Brigham Young University Studies

A Voice for the Community of LDS Scholars

Volume 21  Spring 1981  Number 2

CONTENTS

Joseph Smith's Boyhood Operation: An 1813 Surgical Success
LE ROY S. WIRTHLIN 131

Lula Greene Richards: Utah's First Woman Editor
SHERILYN COX BENNION 155

Joseph Smith the Man: Some Reflections on a Subject of Controversy
MARVIN S. HILL 175

Openings, A Poem
ORSON SCOTT CARD 187

A Prayer for Faith, A Poem
KAREN MIKKESEN 188

A New Direction in Language Testing: Concern for the One
HAROLD S. MADSEN 189

Historians Corner
JAMES B. ALLEN, EDITOR 205

The Canes of the Martyrdom
STEVEN G. BARNETT 205

A Little Leavening
FLORIAN H. THAYN 211
Mormon Bibliography 1979–1980
SCOTT H. DUVALL and SCOTT C. DUNN 225

Book Reviews

DAVID J. WHITTAKER

Carol Cornwall Madsen and Susan Staker Oman, 
Sisters and Little Saints: 
One Hundred Years of Primary 
IDA SMITH and LYNNE SMITH PARTRIDGE 245

Truman G. Madsen, Defender of the Faith: 
The B. H. Roberts Story 
THOMAS G. ALEXANDER 248

Robert S. Ellwood, Jr., Alternative Altars: 
Unconventional and Eastern 
Spirituality in America 
SPENCER J. PALMER 250

The opinions and statements expressed by contributors to Brigham Young University Studies are their own and do not necessarily reflect the views of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Brigham Young University, the editor, or editorial board.

Published Quarterly by 
Brigham Young University Press 
Provo, Utah 84602

ISSN 0007-0106

1981 Brigham Young University Press. All rights reserved. 
Printed in the United States of America.

6-81-53580-6M

SUBSCRIBER NOTICE

Subscription is $8.00 for four numbers, $14.00 for eight numbers, and $19.00 for twelve numbers. Single numbers are $3.00. The rate to bona fide students and missionaries is $6.40 for four numbers. All subscriptions begin with the current issue unless subscriber requests otherwise. Send subscriptions to Brigham Young University Press Business Office, 203 UPB, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah 84602.

If you're moving, PLEASE let us know four weeks before changing your address. A Change-of Address Postcard, available at all Post Offices, sent in advance, will aid us in getting your journal to you promptly. Your courteous compliance with this request will help us to solve a serious and costly problem.
Joseph Smith’s Boyhood Operation: An 1813 Surgical Success

LeRoy S. Wirthlin

In 1813, in America, surgery was not a medical specialty. There were no surgeons as we know them today. Physicians operated out of necessity, but none claimed surgery as a specialty. Moreover, only a few who practiced medicine had ever attended medical school.

These were primitive days. Before the horse-and-buggy days of medicine, physicians rode horseback over the rough country roads. There was considerable riding as there was not a single institution in New England in 1813 that might be called a hospital.

These were also the pre-Listerian days of surgery before appreciation of bacterial infection, before antiseptic dressings, before the surgical rituals of gown, mask, gloves, and sterile instruments.¹ Infection of the surgical wound accompanied most operations; and, therefore, the scope of surgery was very limited. There was no surgery in any body cavity; operations were performed to drain infection, occasionally to repair hernias, to set fractures, and to amputate limbs.

In addition to the problems of infection, the absence of anesthetics limited the number of operations. Before anesthesia was

---

¹Surgery in the rural areas had not improved even by 1870. Surgical practice in the rural midwest was remembered as follows:

Operations in rural districts even for the simplest of lesions were practically unknown. In those days all wounds suppurred. . . . In the first operation 1 witnessed, the surgeon threaded the needles with silk and then stuck them in his lapel of his coat so as to have them readily accessible when needed. He held the knife in his teeth when not in actual use. . . . It is therefore easy to understand why all wounds suppurred. Injuries which today seem comparatively trivial were treated by amputation. . . . The reason for such radical measures was that because of suppuration the surgeon, usually called from a distance, found amputation the most practical measure. (Arthur E. Hernelet, The Horse and Buggy Doctor [Garden City, N. Y.: Blue Ribbon Books, 1938], pp. 6-7.)
demonstrated in 1846, \(^2\) surgery was an ordeal for the patient and surgeon as well. Later with the construction of hospitals in America and with the use of anesthesia, the scope of surgery expanded so that medical centers emerged where surgeons demonstrated their skills in large operating amphitheaters. \(^3\)

In 1813, surgery was carried out under the most humble circumstances, whether in Boston or in a rural area. Yet at that time there were two physicians in New England whose surgical abilities were remembered; one was John Warren of Harvard Medical School, and the other was Nathan Smith of Dartmouth Medical School in New Hampshire. \(^4\)

With the identification of Nathan Smith as one of the principals in Joseph Smith’s boyhood surgery, \(^5\) we have an opportunity to examine a surgical success of an unusual operation. In this case we have documentation from the patient\(^6\) as well as the independent report by the mother, Lucy Mack Smith. \(^7\) We also have interesting surgical documentation. Even though there were no individual patient records in those days, we have medical students’ letters, their lecture notes, and we have the published work of Nathan Smith on his development of the surgical techniques that were to be applied in Joseph Smith’s operation. \(^8\)

Joseph’s surgery has been described as “brutal” and “gruesome,” but when seen through the eyes of the surgeon, there was a great sophistication in the operation performed. The purpose of this report is to examine Joseph Smith’s illness and operation in its historical setting and to examine the surgical contributions of Nathan Smith as they relate to this episode.

\(^2\)The general anesthetic effects of ether during surgery were demonstrated at the Massachusetts General Hospital in Boston, October 1846.


\(^6\)Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, Book A–1, note C, p. 131, Church Archives.

\(^7\)Lucy Mack Smith, History of Joseph Smith (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1938), pp. 51–58. A preliminary manuscript of the first draft of this biography is located in the Library–Archives, Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah (hereafter referred to as Church Archives). This first draft was dictated by Lucy Mack Smith to her secretary, Martha Jane Knowlton Coray. Since the preliminary manuscript adds details omitted in later publications, the original draft will be quoted. A copy of the original draft was kindly supplied by Richard L. Anderson, professor of history and religion, Brigham Young University.

SURGICAL HISTORY

Nathan Smith had gained a wide reputation in New England as a successful surgeon based on his achieving good results under difficult, almost hopeless, conditions. Also, he carried out operations that few in his day dared, and he was successful with these unusual procedures. He was the second American surgeon to enter the abdominal cavity to remove a tumor of the ovary. He also carried out "couching," an ancient procedure for cataracts. Nathan Smith as the sole professor at Dartmouth Medical School (which he founded) became the court of last resort in northern New England, rendering final opinion and definitive surgery for the most difficult problems. His daybooks and Dartmouth students' letters attest that, in doing so, he traveled widely throughout northern New England. One of his students wrote:

I have been a journey of 95 miles up Connecticut River in which I saw four operations successfully employed, three of them were the removing a portion of the bones which perished in the limb, the other which was the most difficult one that I ever saw, was what I mentioned in my letter home. It took Doctor Smith above an hour to perform it. . . . I have been this moment ordered to Vershire, 8 miles in the rain.

Another student wrote:

I went to Concord with Doct Smith and upward of twenty of his students to see a limb taken off but when he got there he concluded that he could cure it without taking off the limb.

These letters document the expanse of Nathan Smith's practice and also refer to an unusual surgical procedure. The operative removal of bone from a limb was not ordinary practice during that period. Nathan Smith had gained experience treating what was colloquially called "fever sore," or what we recognize now as osteomyelitis, the bacterial infection of bone. It was with the development of surgical techniques for this disease that he was to play a decisive role in Joseph Smith's boyhood illness.

---

10Couching was an old procedure for the treatment of cataracts. One placed a needle through the side of the eye into the opacified lens and pushed it down out of the line of sight. Corrective glasses were fitted and sight was restored. There appeared to be little infection in Nathan Smith's hands. A student wrote: "Doct Smith has performed the operation of couching five times within these six weeks. They report to him from all parts of the country, one person from the vicinity of Boston came here completely blind and had both eyes operated upon three weeks since. She can now read tolerably well by the assistance of glasses. The more I become acquainted with Doct Smith the more I have reason to esteem him." (Alexander Boyd to William Boyd, Jr., 26 November 1810, Dartmouth College Library, Hanover, New Hampshire.)
11Ezekiel Dodge Cushing to Mehetibal Cushing, undated, Oughterson Collection, Yale Medical Library, New Haven, Connecticut.
12Alexander Boyd to William Boyd, Jr., 26 November 1810.
Figure 1. The end stage of osteomyelitis was well known. Shown is a pathological specimen of chronic osteomyelitis of the femur. The sequestrum (center) has been removed.

(Table 1, J. P. Weidman, *De Necrost Ossium* [Frankfurt am Main, 1793]. National Library of Medicine, Bethesda, Md.)
Surgical cures for osteomyelitis were unheard of at that time. With an absence of specific treatment and before antibiotics, this illness took great toll of many youth in both morbidity and mortality. If those affected survived the acute phase, they were left with ulcers and chronic purulent drainage.

Even in this century in the immediate pre-antibiotic era, surgical cures were difficult to come by. The overall mortality was still high and varied from 1.5 to 26 percent, with an average of 12 percent.\(^{13}\) Of the survivors, only 50 percent were cured by surgery.\(^ {14}\) The experience to 1937 was summed up by one reviewer: “The survey of the literature on acute hematogenous osteomyelitis from January, 1932, to June, 1937, establishes clearly one fact, and it is the only fact established clearly, namely the disease has a poor prognosis.”\(^ {15}\)

If the disease had a poor prognosis in 1937, prognosis was almost hopeless for centuries before. Although the late pathology of the condition was known (see Figure 1), nothing was done. It had long been recognized that in the more chronic stages, pieces of bone might work to the surface and protrude through the skin (see Figure 2). These pieces were simply plucked away, but this was not surgery. If there were fever and sickness with the chronic stage, the limb was amputated. Amputation continued to be the treatment during the Civil War, the Crimean War, and even into the First World War.

Following the First World War, more conservative methods were employed.\(^ {16}\) Although useful in treating osteomyelitis associated with gunshot wounds and compound fractures, the conservative means were not successful in treating acute hematogenous osteomyelitis. Only after direct surgery on the diseased bones could one begin to speak of cures. Successful management was accomplished by the early drainage of bony abscesses and by aggressive removal of dead fragments. Starr, Lexer, and Wilensky are usually given credit by modern writers for these contributions;\(^ {17}\) these men carried out their work in the early twentieth century.

---


\(^{14}\) Ibid., p. 245.


\(^{16}\) William Orr, following his experience in the First World War, decided that much of the persistent infection in cases of osteomyelitis was due to the repeated redressing of wounds with exposed bone. His treatment which was popular for years consisted of debridement of the wound, packing with vaseline gauze, and immobilizing the limb in a plaster of Paris cast. The gauze dressing and cast were changed only when the odor was severe or the drainage softened the cast. (William Orr, *Osteomyelitis and Compound Fractures and Other Infected Wounds* [Saint Louis: Mosby, 1929].)

Figure 2. A late state in which the sequestrum (almost the entire length of the previous shaft) worked through the surface. This was usually completely separated and could be plucked out, a practice dating to Hippocrates.

(Table IX, Weidman, *De Necrosi Ossium*.)
However, Nathan Smith, who published a classic work on surgery for osteomyelitis as early as 1827,\(^\text{18}\) predated these same contributions by about a hundred years. As his paper is the clearest and most comprehensive treatise to have appeared, it will be quoted so that we can see the disease through the eyes of this early nineteenth-century surgeon. Nathan Smith correctly recognized the pathology of the disorder and the basic principle of care.

Necrosis [osteomyelitis] commences with an acute inflammation, either in the bone itself or its investing membrane, accompanied with an acute pain. . . .

Almost with the first commencement of the pain there occurs severe symptomatic fever of the inflammatory character. The local affection generally terminates in suppuration, frequently as soon as the fourth or fifth day. . . . The matter is at first deposited between the external periosteum and the bone. When the shafts of the long bones are the seats of the disease, about the same time that matter is deposited between the external periosteum, there is formed a corresponding collection between the internal surface of the bone and the membrane surrounding the medullary substance, so that there then exist two collections of matter bathing the opposite sides of the walls of the bone. This fact, which I deem of great importance, as being essential to the correct treatment of the disease . . . namely, the trepanning of the bone.\(^\text{19}\)

Who had the disease in the early 1800s?

Necrosis is almost exclusively confined to young subjects. I have very rarely seen it in persons under five, or over twenty-two.\(^\text{20}\)

Which bones were involved?

In regard to the locality of necrosis, although, perhaps, every portion of the bony fabric is liable to its attacks, yet it occurs in some bones much more frequent than in others. . . . My own experience would determine the tibia to be the most frequent seat of disease; next to this, the femur, and then the humerus.\(^\text{21}\)

\(^{18}\)Nathan Smith, "Necrosis," *Medical and Surgical Memoirs*, pp. 97–121. An early report on surgery for osteomyelitis appeared in the *New England Journal of Medicine* and related details of technique similar to those taught by Nathan Smith. Nathan Smith may have been scooped by a former student, John R. Martin (Dartmouth Medical School class 1810), who published on two successful cases of sequestrectomy in Bangor, Maine. (See John R. Martin, "Two Cases of Necrosis," *The New England Journal of Medicine and Surgery and the Collateral Branches of Science* 1 [1812]: 162–69.)


\(^{20}\)Ibid., p. 101.

\(^{21}\)Ibid., p. 102.
He comments as to the general outcome of the disease:

In regard to the general prognosis of the disease, I have observed that a very great majority of patients survive its attack, though often with long confinement, protracted suffering, and great emaciation. In a few cases, however, the disease proves fatal, and when it does so, it frequently happens at an early period of its progress.22

Nathan Smith began operating directly on osteomyelitis in 1798 when he realized that bony abscesses might be drained.23 With success on the first attempt, he began to operate more frequently. He came to recognize three stages of the disease, each with a different surgical approach.

If the surgeon has the good fortune to be called on the first attack of pain . . . as soon as the disease, by swelling and tenderness of the part, has sufficiently marked the seat of the inflammation, an incision should be made, in a longitudinal direction, through all the soft parts down to the bone, and through the periosteum. . . . I have not been fortunate enough to be called in till matter is formed, and therefore have not had it in my power to test this mode of treatment.24

This operation, for the first stage, was a simple incision through the inflamed tissues over infected bone without actual drainage of the bone. Although Nathan Smith thought this incision might work, he never had the opportunity to test it.

There was an intermediate stage that could be treated by the drilling of bone (see Figure 3). By astute observation alone, Nathan Smith was able to localize the abscess in the bone and drain it.

The second stage of this disease, when the matter has formed between the periosteum and the bone, still admits of a cure without any loss of bone. If, in this stage of the disease, an incision is made through the soft parts, and the periosteum be divided as far as it is separated from the bone, and a portion of the bone be cut out with a saw, or several perforations be made in the bone . . . down to the medullary substance, so as to allow the matter collected between that substance and the walls of the bone to escape, the necrosis or death of the bone will be prevented. . . . If this mode of treatment be put in practice early enough, and the perforations be made in the bone sufficient to afford a free exit to the matter, it will always succeed. The best instrument for perforating the bone is a small trephine that cuts out a piece about the size of a nine-penny-bit.25

21Ibid., pp. 103–104.
22Ibid., pp. 109–11.
23Ibid., pp. 111–12.
24Ibid., pp. 113–14.
In the chronic stage of the disease when death of the shaft of the bone occurs, necessary surgery became more radical (see figures 4 through 8 on pp. 140–42).

In the third stage of the disease, the matter has made its escape through the periosteum, and obtained a lodgement in the soft parts. . . . The treatment, in this stage, is precisely the same as in the second stage, but the favourable result is not so certain, as a portion of the bone may have been deprived of its circulation too long, or may be perfectly dead, and the separation between the living and dead bone may have commenced. In that case, the operation cannot save the bone entire; a portion must necessarily be cast off. . . . The bone should then be perforated and a portion sawed out, so as to give free vent to the matter contained within it. . . . If a portion of bone should be cast off, the perforation will enable the operator . . . to break it the more easily, which is often a necessary part of the operation in removing large sequestra.26

This operation became known as sequestrectomy. It was heroic surgery for the early 1800s.

Figure 4. Nathan Smith's third stage of the disease. In (a), the dead bone (large arrow) is encased in a cylinder of new bone (small arrow). In (b), a cross section of the bone shows the dead portion (large arrow) within the outer casing of new bone (small arrow) and surrounded by purulent material. If a window were created in the new bone (involucrum), the sequestrum could be removed. This was done by making several small perforations with a trephine (c) and connecting these holes by cuts made with a small Heys saw.

Figure 5. With the window of the outer bone removed (a), the surgeon had access to the sequestrum (arrow), which could be broken up and removed (b). The resultant wound consisted of an incision with windowed bone at the base, allowing further egress of infection or small boney spicules.
Figure 6. A 1938 x-ray of a long bone with chronic osteomyelitis showing the sequestrum within the involucrum. With the introduction of the x-ray tube at the turn of the century, localization of diseased bone became easier, and greater enthusiasm for surgical drainage resulted.

Figure 7. An x-ray of a healed femur in which a window had been removed for drainage.
Figure 8. Eighteenth-century surgical instruments. On the left is an amputation saw and a scalpel. The third and fourth instruments are trephines, used to remove a disc of bone. The trephines that Nathan Smith used were of smaller diameter. The sixth instrument is a bone-grasping forcep.

(Benjamin Bell, *A General System of Surgery* (1718), National Library of Medicine, Bethesda, Md.)
But doing the operation is only half the battle; the wound must heal cleanly thereafter. The wound left by such an operation would be considered complex even today. There was an open incision with exposed bone through which there was a window to its central cavity. The medical literature on caring for such wounds is vast. After the First World War, extremities with exposed bone were placed in plaster casts which were changed only when the stench or soilage became unbearable. Wounds were irrigated several times a day with strong chemical disinfectants; some wounds were scraped. Finally, there was a period between 1920 and 1930 when maggots were placed into the wounds to help with the debridement of dead and purulent material. It was not until after the Second World War that the care of a wound with exposed bone became standardized as we know it today.

Nathan Smith wrote little about the care of wounds when bone was exposed. It was perhaps so simple and ordinary that little comment was found necessary.

After the incision, the treatment, both general and topical, should be such as we recommend in cases of simple incised wounds . . . excepting that we should not try to approximate the edges of the incision by adhesive plasters, but dress them with simple applications, such as lint.

After the operation has been performed, in either stage of the disease, nothing more need be attempted, and no instrument, not even a probe, should be thrust into the wound.

In some cases, in which the discharge has been very copious, I have checked it by throwing in a solution of corrosive sublimate, of the strength of 10 grains to a pint of water, to be repeated once in four or five days.

It was remarkable that the wounds did not become secondarily contaminated and require amputation for control of infection. Several factors may have contributed to this success. Patients were cared for in their homes which may have been cleaner than later hospitals. Hospitals tended to concentrate infection, and before antisepic treatment was accepted, there was a significant mortality from

---

29Nathan Smith, "Necrosis," *Medical and Surgical Memoirs*, p. 112. A medical student recorded further detail: "Treat it as in other respects as you would any common wound only that you do not attempt to unite it by first intention, as it will continue to discharge matter for some time" (James S. Goodwin, "Extracts from Lectures Delivered at Dartmouth Medical Theatre by Nathan Smith, M.D.C.S.M.S. Lond," 1812–1813, p. 90, Dartmouth College Library).
31Ibid. Corrosive sublimate was mercury bichloride, a powerful and sometimes toxic disinfectant.
simply going to the hospital. In the late 1800s, the mortality associated with amputations in hospitals was four times as great as those performed in homes. In a home, fewer persons handled the wound and there was no cross contamination from wounds of other patients. Also Nathan Smith warned against subsequent probing or manipulation of the bone, thus reducing the chance of secondary infection. He controlled purulent discharge with a periodic irrigation of a strong disinfectant. In addition, and perhaps most important, there was no great hurry to have the wound close. Nathan Smith seemed to have an unusual appreciation for the natural reparative process. If drained and treated simply, the wound would heal and multiple reoperations, characteristic of the twentieth century, were unnecessary. Nathan Smith comments on his success:

When I first began to perform operations of this kind, I was under the apprehension lest so much bruising and handling of the soft parts, as is sometimes necessary, to dislodge a large sequestra unfavorably situated, might be followed with bad consequences, and some of these operations have been most laborious and tedious, both to myself and the patient, which I have ever performed, yet I have never known any untoward circumstances to follow such operations, of which I have performed a great many.

Nathan Smith apparently enjoyed success with this approach as subsequent amputation is not mentioned. He learned that if the joint was involved the leg was lost. But neither in student notes nor in his paper does he discuss amputation following sequestrectomy.

Even though Nathan Smith himself was successful, his ideas did not become popular. There may have been few brave enough to attempt such radical surgery. There was also minimal opportunity to promulgate a new treatment outside of his classrooms. His work was published twice but seemed to attract little attention. T. Morven Smith, one of Nathan's four physician sons, published a paper in 1838 on his experience with four cases of osteomyelitis. His work followed the teaching of his father:

The following cases are designed to illustrate and justify pathological views, and mode of treatment suggested some years since by my father, the late Professor N. Smith of Yale college, in his surgical memoirs. . . Case I. . . July 27th, early in the morning I visited again my patient, found he passed a bad night. . . . I now concluded to

---

32 Nathan Smith, "Necrosis," Medical and Surgical Memoirs, pp. 120–21.
operate according to the plan of my father . . . to cut down upon the bone, and if I found matter under the periosteum, also to perforate the bone.\textsuperscript{33}

His report described his results with four patients and did not go unnoticed. The report was cited in a French medical publication with the following comment:

The heroic measure proposed by the American surgeon consists in trephining the bone. He states that he had witnessed the success of this in the hands of his father, and that he resorted to it in four cases with success. . . . Notwithstanding the facts detailed in the above paper, many surgeons will hesitate before they trephine a bone . . . fearing that they might not find an abcess within, or that they might give rise to the very condition which they propose to remove. We must leave this question, therefore, undecided, and wait until time and further observations shall aid in its solution.\textsuperscript{34}

The fears of carrying out radical bone debridement and drilling were well expressed in the French citation: an inability to localize the abcess and fear of causing more harm. The technique did not become popular.\textsuperscript{35} Professor Samuel Gross of Philadelphia, in his 1876 summary of the first century of American surgery, mentioned Nathan Smith's work and the report by his son, T. Morven Smith. Professor Gross thought the work sound but added:

Of the nature of this mode of treatment in this class of affectations it is impossible to form too high an estimate. Unfortunately it is seldom resorted to; or, if employed, the operation is performed too late to be productive of much benefit.\textsuperscript{36}

\textsuperscript{33}T. Morven Smith, "Cases of Necrosis Illustrating the Practice of Exposing and Perforating the Diseased Bone at an Early Period in the Progress of the Malady," \textit{American Journal of the Medical Sciences} 40 (November 1838): 93–96.

