile, the perfecting of contraception, the barrage of stimulation coming from the mass media, etc. Certainly, also, the recent Supreme Court decisions against censorship have had an effect. We simply list these developments without elaboration and without judgment, but with the realization that they all interrelate and that they get their impetus from the secular tone of this modern age.

At any rate, the lid is off. Today almost anything goes—in print, in speech, in entertainment, in behavior. Pornography (at least all but the very ”hardest” of the hard core) is readily available. There are ”filthy speech movements” and ”free sex movements” in different parts of the country. There are topless entertainers. There are mate-swapping clubs. Hour restrictions for coeds and regulations against mixed-sex visiting in dormitory rooms are being lifted on many college campuses. Dress is more casual and more revealing. Dancing is less inhibited. Petting is more public. All in all, it is as if a pendulum had been released and swung far to the opposite side before settling to a more moderate balance; some of today’s sex practices are extremes, which are not shared by the majority and
which may prove to be but temporary—though of this last, one cannot be sure.

For many, the new morality is essentially a "fun morality." They welcome the newer freedoms for the opportunities these bring to engage in personal thrills or "kicks." Sometimes the behavior is thought through and well rationalized, but often it is defended simply on the basis that enjoying oneself is good—and that, since sex is fun, just about all sex is good. They remain oriented to temporary pleasures and in this lose sight of the more lasting satisfactions which come from adherence to eternal values.

There are, of course, serious and responsible scholars who take the liberal position. Typical of these was the late anthropologist, Bronislaw Malinowski. He argued—not for complete sexual freedom to be sure—but for limited and regulated coitus outside of marriage nevertheless, justified on two counts: (1) providing, through trial and error, a safer method of selecting a marriage partner; and (2) serving as a safety valve, actually making marriage more stable by draining off some of the cruder sexual impulses and separating these from the sentiment of affection between the spouses. Malinowski, whether one judges his position as right or wrong, certainly challenged the notion of inherent rightness or wrongness of sex outside of marriage and helped open the way for objective inquiry.

At the level of popularization in the mass media, Playboy Magazine stands out. It is a sophisticated but, I think, irresponsible approach to sexual freedom and enjoyment. The "playboy philosophy," developed in a long series of articles by the editor, Hugh Hefner, attacks conventional morality and attempts to build a rationale for sex outside of marriage. The photographs play up the seminude female figure, and these, together with the jokes and many of the articles, drive hard on the theme that sex is fun.

Absolute versus relative values. What has been said up to this point makes it amply clear that in the contemporary world two opposing value systems are battling it out. On the one hand, there is the traditional Judeo-Christian position of absolute or ultimate values: sex outside of marriage is wrong, period. In this view, nonmarital sex is intrinsically wrong, because God has said so; the justification transcends the reach
of man: there is no need for proof and no room for argument. On the other hand, there is the relativistic or situational position: the rightness or wrongness of nonmarital sex depends upon the conditions surrounding its occurrence. In this view, morality depends not upon something intrinsic to the act nor something imposed from the realm of the supernatural, but rather upon the overall effects of the behavior within a specific setting; and, since effects can be expected to vary with the situation, the moral dimensions of a given act will be different at different times and places.

To the traditionalist holding absolute values, the new morality is nothing more than the old immorality. To the modernist holding relative values, it is the rigid insistence upon chastity that is immoral, both because he thinks that self-denial under certain circumstances may work against emotional health and because he sees the arbitrariness of the position serving to stultify free inquiry. In this age of science, it is the modernist (relativist) who seems frequently to have the better of the argument—simply because his approach is more in line with the dominant themes of the day. (This is an observation not a value judgment.)

But, does one need to choose between the absolutistic and relativistic positions? Isn't it possible that some values are absolute and others relative? Or, that a given act has both absolutistic and relativistic components? Perhaps the Christian moralist should welcome the supporting hand of the scientist, for the scripture tells him "By their fruits ye shall know them" (Matthew 7:20); and, if this is so, the scientist should be able to throw new light on religious problems by definitively measuring cause and effect sequences (i.e., the "fruits"). Perhaps, also, the scientist needs better to recognize his limitations, realizing that generalizations must not go beyond the data, and that his data are limited to observations through the five senses. When the scientist demonstrates the relativity of certain effects he does not, by this process, prove that everything is relative.

The controversy over values and morality has resulted in a great deal of name-calling, from both sides. The religionist-traditionalist has been prone to speak of those who possess questioning minds as "worldly," or "liberal," or—when the thinking becomes completely irrational—even as "commun-
ists." The scientist-modernist, on the other hand, has been too quick to label those who incline toward absolutistic values as "visionaries," or "moralists," or even as "bigots." Now, there should be no objection to some of these terms so long as they are interpreted correctly. A liberal, for example, is correctly described as one who has a broad and enlightened mind; and a moralist is only one who is genuinely concerned with problems of right and wrong. But, in the opposing camps, both "liberal" and moralist" have become dirty words: meaning, in the first instance, one who profanes the sacred; and, in the second instance, one who begs the question or refuses to face up to the evidence. It is the unjust connotations and emotional overtones sometimes attached to such labels that get in the way. It is just as unfair for advocates of the "new morality" to call those possessing a contrary opinion "moralistic" as it is for religionists to stigmatize and reject the man who thinks.

MEASURING THE CONSEQUENCES

What can science add to the field of morals; and, if anything, at what points can it contribute? Can there be a sociological basis for decision on proper behavior? If by "proper" is meant something that is intrinsically or eternally right, the answer to this last question is "no," but if the meaning is simply that the behavior lines up with group norms, and hence escapes the consequences of negative group sanctions, the answer is "yes." Though the sociologist cannot decide what is best in an absolute sense, he can determine what is most functional to the systems involved—and hence help decide what is best in a relative sense.

It should be evident, then, that the task of the scientist is not actually to set up or affirm a moral system, not, in other words, to take a moral position—even one based upon empirical evidences—but only to determine cause-and-effect relationships which can aid the nonscientist (including the scientist in his nonscientist role as a citizen) in choosing criteria for moral decisions. The scientist, being confined to empirical data, cannot touch questions of absolutistic morality; nor can he, while in his professional role, make choices among the alternatives of relativistic (normative) morality. But he can clarify the alternatives and thus contribute something to moral questions.
Trends in premarital sexual behavior. Research into the sexual behavior of young people reveals a great deal of variation from one person to the next and among the particular groups studied. Females, for example, engage in premarital sexual relations less than do males; and conservative religious groups, such as our own, hold to the chastity norm more closely than do other subgroups of the culture—especially the non-religious. But the overall trend in recent decades has been in the direction of greater premarital experience. As might be expected, an increasing acceptance of the "new morality" has resulted in a larger and larger defiance of traditional morality. Attitudinal changes have been accompanied by behavioral changes in the same liberal direction. Particularly noticeable have been two trends: (1) toward a sexual "permissiveness with affection"—meaning that premarital relations are increasingly approved where accompanied by love and/or the promise of marriage—and (2) toward a convergence of male and female practices—meaning that, though the female still is more conservative in behavior than is the male, this difference is less than formerly.

For the United States as a whole, it is estimated from the research available that nearly one-fifth of unmarried college females and about one-half of unmarried college males have at one time or other experienced sexual relations: that in the general population approximately one-half of the females and three-fourths of the males have full sexual experience at some time before marriage; and that in the neighborhood of one-sixth of all brides are pregnant at the time of the wedding. My own research has demonstrated that in Mormon culture the proportions for unconventional sexual behavior are significantly lower than those just given.

Premarital sex as a factor in marital adjustment. But, if our inquiry is to reveal anything about the nature of sexual morality, it must go farther than just picturing trends in attitudes and practices. The crucial question has to do with effects or consequences. If it can be shown that premarital relations affect either positively or negatively something that is highly valued, this insight can then be used as a basis for moral decision.
There have been a dozen or so serious studies which have attempted to determine if premarital sexual experience in any way affects the outcome of the marriage. Though the results in some of these have been inconclusive, the preponderant finding has been that marriage is more successful where premarital chastity has been maintained. For example, back in the 1920's Gilbert Hamilton in one study and Katherine Davis in another reported happier marriages where there had been no premarital sexual intercourse. A little later Harvey Locke compared a group of happily married couples with divorced couples and reported significantly higher premarital intercourse rates for the latter. Ernest Burgess and Paul Wallin, in a careful longitudinal study, reported negative correlations between premarital sexual experience on the one hand and both engagement adjustment and marriage adjustment on the other. My own research on premarital pregnancy, though admittedly measuring only a fraction of the cases where there had been intercourse, has consistently revealed higher-than-average divorce rates for this group.

To repeat, not every study has reported this relationship between premarital chastity and marital success, and several have accompanied their findings with a note of caution regarding interpretation. Yet, the research evidence that we do have has tended to pile up on the one side, in support of the chastity norm. Perhaps a major reason for the inconclusiveness of findings up to this point is the failure of most research to take into account the values people hold, to consider how their behavior lines up with their standards.

A cross-cultural testing of the relativism of effects. To throw additional light on this problem, about ten years ago I designed and carried out a research project studying certain aspects of premarital intimacy compared across three cultures: sexually permissive Denmark, moderately restrictive midwestern United States, and highly restrictive (regarding sex norms) Mormon country in the Intermountain Region of western United States. Samples were drawn from each of these cultures, and studied by means of two complementary methods: (1) anonymous questionnaires administered to university students for revealing both attitudes and practices, as well as some of the effects, of premarital sexual intimacy; and (2) record linkage,
whereby official marriage, birth, and divorce records for cross-sections of the populations were matched on a case-by-case basis to provide information on child spacing and premarital pregnancy, and their outcomes in terms of divorce or non-divorce.

In Denmark—which is broadly typical of all of Scandinavia—sexual intercourse during the engagement is a tradition that goes back three or four centuries at least, and in recent years the practice has spread to include the "going-steady" relationship; now as earlier, many Danes tend to wait for pregnancy before going ahead with the wedding. In the United States, including the midwestern region—which may be taken as a fair cross-section of the whole—chastity is the code; and this prescription, though frequently violated and though undergoing considerable liberalization in recent decades, is still the dominant norm, backed heavily by a strong Judeo-Christian tradition. In Mormon country—which, of course, is part of the United States, but, because of the Latter-day Saint culture which pervades it, is unique in many respects—chastity is a highly institutionalized norm supported by strong positive and negative sanctions. With orthodox Mormons, "breaking the law of chastity" is among the most serious of sins.

Now, what were the results of our statistical comparisons? In the first place, we found, as expected, that Denmark showed up as being the most permissive on just about every measure used, both attitudinal and behavioral: our subjects there, for example, approved earlier starting times, in relation to marriage, of every level of intimacy; gave greater approval of premarital sexual intercourse; engaged in premarital intercourse in larger numbers; and became premaritally pregnant in larger number than subjects in either of the American samples—especially Mormon country. Differences in the attitudes and practices of Denmark compared with the United States were consistent and large, and in virtually every instance the Mormon sample showed up as the most conservative or restrictive of the three. This seems to be clear evidence that cultural norms affect personal attitudes, and that attitudes, in turn, have a controlling influence over behavior.

But what about the effects of the behavior in relation to the respective cultural norms? Are the measurable consequences of premarital sexual behavior the same everywhere, or, are they
relative to the culture? We had hypothesized the latter—with the expectation that negative consequences would be greatest where norms are strictest, simply because it is there that the unconventional behavior has greatest disapproval. This is exactly what was found. Though the research was exploratory and we make no claim of measuring all relevant consequences, the following were studied and found to have greatest negative effect in Mormon country:

1. Premarital intercourse in violation of personal standards. When percent approving was compared with percent experiencing this level of intimacy, Mormon country showed the greatest overshadowing of the former by the latter.

2. Negative feelings subsequent to premarital intercourse. Of those who had engaged in premarital intercourse, the largest percentages feeling guilt, remorse, fear, and the like, following the first experience, were found in Mormon country.

3. Concealing the act by hurrying the marriage. There was evidence that Danish couples felt little pressure to step up the wedding even when premaritally pregnant; that midwestern couples, in contrast, tended to marry right after the discovery of pregnancy; and that couples from Mormon country may have hurried the wedding once intercourse had taken place, without waiting for pregnancy to force them into it.

4. Divorce as a consequence of premarital pregnancy. Though each of the three cultures showed higher divorce percentages for the premaritally pregnant than the postmaritally pregnant, this difference in divorce rate was very slight in Denmark but very large and the greatest of the three in Mormon country.

INTERPRETATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

Now, if more of the Latter-day Saints who offend sexually, in comparison with offenders in other cultures, do so in violation of their own standards, and feel greater negative emotion following the experience, and unwisely or hurriedly marry in an attempt to escape the consequences, and if premarital preg-
nancy increases the chances of a subsequent divorce, more among the Latter-day Saints than with others—all of which are strongly suggested by this cross-cultural research—maybe we have found something here that can be useful in moral decision.

I well remember one of our General Authorities many years ago telling the young people assembled in a stake conference at Rexburg, Idaho: "Others might be able to do these things"—he had been speaking of various personal indiscretions—"and get away with it, but you can't because you know better." He was telling us, in other words, that the consequences of acts depend to a considerable extent upon the standards people hold.

To recognize the relativity of certain consequences of premarital sexual behavior is not to deny God. Neither is it to claim that this is the whole story, that everything is measurable by the instruments of science. On the contrary, it is through divine sources that man has been admonished "Where more is given, more is required" (which is a relative statement); and it is a belief of Mormonism that to use one's intelligence is to become more Godlike.

As Latter-day Saints we can take some pride in the fact that both premarital coitus and premarital pregnancy are lower among us than in the country or the world at large. This is one measure of the relative effectiveness of our standards and teachings. But, it must at the same time be recognized that our more restrictive standards, while controlling behavior up to a point, nevertheless result in greater-than-average negative effects upon those who violate these standards. "You can't because you know better."

Two additional "problems" related to the sexual norms of our own particular religious culture might be briefly mentioned before closing. First, of the three cultures studied, this one showed the highest percentage of respondents engaging in terminal petting, which suggests that its very strict prescription against premarital coitus may be resulting in an excess of pre-coital activity carried out for its own sake; at least there seems to be a tendency here, more than in the other cultures and especially the Danish, to draw the line separating moral and immoral sexual behavior just short of chastity. The second item to be mentioned (though not part of the research previously
cited) is that age at marriage shows up disproportionately low in Mormon country; as a matter of fact, in recent years Utah has been among the highest of the reporting states in percentage of teen-age marriages. Explanations for this cultural difference probably lie in the severity of the religious sanctions in support of the chastity norm, plus heavy romantic-sexual stimulants in the general culture, reinforced by Church teaching on the importance and sacredness of marriage, and Church programs bringing young people together at early ages and somewhat continuously—plus the petting pattern just noted—all of which leave boys and girls charged emotionally and/or stimulated sexually, yet without socially approved modes of release except marriage. So they marry young to escape the pressures.

To successfully meet such problems, ways need to be explored either to remove some of the incentive toward premarital sexual expression found in the general culture, or to ease some of the guilt and other destructive consequences by better sex education and better gospel teaching, including perspective on the principle of repentance, or to build better understanding and powers of self-control within the individual. Perhaps there is room for improvement along all three of these lines.

But in the final analysis it is the individual, using his free agency, who decides his course of action. Chastity, or the lack of it, is, more than anything else, a matter of personal decision. It is of crucial importance, therefore, that all of us be given all of the help necessary for mature and responsible decision-making. Part of this help is of the kind provided by a great university such as Brigham Young University. It includes honest research and open discussion. Free agency works best within an atmosphere of inquiry and enlightenment. Those decisions are most sound which are informed decisions. "The Glory of God Is Intelligence."

We are taking the position that, though the social scientist, as scientist, will not moralize, he can, through his research, help bring about a better understanding of the consequences of specific personal acts and, hence, contribute something to moral behavior. There are research bases—some now discovered and others yet to be investigated—which can make moral decision less difficult in today's complex world. And, by acting upon what has been discovered—living according to the
light we have been given—it may well be possible to turn the so-called "new morality" into a morality of more satisfying consequences. "Men are that they might have joy"—not just fun, or passing pleasure, but joy. "You can't because you know better."

But, is knowing the consequences of an act sufficient for the self-control that is needed? Evidence that knowing alone is not enough comes from what has happened in tobacco consumption during recent years. Despite the Surgeon General's report, giving detailed and convincing evidence of the harmful effects of smoking, the dip in the trend line proved slight and temporary. Large numbers of Americans go right on smoking, even knowing the risks they are taking. This same tendency may apply to premarital sex; knowledge alone may not be enough. Still, on the other side of the coin, there is evidence that the causal nature of human behavior can be taught in the schools, even at the very young ages, and that objective thinking produces desirable results. A social scientist by the name of Muuss reported that where this method—objective teaching based upon research discovery—supersedes the traditional judgmental approach, the child is "less punitive, less anxious, more tolerant, more democratic, more responsible, more secure, has fewer conflicts, and has better school adjustment."

Perhaps the thing that is needed most in meeting the problem of a new morality is the teaming of facts and faith, of information and inspiration, of science and religion: science to provide the evidence; religion to provide the meaning and the motivation.

---

Fisherman

HARRISON DAVIS*

Oozing sand,
squishing through beach-hardened toes;
and the salted, mellow air
beating time
like waves
against the bronzed skin.

Muscles coiled
then released;
and a mass of linked greyed strands
rippled through the air,
fell on the crest,
and settled gently over a single, silver-scaled fish,
then washed home.

Small profit,
but the breeze cleansed the body,
and the day was fair.

*Mr. Davis is instructor of English at Brigham Young University.
Eternal Progression and the Foreknowledge of God

JAMES R. HARRIS*

INTRODUCTION

Emphatic statements have been made by Church authorities regarding the nature of eternal progression. For example, Joseph Fielding Smith and Bruce R. McConkie have stated: "It should be realized that God is not progressing in knowledge, truth, virtue, wisdom, or any of the attributes of godliness. He has already gained these in their fulness."1

Other statements have been made by other Church leaders that appear to confirm and also to conflict with the statement quoted above. Both conflicting and confirming statements have often come from the same persons. A few examples are quoted in parallel columns below. Statements in the left-hand column represent God as progressing in knowledge and glory. Statements in the right-hand column indicate that God possesses all knowledge.

God Is Progressing in Knowledge

My Father worked out his kingdom with fear and trembling, and I must do the same; and when I get my kingdom, I shall present it to my Father, so that he may obtain kingdom upon kingdom and it will exalt him in glory. He will then take a higher exaltation, and I will take His place, and thereby become exalted myself."  

Joseph Smith, Jr.2

God Knows All Things

Without the knowledge of all things, God would not be able to save any portion of his creatures; for it is by reason of the knowledge which he has of all things, from the beginning to the end, that enables him to give understanding to his creatures by which they are made partakers of eternal life; and if it were not for the idea existing in the minds of men that

---

* Dr. Harris is assistant professor of undergraduate studies in religious instruction at Brigham Young University.
1 Bruce R. McConkie, Mormon Doctrine (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, Inc., 1958), p. 221.
2 Joseph Smith, Jr., Documentary History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1902), VI, 306. (hereafter D.H.C.)
And they who keep their second estate shall have glory added upon their heads for ever and ever.¹

All organized existence is in progress to an endless advancement in eternal perfections, ... there is no period in all the eternities, where organized existence will become stationary, that it cannot advance in knowledge, wisdom, power, and glory.

Brigham Young⁵

There is progress for our Father and for our Lord Jesus. There is no such thing as standing still in the eternal work of our God. It is endless progress, progressing from one degree of knowledge to another degree.

George Q. Cannon⁷

Why did the Lord ask such things of Abraham? Because, knowing what his future would be and that he would be the father of an innumerable posterity, he was determined to test him. God did not do this for his own sake, for he knew by his foreknowledge what Abraham would do; but his purpose was to impress upon Abraham a lesson and to enable him to attain unto knowledge that he could not attain any other way. That is why God tries all of us. It is not for his own knowledge for he knows all things beforehand. He knows all your lives and everything you will do.

George Q. Cannon⁸

God had all knowledge it would be impossible for them to exercise faith in him.

Joseph Smith, Jr.³

³For whom he did foreknow he also did predestinate to be conformed to the image of his Son.” He (God) knew millions of years before this world was framed that Pharaoh would be a wicked man. He saw—He understood; his work was before him, he could see it from the beginning to the end.

Brigham Young⁶

¹Abraham 3:26.
⁶Ibid., 7:290.
⁷The Millennial Star (Liverpool, 1899), LXI, 117.
⁸Conference Report VII, 290. (Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1899), April 9.
And is it too bold a thought, that with this progress, even for the mightiest, new thoughts, new vistas may appear, inviting to new adventures and enterprises that will yield new experiences, advancement, and enlargement even for the most high?

Brigham H. Roberts

By Omniscience is meant all-knowing. "Known unto God are all his works from the beginning of the world," said the Holy Spirit-inspired council of the apostles and elders of the early Christian Church. "Remember the former things of old. I am God and there is none like me, declaring the end from the beginning, and from ancient times the things that are not yet done, saying my counsel shall stand, and I will do all my pleasure." A sparrow falls not to the ground without the Father's notice . . . .

I think, not that God is more intelligent than any other one of the intelligences, but more intelligent than all of them together.

Brigham H. Roberts

The Prophet Joseph Smith defined the glory of God as "intelligence or light and truth." Light seems to be divine direction in the application of truth (which application leads one to salvation). Truth he said was a "knowledge of things as they are, as they were, and as they are to come." Therefore those who keep their "second estate" (including God) and consequently have "glory added upon their heads for ever and ever," shall actually increase in the "knowledge of things as they are, as they were, and as they are to come." Our Lord is God and his is the great success story of one who kept his second estate. Our Lord is growing and will continue to grow in knowledge; yet it is also clear that the Prophet understood that Christ our Lord is possessor of all knowledge and that he knows all things "from the beginning to the end."

It is obvious from an examination of the above quotes by presidents Brigham Young, George Q. Cannon, and Brigham H. Roberts, that these brethren recognized that a God could

---

8Ibid., p. 68.
10Doctrine and Covenants 93:36.
11ibid., 93:24.
somehow grow in knowledge and at the same time experience no deficiency in his knowledge, being, in fact, a possessor of all knowledge.

There is a tendency for some students of the prophets to build their theological understanding from all statements that might fit into either one or the other of the columns and to ignore the other list. This is probably done because the statements in one column seem to be incompatible with the statements in the other column. And still, others, out of frustration or perhaps a false sense of gospel scholarship, may pit one prophet against another, or a prophet against himself.

Standing in the shadow of so much confusion, it would be refreshing to have someone explain the compatibility of statements such as those cited above. It is intended that this article will illustrate and explain, at least to this writer's mind, the capacity of God to "know all things" and at the same time to progress eternally in "light and truth."

THE NATURE OF GOD'S FOREKNOWLEDGE

Statements about the foreknowledge of God are characteristically associated with references to the "beginning and the end," i.e., that the scope of God's knowledge spans all of man's experience (premortal, mortal, post-mortal, and immortal) and that man's end (i.e., his final condition as an individual) was known by God, "from the beginning."

"The beginning" may represent that period of man's eternal existence when, as a primal intelligence or entity capable of acting and being acted upon, he used his agency to enter God's program of progression. Or, "the beginning" may refer to that great planning session when all things were organized and prepared to launch the program of redemption and salvation under our Lord Jesus the Christ. The phrase certainly identifies some time during man's premortal association with God. (See Chart, Item 1.)

"The end" is reached when man has passed through all stages of preparatory existence and has "arrived" or "become" what he was determined to become, be it a telestial, terrestrial, or celestial being or a son of perdition. (See Chart, Items 2.)

The scope of God's foreknowledge would, at the least, encompass that period of man's existence cradled between the
Eternal Progression and Foreknowledge

The sphere of the gods
The patriarchal order of exalted fathers

The grand storehouse
(Item 1)

Degrees of exaltation
(Item 2)

Stewardship
(Item 3)

A grand union
Of divine kindred
(Item 4)

Consecration
(Item 5)

The constant flow of divine power and thought

The stewardship of Father and Son "on a globe like a sea of glass and fire, where all things for their glory are manifest, past, present, and future."

D&C 130:7
(Item 3)

PRE-MORTAL LIFE
(Item 1)

Immortality
(Item 2)

Mortal Life
(Item 2)

Spirit World Life
(Item 2)

Birth into mortality
The effects of the fall
The resurrection
Redemption of body and spirit

The beginning—From Eternity

To Eternity—The End

The power of the atonement

Over darkness
"beginning and the end." Scriptural testimony of this attribute of Deity is abundant. Characteristic of such scriptures are the following:

But the Lord knoweth all things from the beginning; wherefore he prepareth a way to accomplish all his works among the children of men; for behold, he hath all power unto the fulfilling of all his words. And thus it is. Amen.\(^{13}\) (Italics added)

And I do this for a wise purpose: for thus it whispereth me, according to the workings of the Spirit of the Lord which is in me. And now, I do not know all things; but the Lord knoweth all things which are to come; wherefore he worketh in me to do according to his will.\(^{14}\) (Italics added)

It is apparent from the statements quoted above\(^ {15}\) that the Latter-day prophets were, and are, no less vigorous than the ancient prophets were in declaring the foreknowledge of God. In addition to the words of the great spiritual leaders already cited on this subject, the reader may be led to further conviction and confirmation by recalling these lines from the familiar text of *Jesus the Christ* by Elder James E. Talmage. He wrote:

Our Heavenly Father has a full knowledge of the nature and disposition of each of his children, . . . By reason of that surpassing knowledge, God reads the future of child and children, of men individually and of men collectively as communities and nations; He knows what each will do under given conditions, and sees the end from the beginning.\(^ {16}\)

Elder Talmage appealed to the reason and experience of man to make this doctrine (of the foreknowledge of God) more understandable to the Saints. He reasoned that God obtained his knowledge by a long observation of his children through premortal ages or eons. However, while such observations may have been a source of God’s foreknowledge, it may not have been the only source or even the most significant source. The instructions given by the Prophet Joseph Smith (D. & C. 130) indicate another means by which God, Christ, and all who dwell upon their celestial globe may observe all things pertaining to an inferior kingdom, where things past,

\(^{13}\) 1 Nephi 9:6.

\(^{14}\) Words of Mormon 7 (See also: 1 Nephi 14:22; 2 Nephi 7:10; Alma 13:3; 37:2, 14, 18; 46:23-24; Ether 3:25-27; Doctrine and Covenants 93:28.

\(^{15}\) *Infra.*, pp. 1-2.

present, and future are continually before the Lord. The scripture explains:

The angels do not reside on a planet like this earth;
But they reside in the presence of God, on a globe like a sea of glass and fire, where all things for their glory are manifest, past, present, and future, and are continually before the Lord.

The place where God resides is a great Urim and Thummmim.

This earth, in its sanctified and immortal state, will be made like unto crystal and will be a Urim and Thummim to the inhabitants who dwell thereon, whereby all things pertaining to an inferior kingdom, or all kingdoms of a lower order, will be manifest to those who dwell on it; and this earth will be Christ’s.\(^\text{17}\) (See Chart, Item 3.)

The third lecture on faith, given by the Prophet in the School of the Prophets, is in the main concerned with the character of Diety. It is made clear than a correct idea of the character of Diety is imperative if one is to exercise faith of a quality that will enable him to lay hold upon life and salvation.\(^\text{18}\) Specific qualities of the divine character are enumerated in the chapter as follows: (1) power to fulfill all his promises, (2) mercy, grace, and goodness, (3) unchangeableness in his character, (4) truth, as integrity in his relationship with man, (5) and lastly love. It should be observed that it is the idea of unchangeableness in the above-mentioned qualities of his character that is indispensable to faith. There is no insistence that our God cannot grow in knowledge; however, there is, in lecture four, an insistence that God has knowledge of all things from beginning to end. It is possible for God to grow in knowledge and at the same time have a knowledge of all things from the beginning to the end.

THE NATURE OF ETERNAL PROGRESSION

Eternal progression, like eternal punishment and eternal life, may represent a quality of experience and not exclusively a duration of experience. Eternal progression would be God’s kind of progression, an experience exclusively for those who possess the character of a god and therefore enjoy the powers of a god. Participation in this kind of experience is possible

\(^{17}\) Doctrine and Covenants 130:6-9.
\(^{18}\) Lundwall, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 33.
for man only in an elementary and relatively imperfect sense. There are elements of corruption in the nature of man that seem to render him incapable of maintaining a continuous and perfect union with the mind of God. The methods by which men strain to attain new truth are an evidence of man's very limited mental and spiritual powers. Whether men learn by trial and error, or by the best-planned experimental program, their path to knowledge is long and tedious. This natural deficiency in human nature can be modified as the regenerating and sanctifying powers of the gospel renew the human system so that men may, in an imperfect way, have "the mind of Christ,"¹⁹ through the Holy Spirit.

In contrast with the relatively weak union described above, the mind of our God is in constant and perfect union with all that is divine throughout the immensity of space.

The nature of eternal progression cannot be understood outside of this divine union. The union of a divine society rests upon celestial law and two foremost principles in that body of law are consecration and stewardship. (See Chart, Items 4.)

The earthly system of Zion is a reflection, or type, of the heavenly society of Gods. As men faithfully consecrate all they possess to God, under Zion's law, they become heirs to all that God possesses. However, man must demonstrate that he possesses the character of a God before he can have access to the "Grand Heavenly Storehouse of Divine Powers and Gifts." As the faithful steward in Zion may have access to the earthly wealth of the earthly storehouse, his faithfulness will also give him access to heavenly treasures. However, while he is clothed in the imperfection of mortality his access to heavenly treasures must be limited.

Our Lord, Jesus the Christ, has the character of a God and under the law of consecration he is possessor of all things. All that the Gods possess in wisdom, knowledge, and power, are his through a union of property among all Exalted Fathers. (See Chart, Item 5.) The announcement that Christ received the full powers and prerogatives of the Elohim (Gods or Exalted Fathers) is found in the following verses of scripture:

And I, John, bear record that he received a fulness of the glory of the Father;

¹⁹¹ Corinthians 2:16.
And he received all power both in heaven and on earth, and the glory of the Father was with him, for he dwelt in him.\textsuperscript{20}

Thus, through the indwelling divine Spirit, Christ enjoys a perfect union with the Eternal Father of our spirits. This union is so perfect that the Father is described as dwelling "in him." The Eternal Father of our spirits also enjoys a perfect union with all divine beings throughout the immensity of space. This union is so perfect that the Father correctly bears the title Elohim, meaning Gods, for he represents all Gods as if they dwelt in him. This communion of the Gods (with which our God, Jesus the Christ, is in perfect union), constitutes a "storehouse" of knowledge and power from which, as a faithful steward of the Gods, Christ may and does constantly and instantly draw.

Our Lord, therefore, is at this instant possessor of all knowledge and power (i.e., he is joint owner with all the Gods, even as all of us may become joint heirs with Christ—without detracting from his power and possessions).\textsuperscript{21} The experience of our Lord through the ages, as he moves to ever higher degrees of exaltation (See Chart, Item 6) will call forth a constant flow of knowledge and power from the "Grand Union of Divine Minds." And while he is thus progressing in knowledge there is never a practical deficiency in his knowledge—because his perfect union with all other divine beings enables him to recall, \textit{as from his own mind and experience}, all the experiences and all the knowledge of all the Gods. It is from this plane of experience that the quotations of the prophets (\textit{supra}, pp. 37-39) in the right-hand column are understood to be consistent with statements in the left-hand column.

The Church is an heir to a fine statement on the nature of the divine union described above. It is found in the masterful theological studies of Elder Brigham H. Roberts:

\begin{quote}
It is possible for the mind of God to be in man, to will and to do, as seemeth (God) good. The nature of the Whole clings to the Parts, and they may carry with them the light and truth and glory of the Whole. Moreover, by appointment, any One or Three of the union Intelligences may become
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{26}Doctrine and Covenants 93:16-17.
\textsuperscript{21}Lundwall, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 49.
the embodiment and representative of all the power and glory and authority of the sum total of the Divine Intelligences; in which capacity either the One or the Three would no longer stand only in their individual characters as Gods, but they would stand also as the sign and symbol of all that is divine—and would act and be to all intents and purposes the One God. And so in every inhabited world, and in every system of worlds, a God presides. Diety in his own right and person, and by virtue of the essence of him; And also by virtue of his being the sign and symbol of the Collectivity of the Divine Intelligences of the universe. Having access to all the councils of the Gods, each individual Diety becomes a partaker of the collective knowledge, wisdom, honor, power, majesty, and glory of the Body Divine—in a word, the embodiment of the Spirit of the Gods whose influence permeates the universe.²²

IN CONCLUSION

For the man who would possess that quality of faith that will enable him to become an heir to life in the celestial kingdom, only one attitude toward God will suffice. And that is, to regard God as an all-powerful, all-knowing being. There is no sense or situation in which God is in any way deficient in knowledge or power, and as one who enjoys a perfect union with all exalted Fathers he is the legal possessor of all knowledge and power.