\textsuperscript{34}Cited and translated in George C. Blackman, "On Certain Points Connected with the Pathology and Treatment of Abcess in Bone," \textit{American Journal of the Medical Sciences} 57 (October 1869): 378–91.

\textsuperscript{35}There was another early report, published in 1828, one year after Nathan Smith's paper, on experience with surgery of osteomyelitis on eight cases. This was reported by a Dr. Benjamin Simon of South Carolina who trephined bone for the drainage of abcess. Six of the reports concerned work on slaves:

Joe, the property of Dr. Richardson, had an ulcer on the tibia. . . . An operation was determined on. An incision was made along the tibia on its anterior portion. The integuments were dissected back, and three circles (of bone) removed with the trephine. The intervening space of the circles, and the diseased portions of the cancellated structure were likewise removed with a chisel. . . . His wound was dressed with dry lint, exfoliations took place, healthy granulations ensued, . . . in a few months he recovered. (See Blackman, "On Certain Points Connected with the Pathology and Treatment of Abcess in Bone," pp. 378–91.)

Nathan Smith began his work earlier and had greater experience. In the two student letters cited in the present report we find evidence of four cases alone and his paper spanned a twenty-nine year experience with the disease.

In summary, Nathan Smith preceded modern workers in his understanding and treatment of osteomyelitis by one hundred years. Early drainage of infection, complete removal of sequestra, and the simple, patient treatment of a complex wound were the ingredients of his success.

JOSEPH SMITH’S ILLNESS

With an appreciation for the surgical details, we can examine more closely the accounts of Joseph Smith's illness and surgery. The Smith family moved to Lebanon, New Hampshire, in 1811 and had lived there two years when an epidemic of typhoid fever struck.

In 1813 the typhus fever came into Lebanon and raged there horribly among the rest who were seized with this complaint were my oldest daughter Sophronia, who was sick 4 weeks next Hyrum came from Hanover sick with the same disease then Alvin my oldest and so till there was not one of my family left well save Mr Smith and myself.37

Although the 1813 date was not mentioned in later accounts, it is probably accurate. Joseph Smith remembered his age as about "5 years old or thereabouts," which would not have placed the family in Lebanon.38 We know there was a smaller epidemic in Hanover, New Hampshire, in the fall of 1812. Nathan Smith and his partner, Cyrus Perkins, treated over fifty patients in the vicinity of Hanover, many of whom were Dartmouth students.39 A medical student wrote a report concerning the 1812 typhoid fever epidemic, detailing the symptoms and treatment. He observed:

Nothing remarkable took place until the month of July when (Hanover) was seized with the Typhus Fever. . . . It was observable that it first appeared among the students of College and more particularly among those of the Freshman Class. For several weeks it was confined to young Gentlemen: it then became less common with them and appeared among Young Ladies. It was likewise observable that it appeared principally among those who resided but a short time.40

In the spring of 1813, a highly fatal respiratory disease was rampant in New England and touched Nathan Smith’s family and further accounted for his remaining in Hanover until the fall of 1813.41

---

37Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, "History of Joseph Smith." In the original draft the sentence, "We had lived in this place for the space of two years . . ." was crossed out and replaced by the date 1813.
38Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, A-1, p. 131.
40Samuel Farnsworth, "Account of the Typhous Fever which prevailed in this place, beginning the first of the month [July 1812]." Dartmouth College Library.
Nathan Smith had planned to visit Yale College to organize his move to New Haven. He had been recruited to be their first professor of surgery and medicine in the newly founded medical school; however, the 1813 epidemic interfered with his leaving Hanover. In explaining his delay in meeting with the officers of Yale College, he wrote Professor Benjamin Silliman:

Dear Sir . . . According to my promise to Dr. Cogswell, I intended to have visited you at New Haven last January, but before I was ready to set off on my journey, we were visited by a very fatal epidemic and instances of sickness and mortality became so frequent . . . I believe this country has never before been visited by sickness which has carried off so great a number of adult persons in so short a time. In some towns of this vicinity which contain perhaps from 1000 to 1500 inhabitants they have buried over fifty persons since the first of last January. The disease has not yet much abated either in its violence or frequency of attack.42

As there were repeated episodes of typhoid fever in New England over the years, Nathan Smith developed expertise with treating this disease. His paper on the disease is considered a classic. He recognized that typhoid was contagious, that it would run its course, and that there was little one could do to alter the course or duration. He stressed that one should omit treatment that would make the patient worse. This was in contrast to the current practice in America, for in 1813 bleeding was a major treatment for most inflammatory conditions. Bleeding had been popularized and stressed by Benjamin Rush of Philadelphia. In the accounts we have of the Joseph Smith family encounter with typhoid fever, there was no mention of bleeding, reflecting the influence of Nathan Smith on local practice.

All the children in the Joseph Smith family contracted the disease; only the parents were spared. Joseph’s older sister, Sophronia, was severely affected but recovered. Joseph Smith, seven years old, was also sick and in addition suffered several later complications requiring four surgical procedures.

I was attacked with the Typhus Fever, and at one time, during my sickness, my father dispaired [sic] of my life. The doctors broke the fever, after which it settled under my shoulder, & . . . Dr. Parker caled [sic] it a sprained shoulder . . . when it proved to be a swelling under the arm which was opened, & discharged freely.43

---

42 Nathan Smith to Professor Benjamin Silliman, 31 March 1813, as cited in Emily A. Smith, The Life and Letters of Nathan Smith, M.R.M.D. (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1914), pp. 85–86.
43 Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, A–1, p. 131. The identity of Dr. Parker is unclear. There was a Dr. Parkhurst who practiced in Lebanon. His name appears in Nathan Smith’s daybook for making a house call together. "Oct 13, Elijah Gould (Lebanon) to visit with Dr. Parkhurst $2.00." I am not sure whether Parker was indeed Parkhurst.
The first complication was an abcess under the arm (axillary abcess) which was missed by Dr. Parker. When called to reevaluate the problem after two weeks, he made the proper diagnosis.

Sent immediately for the Doctor who said he was of the opinion it was a sprain. . . . The Physician insisted on the truth of his first opinion and anointed [the] shou[lder] with bone linament but the pain remained [sic] as severe as ever for 2 weeks when the Doctor made a close examination and found that a very large fever sore had gathered . . . which when it was lanced discharged a full quart of Matter.44

The stage was now set for the most serious complication. With Joseph debilitated by typhoid fever and suffering from an undrained abcess of considerable size, bacteria from the abcess spread by way of the bloodstream into the tibia of his left leg. The pain in the leg was acute, unrelenting and severe.

As soon as this sore had discharged itself the pain left it shooting like lightening as he said into the marrow of his leg on the same side. The boy was almost in total despair. Oh Father said he the pain is so severe how can I bear it. His leg began to swell and continued in the most excruciating pain for two weeks.45

When the pain and swelling continued for three weeks, a physician finally was called and young Joseph underwent the first of three operations on his leg.

At the end of 3 weeks he became so bad that we sent again for the surgeon who, when he came cut an incision of eight inches on the front side of the leg between the knee and the ankle [sic] . . . and by continual dressing his leg was somewhat relieved.46

This comment by Lucy Smith describing the length and position of the incision identifies the bone involved to be the tibia. The operation might seem peculiar if we were not familiar with Nathan Smith's surgical instruction. A simple incision to the bone was the procedure recommended for what he called the first stage of the disease. Nathan Smith's statement that he never actually tried this operation suggests that Joseph's first operation was performed by someone other than Nathan Smith, but perhaps by a physician acquainted with Professor Smith's techniques.

The first incision relieved the pain from swelling of the soft tissues but did little to drain or contain the infection in the bone. The

44Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, "History of Joseph Smith." A quart of pus would have been a huge abcess in a seven-year-old boy.
45Ibid.
46Ibid.
wound was dressed and allowed to heal. The healing of this first wound would have taken from two to three weeks, and with its healing, pain and swelling returned.

And by continual dressing his leg was somewhat received [sic] untill [sic] the wound commenced healing when the pain became as violent as ever the surgeon again renewed the wound by cutting to the bone the second time shortly it commenced healing the second time and as the healing progressed the swelling rose at last a councilll [sic] of surgeons was called it was decided that there was no remedy but amputation. 47

This operation was a repeat of the first without the drainage of bone suggesting again that Nathan Smith was not involved with the second procedure. The infection remained unchecked for at least two months. The surgeon who carried out the previous operations, discouraged with the progress of the disease, recommended amputation. A "council of surgeons" or a second opinion was sought. This came in the form of Nathan Smith, his partner Cyrus Perkins, and the usual entourage of medical students in addition to a Dr. Stone.

I endured the most acute suffering for a long time under the care of Drs Smith, Stone and Perkins of Hanover. At one time eleven Doctors came from the Dartmouth Medical College, at Hanover New Hampshire, for the purpose of amputation. 48

Lucy Smith also commented on the size of the group in her preliminary manuscript:

. . . when they rode up to the door & invited them into another room.
. . . Now I said gentlemen (for there were 7 of them) what can you do to save my boys leg They answered we can do nothing we have cut it open to the bone and find the bone so affected that it is incurable. 49

Why was amputation mentioned? We know that Nathan Smith taught amputation was unnecessary and had indeed taught that to

47 Ibid.
48 Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, A–I, p. 131. The identity of Dr. Stone is also a mystery. He was mentioned in both accounts, and in Joseph’s he was listed with those coming from Dartmouth Medical School. He was not on the faculty, as only Smith and Perkins represented the total medical school faculty in 1813. We do not have evidence that he was ever a student at Dartmouth. There are Stones mentioned in the 1940 General Catalog of Dartmouth College and in G. T. Chapman’s Sketches of the Dartmouth College (Cambridge: n.p., 1867), but these men were not physicians. There are no Stones in the records of other New England schools including Vermont Medical College at Woodstock; Castleton Medical College, Castleton, Vermont; University of Vermont Medical School; and the Medical School of Maine (personal communication, Kenneth C. Craner, archivist, Dartmouth College Library to LeRoy S. Wirthlin, 9 April 1980). The latter medical schools started after 1812, but in many cases, physicians would practice and then go to medical school. It is possible and likely that Dr. Stone had no medical school background but knew of Nathan Smith’s work.
49 Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, “History of Joseph Smith.”
the current Dartmouth Medical School class of 1812–1813.\textsuperscript{50} However, amputation was the procedure for treating this condition in America and England at the time, and any other operation would have been a departure from accepted practice. Moreover, medical litigation was not unknown in early America. Nathan Smith had appeared in malpractice trials in defense of other physicians and gave lectures in medical jurisprudence later at Yale.\textsuperscript{51} In this case, Nathan Smith recommended a surgical treatment for osteomyelitis that had no precedence in practice or the medical literature.\textsuperscript{52} Even though he had enjoyed good results, if there were to be problems with the surgery, there would be no medical defense as the operation was not thought worthwhile until after the turn of the century. Amputation would be the ultimate solution, but when faced with this, the response of a family is totally predictable, "Isn't there anything else that you can do?"

I appealed to the principle Surgeon present said I Doctor Stone can you not try once more cutting round the bone and taking out the affected part there may be a part of the bone that is sound which will heal over and thus you may save the leg.\textsuperscript{53}

The immediate reply is not remembered, but if practice were anything like it is today, the response on the part of the surgeon might have included, "Yes we have been doing that operation, but it is something we have been trying out in desperate cases. We cannot guarantee a favorable result. The operation is experimental, but it would be worth trying with your consent." Although this response is speculation, the same approach is used today when presenting a risky

\textsuperscript{50} "In the beginning, I mentioned Necrosis [osteomyelitis] as a disease which frequently was the cause of amputation; true it is a lamentable fact: this is the cause of many limbs being taken off. When in all these cases there is hardly need of a single operation of this kind. When the surgeon understands the use of medicine. When a piece of bone is dead or matter is within the bone I have described what is to be done in a previous lecture." (Goodwin, "Extracts from Lectures," p. 71.)

\textsuperscript{51} In a set of student notes taken at Yale Medical School in 1826, we find a lecture given by Nathan Smith on "Medical Jurisprudence." This remarkable instruction contains sage advice on the deportment and responsibility of physicians when called to testify in court on medical evidence. In a day when virtually nothing was written on the subject, Nathan Smith gave detailed instruction in cases of "Wounds and contusions, Malpractice, Broken bones, Infanticide, Pregnancy, Abortion or Concealed birth, Rape, Insanity, Divorce for want of Conjugal Connexion, and Poisoning." (Notes by Avery J. S[kilton], "Medical Jurisprudence" by Nathan Smith M.D.C.S.M.S. Lond, in Notes by Eli Ives, Yale Medical College, 1826, pp. 137–44. National Library of Medicine, Bethesda, Maryland. For a discussion of Nathan Smith's appearance in court, see Oliver S. Hayward, "A Search for the Real Nathan Smith," Journal of the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences 25 [July 1960]: 268–81.)

\textsuperscript{52} William Heys in England had recommended enlarging an established fistula to remove diseased bone which is not the same as the procedure described by Nathan Smith (William Heys, "Abscess in the Tibia with Caries," in Practical Observations in Surgery [Philadelphia: James Humphreys, 1805], pp. 22–25).

\textsuperscript{53} Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, "History of Joseph Smith."
procedure to a patient facing amputation for other causes. If understood in the context of obtaining informed consent to perform a more heroic operation, the comment of Joseph Smith becomes clear:

But, young as I was, I utterly refused to give my assent to the operation [amputation], but I consented to their Trying an experiment by removing a great large portion of the bone from my left leg, which they did.

Even years later, Joseph remembered this as experimental surgery. The procedure, however, was not unknown in the area around Hanover and Lebanon. Lucy Smith most likely would have been aware of other good results and therefore could suggest it.

They agreed to this after a short consultation; then went to the invalid:—the Doctor said, my poor boy, we have come again. "Yes," said Joseph, "I see you have; but you have not come to take off my leg, have you sir?" No, said the surgeon, "it is your Mothers request, that we should make one more effort; and that is what we have now come for."

Once consent was obtained, the scene changed and the surgeons prepared for the operation. "The surgeons immediately ordered cords to be brought, to bind him fast to the bedstead."

Nathan Smith wrote little about using anesthesia for his surgeries because there was none. He used opium preparations after surgery, but nothing other than alcohol was given prior to operating. There were no great preparations made save that of restraining the patient. Lucy Smith vividly describes the current surgical practice of that day:

When the doctor insisted that he must be confined he said decidedly: "No, Doctor, I will not be bound. I can bear the process better unconfined." . . . "will you drink some brandy." "No," said the child, "not one drop." Then said the Dr, "will you take some wine? You must take something, or you can never endure the severe operation to which you must be subjected." "No," answered the boy, "I will not touch one particle of liquor; neither will I be tied down: but I will tell you what I will do, I will have my Father sit on the bed close by me; and then I will do whatever is necessary to be done, in order to have the bone taken out. But Mother, I want you to leave the room."

---

14 This conversation is repeated in a generally similar way today. A patient comes into my office with gangrene of the toes, and after an examination, arterial occlusion is diagnosed. The patient is instructed that he has gangrene and an amputation may be in order. The response is the same: "Oh no! Can't you do something else?" "Well perhaps if we can restore circulation, the level of amputation can be lowered." In some instances, because of the unusual properties of the graft used in the arterial bypass, the procedure might be considered experimental.

15 Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, A-1, p. 131.

16 Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, "History of Joseph Smith." This consultation would have been short as it would have been Nathan Smith's intent to carry out the less radical but more heroic sequestrectomy operation.

17 Ibid.

18 Ibid.

151
Nathan Smith taught that there was little pain in handling the exposed bone and little discomfort in drilling the cortex. The pain came when the fragments of dead bone were broken up or removed. If separation of the dead bone from living tissue was incomplete, its dislodgement would produce a sharp sudden pain. Although Joseph was required to endure the pain of the operation, he was spared a primitively administered anesthetic characteristic of a later period.

The operation was underway. The mother was not allowed to watch, yet her recording of the procedure is highly accurate and parallels the description found in notes by Dartmouth medical students of the 1812–1813 class.61

So after bringing a number of folded sheets to lay under his leg, I left him... The surgeons began boring into the bone, first on one side of the affected part, then on the other after which, they broke it loose with a pair of forceps or pincers: thus they took away, 3 large pieces of the Bone. When they broke off the first piece, he screamed so loud with the pain of his leg, that I could not repress my desire of going to him but as soon as I entered the room he cried out ‘Oh! Mother! go back! go back! I do not want you to come in I will tough it if you will go.’

With this description of the operation, we know that Nathan Smith was on the scene, for this was his procedure recommended for the third or chronic stage of osteomyelitis (see figures 4 and 5, p. 140). The surgeons continued the work of removing fragments of dead bone. With the removal of the third fragment, Lucy Smith came into the bedroom operating room but was excused and detained from further interrupting the procedure.

I was forced from the room and detained till they finished the operation after placing him upon a clean bed with fresh clothing clearing the room

69See n. 62; see also Wirthlin, ‘‘Nathan Smith,’’ p. 335, n. 58.
60John Collins Warren remembered giving ether anesthesia in the early days at the Massachusetts General Hospital:

I have still a vivid recollection of my efforts as a student and as house pupil at the Hospital (1803-6) to etherize these patients. Going under ether in those days was no trifling ordeal and often was suggestive of the scrimmage of a football team rather than the quiet decorum which should surround the operating table. No preliminary treatment was thought necessary... Patients came practically as they were to the operating table and had to take their chances. They were usually etherized at the top of the staircase on a little chair outside the operating theatre, as there was no room existing for this purpose at the time. In the struggle which ensued, I can recall often being forced against the bannisters with nothing but a thin rail to protect me from a fall down an area of three flights. But however powerful the patient might be, the man with the sponge came out victorious and the panting subject was carried triumphantly into the operating room. (Churchill, To Work in the Vineyard of Surgery, p. 35.)

61Goodwin, ‘‘Extracts from Lectures,’’ p. 58; see also Wirthlin, ‘‘Nathan Smith,’’ pp. 330-31.
62Lucy Mack Smith, Preliminary Manuscript, ‘‘History of Joseph Smith.’’
from every appearance of blood and any apparatus used in the extraction I was permitted to enter he now began to recover . . . for he soon became strong and healthy.\textsuperscript{63}

With the proper operation, the bone drained, and the dead fragments removed, Joseph Smith's long ordeal with osteomyelitis rapidly approached an end. He regained strength and recovered. There was additional drainage of bone, for Joseph recalls fourteen pieces of bone worked their way to the surface before the wound closed.\textsuperscript{64} As nothing was mentioned about the healing of the wound, we assume it was straightforward. Joseph used crutches for three years following the surgery and was known to walk with a slight limp in later life. He led a most robust and vigorous life and seemed not to have been bothered with any effects or complications of his boyhood illness.\textsuperscript{65}

CONCLUSION

A study of the two accounts of Joseph Smith's boyhood surgery has resulted in the identification of the principal physician, Nathan Smith. An examination of Nathan Smith's published work on his operation and techniques developed for the treatment of chronic osteomyelitis provides historical perspective in understanding the unusual conditions of Joseph Smith's surgery and the factors which led to the successful outcome. The study of Nathan Smith's surgical techniques corroborates details mentioned in both Joseph Smith's and Lucy Mack Smith's accounts of the procedure; indeed we can appreciate that Lucy Mack Smith's detailed reporting was highly accurate.

The procedure described by Lucy Smith was a standard operation for Nathan Smith and his students in northern New England. When Nathan Smith entered the Joseph Smith home, he brought with him a fifteen-year experience with his technique of sequestrectomy and drainage. He had more experience with osteomyelitis than anyone had previously recorded in the medical literature in the English

\textsuperscript{63}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{64}Joseph Smith, Manuscript History of the Church, A-1, p. 131.

\textsuperscript{65}In 1928, the remains of Joseph, Hyrum, and Emma Smith were transferred to their present gravesite. In the process of the transfer, some of the boney structures were described but no particular mention of the bones of the leg was made. A photograph of the three coffins with their contents was taken at a distance. It was allowed to study this photograph but because of the distance and the partial drapings with silk, I could not make conclusions regarding the presence or absence of changes consistent with healed osteomyelitis. (See W. O. Hands, "Report of W. O. Hands on the Discovery of the Exact Location of the Martyrs Located," F 81, p. 19; this report and the photograph are located in the Library-Archives, Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, Auditorium, Independence, Missouri. See also Frederick Madison Smith, "Bodies of the Martyrs Located," editorial, Saints Herald 75 [25 January 1928]: 89-90.)
language. Although he enjoyed good results, his work and results were not repeated until the early twentieth century.

The Joseph Smith account also describes a Nathan Smith success with sequestrectomy from the perspective of the patient. Since there were no records, this represents one of his few well-documented total successes with the operation.

In 1813, the paths of two unusual individuals crossed: Nathan Smith—American medical pioneer in the prime of his surgical career—and Joseph Smith—a seven-year-old boy from a humble family, struggling for health, yet to make his mark in the world. The contribution of Nathan Smith to the recovery of young Joseph Smith should be remembered and listed with his other accomplishments.
Lula Greene Richards:
Utah’s First Woman Editor

Sherilyn Cox Bennion

I am only a girl in the cold, proud world,
Working from day to day;
But this is my plan, wherever I can,
To brighten the lonely way.
I look around me and where they stand,
The weary, the sad and weak,
I smile and offer a friendly hand,
And these are the words I speak:
It is better to work than to idle be,
As it’s better to live than to die;
To sustain one’s self, and thus be free,
And it’s better to laugh than to cry.1

So ran a stanza in one of the poems Louisa Lula Greene Richards chose to have published in a volume of her works issued in 1904. It is a representative sample of both her poetry and her philosophy—a philosophy which found expression in the newspaper she edited (she was the first woman editor in Utah), in the column she wrote for the Sunday School magazine of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints for about twenty years, and in the multitude of tributes, hymns and commemorative poems she began writing as a young teenager. She expressed similar ideas in instructions sent the fledgling LDS Relief Society, Primary, and Young Ladies Retrenchment organizations and, no doubt, during visits she paid to members of these groups as an organizer and promoter of all three.

Dedicated, ambitious and prolific, Lula had a vast number of interests, many of which developed into causes and crusades and all of which she must have written about at one time or another during her ninety-five years. While her poetry ran to lofty sentiment and her essays often concentrated on advice for moral living, she was eminently practical, as free with advice on curing bad breath or cleansing the

Sherilyn Cox Bennion is an associate professor of journalism, Humboldt State University, Arcata, California.