For God there is no floundering, no experimentation, no misapplication of truth, for all things, past, present, and future are present with him at his will to recall from the “Grand Union of Divine Minds” or/as from his own mind.

As man may, in an imperfect way, have the "mind of Christ," so also does Christ have, in perfection, the mind of the Elohim (Gods). His words are their words, his thoughts are their thoughts. He represents Deity in his own right and he represents the composite glory, power, knowledge, and dominion of all that is Deity anywhere in the immensity of space.

But, although our God possesses all knowledge, he lives in the constant flow of divine power, thought, and experience which constitutes eternal progression. Eternal progression is God’s kind of progression, to be enjoyed only by those who become Gods.

²²Roberts, op. cit., p. 198.
SAWING WOOD

An Etching
by
Mahonri Young
A NOTE ON "SAWING WOOD"

by

DALE T. FLETCHER

The little ink sketch, "Sawing Wood," by Mahonri Young displays "the animation, the movement, the vibration of life," which Alice Merrill Horne, the art patron, described in writing about Young's work.

Famous as a sculptor, painter, printmaker, and teacher, Mahonri Young (1877-1957) felt drawing to be the crux of art. He carried pencil and pad, or copper plate and etching needle wherever he went, making thousands of drawings. It was his way of life. A reviewer for *Art News* described him as "one of the most gifted and diversely practiced draftsmen in the United States." Behind his drawings there is a sharp eye for the "life" in a subject, an indefatigable hand, and a vital knowledge of what to do and how to do it. Such a prodigious record of one artist's imagination and observation probably does not exist elsewhere in the annals of American art.

In 1959 Brigham Young University purchased the major part of a collection of paintings, sculpture, drawings, prints, and books from the Mahonri Young estate. The remainder of the collection was then donated to the University.

B F. Larsen, who helped complete the arrangements, wrote, "The purchase of the Mahonri Young Collection is much more than the buying of a few printings and pieces of sculpture. We have brought an important man, a sensitive artist here, not to bury him with pomp and ceremony, but to abide with us and speak to us through his live creations."
What Guns, Bombs, and Lives Have Not Purchased: The Frustration of Vietnam*

RAY COLE HILLAM**

The war in Vietnam is not war as we have known it in the past. We Americans like to have our wars simple, and we think they should be for one purpose—victory. But the war in Vietnam defies this description.

There are many different views of the war. Some claim it is a civil war, in which the United States and other powers are meddling. Others argue that it is a war of aggression from the North and, upon request, the United States is supporting the object of that aggression, the Saigon government. Still others see it as an expanding China which the United States and its allies are obligated to resist. There is some merit in all three of these claims. For instance, not every Viet Cong is a Communist; many are nationalists who have joined for reasons other than communism. This has contributed to the notion that the war in South Vietnam is an internal or civil war. However, the Viet Cong, if successful, will create a Communist state either separate from or unified with North Vietnam. Likewise, Hanoi's involvement in South Vietnam, including the recent infiltration of conventional forces, has become obvious to most observers. In fact, now that the war has taken on certain conventional qualities, Hanoi has openly admitted its involvement. Nor can it be doubted that there are certain international complications involving Moscow, Peking, and Washington, though they are not in direct conflict. Thus, the war in Vietnam has its local and international dimensions. It is a war fought at many levels.

*This article is based on the observations of Professor Hillam while he was in Vietnam as a Fulbright-Hays Professor from September 1966 to July 1967. It is a discussion of the nature of the war, as he saw it, and the kind of challenge which confronts the newly elected South Vietnamese government and its allies.

**Dr. Hillam is associate professor of political science at Brigham Young University.
It is also a war with four quite distinct parts. Some stress the conventional qualities of the war and the need to first resist overt aggression. The Department of Defense statement that "the covert nature of the aggression in Vietnam, which characterized the earlier years of the struggle, has now all but disappeared," implies that the war is now conventional. Others emphasize its political qualities: the need to shore up the Saigon government and broaden its base of support and to make a decision about negotiating with Hanoi, with or without the participation of the National Liberation Front. Still others stress the importance of achieving economic stability and prosperity in order to combat inflation and famine—commonly referred to as "the other war." More significant, say some, is the war against clandestine aggression—the organizational war against the enemy infrastructure.

The Objectives and Strategy of the Enemy

The objectives of the enemy in Vietnam give greater understanding to the nature of this different kind of multi-faceted war and reveal that it has a dimension in depth that traditional wars, whatever their scale, lack. The enemy intends not only to seize power or to exchange one government system for another, but to restructure the entire South Vietnamese society, including the destruction of the prevailing myths that bind this society together. In this sense, the objective is total. To achieve this objective, the enemy has resorted to a war of persuasion, manipulation, and compulsion, as well as violence. Thus, the war takes on political, economic, social and psychological, as well as military significance.

The strategy of the enemy in South Vietnam is based partly on a mixture of aphorisms accumulated over the years from the writings of Chinese and Vietnamese revolutionaries and partly on pragmatic assumptions of how best to come to power in South Vietnam. Recently captured enemy diaries and notebooks clearly indicate the emphasis the enemy places on the writings of Mao Tse-tung and Vo Nguyen Giap, the North Vietnamese theoretician. The continual reference to the military maxims and political aphorisms of these two prominent revolutionaries suggests the importance the enemy places on the ideology of guerrilla communism as a directing and motivating factor.
In discussing the strategy of the enemy, it is important to refer to the earlier strategies of Mao and Giap. Mao, in his 1938 lectures, *On Protracted War*, speaks of a three-phased protracted strategy: the defensive, stalemate, and offensive phases. Giap, while he generally accepts Mao's three-phased strategy, in his book entitled *Peoples War, Peoples Army*, adds two preliminary phases which provide first for the psychological milieu for the insurgency, and second for the organizational base for launching the protracted war. The next three phases, which tend to be operational rather than preparatory, are similar to Mao's description of the three-phased protracted war.

In an effort to simplify the description of the enemy's strategy, both as it is based on the Mao-Giap formula and the present environment, perhaps it is best to speak in terms of four phases: the organizational, the nonviolent, the violent, and the legitimization phases.

In the organizational phase, the professional revolutionary and functional cadre develop a network of clandestine organizations and lay the foundation for a comprehensive infrastructure. It is also during this incipient phase that a strategy is developed for launching organized resistance against the constituted authorities.

In the next phase, which is the initial operational phase and is best characterized by the emphasis placed on nonviolent activities, the cadre is actively engaged in political agitation and indoctrination. He organizes and directs study groups, fronts, and other overt organizations designed to enlist popular support for his clandestine movement. This organizational base, both overt and covert, continues to broaden during this phase and subsequent phases of the protracted strategy.

The third phase is characterized by violence. There are assassinations, kidappings, and guerrilla attacks on outposts, police patrols, or convoys. Initially, the enemy employs defensive tactics of hit, run, and hide. The government is in hot pursuit but eventually becomes overextended, yet tries to hold on. Throughout this phase, the enemy is building and consolidating his position. Continued emphasis is placed on clandestine activity and organizational work. Political agitation and indoctrination, as well as acts of terror, continue.
The final phase is one primarily of force rather than issues. The guerrilla units become mobile conventional military units which initiate frontal assaults and attack fortified positions. The war becomes conventional and much of the ideological emphasis is replaced by the long-hoped-for military victory. It is during this phase that the movement hopes to achieve legitimacy and general acceptance, locally and abroad.

In the enemy's protracted strategy, the transition from one phase to the other is not precise and can be reversed, and one phase is not necessarily a prerequisite for another. The chart below illustrates the fluid nature of the enemy's phased strategy of protracted war. Note that each stage, while evolving into an advanced stage, continues its existence up to the end of the conflict.

The war in Vietnam is presently in the third and fourth phases. In fact, there are expressions of all four phases in different areas of South Vietnam. In the Mekong Delta, except for An Giang Province, the enemy is in phase three. In the northern provinces of South Vietnam, he is in phase four. In An Giang and Tuyen Duc provinces, he has never extended much beyond the second phase. In late 1964, the enemy was passing into the fourth phase, but because of the direct and escalated commitment of United States troops, the enemy has had to revert back to earlier phases in some areas.
The Present Situation

Certain military, economic, and political gains have been made since the spring of 1965. There have been military successes against Viet Cong battalion-size forces in such areas as the "iron triangle," and against North Vietnamese units in the Central Highlands. If current estimates are to be accepted, the enemy is gradually declining in strength. These estimates indicate that while he has been recently losing around 15,000 men per month, infiltration from the North has declined to about 7,000 per month and recruitment in the South has declined to approximately 5,000 per month. Thus, the allied military involvement has put substantial pressure on the enemy and has made it more difficult for him to pursue his strategy.

There is some evidence of an improved economic situation. The runaway inflation of a year ago has been curbed and some of the developmental programs have achieved a measure of success in such areas as education, public works, and agriculture. These, hopefully, will improve the productivity and the living standard of the average Vietnamese.

There is also some evidence of political progress. It is estimated that the number of people under government control has increased by six percent during the past year. Nearly 450 hamlets were allegedly brought under the control of the Saigon government in 1966, and the current pacification program (Revolutionary Development) seeks to extend government control over an additional 1,100 hamlets, containing a population of 1.3 million during 1967. Just a year ago, the Thieu-Ky regime was barely able to survive Buddhist riots; yet since that time a constituent assembly has drafted a constitution which was promulgated recently, and free elections have been held, despite extreme Viet Cong terror and opposition.

However, there are also factors which counterbalance these gains. Although some estimates indicate that the enemy may now be beginning to decline in manpower, other estimates show that over the past two years he has been able to increase by nearly 65,000 men. Nearly 220,000 of the enemy have been killed, yet the allies are confronted with the largest enemy force they have ever faced—297,000 men. Furthermore, the enemy has progressed from fighting with captured rifles and limited supplies, to using automatic weapons, heavy mortars, artillery,
and rockets, which have been brought into the South. All these improvements in the enemy position have been made despite intensified pacification efforts and extensive military pressure. More than a million troops have been able to secure only a fraction of a country slightly larger than Utah.

The cost of the war has been high indeed. Currently, the United States is pouring more than two billion dollars a month into the war effort and is losing nearly twice the number of men per week compared with a year ago; the number of U.S. dead now exceeds 13,000. The costs to South Vietnam have also been staggering. In addition to the destruction from the war, the South Vietnamese armed forces have lost more than 50,000 men since 1961. The United States has committed more than half a million men to Vietnam, and the South Vietnamese government expects to increase its 650,000-man army by an additional 100,000. Yet, the enemy has been able to effectively respond to past increases and presumably is capable of meeting new ones.

Despite signs of economic and political progress in South Vietnam, this progress could be abruptly reversed. Without United States support, almost certainly the newly elected government would rapidly collapse.

In view of these conditions, the present situation is one of stalemate. "Stalemate" is an unacceptable term among officials in Washington and the higher echelons in Vietnam, but it is commonly used by Americans serving in Vietnam to describe the current situation.

Why is it that the enemy can successfully stalemate the superior military power of the allies? What is it that would lead a senior American general to say, "I have destroyed the X Division three times. I have chased main force units all over the country and the impact was zilch."

The Infrastructure

The strength of the enemy position in South Vietnam lies in his organization—the infrastructure. The term infrastructure is appropriate since it implies an arrangement of constituent parts beneath the surface. Indeed, the infrastructure is a sophisticated network of parallel, horizontal, and vertical intermediate structures designed to enmesh populations and retain commitments. It is this complex organization which has been
used to mobilize and manipulate the rural population and to prevent the Saigon government from governing.

The question may be properly raised as to how the infrastructure was able to gain this stronghold. The roots are in its predecessor, the Viet Minh movement, through which Ho Chi Minh obtained power in the North. The Viet Minh was a nationalistic movement of Vietnamese against the French colonialists. Ho, through political and organizational genius, was able to seize control of the movement so that it became a Communist front organization. Not long after the Geneva agreements of 1954, the enemy began to strengthen and extend the clandestine apparatus left in the South by Ho Chi Minh.

Conditions in South Vietnam were conducive for waging a clandestine war against the Ngo Dinh Diem regime. An administrative vacuum existed throughout much of South Vietnam partly because Diem was never able to extend effective control over the entire nation and partly because officials in those areas under nominal control of the Diem government preferred to govern in the traditional mandarin manner—"let the peasants come to you, do not go to them."

The vacuum was filled by the remnants of the Viet Minh infrastructure who restructured the existing apparatus, recruited and trained additional cadre, and broadened their popular base. Thus, the infrastructure began to evolve, not wholly as an indigenous clandestine revolutionary movement, but one which was partially transplanted. The chart indicates the line organization of the infrastructure. Direction of the infrastructure is provided by the Central Office for South Vietnam (COSVN) with headquarters in North Vietnam. This is a hard-core Communist organization with lines running into South Vietnam, particularly to the People's Revolutionary Party (PRP) which is composed of Communist cadre, most of whom are South Vietnamese, and which is the intermediary between the leadership in the North and the movement in the South. The PRP provides the leadership for the National Liberation Front (NLF) which, like its predecessor, the Viet Minh, is a Communist front organization. The purpose of the NLF is to serve as a fathering point for all opposition to the Saigon government, and it includes both Communists and non-Communists. The Viet Cong armed units are the military forces subordinate to the PRP.
The infrastructure has three levels. At the top are the dedicated North and South Vietnamese Communists who provide direction for the movement. In the middle are the cadre who are perhaps more motivated by career and professional incentive than revolutionary fervor. Whatever their motivation, they are the backbone of the movement and provide the necessary link between the leadership and the masses. The lower level consists of the peasants who belong to mass organizations; who provide men, provisions, and cover for the military effort; and who are loyal to whichever government is currently in control. The rank and file are often motivated to support the movement through grievances against the government, promises of a better future, or intimidation and terror.

Despite the organizational genius of the enemy, there are some problems within the infrastructure. First, the system favors the poor peasant over the middle-class educated person and offers him special advantages; yet the latter has a tendency to rise to positions of leadership. Often, this results in the unique situation of the middle-class leader resenting the peasant.
because of his special advantages and the peasant resenting the leader because of his higher position. Against the background of class struggle, which the ideology of the enemy encourages, this conflict is sharpened. Second, the rank and file often object to an imposed system of government, whether it be Communist or non-Communist. Earlier, the infrastructure had offered them benevolent government, lower taxes, and reform; but recent military demand has made this impractical, and the rank and file often become disgruntled at unfulfilled promises and a never-ending war. The leaders and cadre of the infrastructure have frequently resorted to terror to achieve their goals, and this has further weakened their appeal. Third, like the Saigon government, the security forces and military units within the infrastructure are not always able to provide adequate security. There is an increased tendency for the rank and file to blame the infrastructure for not protecting them when their village or hamlet is subjected to increasing pressure from Saigon.

The infrastructure has a great advantage over the government since its organization, as designed, thoroughly penetrates every level of society and has been in operation for a number of years; nevertheless, sometimes it is difficult to compete with efficient government administration. These weaknesses contribute to the feasibility of limiting the power of the infrastructure.

**Defeating the Infrastructure**

How can the infrastructure be rendered ineffective? The most meaningful strategy is to dry up its resources. This requires more effectively restricting the infiltration of supplies and manpower from North Vietnam and more important, reducing the local sources of supplies, manpower, and popular support.

The current strategy of interdiction is clearly insufficient. In recent months, infiltration has been so great that the enemy has been able to escalate its military effort, particularly in I Corps (the northern provinces of South Vietnam) from the third to the fourth phase. Bombing the access routes from North Vietnam has been of limited value. Enemy infiltration has been made more difficult by military operations into the demilitarized zone and along the Laotian and Cambodian bor-
der, but it has not been reduced. In fact, it has increased because of the requirements of the enemy in the South.

The apparent futility of the present strategy of interdiction is reflected in the recent statement of the South Vietnamese Defense Minister, General Cao Van Vien, who said that bombing in North Vietnam would not in itself stop infiltration. The problems, he said, are the infiltration routes and base areas the enemy has in Laos and Cambodia and that so long as these problems cannot be resolved, infiltration will not cease. He believes the war will last another twenty to thirty years unless infiltration of men and supplies through Laos is halted.

Since present military measures have not effectively curbed the enemy's infiltration into the South, some argue negotiations with Hanoi is the only other alternative. Negotiations, while they might be desirable, are no guarantee against infiltration. The attitude of Hanoi is to continue the effort in the South, and the Central Office for South Vietnam has been instructed not to deviate from the original goals, even in the event of negotiations with the Americans.

The strategy of interdiction has been of limited value. Negotiations are not only presently unlikely, but it is doubtful whether infiltration would stop even if the belligerents found themselves at the conference table. Some alternative methods must be considered. Perhaps the construction of a fortified belt or barrier south of the demilitarized zone should be more seriously considered. This might later be followed by building a system of strategically situated barriers down the Laotian and Cambodian borders or erecting a fortified barrier across Laos to the Mekong River. These barriers, if properly maintained and enforced, could more successfully restrict the huge flow of supplies and manpower and possibly dry up the infrastructure's external source of support.¹

More significant than infiltration from the North is the availability of support to the enemy in the South. The locally recruited hamlet and village cadre who provide the necessary link between the hard-core leadership and the masses are the backbone of the enemy infrastructure. It is through these

¹After this article was in galley proof, Secretary of Defense Robert McNamara announced that the strategy called for here would be implemented; however, the extent and strength of the barrier system he has in mind is not known at this time.
middle-range cadre, who in many cases have their own political base, that the enemy is able to secure recruits and supplies to carry on the war.

How can the recruitment of young men in the hamlets and the collection of food and other supplies be curbed if not eliminated? How can the enemy’s resources within South Vietnam be dried up? The answer is pacification. There have been pacification efforts in the past, but they have failed.

The first pacification attempts in Vietnam were made by the French some fifteen years ago. But the French were up against impossible odds. Not only was the population firmly on the side of the enemy, but the armed forces of the enemy outnumbered the French. The first attempt at pacification under Ngo Dinh Diem was started in 1957. Known as Operation Sunrise, the effort called for the destruction of the enemy’s administrative structure and the inclusion of the countryside under government control. The villages marked for pacification were mismanaged and ill-defended. Many government officials and pacification workers were assassinated or kidnapped, and the program eventually terminated, leaving the areas more firmly in the hands of the enemy.

Then came the ill-fated Strategic Hamlet program, patterned after the British pacification strategy in post-war Malaya. This program was designed to achieve population and resource control in selected areas by confining the rural population to fortified hamlets. The image of the government was to be built up in these fortified hamlets by intensive propaganda and improved social services. While the concept had merit, impossible goals were set for the program. By the end of one year, it was claimed that approximately half of the estimated 12,537 hamlets, with a population of 8.2 million people, had been pacified through the program. During the next year, 1963, most of the remaining half were to have been pacified. However, the program floundered because it was rushed, overextended, and haphazardly carried out. Furthermore, the Diem government was overthrown by the end of the year.

By January 1964, the mistakes of the past were reviewed and the revised Strategic Hamlet program became known as the New Life Hamlet program in which most of the emphasis was placed on rural construction with local militia providing
security. Since the February 1966 Honolulu Conference, the New Hamlet program has become part of a more comprehensive concept called Revolutionary Development (RD).

The concept of RD is defined as an integrated military and civil process to restore, consolidate, and expand government control so that "nation-building" can succeed. It consists of coordinated military and civil actions to free the people from enemy control; restore public security; initiate political, social, and economic development; extend effective government authority; and win the support of the people, even many within the enemy's infrastructure. It is designed to be a comprehensive, balanced, and integrated approach to provide security and to transform South Vietnam into a free, viable, and enduring society. It is a recognition of the fact that neither the military war nor the "other war" by itself is adequate. In concept, it ties together all sides of the struggle: military, political, economic, and social. As a result, the marginal man (middle cadre) of the infrastructure becomes the most significant target.

In theory, RD is a sound concept. In practice, it has not been moving as well as it might. According to one source, only 168 of 12,537 rural hamlets are under total government control and fewer than 2,000 are under partial control. The enemy, on the other hand, controls nearly 4,000 hamlets.

The heart of the problem is providing security. Many hamlets have been under enemy control as long as twenty years. Clearing the area of main-force enemy units, rooting out the infrastructure, and transforming the political loyalties of the people cannot be achieved overnight. Past crash programs have not been realistic. For instance, it was recently announced that the Khan Van hamlet, just miles from Saigon, had been "pacified" again—for the fifth time.

Unfortunately, the pacification programs have always been under constant pressure from Saigon and Washington to show results. This pressure often corrupts the reporting process, resulting in overplayed success stories and false optimism.

The program, from the beginning, has been plagued by the lack of expertise in leadership and the recruitment of incompetent RD workers. Many of the RD teams which are sent into the hamlets to live with the people for six months or
longer for purposes of pacification have been more of a drain on the economy and manpower pool than an asset to pacification. Some have deserted in mass. Others, however, have been effective where adequate security has been maintained.

The slow and disappointing beginning of the RD program does not mean there is a need for a new program. Rather, the present RD program needs to be perfected, specifically, by being more adaptable to the requirements of each hamlet, and to the nation as a whole. Moreover, since RD is basic to national policy, both the Vietnamese effort and that of their American advisers must be integrated. RD should be a rallying point for every military and civil effort in South Vietnam. Unfortunately, this is not the present situation as the maze of separate and independent programs which give only lip service to RD still continues.

Conclusions

The war in Vietnam is frustrating to most Americans who have served there because of its complexity, protraction, and current stalemate. Frustration also stems from the failure of not knowing what to do next. Withdrawal is virtually impossible, even if desirable. Continued military escalation will have little impact on the infrastructure unless it leads to the kind of massive destruction most Americans consider unthinkable.

The newly elected government and its allies must focus more on the challenge of drying up the enemy infrastructure. The current military stalemate is perhaps meaningful if the positive trends toward constitutional government and economic progress can continue; however, these trends are not assured unless the power of the infrastructure is substantially reduced. Unfortunately, guns, bombs, and lives have purchased little—the infrastructure remains virtually unscathed.
Sonnet: To Peace

MARDEN J. CLARK*

"THINK BIG!" he roared. And from the crowded hall
The echo gathering force roared back, "THINK BIG!"
"The secret path to hope, to joy, success, to all,
I'll let you in on it: Christ cursed the Fig—
No fruit. But first from Him a deeper secret learn:
To Love. In this the Law and Prophets both
Are filled. No need to limit what you earn.
Just learn to Love with pure intent—nothing loath—
And then think big. He'll buy far more than hope could dream.
Sell bonds, sell homes, insure his life. The rose
No longer needs a thorn. The key supreme
Is Love." He’s thinking bigger than he knows,
Behold, in this eternal war is done.
The Christ is wed to Mammon: those twain made one.

*Dr. Clark is professor of English at Brigham Young University.
Freedom and the American Cowboy

Neal E. Lambert*

From the time of "Dead-Eye Dick" and the early editions of the Police Gazette to our own era of "Rawhide" and Ranch Romance the cowboy as symbol and myth has been very much with us. We in our day are no less caught up in the psychology and shooting of the adult western than were the readers of the 1880's and 1890's who devoured Beadle's pocket library editions of cowboy stories. Many have tried to puncture the myth by pointing to the historical cowboy as a figure whose world "was corrupt and rotten. Its heroes, vaunted for their courage, in fact showed only the rashness of the alcoholic or the desperation of the cornered rat."1 But most Americans still see in the cowboy, as did Owen Wister, the embodiment of "the best thing the Declaration of Independence ever turned out . . . the same creature who was the volunteer on both sides in the Civil War—the son of the soil, whose passion and intelligence and character made him able to fight battles almost without need of captains, . . . that is the fellow . . . and the plains brought him again to perfections only latent in civilization."2 Thus it is that the mythical cowboy still rides as the personification of the American dream of self-reliance, individualism, and freedom.

But myth is not history, and for the sake of history we need to ask certain questions about the historical cowboy. In reality how free was he? How independent? How much of an individualist was the man who actually rode the horse and worked the herd? Was he free of all social limitations, or was he bound by a code of conduct? Was the cowboy's life really "free and wild" or did its dangers merely make him reckless in the face of death? And if he did feel free, what was he free to do?

*Dr. Lambert is assistant professor of English at Brigham Young University.


These are the questions that need to be explored, but the answers do not come easily. In the first place, primary accounts of the cowboy's life are few, and many of those that we do have were written with some knowledge of the myth that was already growing, even before the era of the cowboy had ended. In the second place, the cowboy was not much given either to philosophical speculation or to putting his thoughts on paper. Intangible, philosophical subjects were too vague and impractical to interest him. As one old cowboy tells us:

Such things, they don't bring no facts to nobody. The feller that's a-goin' to do all the talkin', he just natcherially begins by pickin' out a startin' p'int that really ain't nowhars at all. He brands that startin' p'int "Asomin' that," so he can know it if he runs acrost it agin. Then he cuts his thinkin' picket-rope and drifts all over the hull mental prairie until he gits plumb tuckered out. And when he gets so doggone tired that he can't think up no more ideas to wave around and look purty in the wind, he just winds up with "wherefore, it follows." Follows. Hell! It don't follow nothin'. It just comes in last.

THE FREE AND INDEPENDENT LIFE

But in spite of the fact that the cowboy was not prone to put his feelings in sophisticated philosophical terms, there can be little doubt that he felt and believed that his was a free and independent life. Teddy Blue, for instance, considered cow-punchers "the most independent class of people on Earth." And when one of his freedom-loving colleagues got jailed, Teddy wrote, "He was just like a caged lion fit to tear himself to pieces. When he had been in there a year, maybe two, they let him out on a writ of error and he went free after that. But

---

3'Then things, they don't bring no facts to nobody. The feller that's a-goin' to do all the talkin', he just natcherially begins by pickin' out a startin' p'int that really ain't nowhars at all. He brands that startin' p'int "Asomin' that," so he can know it if he runs acrost it agin. Then he cuts his thinkin' picket-rope and drifts all over the hull mental prairie until he gits plumb tuckered out. And when he gets so doggone tired that he can't think up no more ideas to wave around and look purty in the wind, he just winds up with "wherefore, it follows." Follows. Hell! It don't follow nothin'. It just comes in last.'


it broke him." It seemed that anything that might restrict his freedom of movement was distasteful to the cowboy. Civilization itself, as it pushed westward, caused the cowboy to move further out on the frontier where he could find things a little less restricted, a little more free. Thus, Teddy Blue went with one herd "because they was going three hundred miles further up north, and that was what appealed to me. It was all new country up there and I wanted to see it, and anyway this other, in Wyoming and southern Montana, was getting settled up. There was ranches every few miles." Charlie Siringo, another "literate" cowboy, felt much the same way. After a few days in town, he tells us, "I then headed southwest across the hills not having any destination in view; I wanted to go somewhere but didn't care where."

This propensity to "move on" was more than just wanderlust. It was a part of what the cowboy called his "open-air life" and his "freedom from restraint." Joe McCoy, who knew the cowboy as well as, if not better than, anyone, told us that the cowboy's life is "hard and full of exposure, but [it] is wild and free, and the young man who has long been a cowboy has but little taste for any other occupation." And another old cowhand, thinking of earlier years, recalled, "From the Canadian Rockies to the Platte, from the Platte to Dodge on the Arkansas, from Dodge to the Gulf of Mexico, the land was free and open and it belonged to the cowboy. I was free too and therefore, I was happy."

If ever man was free it was in the era of the cowboy. He was an inhabitant of the free "land beyond." He lived and worked hundreds of miles beyond settled civilization. He was beyond any law except for that of his own making. He was beyond society except for the few fellow cowboys that he might choose to ride with. If the trail he was following forked, he could go either way. If the outfit he worked for did not suit him, he could quit or stay. His was a land empty of society, law, and fences.

1Ibid., p. 35.
2Ibid., p. 91.
5As quoted by Don D. Walker in "Freedom and Destiny in the Myth of the American West." New Mexico Quarterly, XXXIII (Winter, 1963-64), 382.
But was the cowboy free simply because there were no fences or one-way streets? Where did his freedom ultimately come from? Those who have considered this question do not always agree on just *why* the cowboy was free. Many have suggested that the freedom, the independence and self-reliance of the cowboy are a direct result of the work he did. This is the well-argued conclusion of Edward Everett Dale. In detailing the work of the cowboy, he tells us:

The work of the range rider was of infinite variety, yet at times was characterized by a deadly monotony. In its larger aspects it included driving trail herds, joining in the round-up, branding calves or selecting beef animals and "riding a line," though there were also many other duties. Sometimes his work included breaking horses, hunting wolves, defense against cattle thieves, red or white, and the building of corrals or line camps. Naturally he must do his own personal work, or those tasks necessary to enable him to live in reasonable comfort. For weeks at a time he must take care of his own camp, chop firewood, bring water from the spring, cook his meals, wash his clothing, bedding, and saddle blankets, and do the dozens of other little things that fall to the lot of one who lives alone. It is not strange that in time he developed a surprising degree of resourcefullness and the ability to take care of himself at all times and under all circumstances.11

But other writers, with a different approach to historical problems, suggest that this paragon of freedom was a "product of conditions in the East. He was lured westward by the hazards which the country offered him. . . . There was common then a certain well-known spirit, hard to describe, which makes boys rowdies when they stay at home and men of action when they go away. The West called and the East stood ready with a few thousand lean, hard-boned young men."12 If those few thousand, hard-boned young rowdies did bring their freedom with them from the East, they must have felt some rather forceful and sudden restrictions to that freedom when their own raucous individualism hampered the free life of someone bigger than they were.

This violence has suggested to some that the cowboy's way of living, and consequently his freedom, was the product

---

of a sort of Darwinian process of natural selection that weeded out those who might have surrendered or sacrificed this freedom. "The primitive law of nature known as self-preservation was very evident in August of '82 at Frenchman's Ford," says Andy Adams; "It reminded me of the early cowboy days at home in Texas."15 And an anonymous but evidently accurate commentator wrote that:

Perhaps in no other occupation of men was the theory of the "survival of the fittest" more plainly demonstrated in practice than in the quick weeding out of the weaklings, of the visionary, and of the inherently depraved, among those who understood the cowboy life. . . . In the close communion of cowboy life on the trail and the range, where trust, faithfulness, and the spirit of brotherhood and mutual confidence had to be, a man inherently depraved was out of place.14

Some even suggest that the economics of the situation, the employment of so few men in proportion to the amount of capital invested, were the main source of the self-reliance and individualism of the cowboy.15 But whether or not it was economics, geography, environment, heredity, or a combination of all of these that gave him independence and self-reliance, both the cowboy and most of those who have written about him believed that he was free, more free than most men before or since.

LIMITATIONS AND RESTRICTIONS OF FREEDOM

But at the same time that the cowboy and his interpreters loudly proclaim his freedom and discuss its origins, they also acknowledge that he was limited, that he was in a very real way restricted and to that extent, he was not free. For instance, the open expansiveness of the geography may have given the cowboy a feeling of freedom, but at the same time its unmarked sameness and its lack of water were real limitations to the cowboy's movements and even to his own life. We gain some sense of how this hostile geography impinged on the mind of the cowboy from the following account of cowboy life:

On the great open ranges the whole outlook soon became one vast, featureless, confusing impression, like that derived from...

16Dale, p. 114.
the ocean. Moreover, the general aspect of the plains was, as it still is where the works of men have not disturbed, one of sadness—even of melancholy. . . . No one unfamiliar with them can understand what these effects are. They bore down upon the mind as would a heavy weight upon the body; and a torturing heartache then kept company with a sense of exile. It is doubtful if ever there was a cowboy who did not, at times at least, feel the burden of these influences; and the cattle not uncommonly showed that even they were not immune.  

While this may not be thoroughgoing geographical determinism, there is little shouting about the joys of the free life.

At the same time, being outside civilization did not mean that the cowboy had none of the limitations of a society. Primitive as his relationship to his fellow frontiersmen may have been, it was nevertheless characterized by both social strata and a strict code of social conduct. For instance, while the cowboy may have been very democratic in his relationships with other cowhands, he recognized and observed a distinct social gap between the hands and the foreman, which could be crossed only at the proper place and time, and in the proper manner. This is why Teddy Blue was so surprised when a new foreman asked him, "Ted, you are an old trail man, what is the best way to get the herd across?" Teddy's response was, "Think of a boss asking one of the hands that question!" The cowboy also recognized a social gap between himself and other frontier figures. The trapper, buffalo hunter, and freighter were all below his own station and were expected to give him plenty of room when he came to town.