1Louisa Lula Greene Richards, Branches That Run Over the Wall (Salt Lake City, Utah: Magazine Printing Company, 1904), p. 79.
hair as she was with urgings to pursue education or support woman’s suffrage. She had a sense of humor, as well. It emerged in her selection of items for the miscellany columns of the Woman’s Exponent, which she edited, as well as in her own writing for that paper. In later years it found frequent release in the poems, stories, and comments she prepared “For Our Little Folks” in the Sunday School magazine, The Juvenile Instructor.

Lula was born 8 April 1849, in Kanesville, Iowa, the eighth of the thirteen children of Evan M. and Susan Kent Greene, both of whose mothers were sisters of President Brigham Young. Her parents had joined the Church in New York in the 1830s and moved to Kirtland, Ohio, where Evan taught an English class and served as a clerk to Joseph Smith, the prophet. The Greens moved to Kanesville in 1846, to Salt Lake City in 1852, and then to Provo. There Evan was chosen mayor and representative to the territorial legislature. In 1859 the family moved to Grantsville, where Evan was elected to the legislature for two more terms, and in 1864 to Smithfield, Utah, where he served as city recorder.2

The earliest of Lula’s preserved poetry was a “poetical dialogue” between “Princess Aurora” and the “Mountain Queen” composed at the age of fourteen for herself and her sister to dramatize. She recorded it from memory eleven years later in a letter to her niece, apologizing for its lack of refinement:

You must recollect that I was but a child, fourteen years of age when I composed the poem, and taught your Aunt Lissie her part by repeating it to her. I had read little or no history then; and was not familiar with the proper style of getting up dialogues, having never witnessed more than two evening’s entertainments, of a theatrical nature, in my life. The effort, therefore, is a very crude one, entirely imaginary with no particular aim at effect in any direction. . . . Childish and absurd as it really seemed, it always met with great applause wherever we could be induced to give it in public assemblies. Of course this was pleasing to my girlish ambition; but what was still more gratifying to me, it used to have the effect to make the tears run down your Grand-pa’s cheeks when we would play it in the family circle.3

Scene of the dialogue is an elegant boudoir, where Lissie, as Princess Aurora, sits and dreams of the faraway mountains she sees

---

2Biographical information is from family group sheet for Evan M. Greene, in the Genealogical Department Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City; and Leonard J. Arrington, “Louisa Lula Greene Richards: Woman Journalist of the Early West,” The Improvement Era 72 (May, 1969): 28–31. Lula’s two grandmothers were Nancy Young Kent and Rhoda Young Greene, according to Susa Young Gates, “The Woman’s Exponent,” p. 1, undated typescript in Library–Archives, Historical Department, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City (hereafter referred to as Church Archives).

3Richards to Rhoda Bullock, 13 March 1874, Church Archives.

156
Pioneer Mother, a portrait of Lula Greene Richards painted by her son, Lee Greene Richards
through her window. Lula is the Mountain Queen, a native of those mountains taken captive by Aurora’s father. She comes before the princess to protest her abject state and to plead for release:

True, I’m not taught in grand, old arts and science;
   My dress is coarse, my manners unrefined:—
Yet, I can look on thee in proud defiance
   Is dress, and manners all that make the mind?
If so, why, then I yield in calm submission;
   They say I am your servant—nay, your slave!
Yet think not that I fear in this condition
   To tell thee that thy father is a knave!

After a few more verses, Aurora is convinced and seeks successfully the Mountain Queen’s release. Lula invites Aurora to visit her in the mountains, and the dialogue concludes with the two addressing the audience from the front of the stage.  

Lula’s first journalistic venture was editing the “Smithfield Sunday School Gazette,” one of many handwritten papers distributed by Sunday School students throughout Utah. The “Gazette” was a four-page paper with two columns written on each page, given each Sunday to those who would “come to Sabbath School, keep order and pay attention.”  

Lula’s editorship lasted for six issues, from 24 October to 28 November 1869.

For the first number Lula wrote a front-page editorial reminding Mormon children how blessed they were in opportunities for learning, a recurring theme in her writings. Other features were a “Juvenile Department” with one short paragraph on good manners and another on “The Eagle,” a letter about the Book of Mormon, a poem called “Baby Learning to Read,” and a “Teachers Department” containing a letter to Smithfield children from one of their teachers telling them how to behave in Sunday School. Lula added a note encouraging the children to write for the “Gazette” but asking them not to copy material from other sources.

In a later number, among advice, tributes, poetry, and congratulations to Sunday School classes whose members had passed “a creditable examination,” Lula placed an editorial on rising early, but added the following qualification to her agreement that being up with the sun was generally desirable:

---

4Richards, “Princess Aurora and the Mountain Queen” in ibid.
5“Smithfield Sunday School Gazette,” no. 2 (31 October 1869), Church Archives.
6Ibid., no. 1 (24 October 1869).
Lest our indulgent father and mother should happen to come across this article and make use of our own words to justify themselves in condemning some of our willful ways, we beg to exempt young ladies from this general rule on certain occasions. Such, for instance, as necessity requiring the editing of a Sunday School News Paper Saturday evening after bed time.  

In the same number, her last, she told her readers good-by and asked to be released, "on account of other duties." She had attended a private school in Salt Lake City in 1868–1869 and now wanted to pursue her studies at the University of Deseret.

By the fall of 1871 Lula was back in Smithfield. However, she traveled to Salt Lake City in October to attend general conference and to seek a position teaching elementary school. She was ready to begin work, according to one biographical sketch, when she received a letter calling her home because of illness in the family. Lacking the money she needed to get there, she sat up all night writing poetry which she took the next day to the office of The Salt Lake Daily Herald, asking the editor, Edward L. Sloan, to buy it for the $7.50 she needed.

He did, and "Tired Out" became her first published work. It was a melancholy addition to the Herald's front page, appearing at the top center of the sheet in the spot which Edward Sloan reserved for the poetry he periodically offered his readers, alternating between nationally-recognized poets like Joaquin Miller or Henry Wadsworth Longfellow and local writers. Possibly Lula really was tired out by the time she wrote it, or perhaps the news of illness at Smithfield had dampened her usual high spirits. At any rate, the poem was a letter to the writer's mother asking if the author might come home to die. It ended with these two stanzas:

My companions read it over,
   And with tears and quiv'ring breath
They said I need not send it,
   Then they told me of your death;
They had not dared to tell me,
   For they feared my sudden grief,—
Yet the news was not distressing,
   But to me a sweet relief:
To feel you would not miss me,
   Was indeed a blest relief.

\footnote{Ibid., no. 6 (28 November 1869).}
\footnote{Thomas C. Romney, "Louisa Lula Greene Richards," The Instructor 85 (September 1950): 262.}
There are those around me, mother,
Who have ever kindly smiled;
Who have proved in joy or sorrow
Ever faithful to your child;
There are others who have slighted,
Who have wronged me and oppress’d;
But my heart can know no malice,
And my spirit is at rest,—
And I’m coming, angel mother,
Coming home with thee to rest.9

It was signed “‘Lula.’”

A few days later, back in Smithfield, Lula received a letter from Sloan asking if she would be interested in editing a paper for Mormon women. She later recorded that he first had contemplated giving her work on the Herald but, since other staff members did not agree with that plan, he conceived the idea of the women’s paper. Lula was reluctant, pleading inexperience, but Sloan persisted, so she wrote Eliza R. Snow, the most influential woman in the Church, to find out what Eliza thought about the suggestion and to ask her to get Brigham Young’s reaction. If President Young approved, Lula added, she would like him to “‘appoint the duties of that calling’” as a mission. Eliza wrote back that both she and the President “‘heartily sanctioned the undertaking’” and that President Young would gladly appoint Lula the mission and bless her in it. This he agreed to after inquiring about her capabilities for such an undertaking and being assured that what she lacked in education she could learn and that she was “‘stanch.’”10

During the first months of 1872, planning for the new publication went forward. Eliza and Lula corresponded about possible printers, methods of financing the paper, subscription prices, the necessity of keeping careful records, and the types of content that would be appropriate.11 The paper was to be published twice a month. Lula moved to Salt Lake to begin her editorship, staying with her uncle, Lorenzo D. Young, and using his parlor as an office until the fall of 1872, when Edward Sloan had a small office constructed near the Herald building. Lula lived there with her aunt, Persis Richards, using the back room as living quarters and the front as public office.12

10Richards to Zina S. Whitney, 20 January 1893, Church Archives.
11Eliza R. Snow to Richards, 23 April and 16 November 1871, and 20 February 1872, Church Archives.
Publication date for the first number was set for early in April, to coincide with general conference, but delays in shipments of type and paper postponed its issuance until 1 June.¹³ That 1 June was also Brigham Young’s birthday was a happy coincidence.

The first issues of the Woman’s Exponent were printed in the Herald plant, but before they appeared, Sloan probably had a hand in preparation of a prospectus explaining the aims of the publication and soliciting subscriptions for it. This was sent to all Relief Society presidents and used as an advertisement in the Herald. Lula had set herself a considerable task, for the paper was to discuss “every subject interesting and valuable to women. It will contain a brief and graphic summary of current news, local and general; household hints, educational matters, articles on health and dress, correspondence, editorials on leading topics of interest suitable to its columns, and miscellaneous reading,” as well as reports of the Relief Societies of Utah. It would “endeavor to defend the right, inculcate sound principles and disseminate useful knowledge.”¹⁴

Lula’s first number of the Exponent came close to meeting the promise of the prospectus. In its eight pages, it contained a column of “News and Views,” the first installment of a history of the Relief Society by Eliza R. Snow, a report on Relief Society activities in Ogden, brief essays on the values of labor and cheerful dispositions and the dangers of relying on first impressions, “Household Hints,” poems which were unsigned but probably written by Lula and called “Remember Thy Mother” and “Rearing of Children,” news notes in a column headed “Splinters,” exchanges reprinted from other publications, editorials supporting statehood for Utah and explaining the goals of the Exponent, articles on woman’s place and suffrage, short fillers both witty and whimsical, and advertisements.

Listed as editor was “L. L. Greene.” Lula changed this to “Louise L. Greene” with the 15 July number, explaining, “There appears to be a misunderstanding on the part of numbers of our readers, in regard to the Editor of the Exponent. ‘Mr. L. L. Green, Dear Editor,’ and ‘Editor WOMAN’S EXPONENT, Dear Sir,’ are honorable appellations, but we are not entitled to either ‘Mr.’ or ‘Sir,’ being simply a woman, which our name as it now appears over the editorial department will indicate.”¹⁵

The use of pen names on some contributions and no names on others makes it difficult to state with certainty just how much of the

¹³Richards to Zina S. Whitney, 20 January 1893.
¹⁵Woman’s Exponent 4 (15 July 1872): 5.
content of the *Exponent* Lula actually wrote, but it is probably safe to assume that most of the unsigned material—at least in the early issues—came from her pen. It can also be established, through the *Exponent* and other sources, that the pen names "Geranium," "Mary Grace," and "Mignona" were hers.\(^6\) Thus, a miniature anthology of her work for the *Exponent* can be compiled:

On "Sleep":

If no other reward could be anticipated, for a good, substantial day's work, and the careful keeping of a clear conscience, a night of calm, refreshing sleep is a compensation not to be ignored by the most ambitious and energetic... Is it not very probable that one great cause of the immature deaths in the present age, may be attributed to a lack of indulgence in this exhilarating restorative at the proper time?\(^7\)

On "Temperance":

Temperance enters into the smallest minutiae of life, and beautiful indeed are the lives of the strictly temperate. They may not have genius or brilliant talent. But if by circumstances placed side by side with, or in antagonism with Genius or Talent, for any considerable length of time, Temperance will be sure to win and wear the laurel wreath of fame... If we will be temperate in all things our lives will be beautiful and our deaths but triumphs.\(^8\)

On "Mixed Parties":

We refer to what has been called "mixed parties," where the price of admission is placed at a certain figure, and where every person is welcome who will pay the money at the door. To such places every character, no matter how vile, can claim admission; and, there, simple and guileless young girls may be thrown into the society of men practiced in all the wiles and arts by which maidens are lured to destruction... We earnestly recommend parents to make the strictest inquiries where the slightest doubt rests upon their minds, that they may be satisfied beforehand their children are not exposed to blighting evil, nor thrown in the way of insidious and dangerous temptation.\(^9\)

On "Utah and the Mormons":

We recommend to these very pious people throughout the country, who are so strongly exercised over the condition of Utah, to open their eyes and look around them, and see what a vast field there is, within sight of their very doors, for the philanthropist, the reformer and the man or

---

\(^6\)From list of pen names compiled by Davis Bitton, professor of history, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.

\(^7\) *Woman's Exponent* 1 (1 July 1872): 5.

\(^8\) Ibid. (15 December 1872). p. 5.

\(^9\) Ibid. (1 January 1873). p. 4.
woman of real charity to labor in. And we can assure those at a distance, that the men in Utah who make the loudest outcry against the immorality of the "Mormon," are themselves the most immoral men in the country, and openly boast that they only use this cry as a means of stirring up prejudice to enable them to accomplish designs which it were flattery to characterize as base.20

On "Science and Religion":

Truth is science, and science in its legitimate form embraces all truth; and as "true science and true religion walk hand in hand," nothing that is unscientific can belong to true religion, nor can anything that is irreligious be classed with true science.21

On "Education of Women":

If there be some women in whom the love of learning extinguishes all other love, then the heaven-appointed sphere of that woman is not the nursery. It may be the library, the laboratory, the observatory. . . . Does such a woman prove that perfect liberty of education unspheres woman? On the contrary it has enabled that woman to perceive exactly what God meant her to do. . . . God lead us to find the true woman in the free American home.22

On "Daily Bathing":

If mothers wish their children to be healthy, active and intellectual, this duty must not be neglected, either for themselves or their little ones. . . . From the effects of this treatment, very delicate women have become comparatively robust and healthy.23

On "The Girls":

It has become a common rule with mothers to foster in the minds of their little daughters the belief that to dress richly and be pert and talkative are the chief means of winning attraction, which must be the principal aim of their existence. . . . Well-to-do fathers take pride themselves in noting the pleasure with which their bright, vivacious, witching little darlings will array themselves in the latest styles, and pet and humor instead of correcting their childish vanities. . . . If we want our daughters to become amiable, refined, sensible and beautiful women, we must give them the principles upon which to erect such characters. Teach them to be industrious and orderly in all their habits, and to value the worth of genuine intelligence, and they will find little time and less desire to run wild after fashion.24

20Ibid. (15 January 1873), p. 4.
22Ibid. (1 April 1873), p. 3.
23Ibid. (1 May 1873), p. 5.
24Ibid., 2 (15 June 1873): 7.

163
On "The 'Enslaved' Women of Utah":

With the knowledge thus obtained through years of experience, we de-
nounce the incorrect and vindictive statements still made concerning
men, women and matters in Utah; and regret that any woman should
be engaged in such work. [Women in Utah] are to-day in the free and
unrestricted exercise of more political and social rights than are the
women of any other part of these United States. 25

Along with her own writings, her choice of items for the columns
of ‘News and Views,’ "Splinters," or "Home Affairs" and her
comments on them showed Lula's ideas and opinions. She suggested
after stating half the servant girls in Philadelphia were said to be
drunkards that giving them "a chance to become honest wives and
keepers of their own houses, instead of having to keep irregular hours
waiting on fashionable mistresses" might solve the problem. She
criticized Tennessee Claflin, a fellow journalist more noted for her
flamboyant life-style than for her writing ability, calling her "a sad
spectacle of a talented woman setting modesty, purity of feeling, and
womany grace at defiance, that she may secure the applause of the
reckless and the indorsement of those who set proper restrictions at
defiance." 26 She approved, in a "Household Hints" item, Miss Har-
rriet Beecher's remark "that there is nothing which so distinctly marks
the difference between weak and strong minds as whether they con-
trol circumstances or circumstances control them." 27

A few excerpts from a column and a half of "Splinters" show
their varied nature:

One of the women in the house of the Good Shepherd, St. Louis, is a
carpenter and shoemaker. . . . Clark, the balloonist, who fell from a
balloon at Memphis, died from the effects, less than a week afterward.
. . . Prince Bismarek is going to the Isle of Wight. . . . The
Emperor William, of Germany, is said to be gradually sinking into the
grave. . . . The Baurls, who stand at the head of the iron masters in
Scotland, make as clear profit annually $2,500,000. . . . Nilsson
sketches landscapes nicely. . . . Over ten million pairs of shoes were
manufactured in Lynn, Massachusetts, last year. 28

A year after Lula began her editorship, she was married. Her
husband was Levi Willard Richards, born in 1845 at Nauvoo, Illinois.
His father and mother, Dr. Levi Richards and Sarah Griffith, were on
a mission in England when the Mormons moved to Utah, so their son

26Ibid., p. 1.
27Ibid., p. 3.
28Ibid., p. 4.
was sent west at the age of three with his Aunt Rhoda and Uncle Willard Richards. He was eight when his parents returned. Levi was later to be secretary of the Deseret Sunday School Union Board, clerk of both the Fourteenth and Twentieth wards, a counselor in the high priests quorum and a patriarch of Ensign Stake, and a temple worker for twenty-five years.29

Andrew Jenson, in his LDS Biographical Encyclopedia, wrote that "in all his walks in life, in the privacy of his own home, as well as before the public, Levi W. Richards was always justly upheld as a model of the charity, patience, benevolence and brotherly kindness and love which should characterize all Latter-day Saints."30

Lula bore two daughters while she was Exponent editor, and both of them died before she gave up the editorship in August 1877.31 By that time, however, she was sharing editorial responsibilities with Emmeline B. Wells; both women were listed as editors beginning in December 1875. Emmeline stayed in that position until the Exponent was discontinued in 1914.

Even in the latter part of her editorship, Lula did not neglect the Exponent. Her letters to her family were filled with news about the paper, along with appeals for contributions. This one to her sister Lissie also repeats Lula's feelings about woman's place:

I wish you would look about you a little more and try to jot down something every time that you think might be of public interest. Any little idea, no matter how commonplace, coming from outer settlements, gives life to my paper, and you know it is my business to keep it alive, and nourish and brighten it up all the while. It is doing much good at home, and some abroad; and if we can continue to make it grow its mission will be a great one yet. It is one of the small things which the Lord will make use of to confound the mighty. Besides this, my sister, for your own good, I want you to make an effort to do some other good thing than to raise boys for missionaries in Zion. I know that is a great thing to do, but you have ability to add to it.32

A little later, Lula tried to add to the good that the Exponent was doing by suggesting to her brother and sisters that they help a young woman friend, apparently romantically involved with an unacceptable man, by having her read two articles in the latest number.33

29Andrew Jenson, Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson History Co., 1901), 3:703-705.
30Ibid., p. 705.
31Family group sheet for Levi W. Richards, LDS Genealogical Department Library.
32Richards to her sister Lissie, 21 March 1874, copy in Church Archives.
33Richards to her sisters and brother, Lissie, Lina, and Edmund, 24 November 1874, copy in Church Archives.

165
It was in June 1877 that Lula wrote Brigham Young requesting a release from the editorship, naming family responsibilities as the reason:

Four years ago, you sealed upon me a higher and holier mission—to be a wife and to become a mother!

My object in addressing you now, is to acquaint you with the fact, that I find I have not sufficient strength to perform both missions at the same time, with satisfaction or credit to myself.

I could not, conscientiously, remove my name from the "Exponent" without first consulting you, and asking your approval and blessing in so doing. Sister Emmeline B. Wells, having already reared her family, is a woman well adapted to the work of carrying on our little paper. And although I regret my own inability, which renders it necessary for me to ask to be released from further responsibilities in connection with the paper, I feel well to leave it in her hands.

In years to come, I hope to be prepared to enter again upon such labors, with renewed energies and increased capabilities. For the present, I still ask, if, in removing my name from the "Exponent" I may still feel that I have your favor and blessing?\(^\text{34}\)

The President's reply, addressed to "My dear Niece" and signed "Your affectionate uncle," read:

Your note of the 16th. instant has been received. I am willing you should retire from the editorial chair of the "Exponent," as you desire, and in so doing you have my best wishes and blessings, which you will ever continue to have in fulfilling the duties of life.

Wishing yourself, your husband and the little stranger much happiness and continued peace, . . . \(^\text{35}\)

Lula also explained to *Exponent* readers why she was "withdraw ing from public service for the present," once more adding a few comments on her conception of the proper role of a Mormon woman:

During the years of my life which may be properly devoted to the rearing of a family, I will give my special attention to that most important branch of "Home Industry." Not that my interest in the public weal is diminishing, or that I think the best season of a woman's life should be completely absorbed in her domestic duties. But every reflecting mother, and every true philanthropist, can see the happy medium between being selfishly home bound, and foolishly public spirited.\(^\text{36}\)

Although Lula no longer sat in the editorial chair, she continued to be a frequent contributor to the *Exponent*, "in cases of necessity carrying much of its responsibilities," as she wrote in the margin of

---

\(^{34}\)Richards to Brigham Young, 16 June 1877, Church Archives.

\(^{35}\)Brigham Young to Richards, 28 June 1877, Church Archives.

\(^{36}\)Woman's Exponent 6 (1 August 1877): 4.
Susa Young Gates’s history of the paper. She also wrote for other Mormon publications and composed poetry and song lyrics for special occasions.

Her next major journalistic responsibility was a department begun in 1883 in *The Juvenile Instructor*. Lula was asked by George Q. Cannon, editor of the publication which was designed for Sunday School workers and members, to take charge of the column. The section’s first title was "Chapter for the Little Ones," and its usual content was a story or essay. As it evolved into "Our Little Folks" its content became more varied, including stories and essays by contributors, along with those by its compiler; poetry; charades and puzzles; a series of articles on Mormon stake presidents; and a section of letters from readers.

Sometimes Lula’s contributions to "Our Little Folks" were signed, sometimes not. This "Sentiment for Thanksgiving Day" was one that she initialed:

Thanksgiving and praise to our Father and God,  
Who withholds in His strength from the river and sod;  
But crowns with rich blessing man’s labor and care:  
So kindly, so amply our wants are supplied,  
It is best, always best, if our stores we divide,  
And spread freely ’round us, that all may have share.

"Pussy’s Letter," which follows, was not signed, but its appearance in Lula’s department, whether or not she wrote it, shows that she was wise enough to include material just for fun.

Pussy thought she’d write a letter  
To her friend, the Irish setter.

Little Ruth made all things ready,  
Held the little soft paw steady.

It was very nicely written  
For a simple Maltese kitten.

But—Ruth, do you mind my telling?  
Pussy isn’t good at spelling.

---

38 Richards to Joseph F. Smith, 25 November 1907, Church Archives.  
39 *The Juvenile Instructor* 36 (1 December 1901): 753.  
40 Ibid., 37 (1 February 1902): 96.
The essays did not always teach a moral, either. One was about “A Queer Conference Visitor” who “was the most cheeky little fellow” the author had ever seen. “Without waiting to be invited he came right into the priesthood meeting in the Tabernacle, Monday evening, and instead of going off into a corner and sitting down, he went right up to the stand and presented himself to the presiding authorities.”41 Lula then described the intruder, asking the children to guess who he was. At the end of the description, she revealed that the creature was a bat who lived, she surmised, on top of the Tabernacle organ.