But so far as their social relationships with each other were concerned, the life that cowboys led brought them close together, or as one commentator puts it, "they were clannish, just as soldiers who have been under fire appear clannish to troops who have never been blooded." Our anonymous writer makes the same point, "They were strongly disposed to be clannish, and, while there were occasional feuds between individuals that usually ended in the death of one or the other, some-times of both, as a body of men they would fight for each

---

16Ramon Adams, p. 7.
17Abbott, pp. 194-5.
18See, for instance, Abbott, pp. 102, 211-212.
other to the last."  Thus, while the cowboy may ride in our imagination as a "loner" free from the obligations of civilization, there can be little doubt that in reality he was very much a part of a society, albeit a small and violent one.

LIMITATIONS OF THE CODE

If he was limited by a kind of frontier social strata, the cowboy was even more limited by the stringent requirements of the code that was a very real part of his society. Many might want to discount the idea of a cowboy code as the invention of modern mass media or else a mythical holdover from the medieval romance. But in reality there can be little doubt that there were certain fundamental rules of conduct under which the cowboy had to operate. For instance, though he may have technically been free to come and go, to work or quit as he felt he wanted to do, the cowboy’s code required an almost medieval fealty to his outfit and to his work. Thus, after an extremely long and hard ride after lost stock, the protagonist in Andy Adams’ account of cowboying is ordered out with the herd. There was no hesitation from the trail-weary cowboy, "With a hungry look in the direction of our chuck wagon, I obeyed."  Sleep, food, rest, even the possibility of death were secondary to the requirements of duty. "A man was a three sevens man, a CK man or whatever the brand happened to be and they were trustworthy even when faced with death trying to guard stock drifting in a blizzard or riding full speed to turn a stampeding herd in the inky blackness of night." So writes one who has carefully studied the cowboy.  Cowboys themselves give us the same impression. Andy Adams’ cowboy, for instance, without hesitation swims with a part of the herd across the flooding Platte. Then finding himself on the opposite bank from the chuck wagon he tells us, "As far as dinner was concerned,—well, I’d much rather miss it than swim the Platte twice in its then stage o’ water. There is a difference in daring in one’s duty and in daring out of pure venturesomeness."  

After considering the demanding restrictions of duty, we can see that the so-called "free" cowboy might well long for the

---

20 Ramon Adams, p. 23.
21 Andy Adams, p. 51.
22 Brown, p. 128.
23 Andy Adams, p. 293.
time when he would be free of the cowboy's life; and well he did. "The cowboy longs to see the theatre," Emerson Hough assures us, "to have a trip to the city, to eat an oyster stew and all the green 'garden truck' he can hold. To him it seems that all the great pleasures of life must lie beyond the range, in the 'settlements.'" And turning again to Andy Adams' account of cowboying we read that cowboys "were glad to be free from herd duty and looked forward eagerly to the journey home."

While the cowboy code involved certain broad generalities about duty, it was in some aspects surprisingly detailed and specific. For instance, a cowboy always had to pay his bills and the one who forgot even a small debt, if honestly incurred, would find it hard to get a job. A now famous story tells of a Bar N cowboy who rode out of Miles City without paying his bill to a prostitute. When the foreman heard what had happened he fired the cowboy and the other hands chipped in to pay the bill to uphold the reputation of the outfit. Another detail of the code forbade anyone's using a horse from another cowboy's string. Once the horses had been turned over to the cowboy, no one, not even the boss, could ride one of them without the cowboy’s permission, even though they still technically belonged to the outfit and not to the cowboy. The detail of the code that concerned hospitality was just as strict. "You had to feed and shelter your worst enemy if he came to your house in a storm," one old cowboy tells us, "and if you refused him shelter, you had better leave that country."

To list every aspect of the cowboy's code would take up too much space. We can see well enough from these few examples that the code was specific and detailed, that it loomed large in the cowboy's life, and—most important of all for this study—that it was stringent. The point is, that while the cowboy and his interpreters have talked a great deal about freedom, it was not an unlimited freedom that the cowboy enjoyed. His land, his society, his code all set restrictions on him. His existence was at once free and not free.

---

24As quoted by Ramon Adams, p. 74.
25Andy Adams, p. 381.
26Brown, p. 127.
27Abbott, p. 212.
28Ibid., p. 126.
FREEDOM IN THE UNIVERSE

But to talk of the cowboy's freedom in terms of geography, laws, social mores, etc., though important in its own right, really does not get us to the heart of the matter. We need to probe deeper into the nature of the man himself; we need to ask what it was that the cowboy was free from. We need to ask not simply what was his attitude toward fences, but what was the cowboy's attitude toward the universe? Did the constant dangers of his daily existence give him any preoccupation with death and his own contingency? Did he have any sense of ultimate universal freedom to act; or did he feel that somewhere a calf was growing that would one day crush his bones as a stampeding steer? The answers to these questions are not easy to ferret out, for, as we said in the beginning, the cowboy was not given to philosophical speculation. Still there is enough evidence that we can at least suggest a few generalizations about his attitude toward these universal questions.

The cowboy did express, though sometimes unconsciously, something like a philosophy in the verses and songs he composed to fill the loneliness that was a part of his trade. One "real cowboy of the old school," wrote:

Just let me live my life as I've begun!
And give me work that's open to the sky;
Make me a partner of the wind and sun,
And I won't ask a life that's soft and high.

Make me as big and open as the plains;
As honest as the horse between my knees;
Clean as the wind that blows behind the rains;
Free as the hawk that circles down the breeze.

Just keep an eye on all that's done and said;
Just right me sometime when I turn aside;
And guide me on the long, dim trail ahead—
That stretches upward towards the Great Divide.20

Such musings may not be profound but they do suggest a fundamental commitment to individualism and a responsibility for one's own acts. In the cowboy's mind there may have been a controlling force in the universe, but its interference with his own life was minimal. Thus, with the everyday press of hard work, the cowboy went ahead doing what he "figured was

---

20Dale, p. 133.
best,” neither worrying about ultimate causes or final consequences. “I have been too busy to heed her last advice,” Charlie Siringo wrote of his mother’s dying counsel, “being a just God, I feel he will overlook my neglect. If not, I will have to take my medicine, with Satan holding the spoon.”

With Charlie as with many others, a man’s actions were the result of his own initiative, not the result of a compelling universe. Just how independent of fate and destiny the cowboy could become is revealed in the following statement of Teddy Blue’s:

That family stuffed me full of all that religious bull when I was a kid, but I never had any more use for it after I was grewed, and in that I was like the rest of the cowpunchers. Ninety percent of them was infidels. The life they led had a lot to do with that. After you come in contact with nature, you get all that stuff knocked out of you—praying to God for aid, Divine Providence, and so on—because it wouldn’t work. You could pray all you damned pleased, but it wouldn’t get you water where there wasn’t water. Talk about trusting in Providence, hell, if I’d trusted in Providence I’d have starved to death.

Teddy certainly didn’t feel determined by a providential decree.

And yet however free Teddy Blue, Charlie Siringo, Andy Adams and their colleagues may have felt themselves to be, it must be remembered that death—something ultimate, uncontrollable, and final—was constantly with them. Says Teddy Blue:

If I had been twenty feet further into the herd that night, I and my horse both would have been trampled just like that fellow in ’76. Well, it was all in the game and all cowpunchers knew it when they were riding like that; they all knew that might be their fate with the next jump the horse took.

It was a strange dilemma that the cowboy lived with. He may have been free in his universe, but it was a freedom that only lasted from moment to moment. Death—ultimate, irresistible, irrevocable—was always there. And it may well be that it was because of, rather than in spite of, this dilemma that we see the cowboy as an individualist, as the ideal of freedom.

---

28Branch, pp. 160-161.
29Abbott, p. 28-29.
ULTIMATE FREEDOM

Is it possible that the progress of society away from the dangers that lead to death has been at the expense of individual freedom? Perhaps our modern fascination with danger, with speeding, skydiving, mountain climbing is closely linked to our continuing fascination with the cowboy. Perhaps some universal meanings for all men can be discovered here in the close proximity of a sense of freedom and the possibility of death. One astute analyst of the West suggests as much relative to myth of the West, and it seems to me that we could draw similar conclusions relative to the history of the West. Certainly few if any other historical episodes offer such an opportunity to study the problem of man's sense of ultimate freedom and ultimate fate. Here, stripped of the accumulated social veneer of many centuries, man finds himself almost daily in the limit situation. It may well be that because of his situation, because of the almost daily prospect of violent death, man here developed what finally amounts to a genuine existential sense of his own freedom. While discovering his freedom by thrusting himself into this ultimate situation, he was also proving and flaunting it in the face of the irresistible forces that impinged upon him. Thus when he confronted death it was more with relish and fierceness than reluctance and fear. Not that he hoped for death, but rather that the situation of the confrontation with it gave him, finally, his ultimate sense of freedom.

This whole idea is vividly illustrated by Teddy Blue as he recalls the effects of a particularly nerve-rending thunderstorm on one old cowboy. With the lightning ripping the sky and the thunder banging the ground, in imminent danger of being struck down by the cosmic forces crashing all around him, old Matt Winter yanked off his hat, hurled his blasphemies at the sky, and with the rain pouring in his face yelled, "If you want to kill me, come on, do it!"

Like Matt Winter in the thunderstorm, the cowboy discovered in the dangers of his daily life, even in the presence of death, that he could strike out at destiny. In the very teeth of contingency, the cowboy found his ultimate freedom.

32Don D. Walker, "Freedom and Destiny in the Myth of the American West."
33Abbott, p. 66.
Camp Floyd Centennial

CLINTON F. LARSON*

West of the mountains, in the expanse of land
Covert because it is beyond our concern, fanned
By the winds of clear azure, I lean to the wind
To know the headstones of ancient death finned
With memorial mists and wisps of seething sand.

There, lying in the spare sun, the sagebrush grey
As the Confederacy, is the plot of the stray
Soldiery of the Union who sought valor in the world
West from St. Louis like the dust that swirled
From some lost spume of wind in a vacant day.

There they are, among the grass-sweeping shadows
Where the seethe of prairies touches the meadows,
The cities of color lost in their hour of seeming
As I look to find them, as I search there, dreaming:
Dragoons lean in the light, near spectral widows,

Wraiths of darkness wending around them from sorrow,
From New Haven, New York, and Boston, who must borrow
Time to stay here through the years that intervene.
Ghostly, you writhe for awareness in the sheen
Of the light of graves as if for duty tomorrow.

Captain, who are we to cross the bridge to the square
Of your camp as if to challenge a province where
Your importance flickers like your burnished sheath
Amid your gear reposing here, in glass, underneath
The dull concerns of some brief, perpetual care?

You have won this day of reliquary local lore
Though the memorial plaques announce no event of war.
If, then, you and your blue cadre had lived,
Had returned east, had been skirmishers sieved
With shot, you had died at Gettysburg, as poor

Of fame as here. Again, crests of your valor move away
In the desolate sectors of Utah where gulls prey
On the darting denizens of earth. It is the feel
Of the wind over the plaques and an ashen wheel
That makes me pause as if to hear what you might say.

*Dr. Larson is professor of English at Brigham Young University.
Mormonism and the Germans: An Annotated Bibliography, 1848-1966

D. L. Ashliman*

It is easy, but unjustifiable for the American student of Mormonism to forget that the Latter-day Saints have also attracted the attention of scholars and writers outside of the English-speaking world, many of whose works are worthy of serious consideration. Although I have found no German commentator on the Latter-day Saints who writes with the keen perception of a de Tocqueville, the bibliography below does contain works, some written by outstanding scholars, whose unique perspective should not be ignored by the serious student of Mormonism.

The following bibliography has been compiled chiefly from the resources of the Göttingen University Library. The card catalogs of the New York Public Library and the Princeton University Library were also used.

My principal source of book titles has been the national bibliographies by Kayser and Hinrichs, the *Deutsches Bücherverzeichnis*, and the *Deutsche Bibliographie*. Using these standard works in combination, one can obtain bibliographical data on most books published in the German language since 1750. Subject-matter indexes were not included between 1832 and 1891, so I may have missed some books (especially fiction that did not include the word "Mormon" in the title) from this period if they were not important enough to have been included in other bibliographies, such as the standard theological bibliographies, the bibliographies included in many of the separate studies, or the *Catalog of the Yale Collection of Western Americana*.

Dietrich's *Bibliographie der deutschsprachigen Zeitschriftenliteratur* has cataloged the articles of Germany's most important periodicals since 1861. Between 1909 and 1944 a number of important newspapers were also included. Germany has

---

*Mr. Ashliman spent 1966-67 in Germany working on his doctoral dissertation, which is nearing completion. He is presently Instructor of German at the University of Pittsburgh.
long had an active sensationalistic press, and numerous articles
and stories about the Church must have appeared in Germany’s
tabloids, slicks, and pulps, which would neither be cataloged
by standard bibliographies nor preserved by even the largest
libraries. The Presiding Bishopric’s Office in Frankfurt am
Main has a large file of such material, which has been col-
clected rather haphazardly since about 1952 and systemati-
ically (with the assistance of newspaper clipping services) since
1966. The press has given wide publicity to the deviant or crimi-
nal behavior of wayward Mormons and has capitalized on such
scandals as the polygamous colony at Short Creek, Arizona. On
the other hand, the Church has received much favorable news-
paper publicity from the Tabernacle Choir’s European tour in
1955, concerts and exhibitions by Brigham Young University
and mission groups, and the Utah Symphony Orchestra’s
European concert tour in 1966. And famous Mormons, espe-
cially if they visit Germany, are frequently given good publicity.
Leading this list is Elder Ezra Taft Benson. Other Mormons
who have attracted the attention of the German press include
Ivy Baker Priest, Gene Fullmer, Alice Buehner, and George
Romney.

Since 1964 the Church’s newspaper publicity in Germany
has mushroomed. In this year Elder Ezra Taft Benson or-
ganized the European Information Service, the public-relations
arm of the Church in the German-speaking countries and Italy.
Largely through the efforts of this organization, virtually
every move the Church makes in Germany, Austria, and Swit-
zerland is given newspaper publicity. In 1966 the Information
Service collected an average of 310 column inches per month,
less than ten percent of which was judged to be strongly antago-
nistic. The bulk of this coverage has been of local events and
in local newspapers, for which reason I have made no attempt
to catalog it.

Other forms of mass media are still harder to catalog than
the daily press. Mormons have been occasionally mentioned in
German motion pictures (usually with a humorous reference
to polygamy), but to my knowledge the Church has played
an important role only in Edgar Reitz’s Mahlzeiten (1967),
in which the leading couple is converted to Mormonism. The
film is of special interest because the missionary parts are
played by actual Mormon elders. There is also a Mormon
Comedy presently (1967) being played on German stages, *Wind in den Zweigen des Sassafras* by René de Obaldia, translated from French by Eugen Helmé. But there is little Mormon about Obaldia’s crude, but lovable pioneers, and the fact that they are Mormons is mentioned so fleetingly that most theater visitors will not be aware of it.

Translations of English-language publications have not been included in the present bibliography, and there have been many, especially in Mormon fiction. Nor have the voluminous official Church publications been included, virtually all of which are translations of American works.

For further research outside of the Anglo-American sphere, M. H. A. van der Valk’s *De Prophet der Mormonen Joseph Smith Jr.* (Kampen, 1921) contains a bibliography with over 1,400 items, including many titles in German, French, Dutch, and Scandinavian, as well as English.

1848


A first-hand account of the Mormon exodus from Nauvoo in September 1846.

1854


An objective account of Mormonism and its background in Yankee America by a well-known German journalist who also authored two important books about Bismarck. Busch ends this chapter of his American travel narrative with the statement: “Whatever the miracles of their apostles and prophets may be, Mormonism itself is one of the greatest miracles of the nineteenth century.” (p. 82)

1855


An enlargement of the above treatment. Busch accepts the Spaulding Manuscript theory, as do nearly all German writers (even to the present day). He devotes considerable space to polygamy and includes the Mormon defense, and he mentions many fruits of Mormonism, “which are by no means all bad.” (p. 5)

1856


A relatively unpartisan overall treatment by an editor and publisher of German-language newspapers in Missouri and Iowa from 1851 to 1865.