Of course, much of the content of “Our Little Folks” did contain advice and instruction. A filler at the end of a column might be something like this “Motto: If I can’t do all the good I want to, I want to do all the good I can.”42 Or commentary accompanying an illustration showing four puppies watching longingly from a basket as a kitten laps a saucer of milk would conclude, “Pussy seems to me not to be quite so happy eating alone, as she would be if the puppies had their supper too, instead of watching her so eagerly and whining over her because they have nothing to eat. How would we feel if we were in pussy’s place? Why would we feel that way?”43

Sometimes Lula offered advice to parents. One essay in which she did was titled “The Hurry of the Times, and Need of Relaxation,” a topic, like many of those she wrote about, which is as appropriate today as it was in 1904. She noted that the husband needed relief from the worry of business and that both parents should relax more—and mingle more with their children in the process.44

Lula often had poems published in other parts of the magazine, as well as her own department. In 1905 the magazine offered $50 in prizes for the best poems honoring Joseph Smith on the 100th anniversary of his birth. Lula won first prize, and prominent Mormon composer Evan Stephens took top honors in the next phase of the contest, which was to produce a musical setting for the two winning poems. Lula’s lyric was titled “Joseph the Blest.” The first stanza follows:

---

41Ibid., 39 (1 May 1904): 280.
42Ibid., 37 (1 January 1902): 32.
43Ibid., 42 (1 May 1907): 286.
44Ibid., 39 (15 March 1904): 187.
Father of life and light,
In heav'n above,
This world Thou makes bright,
Warmed by Thy love.
While all the meek rejoice,
Let every heart and voice
Send forth Thy praise,
Who didst on earth bestow,
One hundred years ago,
Joseph, the Prophet dear,
Joseph, the mighty seer
Of latter days!45

Lula’s works continued to be published, even after “Our Little Folks” was discontinued in a 1907 attempt to modernize The Juvenile Instructor and put it on a firmer financial footing. Her response to the change, as she expressed it in a letter to Joseph F. Smith, at that time LDS Church President, as well as Instructor editor, was not exactly a protest; but it did make clear her disappointment and a very human need for approval:

As the changes to be made in the Juvenile Instructor leave out “Our Little Folks” department, of which I have been editor, I feel that in kindness to the children, some notice and explanation should be given them. They write to the “Letter-Box” from all parts of our country, as well as from foreign lands, and it seems to me it would be unfair and disappointing to them to shut off this medium of communication, which they evidently have enjoyed so much, without saying something to them about it. . . .

In retiring from the position I have held for a number of years on the Juvenile Instructor, which position came to me unsolicited and unexpected, through the kindness and courtesy of President George Q. Cannon, it would be very gratifying to me to know if in the past my work has been satisfactory to you, or if, for any reason, at any time it has proven otherwise.46

President Smith made a gracious attempt to mollify Lula in a handwritten reply, saying that he had not only always enjoyed the contents of the column and her management of it but had always esteemed highly her greater gifts as poetess and writer. He said he regarded her “as one of the best and most gifted, in your line, of our dear Sisters, whose names will live in the memories and heart of our people.” He added that he couldn’t help but regret the need of making the changes in The Instructor which had been decided upon

46Richards to Joseph F. Smith, 25 November 1907, Church Archives.

169
“Joseph called the name of the first born Manasseh: For God, said he, hath made me forget all my toil, and all my father’s house.

“And the name of the second called he Ephraim: For God hath caused me to be fruitful in the land of my affliction.”

—Gen. 41:51, 52

Painting by Lee Greene Richards used as an illustration in Branches That Run Over the Wall

170
by the Brethren but that the magazine couldn’t be continued with the constant financial loss it had been incurring.47

While she was still with The Instructor, Lula published a volume of her collected prose and poetry.48 Called Branches That Run Over the Wall, it took that title from its opening section, a long Book of Mormon epic.

Prefatory material included two complimentary letters about this work, one of which noted Lula’s ingenuity in making up wives’ names by transposing letters in the names of their husbands, and an explanation of abbreviations used to show which lines were historical, which supposition, and which contained comments on the text. Also prefatory was the following poem, “At the Door,” which expressed not only how Lula felt about her Book of Mormon poem but also how she must have felt about writing for publication in general:

Upon the threshold, ere I touch the bell,
I pause, and listen—and my heart beats quick.
Who are within? How shall I be received?
Now I remember that for friendly hearts
The world is full of friends.
I need not fear; why should I hesitate?
Ah! mingling with our friends, harsh critics throng,
Who give opinions ere they’re introduced,
And judgment pass before a case is heard.
But, friendship’s holdings must be stronger still,
Than cynics’ scorn, or painful ridicule
Of careless, prating tongues, however sharp;
And love and truth and light, though simply clad,
And artless to excess, will rise—must rise
Superior to their opposites, and live.
This feeling quickens faith and quiets fear.
I ring courageously, then calmly wait.49

The book was divided into three sections, with a painting by artist Lee Greene Richards, Lula’s son, to illustrate each. The Book of Mormon epic, written in a variety of meters and styles, came to a climax with a wedding feast for the five sons of major character Lehi and their wives and then concluded with a few verses summarizing subsequent Book of Mormon history and an admonition to readers to learn for themselves of the book’s truthfulness. The rest of Lula’s book contained shorter poems, sketches, essays and epigrams, many of them reprinted from the Woman’s Exponent or The Juvenile

---

47 Joseph F. Smith to Richards, 30 November 1907, Church Archives.
48 Lula Greene Richards, Branches That Run Over the Wall (Salt Lake City: The Magazine Printing Co., 1904).
49 Ibid., p. v.
Clusters from Drooping Sprays, painting by Lee Greene Richards used as an illustration in Branches That Run Over the Wall

The Children's Garland, painting by Lee Greene Richards used as an illustration in Branches That Run Over the Wall
Instructor. The final section was a collection of poems, recitations and dialogues for children. Two songs, complete with words and music, also were included.

As was usual in Lula's writings, most of the selections had morals. For example:

The high, ambitious one will often stumble
Where safely walks the lowly and the humble;
Oft falls the proudly dignified and grand,
Where modest, unassuming worth will stand.30

However, a few works were obviously written—and included in the anthology—just for fun. "Something New" fits into this category:

Oh! girls, I have seen and have heard something new;
And, womanlike, truly, I'll tell it to you.
It is not a fancy worked cushion or mat,
The style of a dress or the shape of a hat.

You may guess and may puzzle all day and all night,
But I have no idea you'd ever guess right.
And therefore I'll tell you, since curious you've grown,
For a fact that's so wonderful ought to be known—

At least among women, for comfort and cheer
It contains for our spirits; so listen, and hear.
Last evening, I met at a kind neighbor's house,
A man who will own he's afraid of a mouse!31

By the time her anthology was published Lula was fifty-four, and, of course, many changes had occurred in her personal life. Her seventh child, a third daughter who did not survive, had been born in 1888, and her four sons, born between 1878 and 1885, were grown. Each child had been given the middle name Greene. Lee was a well-known artist, and Willard was a participant in the colonization and development of southern Alberta in Canada. Evan became a dentist, Heber a professor of English at the University of Utah.

Another member had been added to the household, as well. She was Persis Louisa Young, Lula's niece, who came to the Richards as a household helper and stayed to become Levi's plural wife. He married her on his and Lula's eleventh wedding anniversary. This arrangement apparently was satisfactory to all concerned. Persis had only one child, who died in infancy, and spent the rest of her life helping with family and household tasks while Lula pursued more

30Ibid., p. 166.
31Ibid., p. 141.
public interests. The two women continued to share the same house after Levi died in 1914.52

Lula was active as an officer in the Mormon auxiliary organizations of the Twentieth Ward, where she lived for most of her life. From its dedication in 1893 until 1934, she was a worker in the Salt Lake Temple, as were both her husband and Persis. She continued to write for Church publications almost until her death, which occurred in 1944, when she was ninety-five years old. Persis died the same year.53

An earlier tribute may reveal more about Lula than those written at her death, although perhaps most obituary praises in both poetry and prose—like those Lula wrote—tell more about their writers than about their subjects. Susa Young Gates described Lula as a rather intimidating character, full of paradoxes:

Extremely modest, if not diffident, she was naturally noble, broad-minded, yet with a rigid moral standard which amounted almost to what is sometimes called by worldly people, fanaticism. Unmindful of such criticisms Lula Greene possessed courage, initiative and considerable fire of poesy and self-expression, modified greatly by a placid, obedient spirit which often hid the steely strength of her will and determination to press forward always in the path of duty.54

Lula certainly was something of the paragon Susa depicted. But she was also a real person, a talented woman who had strong convictions about right and wrong, about justice and duty, about the responsibility of a woman to rear righteous children without withdrawing from involvement in civic affairs, but also about the beauty and joy of life on earth. All of these found a place both in her writing and in her life.

53Gardner, Levi Richards, p. 142.
Josef Smith the Man: Some Reflections on a Subject of Controversy

Marvin S. Hill

One of the things the historian learns when he begins to delve deeply into historical sources is that the great men of the past have always been the subject of bitter controversy. While these men have had their defenders, they have had their critics too.

In the 1790s one famous hero of the Revolutionary Era wrote to another, "As to you, sir, the world will be puzzled to decide whether you are an apostate or an imposter, whether you have abandoned good principles or whether you ever had any." The author of this bit of vituperation was Thomas Paine, whose pamphlet Common Sense is considered by most historians to have been the catalyst of the American demand for independence from Great Britain in 1776; the recipient of this vitriolic letter was George Washington. According to another political partisan of the 1790s, a leader of the opposition party was guilty of the "most ambitious spirit, the most overweening pride and hauteur, so that the externals of pure democracy afford but a flimsy veil to the internal evidences of aristocratic splendor, sensuality, and Epicureanism." The slanderer here was a friend of Alexander Hamilton; the person so denounced was Thomas Jefferson, champion of American democracy. Another American who was extremely controversial during his years in public office was excoriated as "illiterate, coarse [sic] and vulgar," as a "mobocrat, a Southern hater, a lunatic and a chimpanzee." This belittled man was Abraham Lincoln.

Like other great Americans, the Prophet Joseph Smith was not exempt from such disparagement. He had friends who spoke well of him, and he had critics who were often embittered. The result was

Marvin S. Hill, a professor of history at Brigham Young University, presented this speech at the Forum Assembly at Brigham Young University, 20 May 1980.

broad disagreement as to his character and personality. If we consider such traits as his personal appearance, the first impressions he made on others, his treatment of people, his linguistic and oratory skills, and his financial integrity, we find much controversy among his acquaintances. I would like to review part of this argument, to consider some of the reasons for it, and then to suggest some ways the historian can treat the disagreement. Finally, I would like to convey what I think was a wise attitude of the early Saints toward the human side of Joseph Smith.

During his lifetime the Prophet developed from a poor farm boy in Palmyra, New York, to the leader of a large, influential church. In considering his early appearance, we must keep in mind his poverty. One of those who knew him as a young man was Daniel Hendrix, who worked in a store in Palmyra and who said that Joseph came in almost daily. He described him as “the most ragged . . . fellow in the place, and that is saying a good deal.”

David Hendrix said Joseph was about twenty-five years old, I can see him now, in my mind’s eye, with his torn and patched trousers, held to his form by a pair of suspenders made out of sheeting, with his calico shirt as dirty and black as earth, and his uncombed hair sticking through the holes in his old, battered hat. In winter I used to pity him, for his shoes were so worn out that he must have suffered in the snow and slush.4

Pomeroy Tucker, editor of a local newspaper, the Wayne Sentinel, said Joseph was remembered in Palmyra from the ages of twelve to twenty as a “dull-eyed, flaxen-haired youth.”5 Isaac Hale, Joseph’s father-in-law, described him in 1825 as “a careless young man.”6

It is hard to find a description of Joseph in this early period by his many friends. Those that exist do not provide all the details we would like. Parley P. Pratt’s description is a good example. He said that in 1830 “President Joseph Smith was in person tall and well built, strong and active, of light complexion, light hair, blue eyes, very little beard, and of an expression peculiar to himself, on which the eye naturally rested with interest.”7 He does not mention Joseph’s apparel, details which would have been helpful in assessing what David Hendrix said.

---

4Saint Louis Globe Democrat. 21 February 1897, p. 34.
6Eber D. Howe, *Mormonism Unsealed* [sic], or a Faithful Account of That Singular Imposition and Delusion, from Its Rise to the Present Time (Painesville, Ohio: Published by author, 1834), p. 263.
If we consider Joseph’s appearance in later life, we find continued variance. Charles Francis Adams, later American minister to Great Britain during the Civil War, said that when he met Joseph in 1844 Joseph was “clad in the costume of a journeyman carpenter when about his work. He was a hearty, athletic looking fellow, with blue eyes standing prominently out upon his light complexion, a long nose, and a retreating forehead. He wore striped pantaloons, and a linen jacket, which had not lately seen the washtub, and a beard of some three days growth.’’8

But Barthsheba Smith, a Church member, remembered Joseph more favorably: “The Prophet was a handsome man—splendid looking, a large man, tall and fair and his hair was light. He had a very nice complexion, his eyes were blue, and his hair a golden brown and very pretty.’’9

If we examine the sort of first impression Joseph made, again we find a polarity. Orlando Saunders, who lived in Palmyra as a boy and worked with Joseph on the Smith farm, said Joseph was a good worker but a “‘greeny, both large and strong.’’10 By “‘greeny’ he meant an awkward, somewhat unsophisticated rustic. One investigator agreed, saying he lost interest in the Church after discovering that Joseph was “not such a looking man as I expected to see. He looked green and not very intelligent. I felt disappointed and returned home.’’11 On the other hand, Jonathan Crosby, who joined the Church, found Joseph’s unpretentiousness refreshing. He said: “‘I thought he was a queer [sic] man for a Prophet, at first, he didn’t appear exactly as I expected to see a Prophet of God. . . . I found him to be a friendly, cheerful pleasant agreeable man. I could not help liking him.’’12

Nancy Towles, who met Joseph just after he moved to Kirtland, said that he was an “‘ignorant plough-boy,’’ a “‘good natured,—low bred sort of chap.’’13 But Newel Knight, who was Joseph’s friend and convert in Chenango County, New York, said that from the first Joseph had made a favorable impression on the Knights. He was a hard worker and, Newel said, “‘I never knew anyone to gain the

9Young Woman’s Journal” 16 (1905): 549.
11Journal of Luman Andrus Shurtleff,” p. 19, typescript of journal in Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah; hereafter referred to as BYU Special Collections.
12Autobiography of Jonathan Crosby,” pp. 13–14, holograph, Library–Archives, Historical Department of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah; hereafter referred to as Church Archives.

177
advantage over him, yet he was always kind and kept the good will of his playmates.”  

Some non-Mormons, however, remembered Joseph as bad-tempered. Michael Morse, later a brother-in-law, said he recalled that when Joseph was courting Emma some of her brothers were ill-disposed toward him “and took occasion to annoy and vex him.” Finally, Joseph had had enough and “threw off his coat and proposed to defend himself.”

Luke Johnson, a Church member, said that when a certain man who had grown up with Joseph came to Kirtland as a minister of another denomination, the man displayed bad manners. After staying overnight at the Prophet’s home, he called Joseph a “hypocrite and imposter.” Luke Johnson reported that Joseph “covered the minister’s ears with both hands and kicked him out with his foot.”

Peter H. Burnett, who was Joseph’s lawyer in Missouri, and later governor of California, said he attended a meeting in which a certain John McDaniel said publicly that he did not believe in Joseph’s ability to prophesy. The next day, a Sabbath, when Joseph rose to speak he was enraged and said “nobody could slander him in that way, and that if the brethren present would not do something about it he would.”

Again, however, there were those who saw Joseph quite differently. Daniel Tyler, a member, told of a time in Kirtland when William Smith—Joseph’s brother—and some others openly challenged the Prophet’s leadership of the Church, and tempers were hot. Joseph called a special meeting and then opened with prayer, while tears ran down his cheeks. Turning his back so that his sorrow would be less visible, Joseph prayed. Daniel Tyler recorded:

I had heard men and women pray—especially the former—from the most ignorant, both as to letters and intellect, to the most learned and eloquent, but never until then had I heard a man address his maker as though he was present, listening as a kind father would listen to the sorrows of a dutiful child. [The prayer] was in behalf of those who accused him of having gone astray and fallen into sin, that the Lord would forgive them and open their eyes that they might see aright. . . . There was no ostentation, no raising of the voice as by enthusiasm, but a plain conversational tone, as a man would address a present friend. . . . It was the crown of all the prayers I had ever heard.

---

14"Newel Knight’s Journal." Scraps of Biography, Tenth Book of the Faith-Promoting Series (Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor Office. 1883). p. 46.
17Peter H. Burnett, An Old California Pioneer (Oakland: Biobooks. 1946), p. 34.
In his treatment of others, some nonmembers thought Joseph abrupt, even rude. William A. West, a visitor to Kirtland, said he went toward the temple one day and saw Joseph talking with several of the brethren. They were “talking bank, money, steam mills and so on, and the Prophet was very busy.” West said that Joseph finally broke away, but then another man caught up with him and asked to speak with him for a moment longer. In frustration Joseph exclaimed, “‘O God, I wish I were translated’” and walked away grumbling that “everyone wanted to speak with him for just a minute.”

At an outdoor meeting in Nauvoo, Joseph was upset when the congregation was distracted by a flock of geese that flew over while he was giving his address. He stopped his sermon and walked off the stand, saying, “‘If you are more interested in the quak [sic] of a flock of geese than in what I am saying it’s all right!’”

There are several stories that render an entirely different view of Joseph. Emma recalled to her son, Joseph III, how often the elders sought out the Prophet and how much he enjoyed their company. She said to her son: “‘Well Joseph . . . I do not expect you can do much more in the garden than your father would, and I never wanted him to go into the garden to work for if he did it would not be fifteen minutes before there would be three or four, or sometimes a dozen men round him and they would tramp the ground faster than he would hoe it up.’”

Sister Jane S. Richards said emphatically that Joseph took “a personal interest in all his people.” A story which seems to support this is told with regard to his last days in Nauvoo. During a heavy rain some members of the Nauvoo Legion had been out all night on patrol, looking for mobbers that threatened the city. When his men rode in at dawn, foot-sore and tired, Joseph was waiting for them and began inquiries about their work. After a time he noticed that one of the men had bled on a log where they were sitting, and Joseph found that the man’s shoes were worn to ribbons and his feet badly cut. Looking further, he found others in the same condition. He

---

21 Emma Smith to Joseph Smith III, 1 August, n.d., but after 1847, in the Emma Bidamon Papers, Library–Archives, the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, the Auditorium, Independence, Mo.; hereafter referred to as RLDS Church Archives.
22 Reminiscences of Mrs. F. D. Richards,” p. 11, holograph, Hubert Howe Bancroft Library, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, Calif.
immediately invited the men to his store for a new pair of shoes. When the storekeeper told him there were no shoes but only expensive boots, Joseph said, "'Let them have boots then.'" 23

Another story provides further support. While Joseph was conversing with some of the brethren, near his home in Nauvoo, a man came up who said that his home had just been burned down by a mob. Joseph took out five dollars, looked at the other men, and said, "'I feel sorry for this brother to the amount of five dollars; how much do you feel sorry?'" 24

Not only have some of the Prophet's critics said Joseph was rude to strangers, they have even affirmed that he was contemptuous toward his father. Isaac Hale said that Joseph was "'very sassy and insolent toward his father.'" 25 Yet a story which Joseph Knight, an early Church member, relates suggests a bond of love between Joseph and his father. When the Prophet saw Martin Harris and Joseph Smith Senior baptized, he was almost overcome with emotion. Joseph Knight related: "'Joseph was filled with the spirit to a great degree to see his father and Mr. Harris that had been with him so much [baptized]. He burst out with . . . joy and appeared to want to get out of sight of everybody and would sob and cry and after a while he came in, but he was the most wrought that I have ever seen any man.'" 26

The author of the History of Wayne County, New York, said he had heard reports that indicated Joseph was taciturn unless spoken to. 27 Daniel Hendrix, however, remembered that Joseph had a "'jovial, easy, I-don't-care way about him that made him a lot of friends.'" Hendrix said "'he was a good talker, and would have made a fine stump speaker, if he had the training.'" 28 Peter H. Burnett said that in "'conversation he was slow, and used too many words to express his ideas, and would not generally go directly to the point.'" Burnett affirmed that Joseph was an "'awkward but vehement speaker.'" 29 Yet Christopher Crary, a non-Mormon, said "'His language, so far as I was qualified to judge, was correct, forcible, and right to the point and convincing.'" 30 Wandle Mace said the Prophet

24Ibid., p. 22.
25E. D. Howe, Mormonism Unveiled, p. 263.
28Saint Louis Globe Democrat, 21 February 1897, p. 34.
was "very interesting and eloquent in speech,"31 while Job Smith said he was "powerful in invective and occasionally sarcastic."32

A Universalist minister who met Joseph complained that he disliked the Prophet's "swagger and brag."33 But David Whitmer, close friend of the Prophet, said that when he first met Joseph "he was a very humble and meek man."34

There is another discrepancy between the Wayne County historian who said that Joseph was "never known to laugh"35 and Congressman Elisha Potter who said that the Prophet had "a keen wit."36 And still another between Benjamin F. Johnson who said that no man made greater mistakes in his choice of associates than did Joseph,37 and Peter H. Burnett who said that Joseph was a good judge of men.38

A resident of Kirtland, Sam Brown, claimed that near the end of the Mormon stay in Kirtland he was unwilling to lend more money to Joseph for fear he would not get it back.39 Christopher Crary, on the other hand, said that Joseph was always scrupulously honest in paying debts owed to Crary.40 While temporarily estranged from the Prophet following the failure of the Kirtland Safety Society Bank, Apostle Parley P. Pratt accused Joseph of charging "extortionary prices" for three lots of land.41 David Osborne, however, said that on another occasion Joseph was very upset at some of the rich brethren who bought government land cheaply and resold it in small lots to the poor for a high price. He said Joseph was not pleased with such conduct.42 Whatever the matter at hand regarding Joseph Smith, one can find contradictory testimony.

With so much that is controversial about the Prophet, how does the historian go about finding the truth? How does he separate fact from fiction? To start with, let us consider the matter of Joseph's appearance and the initial impressions he made upon people. In trying

32 "Diary of Job Smith," p. 6, holograph, Henry E. Huntington Library, San Marino, Calif.
33 W. S. B. was a Universalist who visited Nauvoo in 1844. See the Universalist Union, 27 April 1844, p. 393.
34 Deseret News, 16 August 1878.
35 History of Wayne County, p. 150.
36 Mulder and Mortensen, Among the Mormons, p. 134.
37 "An Interesting Letter from Benjamin F. Johnson to George F. Gibbs," p. 17, typescript, BYU Special Collections.
42 Juvenile Instructor 27 (15 March 1892): 173.
to assess Daniel Hendrix's remarks about how destitute Joseph looked, we must keep several things in mind. Daniel Hendrix was eighty-seven years old when he was interviewed as to his recollections of Joseph Smith, and it is difficult to determine how accurate his memory might have been. He indicates that Joseph was habitually dressed in old, tattered clothes. This seems possible in these years, for we know that the Smith family was having a hard time financially. Yet, on the other hand, some of the things Hendrix says are not born out by other facts that are firmly established. He says Joseph was lazy, but this is contradicted by other testimony from the period when Joseph was in Palmyra; it is also contradicted by much direct evidence that comes from a later period. Consequently, one must be careful with an account like Hendrix's, written at a time when it was popular to say disparaging things about Joseph Smith.

It is significant, I think, that when Parley P. Pratt described Joseph in 1830 he said nothing of what Joseph wore but indicated his general size, complexion, and personality. When Parley P. Pratt told us Joseph was a person his eye rested upon with interest, he was saying that he responded affirmatively to Joseph and that he was more interested in his character and personality than in his outward appearance. This would appear to be characteristic of a follower. Bathsheba Smith, a Church member, remembered that Joseph's hair was "pretty" but said nothing about his clothing. One might surmise from this oversight that Joseph's apparel was not unusual so far as Bathsheba was concerned. When Charles Francis Adams saw Joseph as rather careless in his personal appearance, he was probably judging him by the standards of the Boston elite, not by western standards.

When it comes to Joseph's treatment of others, the negative evidence often seems biased. Isaac Hale remembered that Joseph was unkind to his father. But one must ask, how many times did Isaac Hale see Joseph with his father? It could not have been many. Lucy Mack Smith reports only two occasions Joseph and his father were together in Harmony, Pennsylvania. Thus Isaac Hale may have

---


44 "Journal of Newel Knight," p. 46; and Orlando Saunders to William H. Kelly, Saints Herald 28 (1 June 1881): 165. Joseph's history cites several occasions where he worked in the fields with the elders, or on the temple, etc., while William Walker says on many a day Joseph cut hay in Nauvoo for ten-hour stretches (Life Incidents and Travels of Elder William Holmes Walker [1943], p. 8).

45 Smith, History of Joseph Smith, pp. 93, 133.
made a broad generalization based on a few brief encounters. Other evidence suggests strongly that throughout most of his life Joseph went out of his way to care for his father, that he loved him deeply. If there were some temporary estrangement between them in 1825, when Isaac Hale knew them, there is no evidence it continued. Isaac Hale’s purpose when he wrote his affidavit for Hurlbut in 1833 was to discredit Joseph. He was angry about Mormonism in general, and about Joseph’s moving away with his daughter. His assertion therefore cannot be taken at face value.

There is enough evidence from what Joseph’s friends have said, and from admissions by the Prophet himself, however, to make it evident that he did have a temper. One of his most intimate friends, Benjamin F. Johnson, said Joseph “would allow no arrogance or undue liberties; and criticisms, even by his associates, were rarely acceptable; and contradictions would arouse in him the lion, at once.”

46 We know from newspaper accounts and court records that Joseph was involved in more than one fight. Yet the evidence is plentiful that he had to be provoked by direct insult before he would resort to any use of violence. We must remember it was customary in this period of American history for direct confrontations and even duels to be fought over personal differences. Andrew Jackson, Henry Clay, and Senator Thomas Hart Benton, to name but three, were involved in duels to protect their honor, or public image. 47 Many a frontier preacher took to brawling when heckled from the crowd. This was a rough age by our standards. As for Joseph, we know that he did not relish fighting, that he felt deep remorse over it. He told Allen Stout in Nauvoo on one occasion that he had been too quarrelsome at times, that “in his youth he had learned to fight much against his will,” and “whenever he laid his hand in anger on a fellow creature it gave him sorrow and a feeling of shame.”

48 Apparently Joseph sought repentance in this area.

Nonetheless, evidence of his temper does not offset the many examples we have of his general tendency to treat people with courtesy and consideration. Peter H. Burnett said in this regard: “There was a kind, familiar look about him, that pleased you. He was very courteous in discussion, admitting what he did not intend to controvert, and would not oppose you abruptly but had due deference to your feelings.”

49

---

46 “Benjamin F. Johnson to George F. Gibbs,” p. 4.
If the occasion in Kirtland when he dismissed the plea of the elder for another minute of his time is accurately reported, it would not be sufficient evidence by itself of his general impatience or lack of consideration. He may have been extremely tired or under pressure to start working upon something else. All of us have had such moments when our patience runs thin.

Negative or positive impressions about Joseph’s language and manners are, again, dependent upon who is doing the observing. Joseph was not nor did he pretend to be an educated man. Still, his skills seem suitable for his time and place. This was an age when Andrew Jackson reached the White House, and Jackson was neither polished nor educated.

So far as the Prophet’s sense of humor goes, the Wayne County historian says Joseph was “good natured,” thus contradicting himself on this point. We have an example of Joseph’s humor preserved for us by Willard Richards, who said that one day Joseph told him he was going to “study in some law books and become a great lawyer.” It might have been that Emma had been encouraging his studying law, for she told her son, Joseph III, after the Prophet’s death that Joseph would have avoided many legal entanglements had he known more about the law. In any case, on the occasion described by Willard Richards, Joseph’s way of studying “was to put his head down on the law book and fall asleep.” Willard Richards said that “he went to snoring.”50 Joseph did not think much of lawyers, which was a widely held attitude in the early nineteenth century.

On the question raised by Parley P. Pratt and Sam Brown on the matter of Joseph’s financial integrity, Professor Larry Wimmer of the Economics Department, Keith Rooker, then of the law school, and I have spent several years in research.51 The financial issue was the subject of much controversy at the time and still is among a few historians. Many accused Joseph of reckless speculation and even financial fraud. They maintained that the Prophet had imprudently invested in land and charged exhorbitant prices for it, that he had established an illegal bank with intent to print worthless currency and exchange it for valuable goods, that he ran up an enormous debt and fled from Kirtland to avoid paying it. We found that these charges were made on insufficient evidence and without an understanding of the economic forces operating in Kirtland. It is true the Prophet bought land in Kirtland and resold it, but Kirtland land prices were

---

50See Joseph Smith’s Journal kept by Willard Richards, 18 March 1843, MS, Church Archives.
not out of line with the general demand for land, not with land prices in nearby communities. Joseph had large debts as a result of his business transactions, but he also had large assets with which he could have paid his debts, had the economy not collapsed. Joseph started his bank to transfer landed wealth into ready capital and, had he been able to secure a charter from the state legislature, he could have established a modest but successful bank. But in 1836–37, for political and economic reasons, the state legislature granted no new charters for banks, and Joseph had to improvise. He set up an anti-banking society that was in fact a simple corporation with note-issuing powers. He may have acted on bad legal advice here, but similar banks were being established elsewhere in the state at this time.52 The number of currency notes issued were not nearly as many as critics have said, and when Joseph learned that the notes would not circulate at face value he withdrew his support from the bank. Joseph sustained larger personal losses here than did any other person, so that in no sense did he risk other people’s money where he would not risk his own. Joseph was a capitalist, but an honest one. When he reached Nauvoo, he tried to settle many of his Kirtland debts.

Careful historical research can help us to understand why the Prophet did many things and can offset the negative interpretations some try to impose. The existence of such contradictory evidence, however, should make us hesitate to jump to hasty or unwarranted conclusions or to claim definitiveness for historical studies that are more in the nature of interim reports.

If a look at the human side of Joseph Smith seems at times somewhat unflattering, it comes from no desire to diminish him. It comes rather from the belief that at times in the Church we tend to expect too much of him, to ask him to be more than human in everything he did. This may lead to some disillusionment, if occasionally we find that he did not measure up to all our expectations. The early Saints usually avoided that kind of mistake. Brigham Young said of Joseph: “Though I admitted in my feelings and knew all the time that Joseph was a human being and subject to err, still it was none of my business to look after his faults.”53 Brigham chose to stress the positive side.

Parley P. Pratt said that Joseph was “like other men, as the prophets and apostles of old, liable to errors and mistakes which were

52Crazy, Pioneer & Personal Reminiscenses, p. 37.
not inspired from heaven, but managed by . . . [his] own judgment.""\(^{54}\)

These brethren knew Joseph as a man with human weaknesses, yet they believed in his divine calling and in his greatness. It seemed to them that what he had achieved as a prophet far outweighed his imperfections. In the long run their love of him and their faith in his calling were decisive in shaping their lives. Seeing Joseph in his various moods, they still called him a prophet of God. That seems to me to be the right attitude for a Latter-day Saint. I do not like to see potentially good Church members alienated when they find that Joseph had human limitations. There are certain nonmembers who would try to take advantage of these for their own purposes. But the faithful will see the Lord's will at work in his Church, even though He must effect that will by the means of earthen vessels. Aware of some things earthen in Joseph, Benjamin F. Johnson still had this to say of him: "From my early youth to the day of his martyrdom I was closely associated with the Prophet Joseph Smith, was his trusted friend and business partner, his relative, and bosom friend. And I knew him as the purest, the truest and noblest of many men."\(^{55}\)

Joseph said of himself, "I do not, nor never have pretended to be any other than a man, subject to passion and liable without the assisting grace of the Saviour, to deviate from that perfect path in which all are commanded to walk."\(^{56}\) He also said: "God is my friend, in him I shall find comfort. I have given my life unto his hands. I am prepared to go at his call and desire to be with Christ. I count not my life dear to me only to do his will."\(^{57}\) And he said: "The Lord does reveal himself to me. I know it."\(^{58}\)

Those who would understand the Prophet must give consideration to his spiritual side as well as his human side. It was his strong commitment to things spiritual which made him so aware of his human failings, so desirous to overcome his weaknesses and to give his all to the work of the Lord.

---

\(^{54}\)Elders Journal 1 (July, 1838): 50.

\(^{55}\)Benjamin F. Johnson, "Mormonism as an Issue: An Open Letter to the Editor of the Arizona Republican," n.d.

\(^{56}\)Latter-day Saints Messenger and Advocate 1 (December, 1834): 40.

\(^{57}\)Joseph Smith to Emma Smith, 6 June 1832, Joseph Smith Letters Collection, RLDS Church Archives.

\(^{58}\)Quoted in the New York Spectator, 23 September 1843.
Openings

Orson Scott Card

He came from agony to us,
It was our pain etched on the body he had left
Fastened to the cross,
But as he touched the key to the lock
And opened up our dark prison
Only light was in his smile,
And he named us all his own.

Then we followed him to grass-tipped rocks
Where many long-shed bodies waited.
He slipped into one dark tomb,
Into the white shroud,
Into the reawakened flesh,
And as the prison filled with light
We sang, and rolled away the stone.
A Prayer for Faith

Karen Mikkelsen

Approaching Thee, I am too circumspect. By turning first toward man, whose lesser sight Is limited to a mere terrestrial span, I refract into many light of One, Diminishing Thy glory. Through a glass I let, eclipsed, Thy Godhood darkly pass. A crown of thorns but dimly can predict The scintillating corona whose light In piercing magnitude reveals to man The glory of the resurrected Son. Ah, let Thy mercy melt the sounding brass To change my heart from sod to sea of glass.

Karen Mikkelsen is a poet residing in New Haven, Connecticut.
A New Direction in Language Testing: Concern for the One

Harold S. Madsen

Doth he not leave the ninety and nine, . . . and seeketh that which is gone astray? (Matthew 18:12)

An impressive LDS filmstrip for teachers entitled ‘‘The One’’ reminds us of the pitfall in thinking too exclusively of the quorum or class and in a story line about a handicapped girl focuses on the uniqueness of each individual. The implication is that reaching the one requires, for many of us, a new perspective. In the area of second-language instruction and testing, a combination of influences is beginning to provide such a perspective in an increasing concern for the individual student. This is reflected both in the professional literature and in our Church institutions as well.

INFLUENCES GENERATING CONCERN FOR THE INDIVIDUAL

Psychological Studies

Cognitive-style research attempts to identify the various ways individuals conceptualize and structure their environment; and closely related to this are investigations of learning-style differences including modality preference (such as aural and visual), tempo (ranging from reflective to impulsive), and problem-solving strategies. Varying learning styles have been found to differ in efficiency and to relate in some ways to differences in personality. Recent studies reveal a need for ‘‘alternate methods to match the educational

---

Harold S. Madsen, Brigham Young University professor of Teaching English as a Second Language (TESL), has published widely in the field of language testing and affect. 


cognitive styles of different students"—as many as five or six for a heterogeneous group of about thirty students.5 Such studies appear also to have implication for test writers. One small example is the discovery that persons differing in learning style likewise vary in their ability to handle narrowly-spaced and broadly-spaced multiple-choice options on exams.6 In brief, current research supports the idea that individuals are unique in both their perceptions and learning styles.

The humanistic movement in psychology and language teaching also has contributed to this new emphasis on the individual. One reason is that humanists are interested in the total person, not simply the intellect. As in the voluminous literature on motivation,7 the interaction of emotions and intellect is closely examined. It has been shown, for example, that learning is significantly enhanced when students see the relevance of what they are studying to their personal lives.8 In fact, Rapaport holds that memory is intimately related to the emotional response of the learner.9 Humanistic instruction therefore strives to provide a blend (or "confluence," as educators label it) of the cognitive and the affective. One manifestation of this is communicative competence instruction, so fashionable this decade, in which the emphasis has shifted from mere linguistic accuracy to verbal exchanges that are socially appropriate, relevant, usually true, and hopefully of some importance to those communicating. Since humanistic education is concerned not only with increased language

---


2 Sperry, Learning Performance, p. 111. Complementing the research being conducted on cognitive styles, learning styles, and personality styles are related investigations into instructional styles (see Frederic J. Bosco and Robert J. DiPietro, "Instructional Strategies: Their Psychological and Linguistic Bases," in Toward a Cognitive Approach to Second-Language Acquisition, ed. Robert C. Lugton and Charles H. Heinle [Philadelphia: The Center for Curriculum Development, 1971], pp. 31–32). In addition, the interaction between learning styles and teaching styles is being systematically studied. A positive interaction is predicted when the learners encounter an approach matching their own characteristics (see Ellis, Fundamentals of Human Learning, p. 288).


4 Beverly Galyean, "Language from Within: A Handbook of Teaching Strategies for Personal Growth and Self Reflection in the Language Classes" (Santa Barbara, Calif.: Confluent Education Development and Research Center, 1976); see also Steвечik, Memory, Meaning, and Method, pp. 38–40.

proficiency but also with the many facets of personal growth, its content ranges from the academic to exploration of values, development of aesthetic sensitivity, improvement of self-image, and achievement of a greater capacity to relate effectively with others.

During this decade there has been a dramatic increase of interest in value exploration—much of it well before Watergate. Along with this, there has been a growing awareness of the limitations of measurable behavioral objectives (still prominent in the Competency-Based Teacher Education Movement) as well as the limitations of experimental research and of language examinations themselves. This perspective recalls the factors that transcend acquisition of knowledge or skills, in a variety of disciplines, ranging from the psychological readiness required in an athletic contest to the inspiration sought for in composing a piece of music.
Underpinning humanistic educational concepts is Maslow's humanistic psychology with its principle of self-actualization. But even more prominent in language teaching throughout this decade are concepts from cognitive psychology and transformational grammar. Rejecting the behaviorists' position that learning is simply a matter of conditioning or the "formation of habits through responses to outside stimuli," proponents of cognitive psychology espouse a mentalist theory, indicating that effective language acquisition comes from meaningful learning and that it is a rule-governed, creative process.

Broad acceptance of such concepts has contributed to the shift in emphasis from the teacher to the learner.

*Shifts in Language Teaching Methodology*

Another influence has been the trend away from traditional audio-lingual methodology with its heavy emphasis on repetitive drills designed to develop automatic responses and language habits. In its place have appeared cognitive modifications as well as cognitively-oriented methodologies that attempt to tap the learner's innate capacity to acquire language. Lozanov's Suggestology attempts to increase fluency and the rate of learning through "hypernesia" by removing anxiety-producing psychological barriers. Gattegno's Silent Way seeks to promote self-reliance and personal initiative by reducing the teacher's verbal input and allowing time for reflection.

Perhaps the best example is Curran's Counseling Learning which, like humanistic education, aims at strengthening the entire individual by developing learner initiative, interaction among students, and mutual respect between teachers and learners as well as increased self-worth. And a teaching approach developed by

---


Walter Gong of San Jose State University and promoted at Brigham Young University, particularly in the College of Humanities, is designed to educate an individual in the broadest sense:

We must lead the student into the application of what he has been taught to the realities of life and the expanding of the central point by the relation of it to everything that he already knows and has experienced. Our job as teachers cannot end with the mere teaching of facts; our job cannot end until we have led our learners to relate our facts to principles and to the total organisms that are themselves. Thus their lives will be blessed by growth and movement toward understanding; and the lives of their wives, husbands, children, and friends will be blessed by an expansion of comprehension.19

With emphases such as these, contemporary methods and approaches are unmistakably contributing to our contemporary focus on the learner.20

NATIONAL TRENDS IN LANGUAGE TESTING

Preparing Tests to Meet Special Needs

How, then, does this translate into language evaluation? Basically, we have moved in the direction of lifelike language in a test form designed for nonnative speakers of the language.

A broad brush stroke representation of language testing trends in recent decades shows it moving in the 1940s and 1950s from a long period of largely intuitive test making (ranging from grammatical parsing and labeling to translation, essay, and précis writing) into a scientific era, during which "less attention was paid to what was tested than to how it was tested."21 While earlier tests often required analysis of the language, the newer objective measures typically required mastery of discrete segments of the language, such as the correct grammatical phrase, vowel sound, or lexical item in a series of unrelated sentences. But now during the communicative era of testing, we generally seek fuller contextualization and a closer approximation of real-life situations. This means an increased use of tests

---


measuring actual performance such as conversational competence or note taking; these involve simultaneously not only the processing of grammar, lexis, and phonology but also coping with fluency, semantic sensitivity and possibly social appropriateness as well. While multiple-choice language exams still exist, test writers tailor these carefully for nonnative speakers. For example, distractors are drawn from foreign student compositions or exercises, and native-speaker errors (such as, "she might of told him") are avoided.

Reducing redundancy in a prose passage has been found to be a very effective device in differentiating between native and nonnative language ability. Experimental forms include a noise test consisting of dictated sentences overlaid with "white" or "pink" electronic noise that partially obscures inflections.22 Another is "gapped listening"—a tape-recorded reading or news broadcast from which portions are deleted at regular intervals. Students take notes and then answer questions based on the original tape. A third is the Integrative Grammar Test—dictated sentences replete with assimilation, contraction, and reduction. Students are asked to write out the full form of the second word they hear in each item. For example, after listening to "Wouldja like-im to help-ya?" they would write you in the blank.

In addition to those experimental forms previously mentioned, there are other reduced redundancy tests in wide use: One is the traditional dictation, now used with one or two modifications. The passage is first read without pauses and at normal speed. Then it is read a second time at normal speed but with pauses for students to write down what they have heard. Very important is the length of the phrases dictated—about five to nine words per phrase group. A brisk third reading without pauses provides for some proofreading. Punctuation can be given and misspellings ignored. To provide consistency in scoring, all errors are weighted the same. More popular still is the cloze test. This powerful instrument consists of a prose passage from which words are deleted at random intervals, typically every seventh word. From the remaining context, students are required to

---

22Both "white" and "pink" noise can be described electronically and metaphorically: "White noise sounds like this: sh/sh/sh/sh/sh. It's simply random frequencies at random amplitudes, the basic kind of noise that you hear in back of radio broadcasts. It's called white because it has the same characteristics as white light, that is, all frequencies are represented at random. I guess pink noise is just a little more regular in frequency." (Randall L. Jones and Bernard Spolsky, Testing Language Proficiency [Arlington, Va.: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1975], p. 70.) White noise is generated electronically utilizing the same amount of energy per cycle segment; pink noise, also generated electronically, utilizes the same amount of energy per octave. White noise is a hissing sound like escaping air from a tire; pink noise is a low rumbling sound like the wind noise in a microphone (and in the same frequency as the speech range).
supply the missing words, as one does automatically in real-life situations, for example, when conversing in a noisy department store or in an air terminal. Variations include selected deletion (with only function words omitted, for example) or multiple-choice cloze. The dictation as outlined here and particularly the cloze procedure provide excellent measures of general language proficiency.\(^{23}\)

In addition to tailoring language exams for nonnatives, test writers are now fashioning a rich variety of evaluation instruments to accommodate the many limitations and special objectives of second-language learners. For children, who would probably be intimidated by or unable to cope with standard paper-and-pencil tests, there are attractive picture tests that can be individually administered in a relaxed conversational manner.\(^{24}\) Many of these can also be used as bilingual tests to assess language dominance. For adults with limited language skills, one can use an oral test with picture cues (for example, the Ilyin Oral Interview\(^ {23}\)) or such measures as a listening test with printed native-language options.\(^ {26}\) Besides standard reading tests, multiple-choice cloze is now available for evaluating a skill like reading, when only passive recognition is required.\(^ {27}\) For advanced students seeking admission to American universities, there are sophisticated test batteries such as the TOEFL or MTEL (Test of English as a Foreign Language and Michigan Test of English Language Proficiency). For highly trained civil servants whose oral communication skills need evaluating, there is the remarkably adaptable FSI test (Foreign Service Institute Oral Interview). And there are tests for language acquisition research,\(^ {28}\) for translators (Translation Evaluation Program), and even for group evaluation of student speaking skills.\(^ {29}\)


The Concern over Bias

Perhaps the most dramatic concern for the individual is manifested in the widespread desire to eliminate all forms of bias from educational tests, particularly language exams. Reflecting older complaints that IQ tests measure language maturity more than native intelligence, various critics are assailing the widespread bias in standardized educational tests. Houts, for example, marshals a formidable array of educators and researchers who assert that present-day educational tests exacerbate social inequities by stigmatizing children instead of reducing these inequities by encouraging a modification of the curriculum to "meet variations in interests, talents, backgrounds."30 In their meticulously documented book, Oller and Perkins together with other researchers note the content similarity in achievement batteries, intelligence tests, personality inventories, and language proficiency tests. Then, through statistical analysis, they demonstrate that language proficiency is "a major variable" in the tests evaluated (accounting for .58 to .88 of the variance in the subscores of the California Achievement Test, for example). These writers conclude that, even for native speakers, tests that purportedly measure intelligence or achievement or personality may primarily be measuring language proficiency. Nonnative speakers are therefore in real danger of being improperly evaluated by such instruments:

It is obvious that the student who speaks and understands the language variety of the test will have an advantage over the student who is more familiar with a different variety. That is, the tests are clearly biased against speakers of non-majority varieties of English.31

So great has the concern become over possible inequities of this kind that legal actions have been taken to protect the rights of minority groups in America. The most dramatic was the 1974 U.S. Supreme Court decision in the Lau v. Nichols case. The Court decided in favor of a class action suit filed on behalf of 1,800 Chinese-speaking students in San Francisco who were allegedly denied equal educational opportunities. Rejecting the school board's "English only" policy, the majority opinion reasoned that under California's state-imposed standards—


31Oller and Perkins, Language in Education, p. 34; see also pp. 33, 94.
There is no equality of treatment by providing students with the same facilities, textbooks, teachers, and curriculum; for students who do not understand English are effectively foreclosed from any meaningful education. . . . Imposition of a requirement that, before a child can effectively participate in the educational program, he must already have acquired those basic [English] skills is to make a mockery of public education. 32

Congress subsequently funded nine General Assistance Centers to help schools meet the needs of students with limited or no proficiency in English. As a result, public schools are now being assisted to provide unbiased evaluation of nonnative English speakers. And appropriate testing has become an important concern, particularly language dominance assessment and evaluation design.