An illustrated account of the Whipple Expedition, of which Möllhausen was a member. The information for his factual, but unsympathetic excursion on the Mormons was gleaned from the reports of John W. Gunnison and Howard Stansbury and from first-hand contact with Mormon pioneers on the upper Missouri River. An English version appeared under the title *Diary of a Journey from the Mississippi to the Coasts of the Pacific with a United States Government Expedition*, trans. Mrs. Percy Sinnett, London, 1858.


A reprint of articles which appeared originally in the periodical *Das Westland*, I-V (1852-1853). Although Andree presents in the main an accurate account of Mormon history, his emphasis on polygamy, the Danites, and Mormon 'fanaticism' does not form a favorable image of the Latter-day Saints.

Schiel, Jacob H. *Reise durch die Felsengebirge und die Humboldtgebirge nach dem stillen Ocean*, Schaffhausen, 139 pp.

Schiel, a member of the Gunnison Expedition, spent seven months in Utah in 1853. Roughly one-third of his book is devoted to the Mormons and is one of the bitterest condemnations of the Latter-day Saints ever published in German. A laudable English translation is *Journey Through the Rocky Mountains and the Humboldt Mountains to the Pacific Ocean*, ed., trans. Thomas N. Bonner, Norman, Oklahoma, 1961.

Overbeck, J. *Der Mormonismus: Nach mormonischen Quellen*, Gotha.


A novel by one of nineteenth-century Germany's most popular (but now forgotten) novelists. Part of the action takes place in Salt Lake City, and Mormons play minor roles. The sinister image of the Mormon Church painted in Möllhausen's later novels is entirely missing in this work.


An account of the Ives Colorado Expedition, of which Möllhausen was a member. He tells of Mormon missionary efforts among the Mohave Indians and reveals the party's distrust and dislike of all Mormons.

GERMAN BIBLIOGRAPHY

1863


In many respects one of the most complimentary Mormon treatments ever to have appeared in Germany. Vollmer even justifies (or at least refuses to condemn) polygamy: "The members of our party found no immorality [among the Mormons]." (p. 177) Of special interest are his detailed descriptions of Utah industries and mining operations. Although the book is "dedicated to the well educated of the German people," it is written largely in the style of a pulp novel and is marred by numerous errors.

1864


A popular novel set in Utah during the Mormon War. The Latter-day Saints are depicted as ruthless fanatics. Although this book received high praise from contemporary literary critics and was republished as late as 1935, it is forgotten today.

1866

"Ein Amerikaner über die Mormonen der Salzseestadt," *Das Ausland*, XXXIX, 1866-1868.

A review of Samuel Bowles' book *Across the Continent*, Springfield, Massachusetts, and New York, 1865 and 1866. The reviewer condemns polygamy and claims that it is unpopular even among the Mormons. He praises the Salt Lake Theater.


1867


A tirade against the alleged manipulation and spiritual enslavement of the Mormons by their ruthless leaders. Storch does mention the secular achievements of the Mormons in Utah and gives special praise to the Salt Lake Theater.

1868


1869


A review of an article in the *New York Herald*, Nov. 5, 1869, telling of the feud between Godbe, Harris (E. L. T. Harrison?), and Brigham Young.
"Wunderliche Heilige: In den Betstunden der Mormonen," Gartenlaube, p. 25.


A first-hand "exposé" of conditions in Utah. The author claims that Mormon polygamy approaches incest, that Mormons suffer greatly because of their refusal to accept medical aid other than the laying on of hands, and that the Negro cannot enter the Mormon heaven.

1870


One of the most comprehensive and best studies of the Mormons to have appeared in German. The approach and tone are similar to the author's earlier works (1854 and 1855). Busch regrets that Joseph Smith's full story may never be revealed because of the unreliability of most of the sources. (p. vii)


Literally the best fictional treatment of the Mormons that has been written in German, but also one of the most slanderous. Greif, a prominent German poet, gives us here a fictional account of Mormon agents in Ireland. The novel, written in the style of Edgar Allan Poe, abounds in intrigue, murder, and abduction, all at the hands of Mormon missionaries.


1871


A report of the increasing friction between the United States government and the Latter-day Saints over the question of polygamy.

"Die neueste Gestaltung des Mormonenreiches in Utah," Das Ausland, XLIV, 783-789.

An account of mining and agriculture in Utah. The author sees in the influx of miners and above all in the completion of the trans-continental railroad the end of Mormondom's protective isolation and the beginning of the Mormon kingdom's fall.

1873


A laudable account by a German diplomat in Washington from 1853 to 1864. Schleiden traveled extensively in America, visiting both Utah and the ruins of Nauvoo. William H. Seward credited him with knowing "more contemporary American history than any other man alive, the Americans not excluded." (Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie, Leipzig, 1908, LIV, 39)

1874


An account which praises the Mormons' accomplishments but condemns polygamy. Special mention is given the Salt Lake Theater and Brigham Young's alleged attempts to woo the popular actress Fräulein Alexandra.


A Metternichian Austrian nobleman's account of his tour of the world capitals. The description of his stay in Utah is little more than a tirade against Brigham Young. The German version is the author's own translation of the original Promenade autour de monde, Paris, 1873. An English translation A Ramble Round the World appeared in London in 1874. The work appeared in Italian as Passeggiata intorno al mondo, Torino, 1875 and Milano, 1877.


An illustrated account of the Mormon overland migration.

Richter, J. J. Bilder aus den Vereinigten Staaten, Zurich.


One of four commendable books on the American West by a noted German geographer.

1877


1879

"Der Mormonenstaat in Utah," Der Katholik, n.s. XLI, 651-663.

1881


Jüngst, Johannes. Die evangelische Kirche und die Separatisten und Sektierer der Gegenwart, Gotha, iii + 60 pp.


A popular nineteenth-century German poet's report of a trip to Salt Lake City in 1880. Bodenstedt's writing skill and his ability as a sensitive, impartial observer combine to make this account of the Latter-day Saints one of the most laudable ever to have appeared in Germany.


Möllhausen, Heinrich BALDUN. *Der Fanatiker*, Berlin, 3 vols., xi + 764 pp.; republished as late as 1905.
A fictional account of Mormon proselyting activities in Norway and their "tyrannical" rule in Utah.


"Von den Mormonen," *Neue evangelische Kirchenzeitung*, cols. 448-449.
A short article which explains the difference between the Utah Mormons and the Reorganized Church, called here the "Kirtland Mormons."

A short general history of the Mormons which praises them for being "among the most industrious, most energetic, and wealthiest citizens of the United States" (p. 77), but criticizes the "despotic religious discipline" (p. 78) which has been forced upon them.

An objective account of the legal problems facing the United States government in the "Mormon problem."


The narrative of a trip through Utah in early 1883. Meyer is unimpressed with Salt Lake City, rails the practice of polygamy, and calls Brigham Young an "absolute autocrat." (p. 421)

An account of Mormon migration to Mexico in an attempt to avoid prosecution under the Edmunds Act.

A sympathetic, well-written account of life among the Mormons.
1887


Minutes of a lecture delivered at a meeting of the *Frankfurter Verein* in 1885, in which Cronau describes the Latter-day Saints and their achievements in the most glowing terms. He attributes the persecution of the Mormons solely to the jealousy of their neighbors, and even sees some good in polygamy, namely the abolishment of spinsterhood.


An anonymous cycle of poems depicting the sad lot of a polygamous Mormon woman. In addition to favorable reviews, the collection received publicity for its novel appearance; the poems were printed on a long strip of paper, which was rolled onto two ornately turned wooden staves.


1888

May, Karl. "Der Geist der Llano estakata," *Der Gute Kamerad* (Stuttgart), II, 19-52 (first installment). Later incorporated into the novel *Unter Geiern*, which has been republished as recently as 1952 in Vienna and Heidelberg.

May is one of Germany's most enigmatic writers. His approximately thirty-five novels of Western adventure are still popular today, more than fifty years after the author's death, although no one now takes seriously his oft-repeated claim that the fantastic adventures recorded in his books were personal experiences. May frequently mentions the Mormons in his adventure stories. An important episode of *Unter Geiern* (which has recently been made into a popular film) is provided by the crimes of robbery and murder of a Mormon missionary.

1889


A rather clumsy "exposé" by an angry churchman, written in Salt Lake City in 1888. An example of Fernhagel's logic: He sees in Joseph Smith's changing his story from gold plates to brass plates a stroke of genius, as materialistic Americans would not long let gold plates remain hidden. (p. 13)

1890


1891


A short notice of the Manifesto and its political results.

1892


An account of a trip to Utah by a German geologist. Streng praises the Mormons and their city in the most flattering terms.

1893


A still popular novel, whose plot is provided by Mormon Harry Melton’s attempts to force a group of immigrants to perform slave labor in a quicksilver mine.

1895


1896


A news article reporting Utah’s admission into the Union. The Mormons’ achievements are described in superlatives—the Salt Lake Temple as "the most beautiful church on the American continent" and Utah as the western state with the "highest standard of living." (p. 196)


1897

"Mormonenjubiläums-Becher," Illustrierte Zeitung (Leipzig), CIX, No. 2822, 156.

A short news article about the fiftieth anniversary of the Saints’ arrival in Utah. The official anniversary cup is the center of the article.

Munzinger, K. "In Stadt und Tempel der Mormonen," Christliche Welt (Freiburg), XI, cols. 991-996, 1049-51, 1069-72.

The report of a trip to "the mysterious city of the Mormons" (col. 992) in 1895. Munzinger boasts of the Mormons’ achievements: "The Tabernacle is one of the world’s greatest construction wonders." (col. 1069) But he is unsympathetic toward their beliefs, and gives Mormon polygamy as a proof "that fanatics and visionaries succumb readily to sensuality." (col. 1049)

"Zur Entstehungsgeschichte des Mormonismus," Adolf Bruells popularwissenschaftliche Monatsblätter zur Belehrung über das Judentum, XVII, No. 8, 204-206.

An unsympathetic general account of Mormonism written for Jewish readers. Contains an accurate synopsis of the Book of Mormon, stressing the fact that the subjects of the book were allegedly members of the House of Israel.
1898


Zaxt finds Mormonism to be the most pernicious of all modern sects.

1899

Ende, A. von. "Vom Propheten der Mormonen," Das neue Jahrhundert (Cologne), Nos. 48, 50.


An attempt to prove an economic theory by quoting at length from an article by William A. Smythe in the Atlantic Monthly, Nov. 1896. Utah is used as an example of an economic utopia.


A short history of John (sic) Smith and the church which he founded. Four pages of quotations from the German hymnbook, the Doctrine and Covenants, and other Church writings are included.


1900


An abridged version of the journal of a Swiss pioneer who crossed Utah in 1846. Two English translations which include the Utah section of his journal are From St. Louis to Sutter's Fort, 1846, trans. and ed. Erwin G. and Elisabeth K. Gudde, Norman, Oklahoma, 1961; and "Journal: July 26-September 8, 1846," trans. and ed. Dale L. Morgan, Utah Historical Quarterly, XIX (1951), 117-176.


An objective, accurate account telling about the Edmunds Act and the Manifesto and praising the latest Mormon achievements in colonization and irrigation.

1902


"Mormonen in Deutschland," Kirchliche Wochenschrift für evangelische Christen (Berlin), no. 49, cols. 776-779.

A short history of Latter-day Saint mission efforts in Germany, together with a sarcastic rebuttal of certain Mormon doctrines. The readers are warned that the Mormons are probably still practicing polygamy and that English hymns are sung in German Sunday schools, thus making conversion to Mormonism both morally objectionable and unpatriotic.


An interesting article, instructing Bavarian civil authorities how to deal with the Mormon problem. Müller points out that Mormon meetings, with the exception of family groups, are prohibited by law (p. 221), that Mormons can be refused the right to conduct religious services at cemeteries (p. 221), and that any foreign missionary can legally be expelled from Bavaria. (p. 222)


1903


Lemcke, Heinrich. "Fahrt nach den Mormonen-Kolonien in Mexiko." Koloniale Zeitschrift (Berlin), IV, 123-125, 139-142.

An interesting illustrated article containing a German visitor's impressions of two Mormon colonies in Mexico, Dublin and Juarez. Lemcke was not only impressed by his hosts, Mr. Pratt and Heinrich Eyring, but also by the accomplishments of the colonists.

Osthaus, F. E. "Bei den Mormonen." Die Woche (Berlin), No. 36.


A fair, frequently complimentary article in a prestigious German Evangelical encyclopedia.


1905


An Evangelical pastor's refutation of the sects.

1906

Brentano, H. "Die Heiligen der letzten Tage," Beilage zur Allgemeinen Zeitung (Munich), No. 256.

1907

Wilson, Albert Edgar. Gemeinwirtschaft und Unternehmungsformen im Mormonenstaat, diss., Leipzig, 38 pp.; reprinted in Jahrbuch für Gesetzge-
GERMAN BIBLIOGRAPHY

A dissertation for the University of Berlin which treats Mormon communism, tithing, cooperative irrigation, trade organizations, and capitalistic business ventures.

1908


Glässer, J. Das Geheimnis der Mormonen: Amerikanische Kriminalerzählung, Reutlingen, 95 pp.

A trivial detective novel in which two private detectives are pitted against the "Order of the Golden Lion of Utah," the secret society of the Mormon leaders. They free a kidnapped girl, uncover numerous other Mormon crimes, and escape to the East.

Das Mormonenmonument: Die sogenannte Kirche der Heiligen der letzten Tage, Zurich.


A tirade against everything Mormon, written by a German Evangelical pastor and former missionary to the Mormons. His account of the mission founded in Utah in 1902 by the German Evangelical Church to "Christianize" the Mormons is of special interest.

1909

"Die ersten Wiener Mormonen," Zeit (Vienna), July 23.

"Mormonen-Staat wird aufgelöst," Hamburger Nachrichten, Nov. 23.

1910


The story of Carl Guth, a member of the all-German Quincy Guard which was dispatched to Nauvoo in the late summer of 1844 by Governor Ford.


An account of the reception in Salt Lake City of a delegation of seventy-six participants in an international women's congress in Toronto. Mrs. Tiburtius found the Salt Lake women "very cultivated" (p. 224), but Mormon doctrine ridden by "contradictions" and "absurdities," but still no more difficult to explain than other religious phenomena of the nineteenth century such as Christian Science and spiritualism. (p. 224) Her twenty-four hours among the Mormons did not allow time for careful research, and her statements are not always
accurate. For example, she claims that the victims of the Mountain Meadows Massacre were "apostate families who hadn't found satisfac-
tion among the Latter-day Saints [and who] wanted to return to the
outside world." (p. 221)

"Zur Entstehungsgeschichte des Mormonentums," Hauuoverscher Kourier, July
26.

1911

Pasztor, A. "Ein Besuch bei dem Mormonen-Papst," Berliner Morgenpost,
Nov. 12.
Zimmer von Ulbersdorf, G. A. [Gustav Adolf Zimmer]. Im Schatten von
Mormons Tempel: Erzahlungen aus der deutschen evangelischen Mission
in Utah, Neukirchen, 112 pp.
"Zustände im Mormonenstaat," Deutsche Tageszeitung, April 25.

1912

Augstin, "Landwirtschaft im Staate der Mormonen," Deutsche landwirtschaft-
lche Presse, No. 12.
"Mormonen-Gefahr in Deutschland," Nationalzeitung, July 23.
"Mormonen-Gefahr in Deutschland," Post (Berlin), July 24.
Meyer, Eduard. Ursprung und Geschichte der Mormonen: Mit Exkursen über
die Anfänge des Islams und des Christentums, Halle a. S., vi + 300 pp.
The standard work on Mormonism in the German language,
written by a distinguished historian. An English translation Origin
and History of the Mormons was published in Salt Lake City in 1961.
Scheurlen, Paul. Die Sekten der Gegenwart, Stuttgart; 3rd ed. rev., 1923, Mor-
A study of modern sects by an Evangelical pastor. He recognizes
Mormonism's temporal achievements, but still considers it to be "a
counterfeit of the religion of Jesus Christ." (3rd ed., p. 174)
Troeltsch, Ernst. Die Soziallehren der christlichen Kirchen und Gruppen,
Tübingen, xvi + 994 pp.

1913


Henn, Robert. Amerikanische Schleudertage: Eine Reise in das Land der
Mormonen und zum Yellowstone-Park, Bremen, Mormons: pp. 34-40.
A German tourist's impression of Salt Lake City.

1914

Schroeder, Theodore. "Der sexuelle Anteil an der Theologie der Mormonen,"
Imago: Zeitschrift für Anwendung der Psychoanalyse auf die Geisteswis-
senschaften (Vienna), III, 197-204.
An explanation of alleged deviant sexual behavior among Mor-
mons (pederasty, sadism, polygamy, sensualism) through Mormon
theology. The journal in which this article appeared was edited by Sigmund Freud.

1915

"Neuer Mormonenbetrug?" Christliche Freiheit (Bonn), XXX, No. 13.

1921


1922


1923


A critical examination of Joseph Smith as a translator. Valk makes no attempt to hide his bias; his principal purpose is "to show that the prophet of the Mormons . . . was not called, led, and instructed by God, but was a servant of sin." (p. 5) Subjects discussed include the fascimiles of the characters from the gold plates and the illustrations in the Book of Abraham. This book is a greatly expanded version of a corresponding section in Valk's De Prophet der Mormonen Joseph Smith Jnr., Kampen, 1921.

1925


A standard Catholic reference work by one of Germany's leading churchmen. Algermissen recognizes the Mormons' social and economic achievements, but still finds Mormonism to be "one of the most perverted and most pernicious heresies." (4th ed., p. 734)

88 BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY STUDIES


Gerardi, Bernhard. Grundsätze und Wege zur Sektenbekämpfung, Wiesbaden.


Jungeblut, Rolf. Das gesellschaftliche System der Mormonen, diss., Frankfurt am Main, viii + 115 pp.

1926

Heimbucher, Max. Die neuseelndischen Sektion, Klagenfurt.


1927


A complimentary general article with eight quality photographic reproductions of scenic attractions in Utah.


Scheurlen, P. Das kleine Sektenbüchlein, Stuttgart, 80 pp.

1928

Algermissen, Konrad. Die Mormonen oder die Heiligen der letzten Tage, Hannover, 76 pp.; reprinted from Christliche Sektionen und Kirche Christi, 1925.


"Mormonen in Deutschland," Nationalzeitung (Basel), June 10.


1929


The author expands a one-day visit to Utah into an entire chapter in this narrative of a trip to America.

———. "Unter den Mormonen," Neue Freie Presse (Vienna), Sept. 15.


1930


A Roman Catholic work against all Christian sects. The Jehovah’s Witnesses are Busch’s principal target but he does not hesitate to throw frequent barbed comments at the Mormons.

"Hundert Jahre Mormonen," Bund (Bern), April 1.


"Die Hundertjahrefeier der Mormonen," Reichsbote (Berlin), April 30.

"Die Hundertjahrefeier der Mormonen," Sächsische Staats-Zeitung (Dresden), April 22.


1931


1932

"Geschichte und Lehre der Mormonen," Prager Presse, July 10.


A book written to "protect the Catholic people from Mormon recruiting attempts." (p. 8)


1933


1937

1938


1939

Rees, A. C. "Im Lande der Mormonen," *Völkischer Beobachter* (Berlin), April 15.

1940


Ponton, a prize-winning novelist, depicts here an early-nineteenth-century European sect, which, perhaps coincidentally, shares both its name and certain beliefs (Zionism, adventism, and abstinence from tobacco and alcohol) with the American Latter-day Saints.

1941


1948


1949


1950


A reasonably accurate, but unsympathetic general account of Mormon history and doctrine in the standard German-language protestant study of religious sects.


1952


A sympathetic portrayal of the Mormon Church in Germany with emphasis on the Latter-day Saints’ missionary activities, which the author suggests are financed by the United States government.


A short article which has little to say in addition to the statement that Mormonism is "a religious socialist sect of the American ‘Wild West.’"


A short, uncomplimentary article. Example: "Mormon doctrine is primitive polytheism built on a foundation of the materialistic glorifi-
cation of sexuality. . . . Polygamy is an essential part of their belief."
(col. 819)

1953

A superficial, but objective sociological study.

A history of polygamy in the Mormon Church from Joseph Smith to Short Creek, Arizona, written in *Der Spiegel*’s traditional sarcastic style.

"Die Mormonen." *Kirche und Mann* (Gütersloh), VI, No. 2, 5.

1954
An important essay on the difference between "church" and "sect" to the German mind. A German translation appeared in *Ökumenische Rundsah*, III, No. 2. Excerpts were printed in *Zeitung*, Sept., pp. 651-653.

Meinhold sees in Mormonism the beginning of American historical consciousness.


Impressions of a German visitor to Salt Lake City with special reference to Mormon economic and political power in Utah.

1955


1956
A doctoral dissertation written by a former supervisor of seminary teacher training at Brigham Young University. The first third of this study traces the theological roots of the Mormon philosophy of education. The second third deals with the lives and contributions
of three Mormon educators: Karl G. Maeser, John A. Widtsoe, and John T. Wahlquist. The last third examines the Mormons' (and Utah's) achievements in education.


A protestant theologian's explanation of the popularity and vitality of various sects, including the Mormons. The sects' small congregations, their emphasis on the participation of the laity, and their emotional approach to religion (spontaneous testimony bearing, etc.) are significant factors, maintains Hutten, but most important, he claims, is their "ability" to guarantee their adherents salvation.

"Die Mikrofilmarbeit der Genealogischen Gesellschaft der Kirche Jesu Christi der Heiligen der Letzten Tage," Der Archivar: Mitteilungsblatt für deutsches Archivwesen (Düsseldorf), XIX, cols. 77-79.

A report, furnished by the Church, of the history and scope of Latter-day Saint microfilming activities.


In spite of the promising title, this volume devotes less than three pages of text to the Mormons, sandwiched within a discussion of the Ku Klux Klan.

1957


An Evangelical theologian's attempt to explain the formation and vitality of various Christian sects. The Mormons find frequent mention.


1958

"Mormonen," Materialdienst: Längsschnitt durch die geistigen Strömungen und Fragen der Gegenwart (Stuttgart), XXI, 105-107, 189-190, 252.


1959


A survey of Mormon history and doctrine in English. Bodensieck "exposes" Joseph Smith's moral laxness and devotes considerable space to polygamy, which he claims was caused by "the nomadic life in camps." (p. 312)
GERMAN BIBLIOGRAPHY


Rothenberg, Friedrich Samuel. Christsein heute, Kassel, Mormons: II, 221.

Verderbliche Irrlehren, Witten, 48 pp.

1960


A critical treatment by a Roman Catholic authority on Christian sects. Algermissen’s work not only suffers from extreme bias, but also from careless research. Example: "Following the death of the last president, O. McKay, who had taken office in 1945, Henry D. Moyle was elected first president by the ‘quorum of twelve apostles.’" (p. 45)


A reasonably objective general account.

Heine, E. "Die Mormonen," Der Lutheraner: Zeitblätter für evangelisch-lutherische Gemeinden in Deutschland (Frankfurt am Main), XIV, 71-72.

An attempt to show that certain Mormon teachings are not in harmony with the Bible.


A short, uncomplimentary article.


A scholarly study of the position of the Bible in a number of sects.

1961


Gründler, Johannes. Lexikon der Christlichen Kirchen und Secten, Vienna, Freiburg, and Basel, Mormons: I, 326-335; II, 1194-95.

One of the most objective general treatments to have appeared in German.

1962


A short general article in the standard German-language Roman Catholic encyclopedia.


A Catholic priest’s explanation (with strong traces of Fawn Brodie) of Joseph Smith and of present Mormon vitality. The cen-
sure is mild, and there are even a few condescending compliments, but a number of errors mar the article, which first appeared in the French *Ecclesia*.


Hutten, Kurt. "Mormonenmissionare ziehen durchs Land," *Evangelischer Di-
gest* (Stuttgart), IV, No. 8, 37-43.

A prominent Evangelical theologian's attempt to warn European Christians about certain "dark points" (p. 40) which are omitted by the admittedly impressive Mormon missionaries. His most important disclosures: the existence of a Mormon splinter group, which even won the allegiance of the first prophet's son, and the practice of polygamy, which was given up only under force from the civil government. This article originated in the *Sonntagsblatt für die Evangelisch-Lutherische Kirche in Bayern*.

"Die Mormonen. "*Stimmen der Zeit: Monatsschrift für das Geistesleben der Gegenwart* (Freiburg im Breisgau), CLXX, 133-135.

An accurate and objective thumbnail sketch of Mormon history and belief, but one which ends on a pessimistic note. The author sees great danger in the development of an influential American mession-
ism.


1963


Apparently the first edition of this book to include a section on the Mormons.


1964

Renker, Z. [Ferdinand Krenzer]. *Unsere Brüder in den Sekten: Die Mor-

1965


An essay on happiness written around a personal encounter with Mormon missionaries.

1966

"Um sechs Uhr aus dem Bett: Zweitausend junge Mormonen beim 'Freud'

A report of the Church's second European youth conference in one of Germany's most prestigious national newspapers. This event was also given considerable publicity in local newspapers.
Book Reviews


In compiling the official messages of the First Presidency of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Dr. James R. Clark has provided a unique perspective for the study of Mormon history that will be of great value to layman and scholar alike.

This volume consists of 104 documents covering that transitional period of Church history from 1885 to 1901. The flow of events is easily followed by their chronological presentation; and an excellent fifty-seven-page index provides opportunity for topical study as well. The reader is well rewarded to consider the explanatory notes that accompany each message, which include references for further reading and quotations from significant primary sources, such as the journals of L. John Nuttall, John M. Whitaker, and Wilford Woodruff.

The first eleven items cover the final two and one-half years of the life of President John Taylor. At that time he and other Church leaders were living in "exile" due to the intensity of the anti-polygamy crusade. Five of these messages were delivered to the Saints in general conference, in the absence of their Church leaders.

There are sixty-nine documents listed during the administration of President Wilford Woodruff, including those pertinent to the solution of the plural marriage issue and the political realignment of the Church.

The concluding twenty-four messages cover the three-year term of President Lorenzo Snow. One-third of these deal with financial matters of the Church, the reformation of which was the prime task of his administration.

The lack of reference to the polygamy question in the period of Lorenzo Snow is noticeable, inasmuch as it was the subject of an official statement by that Church leader on January 8, 1900. Rumors were that the Church was insincere in abandoning the practice of plural marriage in 1890 and that
polygamists were still violating the law pertaining to unlawful cohabitation. In his statement, President Snow noted that, "... the Church has positively abandoned the practice of polygamy ... Nor does the Church advise or encourage unlawful cohabitation. ..."

In this same regard, it may be suggested that the quotation of part of President Snow's May 8, 1899, discourse at St. George, Utah, pertaining to the law of tithing, might logically be extended to include his solemn statement concerning the abandonment of the practice of plural marriage.

Two other messages that were overlooked in this period are noteworthy: The first is a statement by President Woodruff pertaining to the Church and politics, issued October 19, 1895, which is a precursor to the political "Manifesto" of April, 1896, in which he states that the holding of a Church position, "... does not require any man ... to give up his political principles."

The second is a letter sent by President Woodruff at the request of the New York World in July, 1897, that appeared in an article entitled, "Fifty Years of Mormonism in America." Among other things, the President described his entrance into Salt Lake Valley with Brigham Young:

When we arrived at the spot where we could have a good view of the valley he wished me to turn the carriage, which I did, so that he could look without obstruction when the door was opened on the side. After gazing on the valley for a while he said: "That will do, drive on; this is the place. I have seen this valley before in vision."

A few other messages of rather minor importance have been overlooked, such as the call, in 1892, for a special day of thanksgiving; the reaffirmation, on October 15, 1892, of the Deseret News as the official organ of the Church; and the announcement of a special memorial day in honor of the dead of the warship Maine, on July 16, 1898.

Several messages have been listed and briefly described that were not available for publication at this time. One of these was written to Marriner W. Merrill, president of the Logan Temple, January 23, 1889, directing him to discontinue plural marriages. This letter provides a significant clue to the question of the actual terminal date of the practices which arises from
the statement of Wilford Woodruff in the 1890 "Manifesto," wherein he denied that any such marriages had been solemnized during the preceding year, as alleged in the Utah Commission report of that year.

Of slight annoyance in this volume is over fifty typographical errors—the most serious being the transposition of one line of type from its place on Page 310 to a place four lines further in the text. A note in the preface indicates that a desire to preserve the character of the original documents appears to increase the number of errors. Such errors, however, could properly be noted by a literary device, to distinguish them from later additions.

It may be further noted, that the statement on political policy found on Page 233, which was apparently taken from B. H. Roberts' *A Comprehensive History of the Church*, is missing a rather lengthy introductory sentence, when compared with the original in the *Deseret News* of March 25, 1892.

These faults in no way detract from the intrinsic value of this book, and certainly Dr. Clark is to be commended for his highly significant contribution.

Dean C. Jessee
Church Historian's Office

Dr. May, a psychologist and author of such previous books as *The Meaning of Anxiety* and *Man's Search for Himself,* is a supervisory and training analyst at the William Alanson White Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Psychoanalysis as well as an adjunct professor in the Graduate College of Arts and Sciences, New York University.

The fourteen chapters which comprise this book are, in fact, a series of separate essays which have their origins in lectures, articles, etc., produced during the last twelve years. These are grouped into four major sections: (1) our contemporary situation, (2) sources of anxiety, (3) psychotherapy, and (4) freedom and responsibility. There is no index, and the only bibliography is in the form of a section at the end of each chapter called "notes," where several references are listed with a few of the author's comments.

In reading this book, this reviewer was impressed by the clear and lucid style in which May presented his ideas. May is not tendentious, confused, or trying to impress—but rather straightforward and direct. While he is unacquainted with the "religious life" and obviously lives in an intellectual world which sees religion or religious commitment as having little relevance to the twentieth century, his vision of man is basically open-minded, nondogmatic, reflective, and subject to change if given sufficient evidence. However, one example of his intellectual "provincialism" is seen (p. 73) where he speaks of the anxiety which the threat of death offers "... unless one holds beliefs in immortality which are not common in our culture." Anyone who reads the Gallup Poll knows that the majority of American people believe in immortality and life after death—and Rollo May's comment above tells us more about his values and those of his associates and patients rather than people in general in our culture.

While Dr. May speaks from the viewpoint of a psychologist and psychotherapist, the issues and topics he discusses have relevance and significance for all persons concerned about man's role in the universe of things and his struggle and search for identity. For that person with the security of a strong religious commitment this book will give a glimpse into another world—the soul of the man without roots, with shift-
BOOK REVIEWS

ing or dissolving values—or in short—the existentialist. As our society becomes increasingly secularized, this kind of man and his kind of personal problems will become (and are becoming) increasingly epidemic. Dr. May analyzes such current social problems as the student riots at Berkeley and the dependence on drugs (tranquilizers, LSD, etc.) and considers these behaviors as often inadequate ways of coping with our age of anxiety. He believes (as does this reviewer) that anxiety and guilt are extremely important prerequisites to change, that values and valuing are essential for mental health, as are honesty with self, self-insight, courageous facing of flaws and shortcomings, and self-commitment to healthy, rational goals. Concerning the aims of psychotherapy, he states that we should no longer be seduced by the ubiquitous idea of adjustment—the “true” goal should be the full confronting of one’s own existence, even though in doing this, one may be less adjusted to society and may well carry more conscious anxiety. This is something most Latter-day Saints may well contemplate as the values of their religion become increasingly disparate from a society and culture which are radically changing. He states in many different ways that freedom can never be separated from responsibility. He expresses concern about the increasing sexual promiscuity of our age, where sex is often used in the service of security—to overcome one’s own apathy and isolation. Sex is something we can do when we run out of conversation; it is the substitution of bodily intimacy for personal relationship. Promiscuous sexuality is frequently a neurotic way of coping with anxiety; it leads to increased depersonalization, and alienation, not love, growth, fulfillment, etc.

His chapters at times are a little redundant: he differentiates neurotic and normal anxiety a number of times. But this is not overdone, and I do not see it as any major flaw. With regard to the unconscious, he tries to have his cake and eat it too by both minimizing it and still saying it is important. This probably reflects some of his own unresolved conflicts in trying to be an existentialist and psychoanalyst at the same time. I can see this book being used as a supplementary text in classes in philosophy, psychology, or religion, and would, in general, recommend it as being sober, well-balanced, stimulating, and relevant to the above-mentioned fields.

Victor B. Cline, University of Utah

Almost anyone who has heard anything about Mormon history has heard of Porter Rockwell. The legend of this man stands at the pinnacle of Mormon folklore. Harold Schindler has undertaken the difficult—perhaps even impossible—task of attempting to uncover the facts of a life so shrouded by myth and mystery and to interpret them in a way which will give meaning to the man and his work.