Similar actions preceded and followed the Lau case. In 1972, the Supreme Court focused on testing that places students in classes for the educable mentally retarded (EMR). The Court determined that the tests were culturally and socio-economically biased, and it ordered that the students be evaluated by unbiased instruments. When retested with unbiased instruments, two-thirds of the Black students tested out of EMR into regular classes. 33 Also recognizing the limited language proficiency of many immigrants and minority groups, Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 "mandated employers to cease the use of test results to discriminate among potential employees if and when job relatedness could not be established." 34 In recent years, court cases and legislation on tests with language bias have increased. These actions are intended to eliminate bias in a variety of ways, such as freeing children of faulty and stigmatizing labels (for example, "mentally retarded") or halting the practice of educational "streaming" into inappropriate programs. But the broader purpose of these legal actions related to language testing is to preserve individual rights not only in the area of citizenship and voting but also in the realms of education, employment, and human dignity. 35

Cultural bias of another sort is being examined by educators. A Korean teacher of English recently disclosed that in 1976 he took the prestigious TOEFL (Test of English as a Foreign Language), for those seeking to enter an American university. On the listening section, he


was asked questions related to a passage on American literature. Having studied this subject extensively, he performed extremely well, receiving a total score of 623 (a score of 500 would have admitted him into most American universities). After teaching English for two years, he once again took the TOEFL. But this time he encountered a passage on European literature and another on a scientific topic. Though well grounded in Oriental history and the arts, he knew little about the two exam subjects. Consequently, he scored significantly lower than the first time, receiving a total of only 580, or a drop of close to 40 points. Since the TOEFL is a language proficiency test and not a test of general knowledge, such fluctuations reveal a potential cultural bias of alarming proportions.

Also it has been disclosed recently that certain reading comprehension tests evaluate cultural knowledge as well as language proficiency and "thereby discriminate against ESL (English as a Second Language) students"; several tests contain ten to fifteen percent biased items. Consider the following examples from various reading tests:

"There are red and white stripes and white stars in our flag. Our flag contains one . . . for every state.
(a) stripe (b) star . . .

"The French regarded potatoes like most Canadians regard:
(a) spinach (b) tomatoes (c) horsemeat (d) margarine
[note: In the story the French dislike potatoes.]

"Sam won at marbles because he could . . . straighter than Bill.
(a) show (b) shoot (c) draw (d) run

"The Yankee peddler traded as far west as the Mississippi and as far south as Louisiana. He operated . . .
(a) over most of the country (b) as far south as Louisiana . . .

"Pam went to the party with a tall pointed black hat, long black cape and a broom. She was dressed as a . . .
(a) witch (b) ghost (c) cowgirl (d) pumpkin

"Bill ran out on his front porch to watch the firetruck. He lives in
(a) a big apartment (b) a city house (c) a trailer . . . ."\textsuperscript{38}

\textsuperscript{38}Oryang Kwon, personal interview, Provo, Utah, February 1980.
\textsuperscript{40}Ibid.
An illustration is provided by a prominent language-testing specialist who evaluated the Wepman Auditory Discrimination Test:

As a part Mohawk Indian, I have been trained never to trust a stranger behind my back in a small room. This sort of thing is frequently true of American Indians, Blacks, and Chicanos. Since the test administrator (tall, big, authoritative, and threatening) stands behind the children during the test (presumably to avoid lip cues), I wonder how valid the results are with groups who have been culturally trained not to allow a threatening figure to get behind them.

Very recently test bias has even been found in the very form that language tests take, specifically in integrative and discrete-point formats. We recall that integrative tests require the processing of several language components simultaneously, as on dictation or essay tests, while a discrete-point test focuses on one language component at a time, as on a multiple-choice grammar test. Farhady suggests that all-discrete-point or all-integrative tests discriminate against students of some nationalities. For example, in one study, students from Israel and France scored significantly higher on an integrative placement test than on a parallel discrete-point test. But students from Taiwan and Korea scored significantly higher on the discrete-point form. Farhady also suggests the possibility of a sex bias related to test form.

Still another concern is that of eliminating random bias related to the administration and scoring of language examinations. For instance, on oral tests, examiners that speak the native language of an examinee sometimes subconsciously overlook certain errors simply because they encounter these so frequently in the classroom, while errors made by others may be looked at more critically. Moreover, listening tests administered in large rooms where the sound reverberates can result in a weaker showing than normal for students with even minor hearing disabilities. And a number of researchers have investigated the techniques for scoring cloze tests that provide the most valid measure of general language proficiency.

LANGUAGE TESTING IN THE CHURCH

In a variety of interesting ways, language testing in the institutions of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints reflects or transcends secular concerns for the individual. Testing is seen not only as a means of evaluation but also as an aid to motivation and personal improvement. For example, in one Church operation, posters have blossomed recently which quote Elder Thomas S. Monson's observation that "when performance is measured, performance improves. When performance is measured and reported, the rate of improvement accelerates." 

Language Interests for Special Needs in the Church.

In addition, language tests are being developed for more specialized purposes than ever before. BYU utilizes, of course, the usual EFL tests that screen foreign-language applicants to the university, plus tests for placing matriculated students needing further English training and tests for nonmatriculated people in intensive ESL courses. Besides these, the university has prepared examinations in twenty-five foreign languages to enable returned missionaries and others to turn language skills into college credit. Specialized tests are administered not only to missionaries returning from non-English speaking countries but also to prospective missionaries and to missionaries in training. A commercially prepared language aptitude battery is taken by all persons being processed for full-time missions. The Brethren have access to these scores for reference when making missionary assignments.

Missionaries in training are evaluated on five specialized measures. Their foreign language mastery is assessed by means of the

---

42Thomas S. Monson, translation evaluation program poster in Language and Intercultural Resource Center (LIRC), BYU.

43Tests that screen university applicants include the TOEFL and the MTELP as well as the ALIGU, CELT, GCE, etc. Those placing foreign students at the appropriate level include the BYUEPT and the IGT; the Michigan Placement, New Horizons and Win Locator are used for grouping nonmatriculated students. And the BYUEB is used to screen graduate foreign language applicants to the BYU ESL program.

44Students can acquire up to sixteen hours of foreign-language credit on a pass/fail basis with graded credit only at the 201 level. Enrollment in an appropriate upper division course permits the usual letter grade to be assigned for all hours. Students can count this credit toward their General Education Category III requirements. In addition to tests in the usual European and Asian languages, the Foreign Language Achievement Test Series is also administered in languages such as Afrikkans, Aymara, Cakchiquel, Farsi, Indonesian, Samoan, Serbo-Croatian, Tahitian, Tongan, Hebrew, and Thai. These tests are administered to BYU and also non-BYU students if approved by the other institution. (Deborah L. Coon, project coordinator, LIRC, BYU, personal interview, approximately 25 September 1979.)

45The test used is the Modern Language Aptitude Test (MLAT). It is administered weekly at the Missionary Training Center and by stake presidents in outlying areas. The MLAT battery is designed to predict success in learning a foreign language.
U.S. government’s prestigious FSI oral examination. The Discussion Mastery Test (DMT) is administered periodically to check the missionaries’ progress with the basic missionary discussions. This is complemented by the Teaching Skills Evaluation (TSE) that looks at the effectiveness with which the gospel discussions are presented, focusing on the mechanics of the presentation, teaching effectiveness, and missionary spirit. A fourth evaluation is the Final Scriptures Score, tallying the number of discussion-related scriptures that have been mastered. And finally, there is the Speak-Your-Language score, a cumulative self-rating that is recorded daily on a four-point scale; this indicates the degree to which the missionary-in-training uses the target language in daily living.

This elaborate evaluation at the Missionary Training Center is intended to provide not only perspective and incentive for missionaries but also the means of evaluating training and materials.

The Church’s Translation Division also has begun utilizing a variety of highly specialized language measures. One system of evaluation is used for prospective translators of emerging languages (languages in countries where the missionaries are just being introduced) and another for those seeking to translate in the established languages. For translator applicants of emerging languages, a short test called the Translator Screen supplements a personal interview. This integrative test consists of three passages from Church literature that the prospective translator is asked to translate. Because

---

46Missionaries at the Missionary Training Center (MTC), except those studying Serbo-Croatian, are administered the FSI test at the end of the fourth and eighth weeks. Possible scores range from 0 to 5, with 1 constituting “survival-level proficiency” and 5 essentially “native-speaker proficiency.” Upon completing their MTC training, missionaries usually average about 1 to 1+. This points out that while the elders and sisters acquire a rich background in a highly specific religious register, they leave for the mission field with rather limited skills as far as general conversational ability is concerned. Nevertheless, their progress during their brief stint in the MTC is extremely good, by any standard. Ideally, MTC instructors are expected to have an FSI rating of at least 3 in the target language. While the MTC does not report FSI scores to missionaries, it does provide extensive feedback on the nature of each person’s difficulties or strengths. At times, language skills have also been evaluated on a written grammar test. This has recently been suspended, however. (Lane D. Ward, assistant director of training, testing, and zone coordinators, MTC, personal interview, 2 October 1979; Eric Ott, instructional evaluator, MTC, personal interview, 25 October 1979; Cecilia Nihlen, FSI examiner, MTC, personal interview, 2 and 22 October 1979; and Allen C. Ostergar, Jr., director of training, MTC, personal interview, 1980.)

47This twenty-five-minute test covering the eight discussions samples twenty of the fifty-six concepts that have been learned. Discussion pass-off is handled in pairs, with appropriate interaction expected between the two missionaries.

48Translators selected to translate into the varying number (now fifty-four) of emerging languages are presently evaluated less extensively than are those applying to translate into the eighteen established languages—partly because the former translators are often more scarce and partly because the scope of their translations is more limited. They translate packages of materials in phases, starting with Joseph Smith’s testimony, the Gospel Principles manual, Book of Mormon selections, and some basic organizational guidebooks. Translators of established languages deal with material from the entire spectrum of Church operations. (Robert W. Bushman, coordinator of training, LDS Church Translation Division, personal interviews and correspondence, 4 and 8 October 1979, 25 June 1980. Also see Joseph G. Stringham, “The Church and Translation,” Brigham Young University Studies 21 [1981]: 69–90.)
of limited personnel resources in emerging languages, the hiring supervisor, who is not skilled in the language of the prospective translator, checks the faithfulness of the translations by questioning the translator on specific points of the translation and by using back translations. In this manner, the supervisor gains an adequate impression of the translator’s English comprehension skill, background knowledge, and translation skill. Once on the job, emerging language translators double check each other’s work and can assess the appropriateness of a translation’s language for its audience.

Translator applicants of the established languages are very carefully screened. They begin by taking a practice test to familiarize themselves with the format of the comprehensive translator test that follows. The latter consists of an English reading comprehension examination and a translation examination. The test of English comprehension includes a commercial vocabulary and reading exam (the Iowa Silent Reading Test) and a subtest on Church terminology, which simultaneously tests familiarity with Church history, doctrine, and policy. The translation examination requires actual translating of excerpts from Church literature.50 In short, translators are expected to comprehend English well, have a good general background (ranging from Church doctrine and history to cultural understanding and world events), possess effective writing skills in their native language, and demonstrate good transfer skills by finding suitable equivalents in their native language for meanings expressed in English. In addition, they need to have a suitable temperament for their assignment. After a translator is hired, the quality of the translator’s production translations is measured with the same instruments under a program of quality control. Measurements so derived are considered in such personnel management decisions as assignments, salary raises, and promotions.

Factors Complementing or Transcending Language Skills

As in the secular realm, language evaluation in the Church is regarded as an important undertaking—one that often requires a highly specialized design to meet specialized needs and interests. And as we have seen in academia nationally, Church institutions likewise recognize the limitations of such instruments. For example, at Church schools including BYU, admission is based not only on

---

50Examinees translate six passages, 75–100 words each, from the following types of Church writings: general, technical, literary, poetic, and children’s. Three judges independently rate the quality of each translated passage on the basis of faithfulness, clarity, mechanics, and overall value. Results are tabulated and analyzed by three reference groups: the local translation staff, other translators of the geographic region, and translators Churchwide.
academic preparation but also on moral worthiness.\textsuperscript{51} And in screening teachers for overseas Church schools, the Church Educational System is concerned not only with applicants’ academic ability and moral character but also their adaptability and cultural sensitivity.

We can see parallels in the Church missionary program. While language aptitude scores are available on prospective missionaries, it is the inspiration of Church leaders that is the ultimate factor in determining the call. And we have seen that much of the evaluation made of those being prepared for foreign language missions pertains more directly to gospel principles than to language proficiency. We recall, for instance, that one of the criteria for evaluating missionaries’ gospel teaching skills is their spirit. Even though language proficiency is important, the MTC recognizes that it is individual testimony that sparks conversion. While the language component can be measured with considerable accuracy, the most significant attribute of testimony is simply not quantifiable.

Testimony and understanding of gospel principles are also valued in Church translators. Moreover, the four personal qualities sought for in new translators are all extra-linguistic: ability to change, willingness to learn, ability to work with others, and capacity to accept criticism.\textsuperscript{52} Ultimately, then, selection of translators involves assessing not only specialized language skills but also very personal attributes related to gospel understanding and temperament.

It is not surprising, in the light of this discussion, that BYU offers formal coursework in language testing—courses designed to provide skill in developing the sophisticated examinations required nowadays as well as the ability to interpret test results and identify the limitations of language assessment. Moreover, interest in the individual examinee is evidenced in current or recently completed experimental research at BYU: testing studies have focused on the special language

\textsuperscript{51}A confidential statement of the applicant’s moral worthiness is provided by his bishop. A non-LDS applicant is also to be interviewed by a bishop, if one is available, or by a clergyman of his faith. In addition, the applicant commits himself in writing and in the presence of his church leaders as follows: ‘‘I hereby commit myself to do the following while enrolled at BYU if I am admitted or readmitted: (a) Conduct my personal life consistent with the standards of Christian living taught by The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints both on and off campus; (b) Adhere to the other requirements of the attached Code of Honor and Dress and Grooming Standards as defined by the Board of Trustees’’ (BYU Application for Admission and Scholarships, Office of Admissions, BYU). Ethical and moral values receive attention alongside academic subjects. For example, prospective elementary school teachers take a course titled ‘‘Value Clarification in Education,’’ and prospective secondary school teachers are evaluated in part on their ethical and professional behavior (BYU ‘‘Evaluation of Student Teaching Performance’’ form; Eldon H. Puckett, BYU Department of Elementary Education, personal interview, 11 October 1979; and Jeffrey M. Tanner, BYU director of admission, personal interview, 1 October 1979).

\textsuperscript{52}Robert W. Bushman, coordinator of training, LDS Church Translation Division, personal interviews and correspondence, 4 and 8 October 1979, 25 June 1980.
problems faced by American Indians, Japanese, Orientals, and Swedish immigrants to the United States. Other studies have attempted to meet the testing needs of those in developing countries where listening comprehension may be difficult to measure, and of those with very limited second-language proficiency. Finally, some of the most interesting test research related to individual needs is that which studies "affect"—each examinee's emotional reaction to various exam formats. Measurements taken include student perceptions of exam difficulty, level of performance, fairness, relevance to instruction, validity, and amount of anxiety or frustration experienced. These are analyzed in reference to exam type and examinee background. The results of this kind of research promise not only to help improve the accuracy of language measurement but also to reduce test frustration and thereby contribute to an improved climate for language acquisition.

In conclusion, recent secular concern for the total individual, including his or her social-emotional fulfillment, has resulted in language evaluation designed to meet highly specific needs as well as an increased awareness of the limitations inherent in educational assessments and language tests. Understandably, we find in Church institutions a similar concern for the individual. Along with efforts to devise specialized language examinations is an awareness that linguistic skills must be matched by personal and spiritual attributes and that respect for the intellect must be matched by respect for the worth of a soul.

---

54Chie Nishimura, "An Analysis of the Uses of Articles by Japanese Students" (Major paper for the TESL Certificate, BYU, 1980).
55Setsuko Shimizu, "The Difficulties for Oriental Students in Learning English Articles" (Major paper for the TESL Certificate, BYU, 1980).
56Cecilia Nihlen, "Attained English Proficiency by First Generation Swedish Immigrants in Salt Lake City" (Major paper for the TESL Certificate, BYU, 1980).
The Historians Corner

Edited by James B. Allen

Two interesting essays are included in this issue of The Historians Corner. The first is by Steven G. Barnett, an inveterate collector of little-known facts and documents in Mormon history. His discussion of "The Canes of the Martyrdom" clearly demonstrates the love and reverence Joseph Smith's closest associates held for him. But it also provides some significant insight into the nature of some Mormon believers whose devotion to the relics associated with their martyred prophet bordered on veneration.

Our second essay is provided by Florian H. Thayn, head of the Art and Reference Division in the Office of the Architect of the Capitol, in Washington, D.C. Mrs. Thayn had a great deal to do with the historical research involved in the restoration of some of the rooms in the U.S. Capitol building. As a member of the Church, she has also taken an active interest in Mormon historic sites or memorabilia in Washington. Her essay should provide some ideas for Mormon history buffs and tourists who visit the nation's capital, in addition to its basic intrinsic interest.

THE CANES OF THE MARTYRDOM

Steven G. Barnett

Shortly after the martyrdom of the Prophet Joseph Smith in 1844, unusual mementos in his memory—wooden canes—were fashioned from the oak planks of the rough-hewn coffin in which the body was returned to Nauvoo. The history of these mementos—the Canes of the Martyrdom—is elusive, but some conclusions may be drawn from what little solid information can be found.

Steven G. Barnett is a collector of original historical documents.
The canes themselves were given to a small group of the Prophet’s friends. How many canes there were originally, to whom the canes were given, and how many of these canes exist today are matters of pure conjecture. We do know that Willard Richards, Heber C. Kimball, Dimick Huntington, Wilford Woodruff, and probably Brigham Young had such canes. Today, the only authenticated Martyrdom cane carved from the wood of the oak coffins at Carthage known to exist is that of Dimick Huntington. Perhaps those belonging to Heber C. Kimball and Perrigrine Sessions are also still in existence.¹

The Huntington Cane is 33 ½ " long, made from medium brown oak, with a hollowed knob handle containing a lock of Joseph Smith’s hair. Originally, a piece of glass (from the viewing screen of the coffin in which Joseph Smith was laid in state)² covered the hole in the knob, having been affixed to a metal guard placed just inside the top of the cane, but this metal guard has since been broken. The glass is intact, however, still covering the hair it was meant to protect at the base of the knob’s hollowed inside. Just below the knob, there is also a band of metal on the shaft, as well as a metal tip at the base of the cane.³

¹ An undated Church News article entitled “Story of the Cane—Discloses Saga of Pioneers” by Courtney Cortam who interviews Thomas Sessions, a son of Perrigrine Sessions, has been brought to the attention of the author. In this article Thomas Sessions states the following concerning the cane in his possession at that time: “The cane is hardwood. It is made from the wood of the same tree the planks for the prophet’s coffin was made from” (photocopy of this article in collection of author).

² Joseph Smith’s body may have been placed in as many as three different coffins in 1844. These would be the rough oak box he was placed in at Carthage, the outer coffin used while the body lay in state at the Mansion House (which was then filled with bags of sand and buried at the cemetery), and the coffin in which the body was buried secretly in the basement of the Nauvoo House. Perhaps these precautions were taken to protect the bodies from any mutilation that may have been planned by the Prophet’s enemies. (See B. H. Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church, 6 vols. [Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Press, 1965], 2:293.)

³ Oliver Boardman Huntington Journal, MS, Book 18, pp. 62–64. Archives and Manuscripts Department, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo. Under the date of Monday, 8 March 1897, Huntington writes (original spelling and punctuation retained throughout this article):

I had with me a cane made of the rough box hastily nailed together into which the body of Prophet Joseph Smith was placed after he was murdered and brought to Nauvoo from Carthage.

In the top of the cane was a lock of his hair which was taken from his head after he had been buried 7 months. My brother William took it off as he and my brother Dimick were moving the bodies of Joseph and Hyrum from where they were first buried, in the cellar of the Nauvoo House, to the cellar or pit under a little outhouse that was built exclusively for that purpose. The glass over his face was broken and they saved some of that glass. And a piece of that glass covered the hair in the top of the cane, and then a piece of metal with a round hole in the center was over the glass and hair.

Through the hole in the metal (aluminum) the hair could be seen.

At the Party on that evening the cane and its history became known and was viewed, inspected, admired and handled by each individual, and was constantly on the move until

206
References to the Martyrdom canes appear rather frequently in LDS literature. In *Brigham Young* by M. R. Werner, we read:

The memory of the Prophet was perpetuated a few days later. The rough boards which had been used as temporary coffins were sawed in pieces and distributed among Joseph's and Hyrum's friends, who had canes made of them, each with a lock of the Prophet's hair set in the top. These canes are considered sacred relics to-day.4

Matthias F. Cowley, in his *Wilford Woodruff: History of His Life and Labors*, says:

Before leaving Nauvoo, he paid a visit to Emma Smith to whose life he sought to bring consolation in the hour of her bereavement. She gave him a piece of oak for a staff. The oak had been taken from Joseph Smith's coffin.

Apostle Cowley also speaks of President Woodruff's visit to Mary Fielding Smith, widow of Hyrum Smith, where he was given locks of the hair from the heads of Joseph Smith, Hyrum Smith, Samuel H. Smith, and Don Carlos Smith. President Woodruff commented on the reason for collecting these relics:

I also obtained some hair of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles. My purpose in getting it was that I might put a part of each of these collections in the knob of my staff as a relic of those noble men, the master spirits of the nineteenth century.5

---


5. Matthias F. Cowley, *Wilford Woodruff: History of His Life and Labors* (Salt Lake City, Utah: Bookcraft, 1971), pp. 227-28. A more precise account of this event is found in Wilford Woodruff's diary under the date of 23 August 1844:

I met with the quorum of the Twelve in Council a little time or some of them. I visited Emma Smith the widow of the prophet—she let me have a peace of oak for a staff out of the coffins of the Prophet Joseph who was inhumanly murdered in Carthage All in company with his brother Hiram. Emma also let me have a pair of gloves composed of white cotton and [Mes.] Woodruff—a pair Cotton handkerchief both of which the Prophet wore, while living. We called upon Sister Mary Smith widow of Hiram Smith the Patriarch. She gave us some hair from the head of Joseph Smith, Hiram Smith, Samuel Smith, & Don Carlos Smith, all brothers, of the same Parents I also obtained some hair of the quorum of the Twelve Apostles in the Church of Jesus Christ of the Latter day Saints my object was in putting a portion of each in the top of my Staff as a relic of those noble men, master spirits of the nineteenth century, to hand down to my posterity, to deposit in the most Holy and Sacred place in the Holy temple of GOD on the consecrated Hill of Zion. (*Wilford Woodruff Journal*, 23 August 1844, Library--Archives of the Historical Department of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Church Office Building, Salt Lake City, Utah.)
Left: Raymond Taylor holding a Martyrdom cane made from the oak boxes in which Joseph and Hyrum Smith’s bodies were brought to Nauvoo from Carthage, Illinois, 28 June 1844. Right: A close-up of the head of the cane. The cane, now located in the Arts and Sites Division of the Church, Salt Lake City, was owned by Dimick Huntington.
Don Corbett also relates this story in his *Mary Fielding Smith: Daughter of Britain*.6

In the *Life of Heber C. Kimball* by Orson F. Whitney, Heber C. Kimball is quoted as testifying to the healing virtues of these canes:

> How much would you give for even a cane that Father Abraham had used, or a coat or ring that the Savior had worn? The rough oak boxes in which the bodies of Joseph and Hyrum were brought from Carthage, were made into canes and other articles. I have a cane made from the plank of one of those boxes, so has Brother Brigham and a great many others, and we prize them highly and esteem them a great blessing. I want to carefully preserve my cane, and when I am done with it here I shall hand it down to my heir, with instructions to him to do the same. And the day will come when there will be multitudes who will be healed and blessed through the instrumentality of those canes, and the devil cannot overcome those who have them, in consequence of their faith and confidence in the virtues connected with them.

Further on in the same speech, Heber C. Kimball is quoted as saying:

> In like manner I have sent my cane. Dr. Richards used to lay his old black cane on a person’s head and that person has been healed through its instrumentality, by the power of God.7

John D. Lee’s *Confessions* also refer to the cane-carving incident.8

Current editions of Parley P. Pratt’s *Autobiography* carry an illustration of Willard Richards holding his cane.9 An enlarged version of the same collection of pictures of the Twelve Apostles under Brigham Young also appears in William Edwin Berrett’s *The Restored Church*.10 Willard Richards’s cane seems to be identical to the Huntington cane.

There were also some other canes made which have at times been mistaken for those made from the Carthage coffins. James Bird, a cabinet maker assigned to the project, fashioned three canes from the wood left over from the construction of the burial coffins of Joseph and Hyrum Smith. One of these was presented to Brigham Young, one to Heber C. Kimball, and the last retained by Mr. Bird. The Bird

---

8John D. Lee, *Mormonism Unveiled; or the Life and Confessions of the late Mormon Bishop John D. Lee* (St. Louis, Mo.: Bryan, Brand & Co., 1877), p. 153. This passage states that “the remains of the Prophet and his brother were laid in a sepulcher made of stone. The rough boards, which once enclosed them, were sawed in pieces and distributed among their friends, many of whom had canes made of the pieces, with a lock of the hair of the Prophet set in the top of them, and those canes are kept as sacred relics to this day.”
cane is a straight stick with an ivory handle that measures 4½” long. The cane itself is 32½” long with a 1” brass band at its tip. This cane is now preserved by the Bird family in California.¹¹ Members of the Kimball family claim that at one time Heber C. Kimball had three canes connected to the Martyrdom. One of those three canes has been described as 34½” long of solid oak construction. The handle is a solid knob of 1”, banded at its base by a brass ring. The tip of the cane is also brass capped. This is the cane the Kimball family feels was used by Heber C. Kimball for healing purposes, and it is owned by family members living in Salt Lake City.¹²

There is also a possibility that some bogus canes have been made which have been mistaken for those directly connected with the Martyrdom. William R. Hamilton, writing to S. H. B. Smith from Carthage, Illinois, on 18 March 1898, states:

Soon after the killing of the Smiths, Father had the bodies brought to our home, and rough pine coffins made in which they were placed. Those boards have furnished material for thousands of walking canes.

It is improbable that there was enough wood available from two coffins for "thousands of walking canes," and William Hamilton may have been joking as he referred to such claims. If not, he may simply have been in error, for he is the only source that gives any description of the coffin wood being other than oak. The Huntington cane is definitely oak, and Mr. Hamilton may have forgotten some of the facts over the intervening fifty-four years; he was a boy of fourteen at the time of these events.¹³

Some individuals have claimed that these canes have a hidden, dark meaning other than their sentimental and healing virtues. Raymond W. Taylor, in an unpublished article entitled "The Legend of the Friends of the Martyrs," suggests an oath of vengeance.¹⁴ In this theory, the canes were symbolic of the owner's oath of revenge against those who spilled the blood of the Prophet of God. However, the basis for such a belief appears to be purely circumstantial.

---

¹¹Correspondence of the Bird family with author, 18 November 1974 and 10 December 1974. This correspondence includes a photograph of the James Bird cane.

¹²Correspondence of the Kimball family with author, 14 July 1974. Another cane belonging to Heber C. Kimball was embellished with a gold handle inscribed with "The Kingdom of God or Nothing—Heber C. Kimball." This cane is also thought by the Kimball family to be related to the Martyrdom.

¹³William R. Hamilton to S. H. B. Smith, 18 March 1898, photocopy in collection of author. William R. Hamilton's father, Artis Hamilton, was the owner of the Hamilton Hotel in Carthage, where much of the drama of Joseph Smith's last days took place.

¹⁴Raymond W. Taylor, "Legend of the Friends of the Martyrs," MS, 23 July 1970, collection of the author. Raymond W. Taylor is pictured holding the Huntington cane on p. 208. Harry M. Beardsley claims that the canes served as a symbol of status: "Later, the wood was split into short lengths and distributed among the leaders of the Church. For many years walking-sticks made from the wood were recognized as emblems of rank and authority." (Beardsley, Joseph Smith and His Mormon Empire [Cambridge, Mass.: Houghton Mifflin Co.: Riverside Press, 1931], p. 370.)
The Canes of the Martyrdom are a very real part of the Mormon heritage. Shrouded in mystery as they are, the canes stand as a testimony of the love the owners shared for the Prophet Joseph Smith and his work.

A LITTLE LEAVENING

Florian H. Thayn

Over the car radio during a recent morning rush hour, the impersonal voice from the traffic helicopter circling Washington, D.C., droned, ‘‘Traffic on the beltway is backed up to the Mormon temple.’’ A few weeks earlier while on a flight leaving from Washington’s national airport, I was surprised to hear the pilot suggest over the intercom, ‘‘Look to the right and see the spectacular Mormon temple.’’ Nearly everybody in the metropolitan Washington area knows where the Mormon temple is. Its pristine towers pierce the sky like a beacon to the motorist and the airline pilot. Yet how many other less spectacular, even secluded, places in the nation’s capital hold little nuggets of interest that refer to Latter-day Saint or Utah history? A few anecdotes will show the wealth of Utah memorabilia and history in Washington, however obscure and hidden to most of its many visitors.

The earliest contact between Mormons and the city of Washington appears to have been late in 1839 when Joseph Smith sought redress from the U.S. government on behalf of the Missouri Saints who had lost their property and other possessions to the mobs earlier that year. It was November and the young prophet bounced along in a stagecoach filled with passengers who were oblivious to his identity. The old post road unwound through the Alleghenies, jutting out over the more rugged outcroppings of marble and stone before reaching the wooded farmlands of Maryland, and continuing southward toward the infant city of Washington.

In B. H. Roberts’s account of the journey, he states that the coach was approaching Washington when the coachman stopped at a tavern for his grog. The driverless horses became frightened and started running. After calming a hysterical mother and preventing her from throwing her infant out the coach window, Joseph gradually

Florian H. Thayn is head of the Art and Reference Division in the Office of the Architect of the Capitol, in Washington, D.C.
Earliest known photograph of the Capitol. This 1846 "Plumbeotype" shows the Capitol as Joseph Smith would have seen it in 1839. The old House Chamber is on the left, the Senate Chamber on the right. The present dome and wing extensions were added 1855–1865.
worked his way topside through the door to the driver’s seat and successfully brought the runaway horses under control after three miles of terror. The grateful passengers included Congressmen returning to Washington for the December opening of Congress. They showered Joseph with praise and indicated that plaudits might be given to him in the Halls of Congress—until, that is, they learned he was the “Mormon Prophet.” After that discovery, they said no more about his heroic deed which saved passengers, coach, and horses.¹

Joseph and his companion, Elias Higbee, arrived in Washington the following morning, 28 November 1839. They searched for nearly a day to find “as cheap boarding as can be had in this city”² and eventually settled near the Capitol in a rooming house on the corner of Missouri and 3rd streets, where they remained for three weeks. From the convenient location, Joseph and Brother Higbee walked to the White House for their fruitless visit with President Van Buren and to their almost daily visits to the Illinois delegation at the Capitol.³ The corner where the rooming house once stood is now occupied by the east wing of the National Gallery of Art. Identification of that location had been an enigma to some historians because the present-day Missouri and 3rd streets are nearly four miles north of the Capitol, a location that would have been farmland outside the city limits at the time Joseph visited. But during various redevelopment programs in Washington, many streets disappeared, and their names have been transferred to streets in newly developed areas. Downtown Missouri Avenue near the Mall was one of those casualties, thus causing the confusion surrounding Joseph’s Washington visit.⁴

About twenty years after that 1839 trip, evidence of Utah found a permanent place in the U.S. Capitol itself. Utah’s seal has been represented in the ceiling of the present House of Representatives Chamber since 1857 when that chamber was constructed while Utah was a territory. The design of the immense rectangular ceiling was composed of painted glass seals of the states and territories. In extensive remodeling nearly a century later, the chamber ceiling was redesigned and the glass seals were replaced with painted plaster replicas. The present seals are arranged in the order in which each state was admitted to the Union. Utah as the forty-fifth state is

Seal of the Territory of Utah removed from the House of Representatives Chamber ceiling. This print from an old glass plate.
represented on the south border behind the Speaker’s chair—a difficult, if not impossible area for visitors to see.

A few hundred feet from the present House Chamber is the Old Hall of the House used by the Representatives for nearly fifty years. It was here that Joseph Smith consulted with his Congressmen, but since 1864 the old chamber has been designated as National Statuery Hall. By law each state may contribute two statues to the collection. Utah’s single gift is the seated statue of Brigham Young, memorialized in white Carrara marble by Mahoni Young, sculptor and grandson of the pioneer leader. Brother Brigham faces three statues, sent by Wyoming, Washington, and North Dakota, that were created by another renowned Mormon artist, Avard Fairbanks, who also was the sculptor for the nineteen-foot high Angel Moroni on the Washington Temple.

At the opposite end of the Capitol from Statuary Hall is the President’s Room. It holds perhaps the most unseen bit of Utah memorabilia. Presidents formerly used this room when it was necessary to sign legislation in the Capitol in the last hours before Congress adjourned. Every inch of the walls is covered with fresco and oil painting by the skilled artist Constantino Brumidi. A political refugee from Rome, he spent the twenty-five years between 1855 and 1880 beautifying the Capitol of what he called “the one country on earth in which there is liberty.” Tucked in a corner behind the door and beneath a painting of a cherub is a Brumidi painting of a beehive about fourteen inches high, silently testifying that Utah Territory was organized on 9 September 1850. It is incorrectly labeled “Utar” and bears an impossible numeral, MDCCOL, in its date; the correct Roman numeral should read MDCCCL. These errors possibly occurred during subsequent retouching after Brumidi painted the room in 1859.

Mormon beliefs have influenced the form of yet another room in the Capitol. A small room off the Rotunda in the center of the building was designated by law as a place of meditation and prayer for members of the Senate and the House. The focal point of the Prayer Room is the stunning stained glass window bordered with a rope of laurel leaves tied with a ribbon bearing the names of all the states. That the name of Utah is readily visible in the lower left corner is not the significant feature. The more interesting story is about the design that was not selected. In 1953 a special committee composed


215
Brigham Young Statue by Mahonri Young in National Statuary Hall, United States Capitol
Utah Seal in the President's Room, United States Capitol
Proposed Prayer Room Window, United States Capitol
of two prominent Protestant ministers, a Jewish rabbi, and a Catholic priest conferred with a Congressional committee to determine the theme of the window. Their great concern was that nothing depicted in the window or the furnishings should offend the various religious beliefs of Congressmen who would use the room. Among the designs that were discarded were a cross, a triangle as the sign of the Trinity, and angels with wings. A spokesman for the group indicated those symbols would offend some beliefs and specifically noted that "Mormons do not believe that angels have wings." The deliberations of those knowledgeable gentlemen resulted in the present beautiful window depicting George Washington kneeling in prayer.

Directly north of the White House on 16th and Columbia Road stands the former Washington chapel, a center of Latter-day Saint activity for forty-two years until it was sold in 1976. It is with nostalgia that one passes the familiar stained glass windows depicting the Hill Cumorah, Utah's sego lily, continents of the world, and the ships, trains and planes which enabled "all nations to flow" to the United States. Originally, the chapel also boasted a gilded statue of the Angel Moroni fashioned by Thorlief Knapsus; for three years, Washington members could boast of two Angel Moroni statues, one on that chapel and one on the temple. In 1979, however, the statue was removed from the top of the Washington chapel.

One final anecdote will be of particular interest to Mormon visitors to the nation's capital. The interior of the Washington Monument holds a fascinating piece of Utah history. Only the hardy souls who walk up the stairs rather than ride the elevator to the top of the 555 foot shaft will see the memorial stone of Deseret on the twentieth landing, about midway to the monument’s top. For most visitors the original stone was a curiosity without explanation. What does a beehive capped with the incised phrases, "Holiness to the Lord" and "Deseret" represent? The story of the stone, however, while not generally known, is well documented.

The cornerstone for the Washington Monument was laid on a rainy Fourth of July in 1848. To stimulate financial interest in the project, the Washington National Monument Society solicited memorial stones for the interior walls from hundreds of organizations, countries, and local governments, including the self-proclaimed Territory of Deseret.

Brigham Young presented the invitation to the General Assembly of the Provisional State of Deseret. The Saints were loyal to

*Manuscript files, Architect of the Capitol.*
The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints

Former Washington, D.C., Chapel
the memory of George Washington and they wanted to be part of the memorial to him. However, they were still bitter because Congress had rejected their petitions to become the State of Deseret but instead had created the Territory of Utah. To the industrious pioneers their new home was Deseret, and therefore they were determined that the design for the memorial stone must commemorate Deseret. A block of limestone obtained from the San Pete quarries at Manti was carved and embellished by stonemason William Ward in about six weeks. Measuring 3' x 2' x 6'', the completed design included the symbolic beehive, capped with the All-Seeing Eye, borders of classic foliage, and a cornucopia symbolic of blessings of abundance. The inscription "Holiness to the Lord" is now reserved for use solely on the temples.7

An opportunity to cart the stone to Washington came two years later in 1853, when missionaries heading eastward accepted the laborious three-month task. However, construction on the monument was halted for lack of money, and the crisis of the Civil War and subsequent financial depression prevented work on the monument from progressing. The Deseret memorial stone languished in a nearby storage shed for more than thirty-one years. Although the monument was dedicated in 1885, it was not completed and opened to the public until three years later. Sometime during those three years the Deseret stone was set in place.

Interested citizens in Utah and Washington, D.C., began agitating in 1950 for proper identification of the Deseret stone. It was determined that an explanatory inscription should be carved on a piece of granite obtained from the same quarries that supplied stone for the Salt Lake Temple. The project was financed mainly with pennies collected from the children of Utah. Thus it was that on a rainy January day in 1951 a small group of patriots representing the Church and federal and state governments huddled in the confines of the twentieth landing in the monument and dedicated the new stone that was set in the wall immediately below the original beehive.

The late Howard R. Driggs, as president of the American Pioneer Trails Association, made the following statement during the dedication services:


221
DESERET
MEANS HONEY BEE
CHANGED TO
TERRITORY OF UTAH 1850
STATE OF UTAH 1896

Utah State Stone, Washington Monument
Partially Completed Washington Monument
There is vital meaning for all America and the world in the words and symbol carved on the old weathered stone. Deseret means honeybee. This and the beehive mean work, thrift, cooperation. “Holiness to the Lord” means reverence and righteousness. In other words, these stones stand for what has made and what will save our America: UNITY, FAITH, WORK. May they be preserved in this shrine for centuries to come. 8

That stone silently reflects the pioneers’ patriotism for the nation and their affection for George Washington.

As the nation’s and the Mormons’ history continue to be entwined, Washington will continue to hold interesting items of Mormon memorabilia.

8 Senate Document 12, p. 9.
Mormon Bibliography 1979–1980

Scott H. Duvall and Scott C. Dunn

In the past two or three years we have seen a definite increase in the number of publishers catering to the Mormon audience. We daily see and hear advertisements promoting new novels, diaries, and inspirational material designed to appeal to the Mormon culture.

For many years Deseret Book and Bookcraft were the only publishers dealing with and soliciting manuscripts with Mormon content. Then Horizon Publishers in Bountiful, Utah, and Hawkes Publishing in Salt Lake City were established. Perhaps the success of these latter two firms has inspired the proliferation of ‘‘Mormon’’ publishers we now have.

To be sure, some of these recent efforts are private ventures, designed to provide an outlet for the author’s thoughts, creative efforts, or family history. There are several of this type listed in the 1979–1980 Mormon Bibliography. But we have also seen the emergence of several publishers that evidently have visions of larger prospects and circulation.

Randall Publishers, for instance, has existed for only two and one-half years. Formerly Ensign Publishers of Las Vegas, Nevada, Randall moved to Orem, Utah, to have better access to the Mormon market. In 1980 this firm was third (behind Deseret Book and Bookcraft) in volume sales in Utah among Utah publishers. The company has a goal of creating a paperback market for the Mormon novel.

The history of Randall Publishers parallels that of Council Press of Provo, Butterfly Publishing of Santa Barbara, Liberty Publishing of Provo, and a few others. But the growth of Mormon publishing is also evident in other endeavors. For example, Mormons are also buying scriptures, dramatizations, history, talks, and essays on cassettes. There are now many recording companies providing these materials. Furthermore, the success of BYU Studies, Sunstone, and Dialogue

Scott H. Duvall is assistant curator of Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University. Scott C. Dunn, an intern for BYU Studies, is completing his M.A. at Brigham Young University in Teaching English as a Second Language.
points to the development of a Mormon audience interested in contemporary and doctrinal issues.

All of which raises the question: Why? Why is the Mormon community creating a favorable market for these publishers? First, often the public identifies with the subject matter, thus reinforcing the feeling of "belonging" to the group. The publishers may feel they are offering an alternative to the less wholesome material on the market today. In addition, the sesquicentennial undoubtedly had an effect on publishing during 1980. Also, arguments are heard that on the one hand Mormon readers are gullible, that they will read anything that hints of Mormonism; on the other hand that Mormon readers are becoming more sophisticated, that they are demanding more exploration of history and doctrine.

In any case, the proliferation of Mormon literature, whether it consist of fictional, historical, or inspirational works, whether it be in book form, sound recording, or magazines, has made substantial gains recently and will probably be with us in the future. It will be interesting to watch.

HISTORICAL


------. "They Came to Nauvoo." Ensign 9 (September 1979): 20–25.


------. "Called to Settle, Called to Build." Ensign 10 (February 1980): 23–32.


Foster, Robert L. "Rendezvous for the Ghosts of Fort Bridger ... Uinta Outpost." Frontier Times, August-September 1980, pp. 50-53.

Gee, Elizabeth D. "Justice of All or for the 'Elect'? The Utah County Probate Court, 1855–72." Utah Historical Quarterly 48 (Spring 1980): 129–47.


Herring, Dean F. From Lode to Dust: The Birth and Death of Kimberly, Utah. Eugene, Oreg.: Published by author, [1979].


Jesse, Dean. 'Joseph Smith's 19 July 1840 Discourse.' Brigham Young University Studies 19 (Spring 1979): 390–94.


Pratt, Louisa Barnes. *Mormondom's First Woman Missionary.* Salt Lake City: [Daughters of Utah Pioneers], n.d.


White, Larry D. The Second City of Enoch. Fort Wayne, Ind.: Published by author, 1980.


Youngreen, Buddy. "'And Yet Another Copy of the Anthon Manuscript.'" Brigham Young University Studies 20 (Spring 1980): 346–47.


DOCTRINAL


Nyman, Monte S. *Great Are the Words of Isaiah*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1980.


Shoemaker, T. Eugene; Stark, Helen Candland; Newell, L. Jackson; Huxford, Gary; and Bennion, Lowell. "‘Reflections on the Role of the Prophet.’" *Sunstone* 5 (July–August 1980): 34–42.


---

**INSPIRATIONAL**


Durrant, George D., and Barton, Noel R. *Fun and Names, or How to Dig Your Family History without Really Prying*. Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1980.


236


---

**CONTEMPORARY**


Cole, Nick. “Job-grading the Mormon Church.” Director 34 (October 1979): 40–43.


“Packaging Mormonism in Digestible Form.” Christianity Today, 4 May 1979, pp. 50–51.


Terry, Ann; Slaght-Griffin, Marilyn; and Terry, Elizabeth. Mormons and Women. Santa Barbara: Butterfly Publishing, 1980.


BIOGRAPHICAL AND FAMILY HISTORY


Cook, Lyndon W. "'I Have Sinned against Heaven, and Am Unworthy of Your Confidence, but I Cannot Live without a Reconciliation': Thomas B. Marsh Returns to the Church." Brigham Young University Studies 20 (Summer 1980): 389-400.


LeCheMinant, Wilford Hill. *Peter and Sarah Farr LeCheMinant and the 1854 Mormon Emigration from Europe to the Great Salt Lake Valley*. Bountiful: Published by author, 1979.


Papanikolas, Helen Z. "Growing Up Greek in Helper, Utah." *Utah Historical Quarterly* 48 (Summer 1980): 244-60.