Rockwell was a man who was loved and hated with equally extreme passion. He was a man to whom dedication to his Church meant more than all else. His epitaph said that “He was brave and loyal to his faith, true to the prophet Jos. Smith.” Rockwell was one of the early converts to the Church and an early friend of the Prophet. After his birth in Massachusetts and his move to New York, he endured, with the Saints, the persecutions of Independence and Far West as well as those of Nauvoo. Rockwell was a Danite in Missouri, though not a leader. Indeed, he was such a minor figure that his Missouri career is often difficult to follow, and Schindler’s account is often conjectural. In Nauvoo, he was a close friend to Joseph, one of his bodyguards, and the man who rowed him to Iowa to begin the abortive journey to the Rocky Mountains. After Joseph’s murder, Rockwell was involved in the war which raged between the Mormons and Gentiles of Hancock County.

After being acquitted on murder charges which grew out of the Hancock County war, Rockwell joined the Saints on their move west. He was a member of the advance party which entered the Salt Lake Valley in July, 1847. After his arrival in Utah, Rockwell lived and carried on business at several places, including Salt Lake City, Point of the Mountain, and Tooele County.

He participated in the Utah War as a leader of a guerilla band and died in 1878 while under indictment for murders which took place during that war.

Though Schindler’s work is good, especially as a life-and-times account, it raises in the mind of this reviewer several questions. The author presents quotations from a number of
authors using the term "Danites" and other related terms, but he never really comes to grips with the problem of the existence of Danites in Utah Territory. Indeed, the bulk of the evidence which Schindler presents would tend to contradict the view that such an organization existed in Utah. He gives a great deal of credence to the statements of a pseudonymous Achilles, whose book, *The Destroying Angels of Mormondom*, purports to be a sketch of the life of Rockwell. Schindler sets as his goal "the history of a myth, a folk legend, not less than the history of a man" (p. 10). He has attempted to judge the accuracy of the sources; but the reader is left at the end without knowing where O. P. Rockwell, the man, ends and "Old Port," the folk legend, begins. It is clear that Schindler does not believe some of the extreme accounts such as those of Fitz Hugh Ludlow; but he presents, on the unsubstantiated word of Achilles and others, accounts of Rockwell's alleged complicity in murders including those of an old lady and a Negro.

On the other hand, Schindler's evidence that Rockwell may have been responsible for the murders for which he stood indicted at the time of his death (pp. 273-79) appears fairly reliable. Even here, however, some questions are raised in the reviewer's mind. What was Rockwell's motive for the acts? The author suggests the theft of the money being carried by the men (pp. 271 and 273), but Rockwell's whole pattern of life as Schindler has painted it would contradict the assumption that such a motive would appeal to Rockwell. The murders took place during the Utah War, but Schindler presents little to suggest that the war itself or even the reformation which was going on at the time might have played a significant part in the murders.

Schindler is convinced that Rockwell was probably guilty of the attempted assassination of Lilburn W. Boggs. Here, the principal evidence is Rockwell's presence near Independence at the time and a report by Wilhelm W. Wymetal that Patrick E. Connor said that Rockwell told him he had shot Boggs. Schindler says that Rockwell "did not lie" (pp. 79-80). If, as Schindler says, Rockwell did not lie, how does one explain Rockwell's assertion that he was seven miles north of Independence on the night of the crime (pp. 84-85)? There are a number of other problems with Schindler's evidence. It is difficult to determine how Rockwell could have escaped indict-
ment for the crime had there been a shred of evidence against him. The argument that Rockwell might have been trying to fulfill prophecy (p. 72) is specious. Rockwell should have been aware, according to Joseph Smith's own statement, that everything which the Prophet said was not to be taken as the word of God.

Schindler has covered the available primary evidence quite thoroughly, and it is not from his lack of research that lacunae remain in Rockwell's career. The account of his activities in Missouri is sketchy, and were it not embellished by description of the general situation, there would be little to say of Rockwell except that he lived there with his family and operated a ferry. In spite of his thorough research in contemporary records, Schindler has left out of consideration some more recent accounts which might have helped supply a general picture of many problems. Norman Furniss' account of The Mormon Conflict is not cited. Dallin Oakes' article in the Utah Law Review on the Nauvoo Expositor case might have thrown more light on the state's case against Joseph Smith. Gustive O. Larson's article in the Utah Historical Quarterly on the reformation of the late 1850's might have helped in interpreting that period. Also, in the opinion of this reviewer, Schindler's discrimination in the use of anti-Mormon sources is often questionable. Nevertheless, because of the depth of primary research, and in spite of its shortcomings, this account will undoubtedly stand for some time as the standard volume on the subject.

Thomas G. Alexander
Brigham Young University

Toward the end of his life Brigham Henry Roberts expressed the thought that what he had said and done was not important enough to warrant the publication of a biography. However, Roberts partially justified dictating his memoirs by saying that he wanted to prevent someone from just half doing the story of his life. The experiences Elder Roberts had are more thrilling and important than he believed. He was a man who loved, hated, sorrowed, rejoiced, and passionately lived; a man with few close friends who spent much of his time by himself. Alone he walked the streets of English villages at the age of five, virtually alone he crossed the plains at ten, alone he served many missions, and almost alone he fought against prohibition when a large number of his colleagues favored curtailing the sale of liquor. His only really intimate associate was a man who was nearly his opposite, J. Golden Kimball.

B. H. Roberts fought a valiant though vain fight to have the Church represented at the World’s Parliament of Religions held in Chicago in 1893. When this parliament denied his request, he went to the public press in an effort to win support for the cause of the Church. He verbally fought in the halls of Congress for the right to take his seat as the representative from Utah, and his speeches on that occasion are filled with feeling and emotion, revealing the certainty he had that his religious beliefs were the major cause for this rejection. He campaigned for many years on behalf of Democratic candidates running for territorial, state, and national offices; and one can feel the strong-willed passion of a man who believed in his political party.

On his many missions he preached, wrote, and energetically proclaimed the convictions of his heart—that Joseph Smith had seen God and that the gospel had, in fact, been restored. His early life of hunger, poverty, and longing for love and acceptability; the fact that he believed himself deformed; and his almost overwhelming compulsion to learn to read—all graphically portray the reality of the man. His often tender, yet sometimes almost tragic, journey across the plains with a teen-age sister arouses compassion in the souls of those who can identify with him. His learning to read and write, the fact
that he published over twenty books before his death, and his rise from meager beginnings to the leading councils of his Church—all make a thrilling success story that has few if any equals in American lore.

Malan’s book began as a master’s thesis in history at Utah State University. It is unfortunate that the author did not have access to the three-volume memoirs of Roberts, dictated just before his death, which are as yet unpublished.1 These volumes cast a bright light on Roberts’ feelings, thoughts, and personality. In the preface Malan states, “Roberts was a soldier, statesman, striking individual personality, whose iron will enabled him to advance and succeed.” Largely because of Malan’s deficiencies in style and scholarship, that kind of Roberts fails to appear. The author has attempted too much and devoted too few pages to what needed to be written. It is almost impossible to record the life of as colorful a man and as prolific an author as B. H. Roberts in just a few more than one hundred and twenty pages.

Malan’s treatment of plural marriage reveals little depth of scholarship. He mentions several of Roberts’ public discourses and published writings but frequently spends too little time with their content. The reader often wonders what Roberts really said or wrote. It is also unfortunate that Roberts’ stands on prohibition, women suffrage, Mormon theology, and the authority of the Seventies were not discussed in greater detail. Other facets of Roberts’ life such as his family problems, his ability and reliability as a historian, and his political difficulties could have been probed in greater depth. If more attention had been given to developing the historical situation in which Roberts lived, the book would have been much better.

Perhaps the greatest redeeming quality of this work is the fact that no other biography of Roberts has appeared. It does fill a need, and one can glean much valuable material from this short volume. In all fairness to the author it should be said that the master’s thesis from which it is adapted is far superior to the published biography.

There still needs to be a major study made of Brigham Henry Roberts, a work that will somehow make him a living,

1Dr. Truman Madsen, professor of philosophy at Brigham Young University, is in the process of writing a complete biography of Roberts based on these memoirs.
vibrant being; one that will portray his good qualities and his
bad, his victories and his defeats, his loves and his hates. Such a
biography must relate his life to Mormon history and the
world in which it took place, for this is one of the most fas-
cinating stories of any age or people. Perhaps Roberts has not
been dead long enough for the task to be done; yet it seems
sad that so great a man, who lived such a life of struggle,
cannot be captured on the printed page so that all Latter-day
Saints can thrill, cry, laugh, and love with him—not a perfect
man by any means—but a great man just the same. Malan
fails, and the need remains.

Kenneth W. Godfrey
Institute of Religion
Stanford University

From studies of economic pioneering on the Mormon frontier to a history of the sugar beet industry, mostly in the twentieth century, is not so large a leap as might at first appear. Professor Arrington, who established a considerable reputation in the first area before moving to studies of more recent economic developments in the Rocky Mountain West, shows the LDS Church to have been a moving force in the sugar beet industry from the establishment of the first successful intermountain processing plant at Lehi, Utah, in 1891.

Beet Sugar in the West is more than a company history, and less. On balance, this appears a gain. One interested in a detailed review of the Utah-Idaho Sugar Company in terms of administrative organization, personnel, and procedures will not find it in this book, though many key people are mentioned, methods and problems of capital acquisition are reviewed, and aspects of sugar technology, company relations with beet growers, agricultural and mechanical research affecting the industry, and the vicissitudes of the sugar market are explored. If "West" in the title be defined as the area between the Rockies and the Sierras, then the book's title is a better indication of its scope than the subtitle: a broad and useful survey of the beet sugar story, from seed production and nematode fighting to tariffs and government policies is arranged around U and I as the institutional center.

Although the book is short (only 173 pages of text, plus appendices), Arrington brings in enlivening details, like the five Satakes, Japanese internees at Delta, Utah, who thinned 131 acres of beets in the spring of 1942, a statistic to produce groans of admiration from any with childhood memories of endless hours in the fields. The drama in the fight against "blight" and in the company's fight against bankruptcy in the post-World War I price collapse (from 23.57 cents in 1920 to 1.81 cents in 1921) is suggested. In connection with the latter crisis, the energetic courtship of War Finance Corporation loans by Senator Reed Smoot and LDS President Heber J. Grant illustrates that, historically, the Mormon attitude toward governmental aid programs has been ambivalent.
The book is well illustrated with photographs and maps, and the extensive appendices include the officers and directors of the Utah-Idaho Sugar Company and its predecessors, brief histories of all the factories owned and operated by the company and its predecessors, and tables of U and I price and production data. Balance sheets, stock and bond quotations, profit and loss statements, and a historical record of earnings are not provided.

*Beet Sugar in the West* is a well-written and informative treatment of its theme, useful for reference as well as for its contribution to regional, economic, and business history.

Richard D. Poll
Brigham Young University

Ever since I began reading Clinton F. Larson's poems I have expected much of him each time new products of his pen appeared. When I heard that he was writing verse plays and having them staged here and abroad, I admired him also for his courage. To write poetry drama in an unpoetic age is hazardous. To write religious plays is even more venturesome. Many persons in a young, zealous Church might be expected to view with uneasiness the efforts of an imaginative writer dealing with the most cherished and awe-inspiring events in scripture or Church history. The essence of creativity being freedom to create, the creative writer must be granted a generous latitude. This freedom presents both poet and critic with problems. For the poet the question is: How valid is my intuition? The critic similarly should question any criteria that offer themselves. As Karl Jaspers suggested, an innovation can scarcely be judged adequately, for it is part of the future that is coming into being. We need time to determine which creative works are to be discarded and which, woven into our traditions. Is the creative artist to be rated on rigorous fidelity to sacred writing and authoritative history, or on his creativeness? Can the Word—which is often beyond words—be voiced in individual ways that depart from customary expression?

So much for difficulties which Dr. Larson faced as he wrote *The Mantle of the Prophet* and the other dramas in the volume. In one sense, however, his problem was eased by the fact that we cannot compare these plays with Broadway or Hollywood drama but must see them in a class by themselves. They do not belong in the category of secular verse drama of the Elizabethan period or our own. Rather, we must examine them as potential religious experiences. Dr. Larson wished to use the vivid devices of the theatre to lift significant moments out of the matrix of print and give them compelling life on the stage, but these moments are those of spiritual crisis, and we cannot lose sight of that fact.

Because the playwright has chosen to work within the scope of relatively few words and because his audiences will for the most part know a good deal about his subjects, he can employ
a highly concentrated or elliptical treatment. Since many of his characters already possess substance and color in the viewers' memories, he can venture to recall traits or suggest salient features with a few evocative strokes. He accomplishes motivation in the same rapid manner.

How do the plays rate as potential religious experiences? They are, I imagine, highly effective. Nonmembers of the Church would probably need a bit of preparation (except for Mary of Nazareth) which could be done through an introductory talk or an explanatory preface in the program. Otherwise a play such as The Brother of Jared might seem overcryptic and unfocused until the rays begin to concentrate on the climax. But for persons with some degree of preparation, most of the plays, particularly The Mantle of the Prophet, should afford spiritual experiences of a high order. Moreover, they would gain by repeated viewing. The best poetic passages will have, I predict, a perennial freshness. As Marden J. Clark warns in an admirable foreword, many of the passages are not transparently simple. Their contributions to worship resemble those to be found in harmonies of rich music which do not become trite but continue to unfold. There are, of course, many lines which are limpid and clear but worth cherishing in memory, as when in "Third Nephi" Lachus, mourning the death of Rachel, declares

Death is as smooth as the sea,
Soft but unyielding and dark,
And I can never speak to her again!

Only a little later, however, Nephi describes the coming of the Savior thus:

He came like the steel of our conscience of truth
Quietly, His voice the urgency of life.

And a few lines farther on, speaking of loved ones believed dead in the disaster to the city, he says:

They are as the stalks of wheat
That dry golden in the fields. Though they die
Unto God, they do not die in Him, for the germ
Remains, the spirit that is eternal.
The overtones in this are above the simple renewal of life in the spring, or resurrection as we customarily visualize it.

It is in such ways, besides the effects of stage spectacle, that Dr. Larson lifts the climaxes of the plays to religious experience superior to that obtainable from a quotation or ritualized expression repeated so often that it may become only a dying echo of its original significance. The poet's courage is not only in his willingness to write poetry drama in an un-poetic age but in his ability to startle the imagination awake with freshness of images and phrases. Many of these yield up their better values only after we have time to ponder them. Thus readers of these plays, although they will miss much that the stage spectacles can give them, will have their own special opportunities for enjoyment and inspiration.

Carlton Culmsee
Utah State University
Since the policy under which *BYU Studies* is published may not be widely known, the following statement may be of interest to our readers.

**EDITORIAL POLICY:**

**BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY STUDIES**

As heretofore, *Brigham Young University Studies* is to be a voice for the community of Latter-day Saint scholars. Contributions dealing with Latter-day Saint thought, history, theology, and related subjects will receive first priority. Contributors are invited to examine any issues about the "Mormon" world.

But remembering the early commitment of the Church to study all things, to learn about all things, to find the truth in all things, *BYU Studies* will welcome articles in any field of general interest that are written for the informed nonspecialist. Contributions already prepared for the specialized reader in the technical language of the field should be rewritten for the intelligent lay-reader. Creative contributions are also welcome: poetry, short fiction, and drama.

Except for unusual cases, **contributions should not exceed 4,000 words** (approximately 15 double-spaced, typewritten pages). Manuscripts should conform to the MLA Style Sheet, and footnotes should be placed on a separate page at the end of the article.

Each author will receive 20 off-prints and three copies of the number in which his contribution appears.

Subscriptions cost $5.00 for four issues. Single copies are $2.00. Send subscriptions to Publication Sales Department, 132 HRCB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah 84601.

Send manuscripts to Dr. Charles D. Tate, Jr., Editor, *Brigham Young University Studies*, A-283 JKB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah 84601.

**PLANNED FOR WINTER 1968**

Can God Be Pictured? by Truman G. Madsen

Authority Conflicts in the Mormon Battalion, by Eugene E. Campbell

French Reaction to Shakespeare, by John A. Green

The Road to Carthage Led West, by Kenneth W. Godfrey

Before the Sepulchre, by Clinton F. Larson (A drama)

Lessons From the Past or How to Succeed in the University World Without Really Trying, by George M. Addy