**ARTS AND LITERATURE**


*One Hundred and Fifty Years, Sesquicentennial Lectures on Mormon Arts, Letters and Sciences*. Provo: Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, 1980.


243


BIBLIOGRAPHICAL


Reviewed by Ida Smith and Lynne Smith Partridge. Ida Smith is director of the Women’s Research Institute at Brigham Young University. Lynne Smith Partridge, a graduate from BYU-Hawaii and active Primary worker for over sixteen years, is currently a Primary president in Cody, Wyoming. They are sisters in a family long associated with Primary. Their mother was on the Primary General Board under three presidents, their grandmother and great-grandmother were on the Primary General Board under Louie B. Felt (first president of the Primary), and their grandfather (an Apostle) served as advisor to the Primary.

In Sisters and Little Saints, Carol Cornwall Madsen and Susan Staker Oman have delineated the growth of the Primary from a single Primary unit in Farmington, Utah, in 1878, into a worldwide organization in 1978. Moreover, they chart the noteworthy history of female administration in a Church program.

A Primary organization was initially conceived in response to Aurelia Spencer Rogers’s query, “Could there not be an organization for little boys and have them trained to make better men?” (p. 1). Eliza R. Snow, to whom the question was put, secured “the approbation of John Taylor . . . presiding officer in the Church in 1878,” wrote to Farmington Ward Bishop Hess for his approval, and then told Aurelia that she “might consider herself authorized to proceed.” Aurelia did organize the first Primary, and although the participation of girls had not been discussed, she included them in order that the singing might “sound as well as it should” (p. 5). Eliza simultaneously organized a Primary in Salt Lake City in the Eleventh Ward.

The Primary grew under the direction of Eliza R. Snow and the Relief Society from then until Eliza’s death in December 1887. In the first nine-and-one-half years, Eliza organized Primaries all over the Territory, having been given authority to call and set apart ward and stake Primary presidents. At seventy-six years of age, Eliza "traveled over a thousand miles by train and wagon and established thirty-five
Primaries, while conducting the business of the other women’s auxiliaries” (p. 11). Eliza was central in choosing Louie B. Felt to be the first general Primary president and, assisted by Precindia Kimball and Zina D. H. Young, she called Louie to the position, giving her “a grand blessing” (p. 29). Eliza also prepared materials specifically for Primary use, including “a hymnbook, a tune book, . . . a catechism of Old and New Testament questions and answers . . . and a series of books containing recitations and dialogues” (p. 16). Eliza’s death in 1887 was “a blow both to the Primary organization and personally to Louie B. Felt, who had relied almost exclusively on her advice” (p. 30). Under Eliza’s direction the Relief Society/Primary relationship had been one of mother/daughter as the women of those organizations worked closely together.

Despite shyness, illness, and a preference for remaining in the background, Louie B. Felt, supported by “her growing friendship with a young English convert, May Andersen,” proved equal to her stewardship (p. 35). She, as Eliza had done, gave blessings to board members before sending them on assignments to stakes throughout the Church.

Several notable Primary projects took root in Louie’s fifty-year tenure as general Primary president. These included the magazine The Children’s Friend, for which Louie put up her own home as collateral (the First Presidency instructed the women that they might have a monthly publication—provided they paid for it and kept it out of debt), the idea of a hospital, the nickel fund and the idea of encouraging children to give to worthy endeavors, and the divisions into classes by age groups. The Church’s current magazine for children—The Friend—though now separate from the Primary organization is still financially independent of Church funds.

From the inception of Primary, sharing has been a focal point in Primary emphasis. By the end of World War I, “children and officers of the Primary had shipped over 100,000 articles to the Red Cross” (p. 63). In addition, “at the end of World War II [Primary children] were invited to gather toys and clothing for the children of Europe, collecting 122,794 articles that were packed into 3,451 cartons” (p. 132). Primary children have contributed to the Armenian and Syrian Relief Fund, to the building of the “This is the Place” Monument, and to the construction of the Primary Children’s Hospital with the “Buy a Brick” program. It was the Primary, as well, that commissioned Arnold Friberg “to paint the Book of Mormon series as a commemorative feature of the fiftieth anniversary of the Children’s Friend in 1952” (p. 121).
Almost from the beginning, Primary administrators have concerned themselves with promoting "legislative movements to secure enactment and enforcement of proper educational and health laws" (p. 70). The Primary supported the 1918–1919 Children's Year, sponsored by the Children's Bureau of the U.S. Department of Labor. Primary women pioneered Church education for the handicapped when they opened their first Primary for the handicapped in 1960. They anticipated the family home evening program with their "Family Hour" section in The Children's Friend, beginning in 1954.

In light of the present women's movement, it is interesting to note that it was LDS women who made the first inroads into Scouting by women, as a result of the decision by Church leaders to give responsibility for the first year of Scouting to the Primary. Sister LaVern Parmley was the "first woman to participate in many aspects of scouting," including sitting on numerous national Scouting committees and receiving Scouting awards. "Today there is no distinction between the service of men and women in Scouting" (p. 141).

Perhaps one of the largest impressions we derived from reading Sisters and Little Saints (beyond the dedication, intelligence, and obedience of the women who worked in Primary) is the fact that Primary was administered for the first sixty-five years by women who had no children of their own, but who had clear vision of what it means to be a "mother in Zion." They teach us that the nurturing of children is not, and ought not to be, restricted to mothers—or even to women, for that matter, as we see in the Savior's example—for it is central to building the kingdom. These women include:

Eliza R. Snow, who taught that "the very best talent in our midst should be employed to preside over the Primary Associations," women who loved children and had "the faculty of drawing them to them" (p. 13).

Louie B. Felt, who said, "The care of children is women's special charge" (p. 45).

May Anderson, who was not only childless but unmarried, and who, if she "was convinced that a course of action was best for the children," was unconcerned with the inconvenience, however great (pp. 94–95).

May Green Hinckley, who had no previous Primary experience before her call to be general Primary president at age fifty-five, after just eight years of marriage, and who made D&C 68:28 the theme of Primary: "And they shall also teach their children to pray, and to walk uprightly
before the Lord.’” In her patriarchal blessing May was promised that her fame would go forth as a “Mother in Israel.”

These women exemplified the obedience yet independence described in the words from Milton’s *Paradise Lost*:

led in fight, yet Leader seem’d
Each warrior single as in Chief, expert
When to advance, or stand, or turn the sway
Of Battle, . . . each on himself reli’d,
As only in his arm the moment lay
Of victory. . . .  

They were not looking from side to side for direction, but to their file leader: the Savior. They asked for and received the light they needed in order to act—and then moved. They were truly companions in the battle—not followers of their fellowmen. They set the example that women have not only a right but an obligation to seek for their own light in helping to build the kingdom. They did so and were blessed.


Reviewed by Thomas G. Alexander, professor of history and director of the Charles Redd Center for Western Studies, Brigham Young University.

For the general reader as well as the specialist, Truman G. Madsen’s biography of B. H. Roberts will fill a long-standing gap. *Defender of the Faith* provides a chronological treatment of the life of Elder Roberts from his birth in Lancashire, England, in 1857 to his death in Salt Lake City in 1933, highlighting in a sympathetic manner his childhood, conversion, gathering to Zion, youth, and Church service.

Son of a ne’er-do-well, B. H. Roberts lived a life in England that was virtually a page from a Dickens novel. After his mother joined the Church, the family was torn apart, and Roberts’s mother left him in England while she emigrated to America. He and his sister eventually joined her, but not before he had been subjected to the worst that early nineteenth-century England had to offer. In Utah, B. H. endured the harshness of the nineteenth-century Utah mining

---

frontier until he returned to Centerville where he lived as a young tough until he was apprenticed to a blacksmith. Eleven years old before he learned to read, he experienced a conversion to the printed and spoken word which eventually made him one of the foremost scholars, writers, and religious leaders in the Church.

Perhaps most important in the biography are the details of Roberts’s service as a missionary and his work as a writer on religious subjects. Madsen provides detail particularly on Roberts’s southern mission of 1881–1886, when, at considerable risk to himself, he worked at cleaning up the remains of the Cane Creek Massacre, and his other missionary labors in the Northern States, the British Mission, and the Eastern States where he served as mission president during the early 1920s.

Roberts’s writings on Church subjects were voluminous. They included his three-volume defense of Joseph Smith and the Book of Mormon (*A New Witness for God*); the monumental six-volume *Comprehensive History of the Church*; and his much-cited edition of Joseph Smith’s Manuscript History and portions of Brigham Young’s Manuscript History, now known to Church members as the seven-volume *History of the Church*.

The specialist will note in the biography a number of errors on Madsen’s part that a greater knowledge of United States, Western, and Utah history and culture could have avoided. Half the population in Utah, for instance, was never dependent on mining (p. 71). There was no justice of the United States Supreme Court named Sumner Howard (he was justice of the Supreme Court of Arizona Territory) (p. 190). The crusade against the Church did not end with the Smoot hearings (p. 182). Cohabitation with more than one wife was not legal after Utah became a state (p. 245). The congressman who led the attack on B. H. Roberts was Robert W. Taylor, not Taylor (p. 262). B. H. Roberts did not nominate Clarence Bamberger, who was a Republican and political enemy (he nominated Simon Bamberger, a fellow Democrat who was elected governor of Utah) (p. 355).

Perhaps the most serious errors come, however, not with these details, which may have resulted from relying too heavily on work by research assistants or from typographical errors, but they are in Madsen’s treatment of Roberts’s political career. B. H. Roberts would undoubtedly roll over in his grave to hear himself called “an independent” (p. 271). His political opinions followed the Democratic Party quite closely, as a comparison of Roberts’s views with the party positions will show. Far from acting “from the
wings,” he played a central role in Utah Democratic Party politics as a stump speaker, political appointee, and active partisan. His attacks on Reed Smoot during the 1908 campaign, for instance, led to intense cross-examination before the Council of the Twelve, rather than simply the one or two “pulpit preachments” from Joseph F. Smith (p. 272). Other examples could also be cited.

Although it is wrong to expect an author to write the book the reviewer would like to have written, one often wonders about the rationale for the inclusion or exclusion of particular material. This is particularly true with regard to the controversial problems in which B. H. Roberts was involved. One wonders, for instance, why so much space should have been devoted to a consideration of Roberts’s controversy with William Jarman which from the perspective of today will probably be viewed as antiquarian and why no space at all is given to the controversy over the Book of Abraham with the Reverend F. S. Spalding, Roberts’s extensive work in the 1920s encompassing at least three manuscripts on problems related to the Book of Mormon (both of which are of vital contemporary interest), or Roberts’s discussions with the First Presidency concerning the exclusion of the King Follett Discourse from the first edition of the History of the Church.

The value of the biography lies principally in the chronological treatment of the life of B. H. Roberts and in the inspiration it will provide to Latter-day Saints. It is difficult to conceive of a less auspicious beginning for a life which proved so productive and valuable to himself and his co-religionists. B. H. Roberts was undoubtedly one of the mighty men of Zion, and this biography will assist in perpetuating his memory in the collective consciousness of the Mormon people.


Reviewed by Spencer J. Palmer, professor of history and religion, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.

IS MORMONISM EMERGENT OR MAINLINE?

Alternative Altars explores the impact and meaning of religious life in American history outside the Judeo-Christian mainstream. It is a fecund but disjointed panorama—a fascinating collage of essays,
accounts, and affirmations in which Professor Robert Ellwood, director of the East Asian Studies Center at the University of Southern California, probably the leading American expert on emergent "cults," examines closely three "moments" in his own career: Spiritualism and the Shakers, Theosophy (he is a member of the Theosophical Society of America), and Western Zen.

Professor Ellwood sees two styles in American religion today—the "temple" and the "cave." In his view, conventional religion fits the paradigm of Solomon's temple in Jerusalem, stable and fixed, with men dwelling together in happy harmony, full of gratitude to God for fruitful families and bounteous fields. This is mainline religion and is normative, large, and established. On the world scene, it is the huge mosques of Cairo and Tehran, the Altar of Heaven of the old Chinese emperors in Peking, the Grand Shrine of Ise in Japan, and the Christian cathedrals in Europe and America. In the United States it is the Episcopalians, Methodists, Baptists, Catholics, and Jews.

Then there is the metaphor of the cave, filled with alternative altars, with novel religious "cults" (Ellwood rarely uses this term; he opts for "excursus" or "emergent" religion). As in Plato's cave, the inhabitants are unhappy prisoners bound in chains, forced to turn their backs to the light. All they know of reality is a shadowplay created by a bonfire behind them, which projects dark, dancing images before their deprived eyes. Here the groups are small and short-lived, centered around a charismatic leader, basically concerned with mystical experience, having beliefs at great variance with those of the larger community outside.

In Alternative Altars, Ellwood probes two questions he briefly touched upon a year ago in a lecture at Brigham Young University: What is a cult (an emergent religion)? What distinguishes it from an established (mainline) one? His treatment of these questions provides useful indices for examining religious groups which he did not directly consider. For example, using his criteria, we should be able to determine when a religion ceases to be a dissident sect and begins to take on the aura of a legitimate, mainline church. More specifically, using Ellwood's analysis, let us see whether The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints should be regarded as an "alternative altar" of unconventional spirituality belonging to the community of spiritualism, theosophy, Western Zen, and the likes of the Moonies or the Nichiren shoshu people, or whether it is more accurate to identify Mormonism with the traditional mainstream Christian churches.

Obviously, this book review is not the place to attempt a thorough examination of this matter, but let me list here several of
Ellwood's more important criteria for distinguishing emergent religions and suggest ways in which the ideology and operations of Mormonism may compare or disagree with them.

1. Emergent religions as asylum faiths.

In Ellwood's analysis, emergent religions are intense communities, requiring full-time practice. They avoid being directly competitive with established religions by taking more intensive forms than the normative religions do. They are "total institutions." Shakers, Zen centers, the Hare Krishna, etc., are all examples of total institutions comparable to prisons, boarding schools, insane asylums, or monasteries. The nonnormative religions also have a more diffuse influence; in them there are many dual or multiple memberships and activities. For example, many non-Hindu Americans meditate in Maharishi's Transcendental Meditation (TM) mode or do yoga. But very few non-Roman Catholics say the rosary in Catholic churches, and very few synagogues have regular plurality of non-Jewish visitors.

Mormonism a total way of life rather than a creedal pronouncement. Members are expected to apply the principles of their religion in all aspects of daily life—social, physical, moral, economic, political, and academic. Mormonism has sought to develop a lifestyle distinct from the world at large, and there have been elements of separatism in the Mormon historical experience. However, there has never been a monastic syndrome in Mormonism, no propensity for ascetic withdrawal, and no equivalent to the Zen center or the Hare Krishna ashram. Mormons do not shy away from being directly competitive with alternative religions, including the established American faiths. Although there are Mormons who are attracted to Buddhist and Hindu meditation practices, these members could not feel comfortable bringing these into the Church. No one could continue to be known as a practicing Mormon who at the same time becomes a promotional advocate or devotee of TM, Zen meditation, Nichiren shoshu, or the like.

2. Leadership, charisma, and the feminine aspect.

In the unconventional groups, the charisma of the mediumistic minister, the oracle, the inspired, prophetic leader is emphasized. The focus is like the shaman of old, as in the example of Madam Blavatsky of Theosophy or any of the Zen masters, who represent self-
replenishing charismatic leadership in principle. Also a prominent symbol of the many emergent religions is feminine leadership. The predominance of women in ecstatic, mystical, and healing cults is a worldwide fact. It is evident in Haitian voodoo, the ancient Greek Dionysiacs, the Japanese new religions, as in the somewhat decorous shakers, spiritualists, theosophists, and pentecostalists of America. In some of these faiths the feminine is identified with the divine; there is an image of a god which is feminine. In mainline American churches feminine clerical or professional leadership has never been more than nominal.

Mormonism, the living prophet, and a Mother in Heaven. The Mormon religion places primary emphasis on the inspired leadership of a living prophet who is regarded as a revelator and spokesman of the will of God. The prophet-president of the Church is a man, since he must hold the priesthood, and this privilege is reserved for men. The Supreme God of Mormonism is male, but in a sense not completely so. Mormons believe that a modified shakti principle is operative in the celestial spheres. That is, the gods are never without their consorts. Father in Heaven cannot exist without his companion, a Mother Goddess, for man cannot be exalted without a wife. In Mormonism, as in some other religions, there is room for a Mother in Heaven. Relationships in the eternal world require the female presence. Although men and women preserve their individual identity forever, ultimate reality cannot exist without them both.

3. Monism and meditation.

In Eastern spirituality, ultimate reality is One. But between this ultimate monism (a belief that underlying supreme power or principle is one) and this world of toil and shadows, we often have an intermediate polytheism in the emergent religions: an assemblage of masters, spirits, buddhas, gurus, gods, or archetypes who give texture and color to the One, and who can reach down to guide pilgrims along the way. Emphasis on creation is slight; the excursionist has in view instead an eternal, though sometimes evolving, world.

In emergent groups, trance and meditation are often emphasized, although these are either not allowed or are tightly controlled and limited to experts within the group. In fact this is the reason for the existence of a number of meditation groups. They each offer legitimated teachers who are often thought of as members of a long lineage of such teachers. They teach that meditation should be
taught only by experts. In meditation (of TM, Zen, yoga, the Divine Light Mission, etc.) the consciousness is directed away from outward things and is reflected back upon itself, upon particular sacred images or thoughts which are conjured up in the mind, upon the formless essence of consciousness. The meditation act should induce a tranquil or ecstatic state of consciousness.

Mormon pluralism and prayer. In Mormonism, the supreme influence or power in the universe consists of three separate, personal deities: the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, who are united in purpose and plan. They created man and the world. Mankind is literally the spirit offspring of God the Father. In underlying philosophy, reality is dualistic. Good is coeternal with evil. Besides God there is the devil. In addition to mind or spirit, matter also eternally exists, light and darkness are coeternal, etc.

Mormons also believe in meditation, but its object is not consciousness itself. It is essentially a form of prayer which is psychologically and symbolically structured as an "I-Thou" relationship with a personal God (or Gods) conceived of as essentially outside the psyche. In prayer, there may well be an expansive consciousness, but most often it involves a greater awareness of one's relationship with God. In Mormonism prayer can and should be meditative, but it is not confined to introspective experience.


Excursus religions appeal to selected people, not families. They have a tendency to reach isolated people or single status people (young people, older women, and so on) rather than families and demographic cross sections one would expect community religions to reach. The cult stance of most emergent religions is maintained by advancing a single, simple practice which can produce fairly immediate and perceptible subjective change and can be practiced alone or in a small, ad hoc group quite independent of the kind of elaborate activities and structural ramifications of the parish church. Chants (mantras), meditation, special liturgical or healing rites (such as jorei in the World Messianity movement), or exciting concepts or symbols are examples. Also, in excursus religions there is usually an invitation to return to sacred earth. They demarcate sacred space and time with seasonal rites and sacred geographical locations. There are holy places charged with sacred power and worthy of pilgrimages. Often these are sacred mountains or mountain retreats.
Mormonism, a family-centered movement. No other American faith places more emphasis on the preservation of family life and the home than do the Mormons. Therefore, Mormonism seeks to reach people of all ages and all stations in life. Likewise, there is no single, simple distinguishing ordinance or activity in the Mormon faith that is key to all else, or that covers the entire range of spiritual or ecclesiastical needs, although there are a number of rites, ceremonies, and observances that are appropriate at given stages of development in the life of a practicing Latter-day Saint. On the other hand, in the matter of sacred earth, Mormons are probably closer to the emergent religions than to the conventional faiths. Also, like the Hebrews of old, they are temple-building people. And only within the sacred reserves of the temple can the highest and most sacred blessings of the faith be received.

SUMMARY

Using Ellwood's guidelines for distinguishing "new" religions from old, we cannot say that Mormonism belongs fully to either, because it is somewhat ambivalent toward both. In balance, the Mormon religion is closer to the mainline faiths than to the emerging ones. This in part derives from sharing many common Western historical and cultural traditions. It is inaccurate to classify Mormonism as a cult, not simply because it can no longer be regarded as small or short-lived in the American scene, or not simply because it has now become global in outreach and emphasis (it now has four-and-a-half million members in eighty-one countries and sixteen territories), but, more importantly, because it is now perceived more for the ways in which it belongs to the community of mainstream religions (Christ-centered, biblical, strong emphasis on preserving the traditional family, etc.) than for the ways in which it has been regarded as different from them or as strange.

In some fundamental sense, Mormonism is a bridge between the "new" East and the "traditional" West. Among conventional Christian theologians in modern times, there has been an insistence that knowledge of God must rely on reason, logic, and the words of the Bible. Among unconventional religious groups, knowledge of the Divine has been largely subjective and mystic, involving inner consciousness or enlightenment. Somewhere in between these two, and involving something of both, is the Mormon approach to religion. Mormons believe that knowledge of God is neither totally empiricist nor totally mystic. To us, the scriptures speak clearly of
revelation in both objective and subjective dimensions—in both the Word and the Spirit.

The swing toward subjective personal experience, so prevalent among the newly emergent Eastern faiths in this country, has been paralleled by a renewed interest among mainline Christians in “the Spirit.” Speech cannot be parted from the breath that creates it. Although the conventional preoccupation with scientific and reasonable knowledge has been reflected in a general emphasis among biblical Christians on the importance of the Word of Truth, an intellectual understanding of the Word as objectively given is not enough. Knowing about God is not knowing God himself. In this Mormons would tend to agree with the newly emergent religions. The Word must be applied to the heart and mind subjectively by the Spirit, so that man recognizes the divine personalities behind the mighty acts and words and enters into a personal relationship with them. In Mormonism there must be cooperation between internal divine illumination (the emergent faiths) and external truth (the traditional Judeo-Christian faiths). In this particular, at least, Mormonism is both “new and everlasting.”
BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY STUDIES is a voice for the community of Latter-day Saint scholars. Contributions dealing with LDS thought, history, theology, and related subjects will receive first priority.

BYU STUDIES is a serious venture into the study of the correlation of revealed and discovered truth. Dedicated to the conviction that the spiritual and the intellectual are complementary avenues of knowledge, BYU STUDIES welcomes articles from all fields of learning. They should be written for the informed nonspecialist rather than the specialized reader in the technical language of the field. Creative work—poetry, short fiction, drama—is also welcomed.

Except for unusual cases, contributions should not exceed 4,000 words (approximately 15 double-spaced, typewritten pages). Manuscripts should conform to the University of Chicago Press Manual of Style, and footnotes should be placed on a separate page at the end of the article.

Each author will receive twenty offprints and three copies of the number in which his contribution appears.

Send manuscripts to Brigham Young University, Dr. Charles D. Tate, Jr., Editor, Brigham Young University Studies, A283 JKBA, Provo, Utah 84602.

Brigham Young University Studies is being listed in Current Contents: Behavioral, Social, and Management Sciences and in Arts and Humanities Citation Index.